

DISCUSSION

D. Godfrey²

I support the authors' deduction that there is no abrasion in fretting wear. In microscopic observation of fretting action between transparent materials and steel and studies of metal-metal fretting scars, I have never observed abrasion as evidenced by a furrow cut by a particle or an agglomerate of particles. In the case of steel, $\alpha\text{Fe}_2\text{O}_3$ appears to be sheared off the surface and smeared about in the apparent area of contact. In advanced unlubricated fretting of steel, the metal surfaces appear to be completely separated by thick films of oxide.

However, there are two questions about the absence of abrasion that the authors might discuss. Archard's wear equation is based on metal-to-metal adhesion. If there is no metal-to-metal contact due to thick oxide deposits, why does the equation apply? In lubricated fretting wear, the scars are usually brightly polished metal. Also under the $\alpha\text{Fe}_2\text{O}_3$ in unlubricated fretting the metal is locally polished. Now polishing is commonly thought of as a process of abrasion by small, hard cutting particles. How would the authors account for observed polishing during fretting without abrasion?

Authors' Closure

Dr. Godfrey's comments are clearly relevant. We suspect that Archard's k value of 10^{-4} observed in our fretting tests is basically the characteristic k value for all sliding metals generating oxide particles, while sliding metals generating metal wear particles typically give k values of 10^{-3} or above. Some metal combinations sliding in air (for example low carbon steel against low carbon steel) seem to have two possible wear modes, generating either metal particles or oxide particles. In fretting, only the latter wear mode is encountered.

The polishing phenomenon encountered in fretting may in some cases be produced by fine oxide wear debris. In other cases, it is likely that burnishing, namely material removed on a molecular scale in the absence of abrasive particles, is occurring. Burnishing, of course, can also be produced under ordinary sliding conditions, but Dr. Godfrey's suggestion, that burnishing occurs especially readily under fretting conditions, is worth pursuing.

² Chevron Research Co., Richmond, Calif.

2 Feng, I. M., and Rightmire, B. G., "An Experimental Study of Fretting," *Institution of Mechanical Engineers*, Vol. 170, 1956, pp. 1055-1060.

3 Feng, I. M., and Rightmire, B. G., "The Mechanism of Fretting," *Lubrication Engineering*, June 1953, p. 134.

4 Ward, R., "A Comparison of Reciprocating and Continuous Sliding Wear," *Wear*, Vol. 15, 1970, pp. 423-434.

5 Halliday, J. S., Hirst, W., "The Fretting Corrosion of Mild Steel," *Proceedings, Royal Society of London, Series A*, Vol. 236, 1956, p. 411.

6 Halliday, J. S., "Experimental Investigation of Some Processes Involved in Fretting Corrosion," *Institution of Mechanical Engineers, Conference on Lubrication and Wear*, Oct. 1956, pp. 640-646.

7 Tomlinson, G. A., Thorpe, P. L., and Gough, H. J., "An Investigation of the Fretting Corrosion of Closely Fitting Surfaces," *Proceedings, Institution of Mechanical Engineers*, Vol. 141, No. 3, 1939, p. 223.

8 Charney, H., "Fundamentals of Interfacial Slip Damping," MS thesis, Department of Mechanical Engineering, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, June 1970.

9 Aoki, S., Fujiwara, T., Furukawa, I., "Fretting of Bearing Steel by Rolling Contact," *Bulletin of the Japan Society of Precision Engineering*, Vol. 2, No. 3, 1947, pp. 238-245.

10 Feng, I. M., Uhlig, H. H., "Fretting Corrosion of Mild Steel in Air and Nitrogen," *JOURNAL OF APPLIED MECHANICS*, Vol. 21, 1954, pp. 395-400.

11 Uhlig, H. H., "Mechanism of Fretting Corrosion," *JOURNAL OF APPLIED MECHANICS*, Vol. 21, *Trans ASME*, Vol. 86, 1954, p. 401.

12 Godfrey, D., and Bailey, J. M., "Coefficient of Friction and Damage to Contact Area During the Early Stages of Fretting," National Advisory Committee for Aeronautics, TN3011, Sept. 1953.

13 Archard, J. F., and Hirst, W., "The Wear of Metals Under Unlubricated Conditions," *Proceedings, Royal Society of London, Series A*, Vol. 236, 1956, p. 397.

14 Rabinowicz, E., *Friction and Wear of Materials*, Wiley, New York, 1965, p. 157.

15 McDowell, J. R., "Fretting of Hardened Steel in Oil," *TRANS. AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LUBRICATION ENGINEERS*, Vol. 1, No. 2, 1958, pp. 287-295.

16 Rabinowicz, E., "Friction and Wear of Metals," *Metals Engineering Quarterly*, 1, No. 2, 1967, pp. 4-8.

17 Rabinowicz, E., "Advances in Wear-Resistant Materials," *AMERICAN SOCIETY OF MECHANICAL ENGINEERS Paper 72-DE-28*.

18 Mindlin, R. D., Mason, W. P., Osmer, T. F., and Deresiewicz, H., "Effects of an Oscillating Tangential Force on the Contact Surfaces of Elastic Spheres," *Proceedings First National Congress of Applied Mechanics*, 1952, p. 203.

19 Johnson, K. L., "Surface Interaction Between Elastically Loaded Bodies Under Tangential Forces," *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series A*, Vol. 230, July 12, 1955, p. 531.

20 Rabinowicz, E., *Friction and Wear of Materials*, Wiley, New York, 1965, p. 169.