



Courtesy of Stony Brook University.

Introduction

Jennifer Bain

THE FIELD OF MUSIC THEORY covers a vast array of musical repertoires and theoretical approaches, but browsing through the leading music theory journals, it might seem that few scholars work on music and theory before 1600. Surveying the thirty-year run of the journal *Music Theory Spectrum*, one finds only 23 out of approximately 240 articles that discuss music or theory between ancient Greece and the late sixteenth century. Despite this lack of coverage, I can safely report that the field is thriving and notably has been dominated by more than one generation of very fine female scholars, such as Margaret Bent, Anna Maria Busse Berger, Dorit Tanay, Virginia Newes, Bonnie Blackburn, Elizabeth Aubrey, Marianne Richert Pfau, Suzannah Clarke, Elizabeth Eva Leach, Yolanda Plumley, Rebecca Maloy, and Katelijne Schiltz, as well as the two early music representatives on the faculty of the first Mannes Institute for Advanced Studies in Music Theory, Sarah Fuller and Cristle Collins Judd. Considering the also conspicuous underrepresentation of women in the leading music theory journals and, indeed, in the Society for Music Theory, this convergence of women within the discipline of early music theory and analysis is telling.

In a 2008 session in Nashville that addressed the gender imbalance in the Society for Music Theory, Brenda Ravenscroft, chair of the Committee on the Status of Women, reported that from 2001 to 2007 women represented about 30 percent of the total membership, contrasting significantly with rates for the American Musicological Society and the Society for Ethnomusicology, which reported female membership at 46 percent and 50 percent, respectively (Committee on the Status of Women 2009a, 1). Perhaps more significant to the perception of (in)activity in the field by female members, women's submission rates to *Music Theory Spectrum* and *Music Theory Online*, as well as their acceptance rates, fall well below that 30 percent mark on average (Committee on the Status of Women 2009b). Robert Zierolf's survey of *JMT* as well as *Music Theory Spectrum*, *Music Analysis*, and *Journal of Music Theory Pedagogy*, from their inception until 2008, confirmed this gender imbalance across the field (Committee on the Status of Women 2009a, 2). Much more research needs to be done to

understand the reason for these statistics and how to reverse the trend,¹ but I suspect that one contributing factor might be that many women—though certainly not all—working in the broad field of music theory place themselves outside the mainstream, either by repertory (e.g., early music, popular music, postmodern music) or by approach (engaging in, e.g., interdisciplinary work or feminist theory), which means that they may be publishing elsewhere. Certainly this is true for scholars working on music and theory before 1600; often these specialists publish in early music journals or journals of musicology that seem more receptive to topics that precede the onset of tonality. Indeed, three of the contributors to this volume, despite their engagement with music treatises and their frequent use of sophisticated musical analysis—Aubrey, Maloy, and Newes—have never published in music theory journals, while Judd, Fuller, and I publish equally in music theory and musicology journals. Unlike many music theorists who work in later repertoires, these scholars often move easily between work that leans more toward historical concerns and that which leans toward the theoretical, frequently teaching across these (North American) disciplinary boundaries, as well. This special issue of the *Journal of Music Theory* seeks to address both aspects of underrepresentation by bringing together a sampling of these leading female scholars, while at the same time celebrating one of the field's most distinguished members, Sarah Fuller, who this year—2009—marks her seventieth birthday.

* * *

Born in 1939 in Maine, Sarah Fuller completed her A.B. at Harvard University in 1961, an M.A. at Berkeley in 1963, and her Ph.D. in 1969. Her magisterial 1969 dissertation, 689 pages over three volumes, overturned assumptions set forth by giants in the field, Friedrich Ludwig and Jacques Handschin, about the origin and influence of a corpus of works contained in three manuscripts that had been described as Saint-Martial polyphony, which she redubbed as Aquitanian. (Her dissertation supervisor, Richard Crocker, lamented in print in 1994 that her edition of the music included in the dissertation remained unpublished.) Fuller's ability to identify gaps in argumentation or flawed logic, and to offer correctives and fresh interpretations through meticulous research and analysis, features prominently in all of her output and makes her, moreover, an especially astute reviewer and, as I can attest, a sometimes grueling dissertation supervisor. Fuller has continued the editorial work that she also began in her dissertation (volumes 2 and 3 introduce and present a complete, fully documented edition of Aquitanian polyphony) through her collaboration with Winton Dean on Handel's *Giulio Cesare in Egitto* (1998)

¹ The Society for Music Theory's Committee on the Status of Women has offered a clear set of recommendations for the committee and for the executive of the society to accelerate this process (Committee on the Status of Women 2009, 7–9).

and also through her highly regarded and widely used anthology, *The European Musical Heritage c. 800–c. 1750* (1987a/2004), intended for use in music history surveys. The commentary in the anthology presents not only a historical context for all of the works but also a lucid explanation of theoretical concepts such as mode as it was described in the Middle Ages, and brilliant, illuminating close readings of the music.

Fuller has disseminated the rest of her scholarship through a series of weighty and erudite articles and book chapters. My Latin professor at Stony Brook in 1995–96 told me that he had served on one of the university’s committees that had assessed Fuller’s application for full professor, and that he remembered one of the external evaluators remarking that “many scholars write books that ought to have been articles, but Fuller writes articles that could have been books.” Indeed, her articles are rich and have had a sustained impact on the field. They are cited in countless other articles and books, including in *Grove Music Online*, acknowledging, for example, her contribution to the identification of eleven polyphonic works written successively in Aquitanian manuscripts (Fuller 1971; Hiley 2001; Emerson and Hiley 2001), her debunking of the stability of an *Ars Nova* treatise by Philippe de Vitry (Fuller 1985–86, 1987b; Bent and Wathey 2001), and her successful application of reductive analysis to the music of Machaut (Fuller 1987c, 1992; Bent and Pople 2001). A quick search on Google Books similarly reveals dozens of hits. Perhaps most influential is her pair of articles (1986, 1992) that appeared in this journal, grounding a theory of sonority and the directed progression in fourteenth-century *contrapunctus* theory.² More than a third of the essays in *Machaut’s Music: New Interpretations* make reference to Fuller’s work on Machaut (Leach 2003),³ and Elizabeth Eva Leach in her introduction highlights the importance of Fuller’s contribution to the field, which “has proved (and remains) a particularly important source of scholarly engagement . . . with Machaut’s music” (xiii). At least one master’s thesis and two dissertations use her theories about sonority and the directed progression as a point of departure (Durrani 1996; Bain 2001; Hartt 2007). Perhaps most indicative of her impact, in a 2008 Society for Music Theory paper on “The Analysis of Medieval Polyphony and the Critique of Musicology in the Early Work of Felix Salzer,” graduate student John Koslovsky referred without any further explanation to his “Sarah Fuller–style analysis,” assuming, quite rightly, that the audience knew what he meant.

* * *

Fuller’s contribution to this special issue (which she was unaware was dedicated to her) offers a reassessment of Hucbald of St. Amand’s treatise *Musica*.

2 The centrality of this pair of articles in Fuller’s output and her association with the *Journal of Music Theory*, serving on the board from 1993 through 2008, made it the obvious home for this festschrift.

3 See Boogaart 2003, 20; Hirshberg 2003, 144, 158–60; Leferts 2003, 161–62; Flynn 2003, 176; Berger 2003, 195–96; Bain 2003, 205; and Leech-Wilkinson 2003, 250.

Countering the view that Hucbald's treatment of mode follows a standard formula, she argues that it is Hucbald's preexistent knowledge of mode that underpins his description, rather than Boethian number relationships as has been assumed. Cristle Collins Judd similarly problematizes something previously considered routine: the use of the dialogue format in sixteenth-century music theory treatises. Just as Fuller unravels the role of the musical incipits and examples provided by Hucbald (which she also did so illuminatingly in her 1996 article on Heinrich Glarean's *Dodecachordon*), Judd focuses on the music examples in Thomas Morley's *A Plaine and Easie Introduction*. Examining how the examples are used within the dialogue structure, in the interaction among the characters in the dialogue and between the author and the reader, she posits that Morley carefully designs his examples and their placement to elicit a physical, musical response on the part of the reader.

Rather than focus on internal features of the treatises themselves, the last two articles in the issue examine the application of contemporaneous music theory and its relationship to analysis, as Fuller does so convincingly in her 1986 and 1992 pair of articles in this journal. Exposing the many contradictions in poetry treatises, music treatises, and rubrics in manuscript sources concerning generic identification in the troubadour repertory, Elizabeth Aubrey argues against the widespread use of the "low-style/high-style" dichotomy. She demonstrates persuasively that medieval scholars did not use this conceptual framework, and that the musical elements supposedly associated with these two different styles are not so easy to quantify through musical analysis. My contribution provides a historiographical overview of descriptions of the music of Hildegard of Bingen, which in the twentieth century has been described as standing stylistically outside the chant repertoire of her era, while in the nineteenth century and the early twentieth century scholars recognized just how embedded it was in twelfth-century musical traditions. Starting with a review of David Hiley's association of Hermannus Contractus's theory with his music, I demonstrate how closely aligned Hildegard's musical style is not only with Hermannus's but also with music for the Divine Office that originates in the following few centuries.

Rounding out this issue on early music are two substantial reviews by Rebecca Maloy and Virginia Newes of recent books in the field. Maloy provides a cogent discussion of a long-awaited companion volume to *Music Theory from Zarlino to Schenker* (Damschroder and Williams 1990): *Music Theory from Boethius to Zarlino: A Bibliography and Guide*, by David Russell Williams and C. Matthew Balensuela (2007). Newes assesses Elizabeth Eva Leach's *Sung Birds: Music, Nature and Poetry in the Later Middle Ages* (2007), a book that deals with musical representations of birdsong and contemporaneous medieval theory that engages in discussion about whether or not birdsong is music.

With much affection and gratitude, I offer this issue to an extraordinary mentor and friend, Sarah Fuller.

Works Cited

- Bain, Jennifer Lynne. 2001. "Fourteenth-Century French Secular Polyphony and the Problem of Tonal Structure." Ph.D. diss., State University of New York at Stony Brook.
- . 2003. "Balades 32 and 33 and the 'res dalemangne.'" In *Machaut's Music: New Interpretations*, ed. Elizabeth Eva Leach, 205–19. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music, Tess Knighton and Andrew Wathey, ser. eds. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: Boydell.
- Bent, Ian D. and Anthony Pople. 2001. "Analysis, §II: History, 6. Since 1970." *Grove Music Online*. www.oxfordmusiconline.com. Accessed February 26, 2009.
- Bent, Margaret and Andrew Wathey. 2001. "Vitry, Philippe de [Vitriaco, Vittriaco] 2. Music Theory." *Grove Music Online*. www.oxfordmusiconline.com. Accessed February 26, 2009.
- Berger, Christian. 2003. "Machaut's Balade *Ploures dames* (B32) in the Light of Real Modality." In *Machaut's Music: New Interpretations*, ed. Elizabeth Eva Leach, 193–204. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music, Tess Knighton and Andrew Wathey, ser. eds. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: Boydell.
- Boogaart, Jacques. 2003. "*Speculum mortis*: Form and Signification in Machaut's Motet *He! Mors/ Fine Amour/ Quare non sum mortuus* (M3)." In *Machaut's Music: New Interpretations*, ed. Elizabeth Eva Leach, 13–30. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music, Tess Knighton and Andrew Wathey, ser. eds. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: Boydell.
- Committee on the Status of Women, Society for Music Theory. 2009a. "Addressing the Gender Imbalance: Nashville 2008 Summary Report." societymusictheory.org/administration/committees/women (accessed June 18, 2009).
- . 2009b. "Gender and the SMT: Report on Gender Statistics within the Society for Music Theory." PowerPoint presentation. societymusictheory.org/administration/committees/women (accessed June 18, 2009).
- Crocker, Richard. 1994. "Two Recent Editions of Aquitanian Polyphony." *Plainsong and Medieval Music* 3/1: 57–101.
- Damschroder, David and David Russell Williams. 1990. *Music Theory from Zarlino to Schenker: A Bibliography and Guide*. Harmonologia 4. Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press.
- Durrani, Aaminah O. 1996. "An Analytic Approach to the Three-Voice Motets of Guillaume de Machaut." M.Mus. thesis, University of Houston.
- Emerson, John A. and David Hiley. 2001. "Sources, MS, §II: Western Plainchant, 5. 12th century." *Grove Music Online*. www.oxfordmusiconline.com. Accessed February 26, 2009.
- Flynn, Jane. 2003. "The Intabulation of *De toutes flours* (B31) in the Codex Faenza as Analytical Model." In *Machaut's Music: New Interpretations*, ed. Elizabeth Eva Leach, 175–91. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music, Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: Boydell.
- Fuller, Sarah. 1969. "Aquitanian Polyphony of the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries." Ph.D. diss., University of California, Berkeley.
- . 1971. "Hidden Polyphony: A Reappraisal." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 24/2: 169–92.
- . 1985–86. "A Phantom Treatise of the Fourteenth Century? The *Ars Nova*." *Journal of Musicology* 4/1: 23–50.
- . 1986. "On Sonority in Fourteenth-Century Polyphony: Some Preliminary Reflections." *Journal of Music Theory* 30: 35–70.
- . 1987a. *The European Musical Heritage c. 800–c. 1750*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1987. Revised edition, Boston, Toronto: McGraw-Hill, 2004.
- . 1987b. "Did Philippe de Vitry Write a Treatise *Ars Nova*?" In *L'enseignement de la musique au Moyen-Age et à la Renaissance. Colloque organisé par la Fondation Royaumont en coproduction avec l'ARIMM (Association pour la recherche et l'interprétation des musiques médiévales et le Centre national de la recherche scientifique)*. Asnières-sur-Oise: Royaumont, 29–30.
- . 1987c. "Line, *Contrapunctus* and Structure in a Machaut Song." *Music Analysis* 6/1–2: 37–58.

- . 1992. "Tendencies and Resolutions: The Directed Progression in *Ars Nova* Music." *Journal of Music Theory* 36: 229–58.
- . 1996. "Defending the *Dodecachordon*: Ideological Currents in Glarean's Modal Theory." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 49/2: 191–224.
- Handel, George Frideric. 1998. *Giulio Cesare in Egitto*, ed. Winton Dean and Sarah Fuller. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hartt, Jared Christopher. 2007. "Sonority, Syntax, and Line in the Three-Voice Motets of Guillaume de Machaut." Ph.D. diss., Washington University in St. Louis.
- Hiley, David. 2001. "Sources, MS, §IV: Organum and Discant, 1. General." *Grove Music Online*. www.oxfordmusiconline.com. Accessed February 26, 2009.
- Hirshberg, Jehosh. 2003. "A Portrait of the Lady Who Guards Her Honour (B25)." In *Machaut's Music: New Interpretations*, ed. Elizabeth Eva Leach, 139–60. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: Boydell.
- Koslovsky, John. 2008. "The Analysis of Medieval Polyphony and the Critique of Musicology in the Early Work of Felix Salzer." Conference paper delivered at the annual meeting of the Society for Music Theory, Nashville.
- Leach, Elizabeth Eva, ed. 2003. *Machaut's Music: New Interpretations*. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: Boydell.
- . 2007. *Sung Birds: Music, Nature and Poetry in the Later Middle Ages*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel. 2003. "Rose, lis Revisited." In *Machaut's Music: New Interpretations*, ed. Elizabeth Eva Leach, 249–62. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: Boydell.
- Lefferts, Peter M. 2003. "Machaut's B-flat Balade *Honte, paour* (B25)." In *Machaut's Music: New Interpretations*, ed. Elizabeth Eva Leach, 161–74. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: Boydell.
- Williams, David Russell and C. Matthew Balensuela. 2007. *Music Theory from Boethius to Zarlino: A Bibliography and Guide*. Harmonologia 14. Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon.