

recorded. The book is based entirely on printed works most of which are secondary materials rather than primary sources. Even the selection of secondary works is inadequate. The section on the Díaz dictatorship, for example, contains no reference to the multi-volume *Historia moderna de México* edited by Daniel Cosío Villegas. Stanley R. Ross and Charles C. Cumberland are notably absent from the footnotes on the Madero chapter. Although Juan Barragán Rodríguez' two-volume *Historia del ejército y de la revolución constitucionalista* is cited in the bibliography, there is no textual evidence of its having been used. None of the documentary volumes edited by Isidro Fabela was consulted. As the author readily acknowledges in her footnotes, the newspapers and other documents mentioned in the text are taken from other secondary works.

Unfortunately the book is also replete with typographical errors and misspellings of Spanish names. Accents are haphazard. A sampling from the first third of the book will suffice: clery for clergy (p. 2); Flores Migón (p. 34); Otilio Montaña for Montañó (throughout); Ciudad Juárez (p. 75); Oroszco (p. 78); Tlalteloco for Tlatelolco (p. 85); Heurta (p. 87); Dorsal for Dozal (p. 92); Ochau for Ochoa (p. 93); Manuel Choa for Manuel Chao (p. 95); Panfilo Natero for Pánfilo Natera (p. 101); Benavidas for Benavides (p. 111); Benjamin Argumeda for Benjamín Argumedo (p. 109). Academic nit-picking? Perhaps, but when errors of this kind appear in such profusion, the conscientious reader can properly question the care with which the entire project was undertaken.

This book presents in reasonably acceptable form information which cannot be found between any other single set of covers. Perhaps its contribution lies here. The Mexicanist will still do much better, however, to direct his English reading student to Ross, Cumberland, and Quirk for the early Revolution, to Dulles for the middle years, and to Cline for the period since 1940.

University of Nebraska

MICHAEL C. MEYER

*Pershing's Mission in Mexico.* By HALDEEN BRADY. El Paso, 1966. Texas Western Press. Illustrations. Notes. Pp. xvii, 82. \$5.00.

Haldeen Brady is a well-known professor of literature, and is a recognized authority on the folklore that has grown up about Pancho Villa. In his little history of the punitive expedition of 1916 he has produced a vivid, well-written narrative. His research has been careful, and he traces accurately the American movements and operations and the principal events.

There are, however, certain statements and inferences that are open to question or subject to categorical denial. He states, for example, that "Pershing agreed not to use the railroads of Mexico to supply his forces. . . ." The fact is that Pershing was anxious to use the railroads and to seize them if necessary. But he was bound by orders from Washington—and Pershing was never insubordinate. As for the inference that Pershing himself may have made the decision to retain the expedition in Mexico, little need be said. Such a decision was far beyond his authority, and could be made only in Washington, as anyone familiar with the administration of the United States Army will realize instantly.

The inference that throwing away sabers was general throughout the expedition is unsupported by any evidence. Some organizations did not carry sabers into Mexico, while others retained them to the end. If anyone deliberately threw away weapons it was probably semi-trained recruits, of which the expedition had a large number. It might be added that any soldier who "lost" a saber probably found it noted on his next payday. As for the remarks about the precautions that frightened Mexican women took to avoid rape by the Americans, several veterans of the expedition (all of them enlisted men) have informed the reviewer that they never heard of such a thing.

The strictures on the McClellan saddle sound strange to an old cavalryman and also the statement that the American horses were mostly half-bred animals from Fort Reno, Oklahoma. According to the reviewer's memory (which could be wrong in this instance), the government remount-breeding stations were not established until after World War I. In fact until the horse cavalry was finally abolished, nearly all of the horses were purchased in the open market by the Quartermaster Corps.

Although Braddy's research was careful and conscientious, he seems to have overlooked what is probably the most important American source of material, the Punitive Expedition Records in the National Archives. These records include such important items as General Pershing's personal notebooks, carried in the campaign, the actual correspondence (with blood stains) that passed between Captain Boyd and General Gómez before the Carrizal fight, and numerous other documents essential to an understanding of the American cause.

In spite of the foregoing criticisms the book is a valuable contribution to the historical literature on the expedition. Braddy has rendered the historian a distinct service by revealing the previously un-

known figure of Elisa Griensen as the probable cause of the explosion at Parral.

Stanford University

C. C. CLENDENEN

*Chihuahua: Storehouse of Storms.* By FLORENCE C. LISTER and ROBERT H. LISTER. Albuquerque, 1966. University of New Mexico Press. Maps. Notes. Glossary. Bibliography. Index. Pp. viii, 360. \$6.50.

The 450-year history of Chihuahua state is outlined from the period of the "indios" (before 1550) through the "Reconstrucción" following the revolutionary period of 1910-1920. Indian warfare, political intrigue, and revolution are traced across the state from the Indian attacks upon Coronado to the last Apache raid in 1927, and from the first Spanish probe northward for gold and souls to the settlement of the Chamizal dispute.

The Listers make no pretense of primary research, but confine themselves to assembling, sorting, and digesting the considerable existing literature. Because it is well annotated and has a good bibliography, the book should make an excellent reference work for the student. But because it compresses almost five hundred years into three hundred and sixty pages, the narrative is sometimes scanty to the point of becoming a bare recitation of names and places. However, it visits many a fascinating bypath of Chihuahua's stormy past.

One of the Listers' best stories is an archaeological anecdote told to illustrate the point that "red tape is a seemingly inexhaustible Mexican commodity and that petty officials love to throw their weight around" (p. 186). In 1907 a Jesuit priest went to a pueblo in Sonora to search for the earthly remains of two priests slain during an Indian uprising in 1632. After an eighteen-day trip by foot and burro the priest learned from the local *comisario* that a civil law prohibited opening graves. An Indian runner was dispatched to obtain permission. After many days of travel over rugged terrain he returned with a document which the commissioner could not read. He recognized the official state seals, however, and so permitted the dig to begin. The headless remains of the two martyrs were eventually exhumed and given a proper burial, almost three centuries after their death.

This anecdote is closely followed by the story of the brief world heavyweight championship bout between Bob Fitzsimmons and Pete Maher in 1896, staged on a large, flat rock projecting from the Mexican side of the Río Grande while the audience sat in seats located in