

hypoxic events. Our work had shown that ear oximetry accurately tracks progressive reductions in  $\text{SaO}_2$  above the threshold of clinical signs during both halogenated hydrocarbon anesthesia alone and anesthesia with surgery.<sup>8</sup> Thus, Coté's work confirms both the limitations of clinical signs and the usefulness of oximetry that we had previously described.

A clinical sign of hypoxemia during anesthesia that may be more sensitive than others, and which Dr. Coté's group may have had an opportunity to observe, is the color of the blood in the surgical field. During maintenance of anesthesia and (presumably) on-going surgery, they report several episodic desaturations to  $\text{SpO}_2$  values of 85% or less.<sup>1</sup> In those circumstances, one would anticipate that any fresh blood at the site of surgery would be perceptibly dark.<sup>5</sup> Did they observe any change in blood color and, if so, at what level of  $\text{SaO}_2$ ? Do the authors believe this to be an early clinical sign? To my knowledge, there are no published data on these questions.

Hypoxemic injury during anesthesia usually represents a failure of both primary and secondary prevention. While research has explored questions of primary prevention (e.g., rate of failure, critical incidents, and their determinants), less attention has been given to secondary prevention—in particular, the real difficulties that may be encountered in recognizing hypoxemia during anesthesia. (This is somewhat ironic, since failure of primary prevention is tolerable, whereas failure of secondary prevention is clearly not.) Modern pulse oximeters undoubtedly facilitate secondary prevention, but they are not yet a panacea, being frequently inaccurate at lower saturations<sup>9</sup> (as corroborated by the single hypoxemic  $\text{PaO}_2/\text{SpO}_2$  comparison reported by Coté *et al.*<sup>1</sup>), and susceptible to both extraneous artifacts and patient variables other than  $\text{SaO}_2$ .<sup>8</sup> We must still seek scientific knowledge about the sensitivity and specificity of clinical signs<sup>5</sup> and the reliability of oxygen monitors<sup>9</sup> and, in practice, make use of all clues of hypoxemia available to us.

Anesthesiology  
69:439, 1988

*In Reply:*—We agree with Dr. Knill that more research must be done to improve our primary methods of diagnosing hypoxemia; however, very significant desaturation must occur before a patient is visibly cyanotic and, as Dr. Knill has pointed out, many factors may influence the ability to diagnose cyanosis. Our study was designed to examine the incidence of hypoxic events and correlate these events with changes in vital signs and presence or absence of cyanosis. We clearly demonstrated that pulse oximeters are able to diagnose borderline desaturation well before any individual would be capable of this diagnosis, even if he/she knew that the patient was about to become desaturated. Dr. Knill's research on the cardiovascular effects of volatile anesthetic agents may well explain in part why we did not observe changes in vital signs with brief episodes of desaturation. Dr. Knill points out that, in his experience, cyanosis was more difficult to diagnose during halogenated hydrocarbon anesthesia, perhaps due to a "relative hyperperfusion of the skin and mucous membranes;" interestingly, all 14 patients (17 events) in our study who had major hypoxic events diagnosed by the oximeter and not by the anesthesiologist were receiving halothane anesthesia. Bear in mind, however, that nearly all pediatric patients in this institution are anesthetized with halothane.

Dr. Knill poses another interesting question, *i.e.*, can one observe the changes in the color of blood in the surgical field and relate this to oxygen saturation? Because we did not study this, we cannot provide scientific data; however, it is our clinical impression that only severe desaturation manifests as dark blood on the surgical field. Further-

R. L. KNILL, M.D., F.R.C.P.(C)  
Professor  
Department of Anesthesia  
University of Western Ontario  
London, Ontario, Canada  
N6A 5A5

#### REFERENCES

1. Coté C, Goldstein E, Coté M, Hoaglin DC, Ryan J: A single blind study of pulse oximetry in children. *ANESTHESIOLOGY* 68:184-188, 1988
2. Manninen PH, Knill RL: Cardiovascular signs of acute hypoxaemia and hypercarbia during enflurane and halothane anaesthesia in man. *Can Anaesth Soc J* 26:282-287, 1979
3. Knill RL, Gelb AW: Ventilatory responses to hypoxia and hypercapnia during halothane sedation and anesthesia in man. *ANESTHESIOLOGY* 40:244-251, 1978
4. Knill RL, Kieraszwicz HT, Dodgson BG: Chemical regulation of ventilation during isoflurane sedation and anaesthesia in humans. *Can Anaesth Soc J* 30:607-614, 1983
5. Knill RL: Evaluation of arterial oxygenation during anaesthesia. *Can Anaesth Soc J* 32:S16-S19, 1985
6. Comroe JH Jr, Botelho S: The unreliability of cyanosis in the recognition of arterial anoxemia. *Am J Med Sci* 214:1-6, 1947
7. Medd WE, French EB, Wylie VM: Cyanosis as a guide to arterial oxygen desaturation. *Thorax* 14:247-250, 1959
8. Knill RL, Clement JL, Kieraszwicz HT, Dodgson BG: Assessment of two noninvasive monitors of arterial oxygenation in anaesthetized man. *Anesth Analg* 61:582-586, 1982
9. Severinghaus JW, Naifeh KH: Accuracy of response of six pulse oximeters to profound hypoxia. *ANESTHESIOLOGY* 67:551-558, 1987

(Accepted for publication June 2, 1988.)

more, we have had many occasions when the surgeon thought that the blood "looked dark" while the oximeter read 100% saturation. Since both surgeons and anesthesiologists are frequently accustomed to observing hyperoxic blood, any subtle change in color would probably go unnoticed.

We still agree, however, that observing the surgical field is extremely valuable and provides another piece of important data. In addition, we concur that more emphasis should be placed on the sensitivity and specificity of clinical signs and that we must not rely solely on monitors to diagnose desaturation; the oximeter provides an early warning, but it is up to clinicians to integrate the data from the monitors and their own clinical judgment and then take appropriate action.

CHARLES J. COTÉ, M.D.  
Associate Professor of Anaesthesia  
Harvard Medical School;  
Associate Anesthetist  
Massachusetts General Hospital  
Department of Anesthesia  
Massachusetts General Hospital  
Boston, Massachusetts 02114

(Accepted for publication June 2, 1988.)