

**Discussion: “New First-Order Shear Deformation Plate Theories”**  
**(Shimpi, R. P., Patel, H. G., and Arya, H., 2007, ASME J. Appl. Mech., 74, pp. 523–533)**

**J. G. Simmonds**

ASME Fellow

Department of Civil Engineering,

University of Virginia,

Charlottesville, VA 22904-4742

e-mail: jgs@virginia.edu

This paper joins a host of others, beginning with the seminal papers of Reissner [1,2], that attempt to improve the accuracy of classical (Kirchhoff) plate theory *without* a concomitant refinement of the classical boundary conditions—a refinement that necessitates using the equations of three-dimensional elasticity to examine edge layers whose thicknesses are of the order of the

---

Contributed by the Applied Mechanics Division for publication in the JOURNAL OF APPLIED MECHANICS. Manuscript received August 4, 2007; final manuscript received December 28, 2007; published online May 20, 2008. Review conducted by Robert M. McMeeking.

plate thickness. Without such a refinement, improvements to Kirchhoff’s theory are, in general, illusory, as many authors over the past 50 years have emphasized, especially Goldenveiser. See, for example, Refs. [3–9], where many other relevant references will be found.

Often, authors of “improved” plate theories compare solutions of their equations under simple support either to other theories or to exact three-dimensional elasticity solutions. However, because such solutions are mathematically equivalent to those of an infinite plate under periodic surface loads, no edge layers arise so that such comparisons are virtually useless.

**References**

- [1] Reissner, E., 1944, “On the Theory of Bending of Elastic Plates,” *J. Math. Phys.* (Cambridge, Mass.), **23**, pp. 184–191.
- [2] Reissner, E., 1945, “The Effect of Transverse-Shear Deformation on the Bending of Elastic Plates,” *ASME J. Appl. Mech.*, **12**, pp. A69–A77.
- [3] Goldenveiser, A. L., 1997, “On Approximate Methods for Analyzing Thin Elastic Shells and Plates,” *Mech. Solids*, **32**, pp. 115–126.
- [4] Goldenveiser, A. L., 1995, “Internal and Boundary Calculations of Thin Elastic Bodies,” *J. Appl. Math. Mech.*, **59**, pp. 973–985.
- [5] Wan, F. Y. M., 2003, “Stress Boundary Conditions for Plate Bending,” *Int. J. Solids Struct.*, **40**, pp. 4107–4123.
- [6] Ladevèze, P., and Précastaings, F., 1988, “The Optimal Version of Reissner’s Theory,” *ASME J. Appl. Mech.*, **55**, pp. 413–418.
- [7] Gregory, R. D., and Wan, F. Y. M., 1988, “The Interior Solution for Linear Problems of Elastic Plates,” *ASME J. Appl. Mech.*, **55**, pp. 551–559.
- [8] 1985, *Local Effects in the Analysis of Structures*, P. Ladevèze, ed., Elsevier, Amsterdam.
- [9] Simmonds, J. G., 1976, “Recent Advances in Shell Theory,” *Advances in Engineering Science*, Proceedings 13th Annual Meeting Society of Engineering Science, NASA CP-2001, pp. 617–626.