

Hanan al-Cinema

AFFECTIONS FOR THE
MOVING IMAGE



LAURA U. MARKS



Hanan al-Cinema

Leonardo

Roger F. Malina, Executive Editor

Sean Cubitt, Editor-in-Chief

From Technological to Virtual Art, Frank Popper, 2007

META/DATA: A Digital Poetics, Mark Amerika, 2007

Signs of Life: Bio Art and Beyond, Eduardo Kac, 2007

The Hidden Sense: Synesthesia in Art and Science, Cretien van Campen, 2007

Closer: Performance, Technologies, Phenomenology, Susan Kozel, 2007

Video: The Reflexive Medium, Yvonne Spielmann, 2007

Software Studies: A Lexicon, Matthew Fuller, 2008

Tactical Biopolitics: Art, Activism, and Technoscience, edited by Beatriz da Costa and Kavita Philip, 2008

White Heat Cold Logic: British Computer Art 1960–1980, edited by Paul Brown, Charlie Gere, Nicholas Lambert, and Catherine Mason, 2008

Rethinking Curating: Art after New Media, Beryl Graham and Sarah Cook, 2010

Green Light: Toward an Art of Evolution, George Gessert, 2010

Enfoldment and Infinity: An Islamic Genealogy of New Media Art, Laura U. Marks, 2010

Synthetics: Aspects of Art and Technology in Australia, 1956–1975, Stephen Jones, 2011

Hybrid Cultures: Japanese Media Arts in Dialogue with the West, Yvonne Spielmann, 2012

Walking and Mapping: Artists as Cartographers, Karen O'Rourke, 2013

The Fourth Dimension and Non-Euclidean Geometry in Modern Art, revised edition, Linda Dalrymple Henderson, 2013

Illusions in Motion: Media Archaeology of the Moving Panorama and Related Spectacles, Erkki Huhtamo, 2013

Relive: Media Art Histories, edited by Sean Cubitt and Paul Thomas, 2013

Re-collection: Art, New Media and Social Memory, Richard Rinehart and Jon Ippolito, 2014

Biopolitical Screens: Image, Power, and the Neoliberal Brain, Pasi Väliäho, 2014

The Practice of Light: A Genealogy of Visual Technologies from Prints to Pixels, Sean Cubitt, 2014

The Tone of Our Times: Sound, Sense, Economy, and Ecology, Frances Dyson, 2014

The Experience Machine: Stan VanDerBeek's Movie-Drome and Expanded Cinema, Gloria Sutton, 2014

Hanan al-Cinema: Affections for the Moving Image, Laura U. Marks, 2015

See <http://mitpress.mit.edu> for a complete list of titles in this series.

Hanan al-Cinema

Affections for the Moving Image

Laura U. Marks

**The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England**

© 2015 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

This book was set in Stone Sans and Stone Serif by Toppan Best-set Premedia Limited. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available.

ISBN: 978-0-262-02930-8

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

In loving memory of Jack Diamond (1928–2014) and Aida Kaouk (1946–2006)

Contents

Series Foreword ix
Acknowledgments xi

Introduction 1

- 1 Cinematic Friendships: Intercessors, Collectives, Perturbations 23
- 2 The Language of Terrorism: Elia Suleiman's Film Practice 59
- 3 Arab Cinema Unfolds 69
- 4 Mohamed Soueid's Cinema of Immanence 83
- 5 Communism, Dream Deferred 97
- 6 Can Cinema Slow the Flow of Blood? 135
- 7 Asphalt Nomadism 147
- 8 Archival Romances 171
- 9 Hala Elkoussy: Framing Chaos 217
- 10 Hassan Khan: The Social Contract 223
- 11 Mounir Fatmi: Protective Aniconism 231
- 12 Algorithm, Decryption, Glitch 239
- 13 Images in Motion, from Haptic Vision to Networked Space 275
- 14 Sherif El Azma: A Cinema of Cruelty 299
- 15 What Can a Body Do? 307

Distributors 345
Notes 347
Index 383

Series Foreword

Leonardo/International Society for the Arts, Sciences, and Technology (ISAST)

Leonardo, the International Society for the Arts, Sciences, and Technology, and the affiliated French organization Association Leonardo have some very simple goals:

1. To advocate, document and make known the work of artists, researchers, and scholars developing the new ways that the contemporary arts interact with science and technology and society.
2. To create a forum and meeting places where artists, scientists, and engineers can meet, exchange ideas, and, where appropriate, collaborate.
3. To contribute, through the interaction of the arts and sciences, to the creation of the new culture that will be needed to transition to a sustainable planetary society.

When the journal *Leonardo* was started some forty-five years ago, these creative disciplines existed in segregated institutional and social networks, a situation dramatized at that time by the “two cultures” debates initiated by C. P. Snow. Today we live in a different time of cross-disciplinary ferment, collaboration, and intellectual confrontation enabled by new hybrid organizations, new funding sponsors, and the shared tools of computers and the Internet. Above all, new generations of artist-researchers and researcher-artists are now at work individually and in collaborative teams bridging the art, science, and technology disciplines. For some of the hard problems in our society, we have no choice but to find new ways to couple the arts and sciences. Perhaps in our lifetime we will see the emergence of “new Leonardos,” hybrid creative individuals or teams that will not only develop a meaningful art for our times but also drive new agendas in science and stimulate technological innovation that addresses today’s human needs.

For more information on the activities of the Leonardo organizations and networks, please visit our websites at <http://www.leonardo.info> and <http://www.olats.org>.

Roger F. Malina

Executive editor, Leonardo Publications

ISAST governing board of directors: Nina Czegledy, Greg Harper, Marc Hebert (Chair), Gordon Knox, Roger Malina, Tami Spector, Darlene Tong

Acknowledgments

A book so long in the making relies on the support of a lot of people. The friends and colleagues who have helped me in numerous ways over these years are far too many to list, but I must warmly thank Tarek El-Ariss, Samirah Alkassim, Vatche Boulghourjian, Shady Elnoshokaty, Hani Hajj, Mireille Kassar, Aida Kaouk, Peter Limbrick, Dorit Naaman, Denise Oleksijczuk, Bernadette Phan, Walid Ra'ad, Grahame Weinbren, Akram Zaatari, and Farid Zahi, each of whom has inspired, supported, and encouraged me in more ways than I can say. As well as these friends I thank Touda Bouanani, Mia Jankowicz, Vincent Melilli, Ania Szremiski, and William Wells for going out of their way to put me in contact with artists and works. It wasn't easy to get hold of the rare films and artworks that I explore in this book. I cannot thank here all the programmers who brought them to audiences of which I was fortunate to be part, but I must acknowledge Coco Fusco and Steve Gallagher, Nat Muller, Jack Persekian, Jayce Salloum, Rasha Salti, and Christine Tohme. The wonderful organizations that gave me access to the works in their collections include Ashkal Alwan, Beirut; Beirut DC; the Beirut Art Center; the Cinémathèque de Tanger; Docudays, Beirut; the DOXA festival, Vancouver; DOX BOX, Damascus; and the distributors Arab Film Distribution, Video Data Bank, and V-Tape.

To think about these unusual movies, it helps to show them to others, and so I am most grateful to the numerous organizations that invited me to show programs of experimenting Arab cinema and learn from their audiences over these many years. Warm thanks as well to the students who have watched these works with me, some of whom are mentioned in the footnotes: their responses and insights inform, surprise, and delight me. I thank the many editors who worked with me over the years as I published earlier forays into this work; they are named in the relevant chapters. My kind and patient Arabic teachers over these many years also have my deepest gratitude. Thanks to my fabulous research assistants Elysia Bourne, Matthew MacLellan, Fay Nass, and Daisy Thompson.

At MIT Press I thank Doug Sery and the editorial staff who shepherded this book with such care, Susan Buckley and Marcy Ross; it was also a pleasure to work with

copy editor Beverly Miller and designer Margarita Encomienda. Thank you, anonymous reviewers for the Press, for both your enthusiasm and criticism.

I gratefully acknowledge the financial support of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada and, at Simon Fraser University, the Dena Wosk University Professorship.

My three scientist parents, Anne Foerster, Bill Marks, and Jack Diamond, have always supported and inspired me; I can never thank them enough. Finally, Richard Mark Coccia has given me not only all the support and encouragement one could ever hope for from a spouse, but also a cinephilic sensitivity and love of the written word that have improved this book greatly.

Introduction

Hanan al-cinema means the sympathy, fondness, or affection of cinema and also our fondness for the cinema. This book's subtitle, "affections for the moving image," translates the title and hints at the way moving images and sounds affect our bodies, a theme that is important in much of this book. *Hanan al-Cinema: Affections for the Moving Image* embraces some of the works that have affected me over the past twenty years or so, transmits to you, my readers, these works' creative sympathies with the world and invites you to feel similar affections. I hope to show that works from the Arab world over this period, from the early 1990s to 2014, constitute one of the world's most impressive bodies of experimenting cinema.

"Palestine: The Aesthetics of Exile" was the title of the first film program I ever organized, in Rochester, New York, in 1992, with the hope of bringing people interested in Palestine and people interested in experimental cinema together around a set of rare movies. Works like Mona Hatoum's incantation of a refugee's longing, *Measures of Distance* (1988), Elia Suleiman and Jayce Salloum's bracingly accusatory montage of Orientalist movies, *Muqaddimah Li-Nihayat Jidal (Introduction to the End of an Argument)* (1990), and Michel Khleifi's elegiac *Canticle of the Stones* (1990) challenged representation itself as much as they did the Israeli occupation; they seemed to offer a way of redefining political filmmaking energized by the first intifada of 1987 and upturned by the Lebanese civil war. They were *experimenting*.

One of the local organizations that got involved in the program was the National Association of Palestinian Americans (NAPA). When I gave preview tapes of some of the more experimental works to a committee at NAPA, the committee members didn't like them. They pointed out that the very elements I thought made the films and videos politically rich—the disjunctive narrative styles, the intrusion of the filmmaker's presence, the ambiguity between fiction and documentary, and the pastiche of found footage—diluted their political messages. They wanted positive images of Palestinians, films that tell the story about their situation without ambiguity. It was not that the Palestinians found the works confusing. Rather, they were concerned with how audiences in Rochester, non-Arab audiences, would respond to the films. Their objection

was valid: academics and activists to whom I mentioned the show had expressed astonishment that Palestinian cinema even existed. In response to the committee's criticism, I added a couple of good films that were aesthetically more conventional.

Despite its formidable title, "Palestine: The Aesthetics of Exile" turned out to be a successful event. The five weeks of screenings were a political event based on forming connections: the necessarily incomplete films and videos responded to each other, and people with academic, Arab, art, and activist affiliations exchanged opinions and (in this pre-Internet age) phone numbers. By the last screening, the devoted viewers who came to all or almost all the screenings in the series had witnessed—and by their participation created—a fruitfully complex picture of Palestinian cinema in exile.

"Palestine: The Aesthetics of Exile" was the germ of the unlikely Venn diagram, Arab + Experimental, that I would pursue for the next two decades. I learned from the response to this program, and have continued to learn over the decades since, that that Venn diagram has an enormous power at the same time that it is extremely fragile. The Arab contexts demand creative struggle and invention from artists, so these works don't just adapt existing modes of experimental cinema; they introduce new kinds of experiments that change the shape of cinema as a whole. Yet these brave assays are often dismissed as too difficult, too strange, "not what we need now."

Experimentation

If the term *experimental cinema* makes you think of a genre of formalist and structural works on 16mm film from the 1960s, please stretch your mind to accommodate a vaster notion. Experimental cinema, or, more broadly, experimental media art, includes films and videos that experiment formally with the medium, from film formats to low-end video formats to HD to mobile and online platforms. It includes experiments, drawn from critiques of cinema and TV, with sound, montage, structure, reflexivity, and other means. It experiments with the relationship between fiction and documentary, in questions about truth, presence, index, and performance. Indeed some of the richest experimentation works with performativity, treating cinema as an event, from the pro-filmic act to the act of reception. Experimentation also regards content: experimental narrative, essay films, experimental documentary, certain political work. Most experimental cinema is doing philosophy: dealing with epistemology, what we can know; ontology, what is real or true; and phenomenology, what our perceptions can tell us about the world, to name a few. A negative definition is whatever doesn't fit into standards for commercially viable fiction and documentary. Yet the best narrative feature films contain experimental moments.

The works I examine in this book are experiments in two senses: they carry out experiments or try things out, and they are experiential, or based on experience. In both ways, experimentation cuts through convention and gets close to something

newly emerging, to life itself. This double sense of experiment and experience is more familiar to the Arabic word *tajriba*, like the French *expérience*, than it is to the English *experiment*: one can speak in Arab of *sînemâ tajribî* with that double sense of experiment and experience (though it tends to connote experimental film of the 1960s and 1970s).¹ Some of these experimenting strategies are shared by filmmakers and video artists all over the world, while others arise from economic, social, political, and historical circumstances particular to Arab countries.

In the early 1990s, some artists and filmmakers from the Arab world and its diaspora began to depart from narrative fiction and documentary cinema and work in explicitly experimental ways. The Palestinian films and videos mentioned above (among others at that time) were deconstructing political systems of naming and practicing new, stuttering kinds of speech; they were establishing new first principles from the givens of sense experience. A bit later, in the mid-1990s, some extremely intelligent works that we could call experimental documentary appeared in Lebanon. The Taif Agreement of 1989 had concluded the Lebanese civil war without a Truth and Reconciliation Commission, making official the divergence (in Deleuzian terms, impossibility) of accounts of the war. The Lebanese, having barely survived a devastating sixteen-year civil conflict, needed the very finest of philosophical and creative tools in order to try to address what happened. These films and videos by Walid Ra'ad, Eliane Raheb, Jocelyne Saab, Mohamed Soueid, Rania Stephan, Jalal Toufic, Akram Zaatari, and others, drawing on earlier inspirations like the work of Marwan Bagdadi and Borhane Alaouie, experimented not just formally but epistemologically. We can recognize the critical thought of Michel Foucault, Walter Benjamin, and Antonio Gramsci in these works. But most of all, they were distinguished by the artists' invention of methods based on the problems at hand. These were experiments that mattered more than almost any I had seen.

Experiments were occurring across the Arab world, and more and more people began to have access to the means to make these experiments audiovisual. The fact that most of this work is noncommercial gives the makers a great deal of liberty, though it also limits their audience. In Egypt, the large commercial film industry ironically diminished opportunities to experiment with form and address, but this has changed, especially since artists began to work in video in the early 1990s. In Syria, filmmakers and videomakers began to produce some astonishingly radical works, with and without government sanction. North African artisanal film and video, often made by artists educated or working in France, has considerable freedom to experiment. Iraqi filmmakers, in that country and in exile, have made fiery experimental documentaries. Works from the Gulf countries, relatively new to film and media art production, indicate the ways these countries' wealth and conservatism restrict cinematic experiments, but those same qualities may give rise to new forms. And of course filmmakers and artists living away from their home countries are in unique positions to experiment.

Arab Affection-Images, Time-Images, and Enfolded Images

In these experiments, we witness a kind of eruptive power. In the Arab world in the late twentieth century, political pressures, fraught histories, divergent narratives, and competing notions of where the truth is founded and can be found (in memory? in the archive? in the body?) created a crucible that practically demanded experimentation. We can characterize some of these works according to Gilles Deleuze's concepts of images that create within a gap. The affection-image (a concept adapted from Henri Bergson) occupies the gap between perception and action; this is usually a brief moment for the organism because it is easy to deduce and effect a course of action based on what is perceived. But when action cannot be taken, the affection-image dilates; affection becomes passion, an agitated state of passive activity or active passivity. This moment of suspension can give rise to what Deleuze calls the time-image, images produced in creatively widened circuits of perception, memory, dream, and imagination. The affection-image suspends qualities that might become the basis for reactive acts and instead makes them vibrate with the potential for new kinds of acts, feelings, or perceptions. The time-image elevates the incapacity to act to a high creative principle that allows any image to connect with any other.²

The state of creative and painful suspension that these images describe characterizes a great deal of contemporary Arab intellectual culture. Many Arabs have detailed knowledge of both Arab and Western history and a keen awareness of the current circumstances of their society and its relations with others. They can parse the political significance of extremely local or seemingly slight events with stunning acuteness. Those who can afford higher education also often possess both a local and a Western or Western-style education.

Yet in recent decades, this capacity to perceive and to know has not been matched by a capacity to act. This has occurred for historical and geographical reasons. The political events of the twentieth century—colonization, the division of Arab lands, the imposition of Israel and dispossession of Palestinians, the U.S. invasions of Iraq on slim or fabricated justifications, and other neoimperialist acts—combine to create a feeling of powerlessness with regard to outsiders' strategic interest in the Arabic-speaking lands. Appealing to justice makes little difference, given that international law has little effect: Israel continually flouts United Nations resolutions, and in 2003 the United States and United Kingdom illegally invaded Iraq on fabricated grounds that it held weapons of mass destruction.

Furthermore, Arabs know their governments are more or less corrupt and unresponsive, so that civic organization has seemed little more than symbolic. The 2011 Arab Spring uprisings in Tunisia, Egypt, Libya, Bahrain, and, to most tragic result, Syria challenged Arab governments to respond. Surely the efforts of organized and, in Libya

and Syria, armed citizens will leave a permanent mark on those nations, but in Syria, the citizen uprisings of the war's first months were eclipsed by the powers of a tenacious tyrant and a Medusa-headed racket of armed fundamentalists. After the successes of the 2011 protests in Tahrir Square, Egyptians howled in protest in summer 2012 at the calculatedly meager roster of presidential candidates offered them; witnessed the imprisonment of elected president Mohammed Morsi and the military-led massacre of his supporters from the Muslim Brotherhood in July and August 2013; and since the July 2014 election of president Abdel Fattah el-Sisi are dealing with a status quo even worse than the one the Tahrir protesters risked their lives to oppose.³ Egypt's new military government permits military trials of civilians, imprisons journalists on the lightest of pretexts, and bans protests not sanctioned by security authorities, practically guaranteeing that the arts of protest will need to take covert forms.

The Lebanese writer Samir Kassir characterized this feeling of incapacity at the point it had reached after the Iraq War of 2003:

Powerlessness to be what you think you should be. Powerlessness to act to affirm your existence, even merely theoretically, in the face of the Other, who denies your right to exist, despises you and has once again reasserted his domination over you. Powerlessness to suppress the feeling that you are no more than a lowly pawn on the global chessboard even as the game is being played in your backyard. This feeling, it has to be said, has been hard to dispel since the first Iraq war, when Arab land once again came under foreign occupation and the era of independence was relegated to a parenthesis.⁴

Kassir wrote this in 2004. He was assassinated in 2005, possibly by Syrian agents.⁵ His words have continued to ring true in the aftermath of the attempted revolutions that began in 2011, especially in Egypt and Syria, where the people's uprisings could not match the power of their states given the political and financial intervention by the United States, the Gulf countries, Iran, Russia, and other countries.

A diagnosis similar to Kassir's could be made of other places in the world where people struggle against colonialism, neoimperialism, and internal corruption, but it has probably been true of the Arab world for longer than anywhere else. What feeling of resentment could be more justified—where, as Nietzsche said, resentment is the action of those who are not free? Experiments are free acts, not reactive acts: they gain the power to affect others to the degree that they harness active forces.⁶ Resentment, by contrast, prickles from actual and invented slights, intensifying itself in a feedback loop. It feeds conspiracy theories and turns the closest allies against each other. In the 1960s the Egyptian sociologist Anouar Abdel Malek posited the Nietzschean argument that Arabs were animated by a resentment that autonomy and political self-determination would heal.⁷ But since that time, the conditions that inculcate resentment have worsened.

Kassir does not date this affect of powerlessness to the crushing defeat of the Six-Day War of 1967. Why not? The war put an end to the creative rejuvenation of the long twentieth-century cultural renaissance, or *nahda*, as well as to pan-Arab nationalism. Arab intellectual and cultural production since 1967, despite its profound sadness, has bristled with the resurgence of critical thought, dry-eyed and devoid of the comforts of ideology. In 1968, before there was an independent Arab film movement, the great Syrian playwright Saadallah Wannous set a powerful example of critical creative practice in light of Arab leaders' ideological bankruptcy. His play *Soirée for the Fifth of June* (1968), drawing deep not only on Brechtian critique and Beckettian absurdity but also on the nested narrative structure familiar from Arabic literature, stages a failed attempt to depict and explain the events of the disastrous Six-Day War. The Playwright refuses to deliver a script. The Director invents victories to attribute to the regime, which the Actors reject. Spectator characters ask, "Why have we cut off our tongues?" Even the attempt to replace the play with a folkloric dance collapses under the audience's criticism—in a dynamic similar to the censorious responses of both Arab and Western audiences that I discuss below.⁸ Wannous demonstrates the cruel choreography of state repression, humiliation, and despair that push many people into the arms of fundamentalist religion and other opiates, when rigorous historical critique is both the most difficult and the most necessary path that Arabs need to take, in a play that was immediately banned.

Given that Arab societies have continued to face the same problems in the subsequent decades, including and since the 2011 uprisings, Wannous's work is a precedent for the most visionary and caustic works I discuss in this book. He was a longtime friend of Omar Amiralay, one of the founding voices of radical Arab cinema.⁹ At one point, two of the Spectator characters look into a mirror and see no reflection; one says, "Because we are erased images, images that were erased by the national interest before they had fully formed."¹⁰ Creativity springs from the ardent desire, as well as the responsibility, to create one's own image despite the massive odds.

Wannous's caustic absurdism is one of the strongest examples of the many great literary, artistic, and intellectual creations that were impelled by the terrible defeat of 1967.¹¹ However, Kassir, writing in 2004, dates the feeling of powerlessness he is describing to the first Gulf War of 1990–1991. He is describing a new affect, a deep disillusionment and disgust that are not even powered by solidarity in defeat. It is not as cleanly tragic, if I may put it that way, as the post-1967 feeling of defeat across the Arab world. Tarek El-Ariss identifies this new affect in a literary approach that has supplanted the culture of the post-1967 "generation of defeat." This new approach, which he identifies in Ahmed Alaidy's novel *An Takun 'Abbas Al-'Abd* (Being 'Abbas Al-'Abd, 2003), "is no longer concerned with being suspended between present and future, but rather engages the present as something that just *is*, a flickering, regenerating moment that appears, disappears and reappears."¹² El-Ariss argues that

unlike the reader of the “literature of Defeat” who is conjured up as a participant in a historical struggle, seeking to mend the break between the Arab past and future after 1967, Alaidy’s reader is interpellated as the subject of an immediate experience inscribed in the body and expressed in the affects of frustration, anger, and sabotage.¹³

I extrapolate El-Ariss’s argument to suggest that it is even more difficult now than it was after 1967 to believe in a meaningful course of historical self-determination, especially one that is worldly rather than religious. The most rational response would be to inhabit the present without expectation—and anybody who has tried to meditate knows how difficult that is.

Those self-destructive affects El-Ariss describes also press out of the screen toward the viewer in some of the works I discuss in this book. Joyful affects arise too, and sometimes it takes a while to know which is which. They suggest that to get out of a bad situation, you have to plunge into its depths. Apparent diletantism or frivolity, seeming not to care, can be an effective way for creativity to sneak up. With a slight shift of energy, apathy converts into play, possessing a speculative lightness that might survive where more earnest attempts get bogged down under the weight of good intentions and ideology. I try to cultivate embodied responses in myself and the reader, so that we may accompany the films on their creative passage through the body: this approach and its findings are the subject of chapter 15.

As Kassir reminds us, “The contemporary Arab malaise is just a historical moment, not a destiny.”¹⁴ In order to avoid fatalism and keep thinking historically, you need to try to include your body in the chain of causes and effects, as Spinoza urged. Creative experiments, then, arise from feelings of powerlessness that are in many ways accurate diagnoses of the historical situation. The incapacity to act intensifies the conditions of creativity. It presses Arab artists to perceive even more keenly, inform themselves even more precisely, plunge into public archives and private memory, dream, fantasize, and invent. Moreover, when the feeling of incapacity moves through the body—when either the film or the viewer really owns that feeling of powerlessness—reaction and resentment disperse and give way to free acts.

These decades of struggle have given rise to Arab affection-images and Arab time-images that are some of the most potent artistic achievements of our time. These emergent images are gifts to the entire world, for Arab artists are in a position to see what the rest of the world cannot see. Creative communities and alliances all across the Arab world support and nurture these acts, as chapter 1 details.

Another way to conceive of Arab creativity in the face of the historical events of the past century is in terms of Jalal Toufic’s influential concept of the “withdrawal of tradition after a surpassing disaster.”¹⁵ As Theodor Adorno stated that there could be no poetry after Auschwitz, so Toufic argues that the series of tragedies in the Arab world amount to a surpassing calamity, encompassing “both material destruction and immaterial withdrawal,” after which simple representation is impossible. This concept is

grounded in Shi'ite mysticism: after the murder of Imam 'Ali's son Hussein at Karbala in 680, the true meaning of the Quran was occulted because there would no longer be a spiritual leader on earth until the coming of the Mahdi, or quasi-Messiah. In contemporary times, Toufic argues, it means that art's task is to reveal the withdrawal of what we think is still there. The withdrawal of tradition after a surpassing disaster prescribes an art that is radically aniconic or even iconoclastic, a black hole where images used to be.

Slightly different from Toufic's argument, in a secular version of some strands of Shi'ite thought, as well as that of Deleuze, Leibniz, and others, I consider that lost, dead, forgotten, and otherwise inaccessible beings and events are *enfolding*. The past persists, enfolding, in virtual form, and some of its facets may unfold to some degree in the present. Acknowledging artists' ability to invent and create from almost nothing, I prefer to endow the concept of withdrawal with fluidity—to acknowledge different manners of unfolding, of which aniconism, or complete enfolding, is only one.

Toufic writes that the attempt to record things whose referent is withdrawn is a vicious circle: "What has to be recorded has been withdrawn, so that, unless it is resurrected, it is going to be overlooked; but in order to accomplish that prerequisite work of resurrection to avoid its overlooking, one has initially to have, however minimally, perceived it; that is countered its withdrawal, i.e. resurrected it."¹⁶ This paradoxical condition suggests that art needs to receive some kind of flash, some little seed, of what has been withdrawn in order to show that it is withdrawn. I suggest that it is possible, with patience and devotion, to unfold some aspect, some seed, of what has been forgotten or repudiated or is too unbearable to behold. From these seeds it may be possible, not to revive the past, but to quicken new kinds of growth.

There are many manners of unfolding: some of them are sternly aniconic or iconoclastic; some of them unfold histories in partial, elastic ways; some of them involve lightness, tenderness, humor, and play. Another form of enfolding is *taqiyya*, dissimulation, long practiced by Muslims who had to hide their minority faith: a way of saying one thing while meaning another. *Taqiyya* invites us to perceive work that seems to be simple or banal as radically enfolding.¹⁷

Experimentation is in a sense prepolitical. Often it does not make political statements, for to do so crams the experiment into a mold whose outcome is known. Rather, in its freedom it creates a foundation and source of strength for political acts. In 2008 Khaled D. Ramadan and Silke Schmicki characterized the current generation of Arab video artists and independent documentary filmmakers as "a resisting generation. It is not necessarily a political resistance and is far from an organized common movement. It is rather a colourful mosaic of individual statements, a diversification of points of view, a playful association of ideas; resistance in the sense of Deleuze's: 'Creating is not communication, but resisting. ... Art is what resists: it resists against death, servitude, infamy, shame.'"¹⁸

So far I have been suggesting that creative experiments arise from sociopolitical malaise. Does this mean that Arab people have to keep suffering so Arab artists can keep making great art? No, it doesn't. I do think that the creative and intellectual ferment in the Arab world now, including the work examined in this book, constitutes a new *nahda*, or cultural revival, in the Arab world. I hope it continues to strengthen and consolidate, to build more ambitious and independent laboratories for its experiments. Some of this ferment has already settled and stratified, producing new genres and marketing categories. Maybe someday Arab life will be so stable on so many fronts that artists will struggle for subject matter, as Western artists often do now.

"Arab"

This book focuses on films and videos from the Arabic-speaking world, a flexible definition that does not essentialize ethnicity or religion. The term *Arab world* is simpler, but some think this excludes North Africa.¹⁹ So the corrective *Arabophone* seemed called for. Then there's *Middle East*, or the shorthand *Mideast*, terms that anchor the world map to Europe and all that lies east and west of it. *Middle East*, rarely employed inside the countries that it designates, is used as a mealy-mouthed metonym for the majority Muslim, oil-producing region from which Israel pokes like a sore thumb. It tends to be shorthand for the Palestinian-Israeli conflict, jihad, and oil. *Middle East* also designates majority-Muslim countries whose language is not Arabic, especially Iran and Turkey. It jumbles together Muslim countries with quite different cultures into a modern Orient.

There's the term *Middle East and North Africa*, with its bland acronym MENA. The map it brings to mind is a Muslim map, as it indicates the early spread of Islam, though it excludes sub-Saharan Africa, South Asia, Islamic Central Asia, and Indonesia. Lazily, *Arab* often stands in for *Muslim* for Westerners, erasing Arabic-speaking Christians and Jews. Most people in the Arabic-speaking world are Muslim, in practice or in heritage. Muslim culture, with its foundation in the Arabic Quran, provides a cohesion among Arabic and non-Arabic speakers. It also informs the identity of Christians and Jews in the region. This book maintains a gap between "Arab" and "Muslim," as many of the Arabic-speaking filmmakers whose work I write about here are not Muslim, and though Islam provides the cultural background for many of the works I discuss, it comes to the fore in only a few of them.

To focus on the Arabic-speaking world, as this book does, designates the large region where people speak and read Arabic, in its many dialects, and its diaspora. Dialects are so different that Arabic speakers from Morocco and Iraq may not understand each other, but they can listen to the same Modern Standard Arabic on the television news, in political speeches, and in poetry. The Arabic language designates an "imagined community," in Benedict Anderson's term, indicating shared history, knowledge, and

culture. The Arabic-speaking world also includes Israel. A friend reminds me, “Israel is an Arabic-speaking country; in fact it’s the only country in the world where Arabic is the second official language.”²⁰

This book ascribes national origins to filmmakers, but most of the Arabic-speaking nations are colonial constructions. In our time, “Arab” designates the political history of a region that has been violently transformed by Western imperial intervention, culminating (but by no means ending) in the imposition of the state of Israel. In the nineteenth century, the Ottoman Empire, though weakening, still loosely united a large region that included most of the Arabic-speaking world: the Levant (now Syria, Lebanon, Israel, and Iraq), the eastern border of the Red Sea (now Saudi Arabia and Yemen), and North Africa with the exception of the sultanate of Morocco. The Ottoman Empire maintained a loose and expansive unity among people of different languages and faiths. European nations invaded the region in search of agricultural land, minerals, and cheap labor. France colonized Algeria in 1830 and “protected” Tunisia in 1881 and Morocco in 1912; Britain occupied or made agreements with Bahrain in 1881, Egypt in 1882, Oman and Aden in 1891, Sudan and Kuwait in 1899, Qatar in 1916; Italy colonized Libya in 1911.

After World War I, Britain and France, in the Sykes-Picot Agreement, carved the former Ottoman lands into the arbitrarily designated new states of Syria, Lebanon, Palestine, Trans-Jordan, and Iraq. In 1917 Britain broke its promise to the colony of Palestine with Sykes-Picot and the Balfour Declaration. British foreign secretary Arthur Balfour declared support for the establishment of a Jewish homeland in Palestine, saying, “In Palestine we do not propose even to go through the form of consulting the wishes of the present inhabitants of the country.”²¹ The European powers involved in the post-World War I cut-and-paste avoided the seemingly obvious option of designating a single Arab state, likely because such a state would have been too powerful and would have rendered the establishment of Israel difficult or impossible.²²

Despite the fact that the modern Arab world has always been subject to outside powers, first the Ottoman Empire, then the West, the period from the late nineteenth century to World War II witnessed a flowering of political openness and cultural creativity: the first *nahda*. The Tanzimat reforms coming from the Ottoman capital, Mohammed ‘Ali in Egypt and Khayr al-Din in Tunisia, proposed and carried out reforms to modernize and democratize the state. In Arab metropolises, electricity flowed, streetcars clanged, movie houses drew crowds. Arab intellectuals, many educated in Europe, founded movements to democratize government, advocate for political accountability and the rule of law, adapt a Marxist analysis to the Arab situation, enfranchise poor people, educate women, and either secularize the state or define modern reforms in Islamic terms.²³ New art forms flourished, quickly adapting and indigenizing Western literary forms, theater, visual arts, and of course cinema: artists in all of these forms expressed

the new modernist and populist ideals. Like the European Enlightenment, the *nahda* was largely a bourgeois phenomenon, but its expressions, especially in theater and cinema, also touched and changed the lives of poor people.

This first *nahda* survived the abolition of the Ottoman Empire and colonizers' cut-ups of Arab lands. But the recently created and not yet independent Arab nations neighboring Palestine were overwhelmed by the Zionist military coalition, the Haganah, in the war of 1948–1949 that established the state of Israel and killed and displaced the Palestinians, rendering them stateless. This event is referred to as the *nakba*, or disaster. As Kassir points out, the *nakba* was a catastrophe not only because of what happened to Palestine but “because it signified to the Arabs—at least those in the Levant—that foreign rule, which seemed to be on its way out after World War II, was there to stay and that they were as helpless to confront it as they were at the end of the First World War.”²⁴

The independence movements of the 1940s, especially in North Africa, and subsequent nationalist movements defined Arab nations from within. The colonies gained independence after World War II in a staggered series of dates: Libya first, in 1949, while Britain did not relinquish the Gulf region until 1971 when the United Arab Emirates was formed. Of course, “independence” cannot really characterize countries that were economically and politically dependent on their former colonizers. However, the pan-Arabism of Gamal Abdel Nasser, leader of the army officers who took power in Egypt in 1952, and of the Baath (Resurrection) Party, which seized power in Syria and Iraq in 1953, emphasized Arab unity across nations (more on this in chapter 5). The period of pan-Arab nationalism championed by Nasser abruptly halted when Israel trounced Egypt, Jordan, and Syria in the Six-Day War of 1967 and expanded its occupation into Sinai, Jerusalem, Jordan, and the Golan Heights. This war also ended the second *nahda* and inaugurated a period of cultural inwardness and increasing religious fundamentalism.

The disaster of 1948 and the failure of 1967 are sometimes treated as tragedies, as though they were the inevitable outcomes of global hegemony, or a punishment from God. After 1967, all the progress of the *nahda* appeared to be for naught. Bracing critiques counter such fatalism. Syrian philosopher Sadeq Jalal al-Azm, in *Self-Criticism after the Defeat* (1969), critiques the term *nakba*, which implies a natural phenomenon beyond human control.²⁵ Similarly, as Elizabeth Kassab points out, the contemporary Syrian intellectual Yassin al-Haj Saleh deconstructs the notion that the 1967 defeat was a founding event or “original sin”: it was just a historical event.²⁶ We need to see history without teleology, Saleh argues, in order to appreciate the potential of the present as well as the past.

So let us say that a cascade of extremely bad historical events for the Arab world followed, killing and displacing millions of people and all but ruining hopes

for constructive civil society: the Lebanese civil war (1975–1990); the Iran-Iraq war (1980–1988); the Algerian civil war following the scrapped elections of 1992; the catastrophic civil wars in Sudan (1955–1992, 1995–2002), a country that has known more war than peace in its short history; Iraq’s invasion of Kuwait in 1990 and the subsequent first Persian Gulf War; the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001, and the U.S. and U.K.’s opportunistic invasion of Iraq; Israel’s expanding occupation of the Palestinian territories; the breakdown of Libya after its revolution in 2011; the Syrian civil war; and the rise of ISIS and other fundamentalist armies. In short, the Arabic-speaking nations are very young, and in almost all cases scarred from birth by colonial histories, untenable relationships with Israel, and the unfortunate geography that invites foreigners (including other Arabs) to play out their interests in Arab countries.

Not Representing

The Lebanese filmmaker Ghassan Salhab, a deeply cultured, Francophone cinephile, interviewed Jean-Luc Godard for his 2006 film *Brève rencontre avec J-L Godard*. Godard held forth on the thesis he introduced in *Notre musique* (2004) that Israelis make fiction, Palestinians make documentary, and all the films are bad because they don’t bring these categories together. Salhab rejoined, “*Quand on filme au Liban, on dit le réel et le fiction: la frontière est tout de suite poreuse*” (When we film in Lebanon, we say the real and fiction: the border is porous right away). But Godard, rather than recognizing that Lebanese filmmakers have learned his lessons for themselves, interrupted Salhab and continued to talk about Israeli films and Palestinian films. His discourse was clever, but evidently when Godard heard “Lebanon,” he thought “Palestine.” And if the great Jean-Luc Godard, with his linguistic rigor and principled activist stance, conflates the entire Arab world with Palestine-Israel, how much easier it is for other Westerners to do so.

For such reasons, this book dwells lightly on the many works that deal with the relationship between the Palestinians and Israel. Other writers have covered these works well. The history of that relationship deeply defines the politics and culture of the Arabic-speaking world. But it seems that people reflexively look to Palestinians to reflect on it, when Syrian, Lebanese, Egyptian, and other filmmakers offer valuable analyses of the history of Israel in the region.

Furthermore, this book turns slightly away from politics altogether. For decades Arab filmmakers and artists have been asked to speak about politics, or their work has been seen solely in terms of political issues. At points Arab cinema has been directly activist and addressed fellow Arabic speakers in the manner of classical “third cinema,” including films of the Algerian-French war, the work of the Palestinian Film Unit from 1968 to 1982, and Lebanese documentaries from the same period engaged in the Palestinian struggle. But within the twenty-year time period this book mostly covers, it is

outsiders who have desired that Arabic cinema be political. Arab filmmakers have been asked to turn westward and explain Arab situations to them.

In part this consultative role has been a laudable turn, a riposte to Western imperialism and Orientalism. It has been motivated by the arguments that ethnography by outsiders serves Western interests, converting knowledge to power—Edward Said's Foucauldian synthesis that arose in the 1970s.²⁷ This synthesis powerfully influenced ethnographic and documentary filmmaking, which incorporated all kinds of reflexive techniques and sought to hear from people who were oppressed in their own words instead of speaking for them. But this sincere and rigorous self-questioning on the part of Westerners often devolved to the lazy assumption (influenced, I suspect, by a bastardized form of the high ethics of Emmanuel Levinas and Jacques Derrida) that since one cannot possibly understand the experience of the other, one should not even try. At the 1991 Robert Flaherty Seminar, after a screening of Suleiman and Salloum's *Introduction to the End of an Argument*, the group gathered after the movie, in Flaherty tradition, to talk about it. A young filmmaker said, "Well I don't speak Palestinian, so I can't say anything about the film." She was blithely using the badge of irreconcilable cultural difference as an excuse for ignorance, to the point of not seeming to know that Palestinians speak Arabic! During the period in which these works were made, cultural sensitivity became an excuse for not doing your homework.

It would be nice to think those days are over. Yet Arab artists, and the independent organizations that support their work, continue to bear the burden of expectation to explain the region to Western audiences. Numerous times Western curators and arts organizers have swooped down on the region looking for palatable and marketable packages of Arab art. Egyptian video artist Hassan Khan deftly skewers the outside pressure on Arabs to explain and represent themselves in his one-and-a-half-minute *Sometime/Somewhere Else* (2001). On the top half of the screen, a young Egyptian earnestly explains his sense of civic duty to some interviewers for Swedish TV. On the bottom half, a teenager wails on a guitar in his bedroom. In between, speeding titles assert that the earnest young man is "a product of a specific situation," while the head-banging youth is "living the fantasies of transmission." The fine young man is "playing games with the outside world"; the guitar wailer is "sometime somewhere else." It is as though being a model citizen, representing yourself and your country to the world, hollows you out, while devoting yourself to creation with no audience keeps you alive by transporting you to a place beyond the geopolitical. The earnest youth speaks of the importance of education, what he would do if he were president, and so on; his voice is overpowered by abrasive squeaks and growls and ear-wounding feedback from the other's guitar. A text snakes between them:

this is a cipher / this is a message / this is a code / this is an insanely brief memory / this is a frame
/ this is a drama / this is a language / this is a politics / this is a trace / this is a relationship / this is

a narrative / this is an attempt / this is a sequence / this is a cold calculation / this is a clever game / this is a fable / this is a complex parable / this is a betrayal / this is a simple allegory / this is a frivolous solution / this is a choice / this is a clumsy strategy / this is an enigma / this is a potentially grand statement / this is a sublimation / this is an elegant trick / this is a sign.

Each summary of what the video achieves is deconstructed by the next.

Khan says in an interview, “In western media, in cultural institutions and amongst popular conceptions there is a hunger for explanations, a subtle form of pinning down, of instrumentalising the work so it may serve as a means to an end. ... I refuse to inhabit that position (a position that transforms my work into a function). An invisible double standard. We do not represent.”²⁸

Outsiders had considered reasons for asking Arabs to represent, of course. Poststructuralist embarrassment about interpretation intertwined with anti-imperialist hesitation to ascribe final meaning to Arab cultural products. Said’s legacy taught us that when somebody hazards to characterize Middle Eastern cultures, those characterizations, subtle and cautious though they may be, will be swept into political deployments. These deployments might be, at best, cultural policy directives used by powerful funders like the Ford Foundation; at worst, they might be racist justifications for war and neoimperialism. There is much more to say about caution, including the cautious habit of people in the Arab world to see Arab cinema and media art not through their own eyes but through anticipated Western judgments. But lately neoimperialism affects Arab cinema and media art simply and baldly through the art market.

Meanwhile, the old racist, Orientalist, and imperialist attitudes infect popular culture images of Arabs as much as they ever have.

In short, “Arab” is a category that deconstructs itself, but in so doing it draws attention to the histories that brought it into being. Most of the Arab filmmakers and artists I have spoken to dislike being discussed in terms of their nation of origin and resist being categorized as Arab filmmakers and artists. After this book, I hope to write more thematically, about things like dreams, archives, aesthetics, aniconism, Communism, and film distribution, pairing works by Arab artists with their creative counterparts from other places.

Cinema

The innocent term *cinema* bristles with problems. I intend it to cover all time-based, recorded, audiovisual media, as its etymology of *kinema*, movement, suggests, but of course many people associate it with the movie theater and even with feature-length fiction movies. It would be nice to call all moving-image works “movies,” but that doesn’t seem a feasible option at present. Over the years this book covers and among the practitioners I discuss, there has been a lot of fluidity in the names people give their practice. *Film* originally meant a photographic work on acetate, of course, and it was

associated with the film industry. Ranks broke when analog video came along. In the late 1980s and early 1990s, many of the people featured in this book were working in analog video, even if they called themselves filmmakers. But some called themselves videomakers, acknowledging the materiality of the medium whether as documentarists or as artists. Some referred to their work as video art. For a while, it was possible to talk about “film and video” in a meaningful way. When digital video became accessible in the mid- to late 1990s, names for what people made and what they did divided again. A lot of people reverted to calling themselves “filmmakers” and their work “films,” despite the fact that they were not working on film. Some people were media artists who made media art (a term that emphasizes the use of the electronic medium); some were making artists’ media (a term that suggests the maker is a visual artist who has taken up video). Some prefer to call themselves simply artists.

This terminological thicket rises from new institutional branches. Some of the works in this book were made by people who think of themselves as filmmakers and who screen their work in festivals and theaters and on television. But increasingly in recent years, moving-image artists are showing their work in galleries. As a result, the market for these works has bifurcated into the cinema circuit and the art circuit, and the discourse splits too, between the respective terms and historical references for film and for visual art. The mild term “moving images” in this book’s title is a compromise, although it neglects the element of sound that is important in many of these works.

Never the Right Time

Over the twenty years this book covers, it has always seemed it is never the right time to show or even make experimental Arab cinema. All Arab countries impose strict regulations on what can be said and shown in films, and censorship boards mutilate films accordingly or ban them outright.²⁹ However, this section focuses on the censorious reception of works that do arrive to the screen in both Arab and foreign contexts. Justifiably, people in the Arab world have become ever more mistrustful about how their cultural products will be taken up. Artists are attacked or enjoined to self-censor, events are postponed, and “frivolous,” “inaccessible,” or “merely personal” issues are put aside until such time as they are again deemed to be relevant—for “this is not the right time to show them.” In the lurching dynamic between the moment people are creative and the moment their creativity is recognized and seized on, the works get muffled, deformed, and forced to represent. The opening story about “Palestine: The Aesthetics of Exile” hints at these dilemmas.

After the attacks on the World Trade Center in 2001, thoughtful (and not-so-thoughtful) people in the cinema and art worlds panicked. Suddenly there was a demand for explanation, preferably from Arabs and Muslims. The bubbling creativity of the Arab world’s cinema and art scenes suddenly gained a lot of international

attention. Curators descended on Beirut and Cairo in droves, scooping up local artists and lifting them to international fame—following the pattern established by “Contemporary Arab Representations,” the series that Catherine David of the Centre Georges Pompidou in Paris initiated in 1998. Artistic activities in the Arab world, never free from scrutiny, started to be subject to a whiplashing series of gazes. Foreign audiences wanted to gain an authentic Arab view through the eyes of the work; local audiences tried to anticipate what the foreign audience would look for in the work; foreign audiences rejected some works as not authentic enough; local audiences rejected some works as giving the wrong impression to foreign audiences.

Outside the Arab world, dozens of exhibitions were organized, some of them straining under the effort to satisfy so many different interests, some of them simply opportunistic. Their titles often referred to veils. The Sharjah Biennial, the Istanbul Biennial, Art Dubai, and other biennials and art fairs focusing on Arab and Middle Eastern art sprang up or expanded greatly. Shortly after 2001, Western museums with important holdings of Islamic art in Berlin, London, New York, and Los Angeles closed their collections, limiting the permanent exhibition to a few greatest hits for several years, while they reorganized them to respond to pressures to explain the Muslim world to newly curious audiences. Western and Arab collectors began to recognize the growing value of contemporary art from the Arab world, and in 2007 Sotheby's initiated its first European auction of Arab and Iranian contemporary art. The market has become a driving force in the Arab art world, though this development has so far little affected media art, which remains difficult for private collectors to buy and display.³⁰

Cinema fared slightly differently. Coming into the 2000s, Arab and Arab-diaspora films and videos showed up more frequently in mixed company or sidebars of Arab cinema at festivals such as Rotterdam, Images du Réel at the Centre Pompidou in Paris, and Images in Toronto. Dozens of Arab and Middle Eastern festivals and one-off programs sprang up, of which Rasha Salti's series for the Museum of Modern Art (2010–2012), “Mapping Subjectivity: Experimentation in Arab Cinema, 1960s–Now,” most closely follows the contours of the works discussed in this book. Some Arab filmmakers whose work has an experimental tang, like Suleiman, Yousry Nasrallah, and Nacer Khémir, rose to worldwide fame.

Less excusable than the sudden demand by Westerners for Arabs to explain themselves were efforts to shut them up. I describe one of these efforts at length. At the Museum of Civilization in Hull, Québec, the modest, wise, and quietly activist Syrian Canadian curator Aïda Kaouk had finished the five-year preparations for “Ces pays qui m'habitent/The Lands within Me,” an exhibition of the art of Arab Canadians. The show was to open on October 19, 2001. The director of the museum, Victor Rabinovitch, decided that the subject was too sensitive after the 9/11 terrorist attacks and postponed the show. Of particular concern was Salloum's *untitled part 1: everything and*

nothing (2002), an interview with Lebanese resistance fighter Soha Bechara that criticizes Israel.

Several artists in the show—Liliane Karnouk, Rawi Hage, Jamelie Hassan, and Jayce Salloum—and I, who had written an essay for the catalogue, started a public protest, which was taken up all over the country. The New Democratic Party raised the issue in the House of Commons. Even Prime Minister Jean Chrétien intervened in support of the exhibition. Under all this pressure, Rabinovitch reversed his decision.³¹

Giddy with nervousness, all of us involved in the show attended the opening night celebration. Hage describes it:

Then Sheila Capps, the minister of culture, gave her speech to the Arabic community, alternating the Arabic *salaam* with a Hebrew *shalom*. Maybe she too had waited at the bar and paid five dollars for a drink. Who knows, maybe it was just one more incident of the “balanced” coverage that is the norm in our society. No surprise, protest, or objection came from the audience. We Arabs know all about that; anything that has to be said about our experience has to be balanced automatically by an apologetic *shalom* maybe or by a two-minute CNN expert. Or maybe it was a desperate act to compensate for Jayce’s dissent. Who knows?

Now a dancer was fretting her Middle Eastern body in the middle of the sand circle. I was hoping for an Inca priest to appear and perform some human sacrifice ritual. We all need a scapegoat now more than ever.³²

A week after the exhibition opened, Aïda Kaouk learned that her contract would not be renewed. Furthermore, the museum would abolish the South-West Asia and Middle East Program that she had directed, a singularly benighted decision at a time when Canadians needed to know more about the region. Kaouk challenged the museum’s decision through the Canadian Human Rights Act and won. However, the museum did terminate the Middle East and South Asia department, and so her subsequent tasks were minor.

Tragically the glare of controversy and suspicion that arose around the exhibition almost blinded visitors to the art. Aïda (we became friends during preparations for the exhibition) had solicited artists for the show with utmost care and endeavored to exhibit their art appropriately. The majority of them were not in the orbit of contemporary conceptual art: they were painters, sculptors, calligraphers, textile artists, jewelers, ceramists. Many of their works were modest; they demanded a quiet and patient regard. Most likely the controversy had the effect that people rushed past the beautiful paintings and elegant ceramics to see the controversial bit—Salloum’s video. Even that, I wager, viewers were less likely to view patiently with an open mind to its aesthetic subtlety, as a title like *everything and nothing* invites. It was as though Aïda had prepared a banquet of the utmost delicacy only for it to be passed over for more base, crudely politicized fare. Aïda Kaouk died in a car accident in 2006.

The brutal outcome of “The Lands within Me” disappointed and saddened me bitterly. I think it has a lot to do with my decision not to look at Arab films and videos politically, or never only politically, but to cherish them for their singular aesthetic qualities.

Here are some more stories about bad timing. Moroccan French artist Mounir Fatmi has long criticized religious fundamentalism while also drawing on the history of Islamic religious art, a combination that unsettles some people. For the festival Printemps de septembre in Toulouse in 2012, a celebration of the Arab Spring, Fatmi planned to project the video installation *Technologia* (2010), composed of a Quranic saying inscribed inside a rotating disc, on a bridge. During installation, the work was projected on the bridge before barriers could be set up to prevent people walking on the sacred text. Local Muslim youths came to block the bridge and a scuffle ensued. Fatmi willingly removed the work, though in protest he pointed out that the work is owned by the Museum of Contemporary Art in religiously conservative Doha.³³ Weirdly, in reaction to this event, the Institut du Monde Arabe (IMA) in Paris preemptively pulled Fatmi’s six-hour video, *Sleep/Al-Na’im* (2012), which the museum had solicited for the exhibition “25 ans de créativité arabe.” It is a remake of Andy Warhol’s six-hour *Sleep* of 1963, with a digital rendition of Salman Rushdie in the role of the sleeper. It would seem the museum’s curators feared that the figure of Rushdie—against whom, in 1989, the Ayatollah Khomeini had issued a fatwa calling for his death because of the “blasphemous” *The Satanic Verses*—would incite similar disturbances by Muslims in Paris. In an interview IMA director of exhibitions Aurélie Clément-Ruiz denied that *Sleep/Al-Na’im* had been censored for religious reasons, asserting instead that the work did not seem “pertinent” to the exhibition.³⁴ This seems disingenuous, as the exhibition team knew the work quite well, having visited Fatmi’s studio to view and discuss the work with apparent enthusiasm.³⁵ I think the museum should have defended the work and invited the disaffected Muslim youth of Paris to experience it—a portrait of a man who has suffered death threats, living clandestinely, and the media gauntlet for twenty-three years finally getting a good rest.

The most severe criticism of ill-timed cinema—as opposed to censorship framed in liberal disavowals—seems always to come from Arab audiences trying to anticipate, often quite astutely, how Western audiences will interpret the works. That is what the members of the National Association of Palestinian Americans were doing in our conversations in Rochester in 1992. As Kassir wrote, “When you are thrown off course by the Other’s gaze, or by the comparison to the Other, self-awareness is not a great help. The Arab sense of self has become so undermined that the slightest thing is enough to distort it.”³⁶ In September 2002, as the United States and United Kingdom were fabricating excuses to invade Iraq, the Iraqi filmmaker Saad Salman, long exiled in Paris, showed his film *Baghdad On/Off*, a wickedly sharp critique of the Saddam Hussein regime, at the Beirut Cinema Days festival. (On this movie, see chapter 7.) Audience

members attacked Salman's film, saying it was not the right time to critique the Iraqi government. Any such critique by an Arab would feed Western excuses to invade Iraq.

A critical reception smothered Joana Hadjithomas and Khalil Joreige's *Je veux voir* (2008), a delicate experiment in the meeting of documentary and fiction for which they invited Catherine Deneuve to travel south with actor Rabih Mroué in order to witness the destruction of southern Lebanon during the July War of 2006. Though the film was well received abroad, in Lebanon the filmmakers were denounced from all sides. Some criticized the film as being too sympathetic to the Resistance, that is, Hezbollah; others went so far as to call the filmmakers Israeli collaborators. Many were angry that Deneuve does not express horror at the destruction she witnesses, so that she could be a more effective ambassador for Lebanon. "People reacted to the fact that the film resisted appropriation: none of the multiple parties could take it to their side. So they were very angry at us," Hadjithomas writes.³⁷

Syrian filmmaker Omar Amiralay gets to the heart of this quandary of bad timing: "When intellectuals in despotic societies manage, with great difficulty, to make an act of resistance, they are surprised to hear intellectuals beyond their borders say, 'You are playing into the hands of the imperialists.' I find it absolutely shameful for this pseudo-left, pseudo-Islamist orchestra to be complicit in the crimes committed by these regimes against their own people. Anytime I hear this, I'm mad enough to spit."³⁸ The most articulate riposte comes from Egyptian artist Doa Aly, responding to the reactionary fever that beset artists during the 2011 Tahrir Revolution. "There's something morbidly bourgeois about implying the existence of a 'time for art.' The thought that art can only exist to react is disquieting. But more so is the idea that art cannot exist if it cannot react 'appropriately.'"³⁹

Shouldn't the aim be to declare it the right time for Arab filmmakers and artists to make, and for all of us to show and see, whatever kind of work they want? To recognize that we are in the midst of a cinematic *nahda*, which like the previous *nahdas* occurs in an environment not of consensus but of lively public argument? The often strained political flux in Arab countries can force artists to represent, but it also opens new pathways on which artists can gather creative forces of expression. As Lebanese filmmaker and film programmer Hania Mroué said after the 2006 screening of the program *Videos under Siege*, "These big [wars] are not as important as people think. What matters is our daily life. If I'm a director, my first priority is to make films, not liberate my country. The Arab countries always use this as an excuse. They say, 'How can you ask for money for culture when we have wars?' Well, we will always have wars so let's have money for culture now."⁴⁰ As we'll see in chapter 1, that is happening, thanks to the dedication of activist cinephiles like Mroué.

I would like to confidently state that now *is* the right time for an affectionate celebration of experimenting Arab cinema. The creative activity now taking place across

the Arab world looks like a new *nahda* that, in the midst of political turmoil, invents free acts that spark courage, imagination, and perseverance.

Plan of the Book

Hanan al-Cinema is not a survey. There are so many wonderful artists populating the field of experimenting Arab cinema that it is impossible to refer to all of them. Instead, the book comprises thematic essays interspersed with portraits of individual artists. Most of the writings are completely new, but some of them are revisions of earlier essays. Chapter 1 offers case studies of the infrastructure for experimental cinema and media art in the Arab world, in light of criteria of sustainable evolution. Next, in chapter 2, is an excerpt from an essay from 1992, "Terrorism as Language: Elia Suleiman's Film Practice," which indicates the early stakes for Arab filmmakers of experimenting and "not representing," as well as the emerging importance of embodiment in experimental cinema. Distinct from a refusal to represent, as in Suleiman's early works, the *enfoldedness* of images, as though to protect them from perceptibility, struck me in many Arab works. Thus chapter 3 introduces the theory of enfolding-unfolding aesthetics that informs several other chapters. Enfolding-unfolding aesthetics is informed by classical Islamic philosophy as much as by Deleuze's writing on the fold, and this and chapter 4 look to classical Islamic thought to elucidate different ways cinema can make events perceptible and seek connections among them. Chapter 3 explores the historiographical methods of several Palestinian, Lebanese, Egyptian, and Syrian works, which I characterize as "manners of unfolding." Chapter 4 describes how documentarist Mohamed Soueid's Civil War trilogy deploys seemingly absurd fragments to hint at profound truths, in what I argue is a modern expression of classical Islamic atomism. Soueid's works also point to a historical period that has interested many contemporary artists and intellectuals: the radical, often armed, secular left movements of the 1960s and 1970s. Chapter 5 studies the surprising number of recent experimental works that look back at this period, contextualizing these in a history of Communism in the Arab world, to try to figure out what happened to the secular left. The answer lies in part with the rise of Islamic armed movements. How filmmakers deal with the near-taboo subject of religious practice, and one of its most spectacular manifestations, the controversially gory Shi'a commemoration of the martyrdom of Imam Hussein, is the subject of chapter 6. A current of Shi'a intellectual resistance runs through these three chapters. The historical inquiry of chapter 5 also characterizes chapter 7, which looks at Arab road movies that shift the terrain from desert to pavement.

Chapter 8 discusses some of the rich array of films that volatilize archival footage and make it resonate in the present. Moving from films whose archive is nearly nonexistent to those that draw on richly available personal archives, the chapter proposes an enfolding-unfolding analysis in which the viewer's engagement plays an important

part. A portrait follows in chapter 9 of Egyptian media artist Hala Elkoussy, in whose work the reimagined archive plays a central role.

Next follow some chapters that touch on algorithmic aesthetics. Chapter 10 is a study of Moroccan media artist Mounir Fatmi, many of whose works use algorithmic aesthetics to respond to censorship and control. Hassan Khan's implicitly algorithmic treatment of social relations is the subject of the next portrait-chapter, chapter 11. Chapter 12 looks at Arab works in which systems of information are posited and broken down, from those that employ an algorithmic aesthetic to critique structures of power to those that embrace the materiality of digital media, as expressed in low resolution, compression, and stuttering pixels.

The final chapters extend the book's emphasis on bodies—the bodies in the film, the body of the film, and the body of the viewer—to explore relationships of care and responsibility. Chapter 13 looks at the changing ways Palestinian artists have put their world into contact with viewers over a twenty-four-year period, from haptic images to the use of networked media, and suggests an ethics of reception. Chapter 14 examines the strategies of Sherif El Azma to startle and awaken the viewer's body, as a prelude to opening her mind, similar to Antonin Artaud's theater of cruelty. Finally, chapter 15 examines a number of works that enact a Spinozan struggle to achieve "adequate ideas," that is, ideas that arise from the capacities of a body, and proposes that those ideas may lie with the viewer.

Hanan al-Cinema is not able to express all my affections for experimenting Arab cinema. A lot is left out. "Who Is Allowed to Speak of the Films of Nacer Khémir?" which is not here, would have asked how it is possible to approach works that luxuriate in beauty and mysticism, risking charges of orientalism. It would have included Amer Alwan's *Zaman: Man of the Reeds* (2004), a beautiful and moving film about Iraq's traditional marsh-dwelling people, which is also a road movie. A chapter would have studied the poetic documentaries and essay films of several Syrian makers, in both Syria and in diaspora, including Hala Alabdalla, Ammar al-Beik, Mehdi Medacci, Reem Ali, and Nidal Al Dibs. A chapter on the modernist masters Dima El-Horr of Lebanon and Tariq Teguaia of Algeria has to wait for later, as does a study of the deft and formally complex narratives of Nadine Khan, an appreciation of the delicate and terrifying animations of Amal Kenawy, and many other wonderful works to which the book cannot do justice. I would have liked to publish revisions of some other earlier writings on Arab experimental cinema, but the book got too long.⁴¹ I trust, however, these affectionate analyses of filmmakers and artists will inspire readers to explore their works and those of others. Arab artists have generated one of the most inspiring bodies of work in contemporary cinema: the vital spirit of experimentation in their works is infectious. My dearest hope is that readers will seek out these works, exhibit them in the company of other experimenting films and videos from around the world, and enjoy the unforeseen creative resonances that arise.

Notes

Introduction

1. As Sherif El Azma tells me, in a conversation on June 10, 2012.
2. On the affection-image, see Henri Bergson, *Matter and Memory*, trans. N. M. Paul and W. S. Palmer (New York: Zone Books, 1991), 52–60, and Gilles Deleuze, *Cinema 1: The Movement-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Barbara Habberjam (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 87–122. On the time-image, see Gilles Deleuze, *Cinema 2: The Time-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Robert Galeta (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989).
3. Mohannad Sabry, “How Egypt’s Protest Law Brought Down the Revolution,” *Al-Monitor*, September 9, 2014.
4. Samir Kassir, *Being Arab*, trans. Will Hobson (London: Verso, 2006), 4.
5. Robert Fisk, “Introduction: Who Killed Samir Kassir?” *Being Arab*, vii–ix.
6. Gilles Deleuze, “Active and Reactive Forces,” in *Nietzsche and Philosophy*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson (London: Athlone Press, 1983), 61–68.
7. Elizabeth Suzanne Kassab, *Contemporary Arab Thought: Cultural Critique in Comparative Perspective* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2010), 91.
8. Described in *ibid.*, 48–53, and Assad Al-Saleh, “The Legacy of Saadallah Wannous and the *Soirée for the 5th of June* amidst the Arab Revolts,” in *Doomed by Hope: Essays on Arab Theater*, ed. Eyad Houssami and the Masrah Ensemble and trans. Meris Lutz (New York: Pluto Press, 2013), 77–91.
9. Wannous and Amiralay collaborated on *Daily Life in a Syrian Village* (1978), a surgical critique of the multileveled failure of agrarian reform that remains banned in Syria. Amiralay made a documentary on his friend shortly before his death, *Il y a tant de choses à raconter* (1997), in which Wannous reflects on the dashed political hopes of their youth.
10. Quoted in Al-Saleh, “The Legacy of Saadallah Wannous,” 87. The nonreflecting mirror calls to mind the vampire motif that occurs across the works of Lebanese filmmakers Walid Ra’ad, Ghassan Salhab, and Roy Samaha and the writings of Jalal Toufic.

11. Kassab argues that the post-1967 intellectual landscape produced a wide variety of articulate critical responses to the defeat in "Critique after the 1967 Defeat," in Kassab, *Contemporary Arab Thought*, 48–114.
12. Tarek El-Ariss, *Trials of Arab Modernity: Literary Affects and the New Political* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2013), 156.
13. *Ibid.*, 157.
14. Kassir, *Being Arab*, 41.
15. Jalal Toufic, "Forthcoming," in *Forthcoming* (Berkeley: Atelos, 2000), 64–75, reprinted in the catalogue essay of Walid Ra'ad, *Scratching on Things I Could Disavow: A History of Modern and Contemporary Art in the Arab World / Part I_Volume 1_Chapter 1* (Beirut: 1992–2005), ed. Clara Kim (Los Angeles: California Institute of the Arts/REDCAT, 2009).
16. Toufic, "Forthcoming," 65.
17. For a further explication of manners of unfolding, see Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity*, chap. 1, "Getting Things Unfolded," and chap. 8 (on enfolding and unfolding in light of Shi'ite thought), "Word becoming figure, figure becoming word," as well as the website by Finn Brunton, "Manners of Unfolding: Explorations following Laura U. Marks' *Enfoldment and Infinity: An Islamic Genealogy of New Media Art*," www.enfoldment.net.
18. Khaled D. Ramadan and Silke Schmicki, "Contemporary Audiovisual Tendencies in the Middle East and North Africa: Reflection on the Middle East Video Channel," at "Farewell to Post-Colonialism," Third Guangzhou Triennial, 2008.
19. When I wrote to the Cinémathèque de Tanger in 2012 asking to visit its archive, the archive manager, Léa Morin, asked me my research interest: I said experimental cinema from the Arab world. She wrote back, "Are you also interested in Moroccan [*maghreben*] cinema?" Her question asserted a distinction between North Africa and the Arabian Peninsula and Fertile Crescent.
20. That friend, Akram Zaatari, has lived up to his own challenge, in 2009 curating a program, Radical Closure, that included works by Israeli artists alongside Arab, Turkish, and Western artists. Originally programmed for the Internationale Kurzfilmtage Oberhausen, Radical Closure is available from Video Data Bank.
21. Quoted in Roy Armes, "Filmmaking in Divided Lands," introduction to *Arab Filmmakers of the Middle East* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2010), 3.
22. *Ibid.*, 3–4.
23. Kassab, *Contemporary Arab Thought*, 17–47.
24. Kassir, *Being Arab*, 73.
25. Kassab, *Contemporary Arab Thought*, 75–77.
26. *Ibid.*, 78.

27. Edward Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books), 1979.
28. Hassan Khan, interview with Marina Sorbello, *Cairoscope: Images, Imagination, and Imaginary of a Contemporary Mega City* (Berlin: Argobooks, 2008), 149.
29. Each Arab country has its list of censored or banned films. For a single example, Lebanese censors cut 47 minutes from Randa Chahal Sabbagh's *A Civilized People* (1999).
30. The May/June 2012 issue of *Canvas: Art and Culture from the Middle East and Arab World* on young Arab collectors notes that some collect video installations, and the 2012 Art Dubai Collectors' Circle program included a session on "Living with Video" led by gallerist Chantal Crousel.
31. For accounts of the exhibition and controversy, see Katie Cholette, "The Limits on Cultural Expression at Canada's National Cultural Institutions," *International Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue internationale d'études canadiennes* 31 (2005): 57–80, and Ayesha Hameed, "Crisis of Representation: Multiculturalism, Minquon Panchayat and 'The Lands within Me,'" in *Imagining Resistance: Visual Culture and Activism in Canada*, ed. J. Keri Cronin and Kirsty Robertson (Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2011), 141–146.
32. Rawi Hage, "Of Arabs, Museums and Civilizations," *Fuse* 25, no. 1 (2002): 24–27.
33. Jean-Manuel Escarnot, "Pas-de-deux coranique à Toulouse," *Libération*, October 3, 2012.
34. "L'affaire Mounir Fatmi: interview Aurélie Clément-Ruiz," M2 JournalismCulture, January 15, 2013, www.youtube.com/watch?v=hottU0w2I5Q.
35. Aline Biasiutto, assistant to Mounir Fatmi, correspondence with the author, September 9, 2014.
36. Kassir, *Being Arab*, 3.
37. Joana Hadjithomas, correspondence with the author, February 13, 2012, and interview with the author, June 16, 2012.
38. Stuart Klawans, "Wind from the Mideast," *The Nation*, June 6, 2006.
39. Doa Aly, "No Time for Art," June 15, 2011, moabdallah.wordpress.com/2011/06/15/no-time-for-art.
40. Kaelen Wilson-Goldie, "Short War Films Offer Partial Hindsight," *Daily Star*, September 22, 2006, and "The War Works: Videos under Siege, Online and in the Aftermath, Again," *Art Journal* 66, no. 2 (2007): 68–82.
41. These include Laura U. Marks, "Signs of the Time: Deleuze, Peirce and the Documentary Image," in *The Brain Is the Screen: Gilles Deleuze's Cinematic Philosophy*, ed. Gregory Flaxman (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press, 2000), 193–214; "What Is That 'And' between Arab Women and Video? The Case of Beirut," *Camera Obscura* 18, no. 2 (2003): 41–70; "Lamia Joreige's *Objects of War*," *Art Journal* 66, no. 2 (2007); "A Fond Forgetfulness: Jamelie Hassan's Archival Encounters," in *The Films and Videos of Jamelie Hassan*, ed. Julian Haladyn and Miriam Jordan (Windsor, ON: Platform Centre for Photographic and Digital Arts, 2010); "Akram Zaatari's *In This House*:

Diagram with Olive Tree," catalogue essay, Akram Zaatari, *Earth of Endless Secrets* (Frankfurt: Portikus Gallery, 2010), 228–231; and "Calligraphic Animation: Documenting the Invisible," in *Animation* 6, no. 3 (2010): 245–262 (special issue on documentary).

Chapter 1

Early versions of parts this chapter appear in "Arab Media Art: Experiments in Exhibition," in *Film Festival Yearbook 6: Film Festivals and the Middle East*, ed. Dina Iordanova and Stefanie Van de Peer (St. Andrews University Press, 2014), 43–60, and "Arab Experiments: Creation, Exhibition, Distribution," in *Proceedings of Think: Film, International Experimental Cinema Congress 2012*, <http://thinkfilm.de/panel/avantgarde-lost-time-and-space-laura-u-marks>.

1. Thomas Burkhalter, *Local Music Scenes and Globalization: Transnational Platforms in Beirut* (New York: Routledge, 2013), 18–20.
2. Richard Avramenko, "Zarathustra and His Asinine Friends: Nietzsche and Taste and the Groundless Ground of Friendship," in *Friendship and Politics: Essays in Political Thought*, ed. John von Heyking and Richard Avramenko (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame, 2008), 287–314.
3. Hassan Khan, *Nine Lessons Learned from Sherif El Azma* (Cairo: Contemporary Image Collective, 2009), 7–8.
4. Gilbert Simondon, "The Genesis of the Individual," in *Incorporations*, ed. Jonathan Crary and Sanford Kwinter and trans. Mark Cohen and Sanford Kwinter (New York: Zone Books, 1992), 296–319.
5. *Ibid.*, 303.
6. Khan, *Nine Lessons*, 4–5.
7. Simondon, "Genesis of the Individual," 315.
8. Khan, *Nine Lessons*, 8, 14–15.
9. Simondon, 298–299.
10. See, among others, Anne Ciecko, "What the Sea Brings: Cinema at the Shoreline in Bahrain's First Feature Production and Film Culture," *Continuum* 27 (October 1, 2013): 704; "Digital Territories and States of Independence: Jordan's Film Scenes," *Afterimage: The Journal of Media Arts and Cultural Criticism* 36, no. 5 (2009): 3–6; and entries "Saudi Arabia," "United Arab Emirates," and "Yemen" in *Historical Dictionary of Middle Eastern Cinema*, ed. T. Ginsberg and C. Lippard (Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 2010), 355–357, 409–410, 428–429.
11. Fares Chalabi, "The Idiots," in Marwa Arsanios and Suna Kafader, eds., *How to Make (Nice) Things Happen* (Beirut and New York: 98weeks and ArteEast, 2010), published at www.arteeast.org, 37.

12. Hania Jurdak, "Bosta—A 100% Lebanese Feature Film," *Cedar Wings* (December 2005–January 2006): 14.
13. Jim Quilty, "The Things Money Can Buy You," *Daily Star*, November 19, 2012.
14. <http://mawred.org/about-us>.
15. <http://www.yatfund.org>.
16. <http://princeclausfund.org>.
17. www.fordfoundation.org/issues; www.fordfoundation.org/regions/middle-east-and-north-africa.
18. Laura U. Marks, "What Is That 'And' between Arab Women and Video? The Case of Beirut," *Camera Obscura* 18, no. 2 (2003): 41–70.
19. Tareq Y. Ismael, *The Communist Movement in the Arab World* (New York: Routledge/Curzon, 2005), 4–5.
20. Samir Amin, "Synthesis and Reflections," interview with Amady Aly Dieng, in *Samir Amin: Pioneer of the Rise of the South* (New York: Springer, 2014), 149.
21. Randall Halle, "Offering Tales They Want to Hear: Transnational European Film Funding as Neo-Orientalism," in *Global Art Cinema: New Histories and Theories*, ed. Rosalind Galt and Karl Schoonover (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), 311.
22. Marwa Sharafeldin in "Sticky Fingers: Foreign Funding in Flux," interviews with Issandr El Amrani, Moukhtar Kocache, William Wells, Alaa Abd El Fattah, Khaled El Qazzaz, Basma El Hussein, Oussama Rifahi, Amr Gharbeia, Sarah Rifky, Hossam El Hamalawy, Angela Harutyunyan and Marwa Sharafeldin, *Bidoun* 26 (Spring 2012).
23. Rifky, in *ibid*.
24. Wells and El Hussein, in *ibid*.
25. Quoted in Mark Westmoreland, "Crisis of Representation: Experimental Documentary in Postwar Lebanon," doctoral thesis, University of Texas at Austin, 2008, 170.
26. Kocache, in "Sticky Fingers."
27. George Ki'idi, "The File: Emile Chahine, Mohamad Soueid," *Al-Nahar*, October 21, 1991 and "The File: Houssam Khayat, Khaled Itani," *Al-Nahar*, October 28, 1991, cited in Lina Khatib, *Lebanese Cinema: Imagining the Civil War and Beyond* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2008), 45.
28. Salwa Mikdadi, "New Trends in Arab Art: NGOs and the Public Sphere," in *New Vision: Arab Contemporary Art in the 21st Century*, ed. Hossein Amirsadeghi, Salwa Mikdadi, and Nada Shabout (London: Thames and Hudson, 2009), 22–29.
29. *Ibid*.
30. Kaelen Wilson-Goldie, "The End of Sharjah's Biennial?" *Daily Star* (Lebanon), April 14, 2011.

31. Most illuminating in this regard was the panel organized by Walid Ra'ad, "Where Is Beirut, Ramallah, Cairo ... From the Saadiyat Island? Arab and/or Emirati and/or Yet-More Islands of Happiness: The Making of Art, Artists, Art Histories, and Art Museums in the Arab World," at Home Works 5: A Forum on Cultural Practices, Beirut, April 24, 2010. See also Sonia Mejcher-Atassi and John Pedro Schwartz, Introduction to *Archives, Museums, and Collecting Practices in the Modern Arab World* (Fernham: Ashgate, 2012); and Davide Ponzini, "Large Scale Development Projects and Star Architecture in the Absence of Democratic Politics: The Case of Abu Dhabi, UAE," *Cities* 28 (2011): 251–259.
32. Mishaal Al-Gergawi and Vasif Kortun, remarks at "Where Is Beirut, Ramallah, Cairo?" April 24, 2010.
33. Sarah A. Rogers, "Culture '45 and the Rise of Beirut's Contemporary Art Scene," in *Six Lines of Flight: Shifting Geographies in Contemporary Art*, ed. Apsara DiQuinzio (San Francisco: San Francisco Museum of Modern Art, and Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012), 35.
34. "Dar El Fan," translated excerpt of *Janine Rubeiz et Dar el Fan. Regard vers un patrimoine culturel* (Beirut: An Nahar, 2003), in Arsanios and Kafadar, eds., *How to Make (Nice) Things Happen*, 24–31.
35. Nouri Bouzid, "New Realism in Arab Cinema: Defeat Conscious Cinema," trans. Shereen el Ezabi, *Alif: Journal of Comparative Poetics* 15 (1995): 246–247.
36. Khatib, *Lebanese Cinema*, 25.
37. See Laura U. Marks, *The Skin of the Film: Intercultural Cinema, Embodiment, and the Senses* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000), chap. 1, and "Signs of the Time: Deleuze, Peirce and the Documentary Image," in *The Brain Is the Screen: Gilles Deleuze's Cinematic Philosophy*, ed. Gregory Flaxman (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press), 193–214.
38. Thanks to Rania Stephan for this information.
39. "Beirut Development & Cinema: The Cooperation that Puts Communication in the Service of Development" (2002). <http://beirutdc.org> in September 2002; no longer online.
40. Mirene Arsanios, Karine Wehbé, and Wael Safieddine, "How Espace SD Started," in Arsanios and Kafader, eds., *How to make (nice) things happen*, 14.
41. Philippe Azoury, "L'ébullition libanaise: À l'occasion du festival Côté court de Pantin, rencontre à Beyrouth avec de jeunes cinéastes tant inquiets qu'ardents," *Quotidien*, March 29, 2006.
42. Kaelen Wilson-Goldie, "Beirut DVD Market Latest Platform for Local Films: Directors, Festivals Work with New Company Incognito to Bring Their Work to the Masses," *Daily Star*, March 8, 2006.
43. See <http://www.neabeyrouth.org>.
44. Akram Zaatari, program notes for DVD box set *Radical Closure* (Chicago: Video Data Bank, 2009).

45. Mikdadi, "New Trends in Arab Art," 26.
46. Samirah Alkassim, "Experimental Video in Cairo," *Nebula* 3, no. 1 (2006): 136.
47. Ibrahim Al-Ariss, interview with Lina Khatib, April 2006, cited in Khatib, *Lebanese Cinema*, 48.
48. Sherif El Azma, conversation with the author, June 10, 2012.
49. Akram Zaatari and Mahmoud Hojeij, eds., *Transit Visa: On Video and Cities* (Beirut: Transit Visa, 2001).
50. Jalal Toufic, "Quickly, a Stereotype!" in *ibid.*, 81.
51. "Al-Nitaq Festival of Art in Downtown Cairo, 15-24 March," *Al-Ahram*, March 15–21, 2001.
52. Mohammad Allam, correspondence with the author, August 2014.
53. Kerstin Pinther, "Going Places: Image Policies, Artistic Practices, Urban Spaces," in *Afropolis: City, Media, Art*, ed. Kerstin Pinther, Larissa Förster, and Christian Hanussek (Johannesburg: Jacana Media, 2012), 113.
54. Jessica Winegar, "Cultural Sovereignty in a Global Art Economy: Egyptian Cultural Policy and the New Western Interest in Art from the Middle East," *Cultural Anthropology* 21 (2006): 173–204.
55. *Ibid.*, 185.
56. Wells, in "Sticky Fingers."
57. Kaelen Wilson-Goldie, "Underdogs on Top," *National* (UAE), January 23, 2009.
58. *Ibid.*
59. Omnia El Shakry, "Artistic Sovereignty in the Shadow of Post-Socialism: Egypt's 20th Annual Youth Salon," *e-flux Journal* 7 (June–August 2009): 5.
60. *Ibid.*
61. Omar Kholeif remarks on this phenomenon in "The Social Impulse: Politics, Media, and Art after the Arab Uprisings," *Ibraaz*, May 2, 2012, 34.
62. Shady Elnoshokaty, "Experimental Media Workshop, Helwan University, 2000–2007," <http://mediaartworkshop.com/about.html>.
63. *Ibid.*
64. "Workshopping the Future: Shady Elnoshokaty in Conversation with Omar Kholeif," *Ibraaz* (November 2012).
65. <http://massalexandria.wordpress.com>; Fatma Hendawy, "MASS Alexandria: Toward a Contemporary Art Educational Program," *Egypt Independent*, May 17, 2011.
66. Sherif El Azma, conversations with the author, June 10, 2012 and April 22, 2013.
67. Ahmad Kamel, conversation with the author, June 7, 2012.

68. William Wells, conversation with the author, June 6, 2012.
69. Kay Dickinson, "The State of Labor and Labor for the State: Syrian and Egyptian Cinema beyond the 2011 Uprisings," *Framework: The Journal of Cinema and Media* 53, no. 1 (2012): 99–116; also Meyar al-Roumi, conversation with the author, March 28, 2013.
70. Dickinson, "The State of Labor," 106.
71. Rasha Salti, "Critical Nationals: The Paradoxes of Syrian Cinema," in *Insights into Syrian Cinema*, ed. Rasha Salti (New York: ArteEast, 2006), 21–44; Cécile Boëx, "The End of the State Monopoly over Culture: Toward the Commodification of Cultural and Artistic Production," *Middle East Critique* 20, no. 2 (Summer 2011): 144.
72. Mayyar al-Roumi and Dorothée Schmid, "Le cinéma syrien: Du militantisme au mutisme," in *Cinéma et monde musulman: Cultures et interdits*, ed. Madkour Thabet, Mayyar Al-Roumi, and Dorothée Schmid (Paris: L'Harmattan, 2009), 4–26.
73. Salti, *Insights into Syrian Cinema*.
74. When the Israeli army entered Quneitra they found it abandoned. The premature announcement that the city had fallen may have been planned to allow the Syrian army time to withdraw to Damascus, 45 miles from Quneitra. Three hours after the initial broadcast, Syrian radio broadcast that Syrian soldiers were still defending Quneitra, but in fact they were retreating en masse, having believed the earlier radio broadcast. Michael B. Oren, *Six Days of War: June 1967 and the Making of the Modern Middle East* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 294–302.
75. Salti, "Critical Nationals," 35.
76. Hala Alabdalla Yakoub, "Interview with Omar Amiralay," in Salti, *Insights into Syrian Cinema*, 116.
77. Hisham Bizri, "Al Ma'ahad al-'Arabi lil-Film [Arab Institute of Film]," unpublished document, 2005.
78. Ibid.
79. Anne Ciecko, "Digital Territories and Sites of Independence: Jordan's Film Scenes," *Afterimage* 36, no. 5 (March/April 2009).
80. Salti, "Critical Nationals," 43.
81. Lawrence Wright, "Syrian Filmmaker Orwa Nyrabia Freed," *New Yorker*, September 12, 2012.
82. Royal Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, "Evaluation of Media Cooperation under the Danish Arab Partnership" (2014), www.netpublikationer.dk/um/11210/html/printerversion_entire_publication.htm.
83. "About Screen Institute Beirut," <http://screeninstitutebeirut.org>.
84. See, for example, Stuart Allen, *Citizen Witnessing in Times of Crisis* (Cambridge: Polity, 2013); Matt Sienkiewicz, "Start Making Sense: A Three-Tier Approach to Citizen Journalism," *Media*,

Culture, and Society 36 (2014): 691–701; Kari Andén-Papadopolous, “Citizen Camera-Witnessing: Embodied Political Dissent in the Age of ‘Mediated Mass Self-Communication,’” *New Media and Society* 16 (2014): 753–769, and other writings; and Rasha Salti, “Shall We Dance?” *Cinema Journal* 52:1 (2012): 166–172.

85. Rasha Salti in conversation with Fawz Kabra, “Curating Film,” *Ibraaz Platform* 4 (January 2013): 10.

86. Maryam Jamshidi, *The Future of the Arab Spring: Driving Social, Cultural, and Technological Innovation from the Grassroots* (Kidlington, Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, 2013), 87.

87. India Stoughton, “‘Bullet Films’ Offer Syrian Snapshots,” *Daily Star*, July 16, 2014.

88. <http://www.creativememory.org>.

89. Jim Quilty, “When Reality Is Stronger Than Fiction,” *Daily Star*, July 24, 2014.

90. Jasmina Metwaly, conversation with the author, April 22, 2013.

91. Tamer El Said, conversation with the author, April 24, 2013.

92. Melanie Goodfellow, “Egyptian Film Rebels Form Breakaway Union,” *Screen Daily*, December 13, 2012.

93. “International Film Community Stands in Solidarity with Syria by Screening a Special DOX BOX Global Day Program,” press release issued by DOX BOX, ArteEast, and Network of Arab Art-house Screens, March 2, 2012.

94. “Ittihad al-Sinemaeyeen al-Sudaneyeen Yanfi: La ‘Alaqa li al-Ittihad bi al-Khurajan al-Sudan li al-Sinema al-Mustaqala” [Sudanese filmmakers’ union rejects: The Sudan director’s union has no relation with independent cinema], *Al-Maidan*, 2012, n.d.; Talal Afifi, correspondence with the author, August 15, 2014.

95. Ian Francis, “Tangerine Dreams,” *Sight and Sound* 22, no. 6 (June 2012): 8.

96. Bouchra Khalil and Yto Barrada, “Cinémathèque de Tanger Frequently Asked Questions,” in *Album: Cinémathèque de Tanger*, ed. Omar Berrada and Yto Barrada (Barcelona and Tanger: Institut de Cultura de la Ajuntament de Barcelona and Cinémathèque de Tanger, 2011), 33.

97. *Ibid.*

98. *Ibid.*, 37.

99. William R. Snyder, “Backstage with Yto Barrada: Renewing Moroccan Culture through Cinema,” *Wall Street Journal*, February 15, 2008.

100. Francis, “Tangerine Dreams,” 8.

101. Alkassim, “Experimental Video in Cairo,” 132.

102. Lucas Hilderbrand, “Moving Images: On Video Art Markets and Distribution,” in *Resolutions 3: Global Networks of Video*, ed. Ming-Yuen S. Ma and Erika Suderburg (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2012), 1–17.

103. Electronic Arts Intermix, Lux, Video Data Bank, and V Tape are some distributors with exemplary pricing schemes.
104. Stefanie Van de Peer, "Damascus and Beirut, or Why Arab Film Festivals Go On and Offline," *Film Festival Yearbook 6: Film Festivals and the Middle East*, ed. Dina Iordanova and Stefanie van de Peer (St. Andrews, Scotland: St. Andrews Film Studies, 2014), 209.
105. Akram Zaatar, correspondence with the author, June 14, 2011.
106. Hassan Khan, correspondence with the author, October 1, 2012.
107. Bashir Makhoul, "Locations, Transmissions and the Constellation of Palestinian Video Art," in *Palestinian Video Art*, ed. Bashir Makhoul (Jerusalem: Palestine Art Court, 2013), 20–49.
108. Van de Peer, "Damascus and Beirut, or Why Arab Film Festivals Go On and Offline," 208.
109. Al Jazeera commissioning producer Louai Haffar, correspondence with the author, August 17, 2014.
110. Marcel Schwierin, "Assembling, Framing, Composing," *Arab Shorts: Independent Short Films and Media Art* (Cairo: Goethe-Institut Kairo, 2012), 8.
111. For a discussion of the relative benefits for artists of the gallery and theatrical systems, see Laura U. Marks, "Immersed in the Single Channel: Experimental Media from Theater to Gallery," *Millennium Film Journal* 55 (Spring 2012): 14–23.
112. Éric Le Roy, "Le fonds cinématographique colonial aux Archives du film et du dépôt légal du CNC (France)," *Journal of Film Preservation* 63 (October 2001): 55.
113. Mohamed Haouchine, "Après l'ouverture officielle de la cinémathèque de Tizi Ouzou: *Lyès Semiane: 'La Cinémathèque algérienne doit reconquérir son public!'*" *Liberté*, October 23, 2012; Wafia Sifouane Mouffouk, "Algérie: Promotion du cinéma et des salles obscures," *La Tribune*, January 8, 2014.
114. Morin directed the Cinémathèque de Tanger. Léa Morin, "The Cinémathèque Algérienne: The Ongoing Restoration of a Masterpiece of World Cinema Heritage?" *Modern Heritage Observer*, November 3, 2013.
115. Mohamed Sabiri, "Centre Cinématographique Marocain," *Journal of Film Preservation*, nos. 77/78 (October 2008): 31–32.
116. Abdel Rahman, "Egypt," *Journal of Film Preservation*, nos. 77/78 (October 2008): 15.
117. Yasmin Desouki, "The Bibliotheca Alexandria and the Preservation of Egypt's Visual Cultural Heritage," NYU Tisch School of the Arts Moving Image Archive Program (2007), 6. www.nyu.edu/tisch/preservation/...2/07f_1800_Desouki_final.doc; "Prince Alwaleed Meets Egyptian Prime Minister in Riyadh," *Middle East Times*, n.d., http://www.mideast-times.com/left_news.php?newsid=1693.
118. <http://modernegypt.bibalex.org>.

119. Heba Farid, "Evidence of What? The Photographic Archive and Its Problematics," in Hanan Sabea and Mark R. Westmoreland, eds., *Cairo Papers in Social Science* 31: 3/4, "Visual Productions of Knowledge: Toward a Different Middle East" (Fall–Winter 2008): 57.
120. See <http://caiobserver.com/>
121. Hares Bassil, "Lebanon," *Journal of Film Preservation*, nos. 77/78 (October 2008): 28–29.
122. Itidal Ismail, "Palestine," *Journal of Film Preservation*, nos. 77/78 (October 2008): 35.
123. <http://www.jer-cin.org.il/Archive/Cataloguing/Digitization.aspx>. Consulted June 9, 2014. The page appears to have been written in 2008, as it refers to plans for 2009, so likely things have changed since then.
124. Gladys Saade, "Lebanese Television Archives," *Electronic Library* 22, no. 2 (2004): 143.
125. There has not been much activity since 2009. Lara Saba, *Shattered Memories* (2008) made from archives of Télé-Liban, <http://www.fondationlibancinema.org/cinemaheritage.html>.
126. Giovanna Fossati, *From Grain to Pixel: The Archival Life of Film in Transition* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2009), 65.
127. Mikdadi, "New Trends in Arab Art," 27.
128. Christine Tohme, correspondence with the author, October 3, 2012.

Chapter 2

This chapter is a revision of an article originally published in *Framework* (London), no. 38 (1992).

1. Homi K. Bhabha, "DissemiNation," in *Salman Rushdie and the Third World: Myths of the Nation*, ed. Timothy Brennan (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1990), 299.
2. Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), 351–423.
3. Edward W. Said, *After the Last Sky: Palestinian Lives* (New York: Pantheon, 1985).
4. *Ibid.*, 56.
5. Christian Metz, "The Cinema: Language or Language System?" in *Film Language: A Semiotics of the Cinema*, trans. M. Taylor (New York: Oxford University Press, 1974).
6. Said, *After the Last Sky*, 40.
7. Elaine Scarry, *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985), 6.
8. In 2015 retrospect, the image probably is a criticism of the Palestine Liberation Organization.
9. Deleuze and Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus*, 360.

10. Hélène Cixous and Catherine Clément, *The Newly Born Woman* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1985), 7.

11. Deleuze and Guattari, 378.

Chapter 3

This chapter is a revision of “Experience—Information—Image: A Historiography of Unfolding in Arab Cinema,” in *Cinema at the Periphery*, ed. Dina Iordanova, David Martin-Jones and Belén Vidal (Detroit: Wayne State University Press), 232–253, published with permission; and “Experience—Information—Image: A Historiography of Unfolding. Arab Cinema as Example,” *Cultural Studies Review* 14:1 (March 2007); published with permission.

1. Siegfried Kracauer, *History: The Last Things Before the Last* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1969), 136.

2. This understanding of history as knowable not in itself but only in its representations, which are themselves historical, is drawn from Michel Foucault, *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, trans. A. Sheridan Smith (New York: Harper and Row, 1972), and Gilles Deleuze, *Foucault*, trans. Séan Hand (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1988).

3. Gilles Deleuze, *Le Pli: Leibniz et le baroque* (Paris: Minuit, 1988).

4. On the plane of immanence, see Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *Qu'est-ce que la philosophie?* (Paris: Minuit, 1991), chap. 1.

5. See Charles Sanders Peirce, “The Principles of Phenomenology,” in *Philosophical Writings of Peirce*, ed. Justus Buchler (New York: Dover, 1955), 74–97.

6. Charles Sanders Peirce, “Logic as Semiotic: The Theory of Signs,” in *Philosophical Writings of Peirce*, ed. Justus Buchler, 99.

7. Peirce, “The Principles of Phenomenology,” 79.

8. Sean Cubitt, *The Cinema Effect* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2004), 64.

9. Guy Debord placed spectacle at the level of the image, while enfolding-unfolding aesthetics shift it to the level of information that is not necessarily perceptible. See Guy Debord, *Society of the Spectacle*, trans. Donald Nicholson-Smith (New York: Zone, 1994).

10. Gilles Deleuze, “The Crisis of the Action-Image,” in *Cinema One: The Movement-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Barbara Habberjam (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), 201–208; and Gilles Deleuze, “The Painting before Painting,” in *Francis Bacon: The Logic of Sensation*, trans. Daniel W. Smith (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2002), 71–80.

11. Laura U. Marks, “Invisible Media,” in *New Media: Theories and Practices of Digitextuality*, ed. Anna Everett and John T. Caldwell (New York: Routledge, 2003), 33–46.

12. Cubitt, *The Cinema Effect*, 42–69.
13. Deleuze, *Cinema Two: The Time-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Robert Galeta (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989), 78. On conspiracy, see Deleuze, *Cinema One*, 209–214.
14. See Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, “The Smooth and the Striated,” in *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, trans. Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), 492–499.
15. Sobhi al-Zobaidi, “Voiceless Sounds and Disfigured Bodies in *Paradise Now*,” *ArtSchool Palestine*, 2004, www.artschoolpalestine.com.
16. Hany Abu-Assad, response to review of *Paradise Now* by As’ad Abukhalil, *The Angry Arab News Service*, May 24, 2006, angryarab.blogspot.com.
17. Interviews with these filmmakers appear in Rasha Salti, *Insights into Syrian Cinema: Essays and Conversations with Contemporary Filmmakers* (New York: ArteEast, 2006).
18. Peirce, “Logic as Semiotic.”
19. Elaine Scarry, *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987).
20. Akram Zaatar, “Interviews with Nabih Awada,” *Earth of Endless Secrets*, ed. Karl Bassi and Akram Zaatar (Frankfurt: Portikus, 2009), 53.

Chapter 4

This chapter is a revision of “Mohamed Soueid’s Cinema of Immanence,” *Jump Cut* 49 (2007), www.ejumpcut.org; published with permission.

1. See Laura U. Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity: An Islamic Genealogy of New Media Art* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2010), 189–218.
2. See Oliver Leaman, *An Introduction to Classical Islamic Philosophy*, 2nd ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).
3. See Alnoor Dhanani, *The Physical Theory of Kalam: Atoms, Space, and Void in Basrian Mu’tazili Cosmology* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1994).
4. Yasser Tabbaa, “The Muqarnas Dome: Its Origin and Meaning,” *Muqarnas* 3 (1985): 69.
5. Gilles Deleuze, *Pure Immanence*, trans. Anne Boyman (New York: Zone, 2001), 38.
6. Alfred North Whitehead, *Process and Reality: An Essay in Cosmology*, corrected edition, ed. David Ray Griffin and Donald W. Sherbourne (New York: Free Press, 1978).
7. Jalal Toufic, *Forthcoming* (Berkeley: Atelos, 1999), 115–136.

8. Quoted in Khemais Khayati, *Cinéma arabes: Topographie d'une image éclatée* (Paris: L'Harmattan, 1996), 61, my translation.
9. Maggie Awadalla, introduction to Khemais Khayati, "A Wanderer Seeking the Words of Love in Impossible Cities: Nacer Khémir," trans. Maggie Awadalla, *Alif* 15 (1995): 252. Viola Shafik notes that Khémir's oeuvre is one of the few in Arab cinema that pursues the aesthetics of Islamic art, particularly of the Persian miniature, in *Arab Cinema: History and Cultural Identity* (Cairo: American University in Cairo Press, 1998), 53.
10. Mohamed Soueid, *History of Silent Cinema in Lebanon* (Cairo: Arab Artists Union, 1996; in Arabic); *History of Movie Theaters in Old Beirut* (Beirut: An-Nahar, 1996; in Arabic); *Littérature et scénarios au pays arabes* (Paris: Institut du Monde Arabe, 1995); *Cinema Legislation in Lebanon* (Cairo: Arab Artists Union, 1993; in Arabic); and *Suspended Cinema: Lebanese Civil War Films* (Beirut: Institute of Arab Research, 1986; in Arabic).
11. Walid Ra'ad is perhaps the Lebanese artist who has most consistently pursued a psychoanalytical understanding of the Lebanese historical trauma.
12. As in Su Friedrich's *Rules of the Road* (1993), in which the filmmaker, having been deserted by her lover, sees the latter's wood-paneled station wagon all over town and captures several of these cars in a single mobile shot, so Soueid observes camouflage garbing women of many shapes and sizes, living and plastic, in a single deft pan of the busy sidewalks of Hamra Street.

Chapter 5

1. André Breton, *Mad Love: L'amour fou*, trans. Mary Ann Caws (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1987), 38.
2. Tareq Y. Ismael, *The Communist Movement in the Arab World* (London: Routledge/Curzon, 2005), 1.
3. Quoted in Rami Ginat, *Egypt's Incomplete Revolution: Lutfi al-Khuli and Nasser's Socialism in the 1960s* (London: Frank Cass, 1997), 11.
4. John Patterson, "Is Islamist Extremism to Blame for Making Film Directors Pine for Old-School Leftwing Fanaticism? If So, Then Bring It On," *Guardian*, October 16, 2010.
5. Ismael, *The Communist Movement*, 21.
6. Albert Hourani, *A History of the Arab Peoples* (New York: Warner, 1991), 402–404.
7. See, for example, Musa Budeiri, *The Palestine Communist Party, 1919–1948: Arab and Jew in the Struggle for Internationalism* (Chicago: Haymarket Books, 1979), xv–xix, 33–34, and Joel Beinin and Zachary Lockman, *Workers on the Nile: Nationalism, Communism, Islam, and the Egyptian Working Class, 1882–1954* (Cairo: American University in Cairo Press, 1998), 140–141, 313–314.
8. Beinin and Lockman, *Workers on the Nile*, 368.
9. Ginat, *Egypt's Incomplete Revolution*, 14; Ismael, *The Communist Movement*, 21–25.

10. Hourani, *History of the Arab Peoples*, 406.
11. Ginat, *Egypt's Incomplete Revolution*, 128–130.
12. Ruth Tsoffar, “Forget Baghdad: Jews and Arabs—The Iraqi Connection,” in *The Cinema of North Africa and the Middle East*, ed. Gönül Dönmez-Colin (London: Wallflower Press, 2007), 263.
13. Ismael, *The Communist Movement*, 43–44.
14. Madhi Amil, *Azamat al-Hadara al-'Arabiyya am Azamat al-Burjwajiyya al-'Arabiyya?* [The crisis of Arab civilization or the crisis of the Arab bourgeoisie?], cited in Elizabeth Suzanne Kassab, *Contemporary Arab Thought: Cultural Critique in Comparative Perspective* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2010), 147.
15. Dieter Senghaas, “Preface,” in Samir Amin, *Samir Amin: Pioneer of the Rise of the South* (Springer, 2014), ix; Kassab, *Contemporary Arab Thought*, 150. Amin left Cairo in 1960 during the wave of government arrests of Communists. At eighty-three, he is the director of the Third World Forum in Dakar and continues to apply a rigorous Marxist analysis to the political economy of the region.
16. Stefanie van de Peer, “The Moderation of Creative Dissidence in Syria: Reem Ali’s Documentary *Zabad*,” *Journal for Cultural Research*, 16, nos. 2–3 (2012): 297–317.
17. Kirk J. Beattie, *Egypt during the Nasser Years* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1994), 75.
18. *Ibid.*, 129–131.
19. *Ibid.*, 176, 184–185.
20. Beinín and Lockman, *Workers on the Nile*, 457.
21. Susan Gilson Miller, *A History of Modern Morocco* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 157, 169; Hourani, *History of the Arab Peoples*, 403; Tarek Elhaik and Dominic Willsdon, “Tricontinental Drifts” in *Six Lines of Flight: Shifting Geographies in Contemporary Art*, ed. Apsara DiQuinzio (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012), 193–194.
22. Miller, *History of Modern Morocco*, 167–170, 185–186.
23. Hourani, *History of the Arab Peoples*, 428; Miller, *History of Modern Morocco*, 180–184; Yahia Zoubir, “Soviet Policy toward the Western Sahara Conflict,” *Africa Today* 34, no. 3 (1987): 17–32.
24. “Charte d’Alger du cinema africain,” *Afrique littéraire et artistique* 35 (1975): 100–101, trans. Liz Heron, reprinted in *Film Manifestos and Global Cinema Cultures*, ed. Scott MacKenzie (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014), 296–298.
25. Marwa Arsanios documents this work of committed experimental cinema in a series of interviews in *Ibraaz*: “The Missing Link Part One,” conversation with Cecilia Anderson, Ghassan Salhab, Raymond Gebara, and Mona Gebara, June 1, 2011; “The Missing Link Part Two,” conversations with Mohamed Soueid and Nadim Tabet, November 1, 2011; and “The Missing Link Part Three,” conversation with Ahmad Ghossein, May 2, 2012.

26. Emily Jacir, "Palestinian Revolution Cinema Comes to NYC," *Electronic Intifada*, February 16, 2007.
27. See Joseph Massad, "The Weapon of Culture: Cinema in the Palestinian Liberation Struggle," in *Dreams of a Nation: On Palestinian Cinema*, ed. Hamid Dabashi (London: Verso, 2006), 30–42; also see <http://dreamsofanationarchive.org>.
28. Jacir, "Palestinian Revolution Cinema Comes to NYC."
29. Fernando Solanas and Octavio Getino, "Towards a Third Cinema," in *Movies and Methods*, ed. Bill Nichols (Berkeley: University of California, 1994), 44–64.
30. Samir Kassir, *Beirut*, trans. M. B. Debevoise (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010), 509.
31. Terri Ginsberg and Chris Lippard, *Historical Dictionary of Middle Eastern Cinema* (London: Scarecrow Press, 2010), 255–256; Sheyma Buali, "A Militant Cinema: A Conversation between Mohanad Yaqubi and Sheyma Buali," *Ibraaz* 16 (May 2, 2012).
32. Adania Shibli, "Not Forgotten: The Palestinian Film Archive," *Sight and Sound*, November 15, 2013.
33. Vincent Lin, "Palestinian Cinema and Identity," student essay for my course Media Art in the Arab World, Simon Fraser University, November 2013.
34. Nadia Yaqub, "Azza El-Hassan and Impossible Filmmaking in Israel/Palestine," in *Resistance in Contemporary Middle Eastern Cultures: Literature, Cinema and Music*, ed. Karima Laachir and Saeed Talajooy (New York: Routledge, 2013), 162.
35. *Ibid.*, 160–162.
36. They are Oraib Toukan, Kay Dickinson, Peggy Ahwesh and her students at Bard College, the Moving Image and Archiving Program at New York University, and Sabah Haider. "Work Continues on a Film Trove in Jordan," *Moving Image Archive News*, April 14, 2012. See the documentation of the Jordanian film trove at <http://afilmarchive.net>.
37. Leah Caldwell, "Unearthing Jordan's Soviet Cinema," *Al-Akhbar*, May 23, 2012.
38. Buali, "A Militant Cinema," n.p.
39. Jacir, "Palestinian Revolution Cinema."
40. Buali, "A Militant Cinema," n.p.
41. Caldwell, "Unearthing Jordan's Soviet Cinema."
42. Hourani, *History of the Arab Peoples*, 412.
43. Paul Chamberlin, *The Global Offensive: The United States, the Palestinian Liberation Organization, and the Making of the Post-Cold War Era* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 22.
44. *Ibid.*, 19.

45. *Ibid.*, 25.
46. *Ibid.*, 31; John Calabrese, *China's Changing Relations with the Middle East* (London: Pinter, 1991), 33 and *passim*; Carolyn McGiffert Ekedahl, "Fedayeen—'Men of Sacrifice,'" intelligence report to CIA (1970; declassified document released May 2007), http://www.foia.cia.gov/sites/default/files/document_conversions/14/esau-47.pdf.
47. Chamberlin, *The Global Offensive*, 61.
48. Walid Sadek, "Collecting the Uncanny and the Labor of Missing," in *Archives, Museums and Collecting Practices in the Modern Arab World*, ed. Sonja Mejcher-Atassi and John Pedro Schwartz (London: Ashgate, 2012), 220.
49. Chamberlin, *The Global Offensive*, 63–64.
50. Ekedahl, "Fedayeen—'Men of Sacrifice.'"
51. Daniel Heradstveit, "A Profile of the Palestine Guerrillas," *Cooperation and Conflict* 7, no. 13 (1972): 13–36.
52. Chamberlin, *The Global Offensive*, 61.
53. On the passage of microperceptions to consciousness, see Gilles Deleuze, *The Fold: Leibniz and the Baroque*, trans. Tom Conley (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press, 1993), 86.
54. For details, see Yusri Hazran, "The Rise of Politicized Shi'ite Religiosity and the Territorial State in Iraq and Lebanon," *Middle East Journal* 64, no. 4 (2010).
55. Rabih Mroué, "Grandfather, Father and Son," trans. Ziad Nawfat, in *Images, mon amour: Fabrications* (Madrid: Centro de Arte Dos de Mayo, 2013), 183–184, 179.
56. Hussein Mroué's works include *Al-Nazzat al-Madiya fi al-Falasaifa al-Arabiyya al-Islamiyya* [Material tendencies in Islamic philosophy] (Beirut: Dar Al Farabi, 1988).
57. Human Rights in the Middle East: Joint Hearing before the Subcommittees on Europe and the Middle East and Human Rights and International Organizations of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, House of Representatives, 102nd Cong., 2nd sess., September 15, 1992 (Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office 1993), 79.
58. Hazran, "Rise of Politicized Shi'ite Religiosity," 536.
59. Kassir, *Beirut*, 505.
60. Ismael, *The Communist Movement*, 108–109.
61. Rabih Mroué, "Three Posters," trans. Mona Abou Rayyan, in *Images, mon amour: Fabrications*, 310.
62. *Ibid.*, 309.
63. Atef Alshaer, "Islam in the Narrative of Fatah and Hamas," in *Narrating Conflict in the Middle East*, ed. Dina Matar and Zahera Harb (London: I. B. Tauris, 2013), 117–118.

64. Akram Zaatari, *A Conversation with an Imagined Israeli Filmmaker Named Avi Mograbi* (Aubervilliers: Les laboratoires d'Aubervilliers, 2012), 9.
65. "Djamila Bouhired," *Fanoos Encyclopedia*, <http://www.fanoos.com/>.
66. On the image of the female fighter see Dorit Naaman, "In the Name of the Nation: Images of Palestinian and Israeli Women Fighters," in *Killing Women: The Visual Culture of Gender and Violence*, ed. Annette Burfoot and Susan Lord (Waterloo, ON: Wilfred Laurier University Press, 2006), 273–291.
67. Chad Elias, "The Libidinal Archive: A Conversation with Akram Zaatari," *Tate Papers*, 19, March 12, 2013.
68. Gordon Hon, "Blessed Oblivion: Palestinian Video Art and the Avant-Doc," in *Palestinian Video Art*, ed. Bashir Makhoul (Jerusalem: Palestine Art Court, 2013), 178.
69. Nouri Gana, "The Battle for Tunisia," in *The Dawn of the Arab Uprisings: End of an Old Era?* ed. Bassam Haddad, Rosie Bsbeer, and Ziad Abu Rish (London: Pluto Press, 2012), 73.
70. Martine Gozlan, "Tunisie: Les islamistes se dévoilent," June 29, 2011, <http://www.marianne.net>.
71. Samir Kassir, *Being Arab*, trans. Will Hobson (London: Verso, 2006), 82, 12.
72. Omnia El Shakry, "Egypt's Three Revolutions: The Force of History behind this Popular Uprising," in Haddad et al., *The Dawn of the Arab Uprisings*, 100.
73. Kassir, *Beirut*, 499–500.

Chapter 6

An earlier version of part of this chapter appeared in *The Senses and Society* 6:3 (2011).

1. Tilman Nagel, *The History of Islamic Theology* (Princeton, NJ: Markus Weiner, 2000), 41–57.
2. *Ibid.*, 53.
3. Jalal Toufic, *Âshûrâ: This Blood Spilled in My Veins* (Beirut: Post-Apollo Press, 2005), 12.
4. Yusri Hazran, "The Rise of Politicized Shi'ite Religiosity and the Territorial State in Iraq and Lebanon," *Middle East Journal* 64, no. 4 (2010): 528, 532.
5. Toufic, *Âshûrâ*, 14.
6. Brian Massumi, *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002), 26.
7. Drew Leder, *The Absent Body* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990).
8. A passage from Jean-Paul Fargier's film with Jacques Derrida, *Memoirs of the Blind* (1990).
9. See Kjetil Rodje, *Images of Blood in American Cinema* (London: Ashgate, 2015).

10. David Fellerath, "Nausea on a Sea of Blood: Why Did the Full Frame Festival Yank Noble Sacrifice?" *IndyWeek*, April 23, 2003.
11. Laura U. Marks, *The Skin of the Film: Intercultural Cinema, Embodiment, and the Senses* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000).
12. Fellerath, "Nausea on a Sea of Blood."
13. Vivian Sobchack, *The Address of the Eye: Phenomenology and Film Experience* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1992).

Chapter 7

This is a substantial revision of a chapter published in *Landscape and Film*, edited by Martin Lefebvre (New York: Routledge 2006). Warm thanks to Haidar Sadek, Akram Zaatari, and Mohamed Soueid for fruitful conversations in the course of this writing.

1. A tale related by Ka'b al-Ahbar to 'Umar ibn al-Khattab, in al-Maqrizi, *al-Mawai'iz wa-l-i'tibar bi-dhikr al-khitat wa-l-athar* (Cairo, 1324); quoted in Jibrail S. Jabbur, *The Bedouins and the Desert: Aspects of Nomadic Life in the Arab East*, trans. Lawrence I. Conrad (Albany: SUNY Press, 1995), 48.
2. Mohammed A. Bamyeh, *The Social Origins of Islam: Mind, Economy, Discourse* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1999), 7.
3. Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, trans. Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), 500.
4. Stephen Morris, "Structure from Instability," talk at the conference Subtle Technologies: Blurring the Boundaries between Art and Science, Toronto, May 11, 2002. See also Philip Ball, *The Self-Made Tapestry: Pattern Formation in Nature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001).
5. Manuel De Landa, "Geological History: 1000–1700 A.D.," *A Thousand Years of Nonlinear History* (New York: Zone, 1997), 55 and passim.
6. Bamyeh, *Social Origins of Islam*, 18–22.
7. William Gifford Palgrave, *Narrative of a Year's Journey through Central and Eastern Arabia, 1862–1863*, quoted in Jabbur, *Bedouins and the Desert*, 377.
8. M. 'Abd el-'Aziz, 1993, quoted in Madawi Al Rasheed, *A History of Saudi Arabia* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 154.
9. Daryl Champion, *The Paradoxical Kingdom: Saudi Arabia and the Momentum of Reform* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), 49.
10. I thank Haidar Sadek for pointing out the double striation at work in this film.
11. Bamyeh, *Social Origins of Islam*, 51, 176–177.
12. Mouny Berrah, "Algerian Cinema and National Identity," in *Screens of Life: Critical Film Writing from the Arab World*, ed. Alia Arasoughly (Québec: World Heritage Press, 1996), 74–75.

13. Jabbur, *Bedouins and the Desert*, 14.
14. Ali Abu Shadi, "Genres in Egyptian Cinema," in *Screens of Life*, 103.
15. Hady Zaccak, "Les Arabes dans 'le western,'" *Regard* 5 (January 2003): 53–58.
16. Quoted in Viola Shafik, *Arab Cinema: History and Cultural Identity* (Cairo: American University in Cairo Press, 1998), 197.
17. Saad Salman, interview with the author, October 9, 2002.
18. Donald P. Cole, "Where Have the Bedouin Gone?" *Anthropological Quarterly* 76, no. 2 (2003): 235–267, argues that "Bedouin" now designates less a way of life than a cultural identity as a result of the intertwining forces of colonization, commercialization of pasturage, new occupations, and sedentarization.
19. Bamyeh, *Social Origins of Islam*, 24.
20. Abdelrahmane Munif, *Cities of Salt*, trans. Peter Theroux (New York: Vintage International, 1987), 185–186.
21. Al-Rasheed, *History of Saudi Arabia*, 154.
22. Cole, "Where Have the Bedouin Gone?" 243.
23. I am indebted to Mohamed Soueid for this disturbing information.
24. The discourse on the road(block) movie genre continues to develop. See, for example, Nurith Gertz and George Khleifi, "Palestinian 'Roadblock Movies,'" *Geopolitics* 10, no. 2 (2005): 316–334; Haim Bresheeth, "Reviving the Palestinian Narrative on Film: Negotiating the Future through the Past and Present in *Route 181*," in *Resistance in Contemporary Middle Eastern Cultures: Literature, Cinema and Music*, ed. Karima Laachir and Saeed Talajooy (New York: Routledge, 2013), 138–152; and Nadia Yaqub, "Utopia and Dystopia in Palestinian Circular Journeys from Ghassân Kanafânî to Contemporary Film," *Middle Eastern Literatures*, 15, no. 3 (2012): 305–318.
25. Shafik, *Arab Cinema*, 155.
26. Deleuze's term for a place that has been stripped of its specificity, in *Cinema 2: The Time-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Robert Galeta (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989), xi.
27. Deleuze and Guattari, "1440: The Smooth and the Striated," *A Thousand Plateaus*, 493.
28. E. C., "Beyrouth au crible," *L'Humanité*, February 12, 2003.
29. Quoted in Bamyeh, *Social Origins of Islam*, 147.
30. Deleuze and Guattari write, "Ibn Khaldoun defines the war machine by: families or lineages PLUS esprit de corps." "1227: Treatise on Nomadology: The War Machine," in *A Thousand Plateaus*, 366.
31. See my chapter "Signs of the Time: Deleuze, Peirce and the Documentary Image," in *The Brain Is the Screen: Gilles Deleuze's Cinematic Philosophy*, ed. Gregory Flaxman (Minneapolis:

Minnesota University Press, 2000), 193–214. Films from Lebanon, including works by Walid Ra'ad, Jalal Toufic, and the Lebanese-Canadian Jayce Salloum, provide my central examples of the falsified documentary.

32. Deleuze and Guattari, "1227: Treatise on Nomadology," *A Thousand Plateaus*, 381.

Chapter 8

1. Joana Hadjithomas and Khalil Joreige, "Lasting Images," in *Home Works II: A Forum on Cultural Practices*, ed. Kaelen Wilson-Goldie, Masha Refka, Mohamad Hamdan, Yussef Bazzi, and Zeina Osman (Beirut: Lebanese Association for Plastic Arts—Ashkal Alwan, 2005), 142.

2. Carolyn Steedman, *Dust: The Archive and Cultural History* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2001), 69.

3. Mark A. Greene, "The Messy Business of Remembering: History, Memory, and Archives," *Archival Issues* 28, no. 2 (2003–2004): 95–103.

4. Mary Ann Doane, *The Emergence of Cinematic Time* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2002), 23.

5. Magdi Abdel Rahman, "Egypt," *Journal of Film Preservation* 77/78 (October 2008): 14.

6. Paula Amad, *Counter Archive: Film, the Everyday, and Albert Kahn's Archives de la Planète* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2010), 4, 94.

7. On the fossil image, see Laura U. Marks, *The Skin of the Film: Intercultural Cinema, Embodiment, and the Senses* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000), 51–53, 83–85, and passim.

8. Gilles Deleuze, *Foucault*, trans. Séan Hand (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1988), 117.

9. Steedman, *Dust*, 82, referring to D. W. Winnicott, "The Location of Cultural Experience," in *Playing and Reality* (London: Routledge, 1971), 95–103.

10. Hussein Omar, "Making Memory History," in *Speak, Memory: On Archives and Other Strategies of (Re) Activation of Cultural Memory*, ed. Laura Carderera (Cairo: Townhouse Gallery, 2011), 23.

11. Steedman, *Dust*, 45.

12. Allan Sekula, "The Body and the Archive," *October* 39 (Winter 1986): 3–64.

13. Nick Denes, "The Silver Screen: Re-Presenting Representations of Palestine," *This Week in Palestine*, 158 (June 2011): 1.

14. Charles Sanders Peirce, "How to Make Our Ideas Clear," in *Philosophical Writings of Peirce*, ed. Justus Buchler (New York: Dover, 1955), 30.

15. Steve Anderson, *Technologies of History: Visual Media and the Eccentricities of the Past* (Hanover, NH: Dartmouth College Press, 2011), 72.

16. Walid Sadek and Mayssa Fattouh, "Tranquility Is Made in Pictures," *Fillip* 17 (2012): 57.
17. Chad Elias, "The Libidinal Archive: A Conversation with Akram Zaatari," *Tate Papers*, 19, March 12, 2013. Elias is writing about Lebanese artists who began working in the 1990s, chiefly Lamia Joreige, Rabih Mroué, Walid Ra'ad, and Akram Zaatari.
18. Laura U. Marks, "Signs of the Time: Deleuze, Peirce and the Documentary image," in *The Brain Is the Screen: Gilles Deleuze's Cinematic Philosophy*, ed. Gregory Flaxman (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press, 2000), 193–214.
19. Walid Ra'ad, "Scratching on Things I Could Disavow: A History of Art in the Arab World," exhibition text, *Documenta* 13 (2012). On the Gulf Labor Project, see www.gulflabor.org.
20. Mario Perniola, *Enigmas: The Egyptian Moment in Society and Art*, trans. Christopher Woodall (London: Verso, 1995), 10.
21. Steedman, *Dust*, 83.
22. *Ibid.*, 77.
23. <http://dreamsofanation.org>, consulted January 12, 2013. No longer online.
24. Nahed Awwad, "In Search of Jerusalem Airport," *Jerusalem Quarterly* 35 (Autumn 2008): 51–63.
25. Rayess Bek, "Sound Box," *NOW Lebanon*, February 18, 2013.
26. *Ibid.*
27. Basel Abbas and Ruanne Abou-Rahme (in conversation with Tom Holert), "The Archival Multitude," *Journal of Visual Culture* 12, no. 3 (2013): 349.
28. Tashweesh, "Live in Ramallah" (2012), "Live in Beirut" (2012). <http://vimeo.com/tashweesh>.
29. Gilles Deleuze, *Cinema 2: The Time-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Barbara Habberjam (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989), 55.
30. To Foucault's categories of *seeable* and *sayable*, I add the *perceptible* or the *sensible*, for an archeology of sense memory: Marks, *The Skin of the Film*, chap. 1.
31. Deleuze, *Foucault*, 77.
32. Gilles Deleuze, *The Fold: Leibniz and the Baroque*, trans. Tom Conley (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press, 1993), 17.
33. Charles Sanders Peirce, "The Principles of Phenomenology," in *Philosophical Writings of Peirce*, ed. Buchler, 81.
34. See Laura U. Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity: An Islamic Genealogy of New Media Art* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2010), chap. 1, and chapter 3, this volume.
35. I argue that the Isma'ili Shi'ite theory of latent knowledge enfolded within manifest knowledge, developed in thought, historically informed European theories of the dialectic, for example,

through Hegel's fascination with alchemy. You can find some hints of how this knowledge traveled westward in the notes to chapter 7 of Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity*. For now I'll just assert that a theory of the fold—that the stuff of the universe consists of a unity folded tight into an infinitesimal multiplicity—is at minimum a bicultural, European and Islamic, theory.

36. Deleuze, *Foucault*, 57.

37. In Deleuze's terms, adapted from Peirce and Bergson.

38. Laura Mulvey, "Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema," *Screen* 16, no. 3 (1975): 6–18.

39. Hosni also populates the cinephilic oeuvre of Mohamed Soueid. In his film *Civil War*, a distressed male voice says over a shot of the twin towers falling on September 11, 2001, "Souad Hosni is dead!" His novel in Arabic, *Cabaret Suwad* (Beirut: Dar el-Adab, 2004), weaves personal and political histories around the figure of Hosni.

40. Terri Ginsberg and Chris Lippard, *Historical Dictionary of Middle Eastern Cinema* (London: Scarecrow Press, 2010), 182. Evidence for murder includes that Hosni's audio diaries, which she had been recording for her biography, were missing after her death. See, for example, Nessma Elassar, "Zouzou ...," <http://zouzou0.blogspot.ca>.

41. Rania Stephan, conversation with the author, June 28, 2014.

42. Matthew Maclellan, "Disturbing Pixels: Materiality of the Image in *The Three Disappearances of Soad Hosni*," student essay for my course "Media Art in the Arab World," Simon Fraser University, November 2013. In "Dossier on Media Art in the Arab World," <http://www.sfu.ca/sca/programs/art-culture-studies>.

43. Raed Yassin, conversation with the author, September 15, 2013.

44. Paul Bové, "The Foucault Phenomenon," introduction to Deleuze, *Foucault*, xxxi.

45. Alison Greinert, at a screening and discussion of the film with Jason Middleton and his students at the University of Rochester, March 4 and 5, 2014.

46. Deleuze, *Foucault*, 17.

47. *Ibid.*, 11–12.

48. *Ibid.*, 64.

49. Isaac Julien, "Undoing the Colonial Archive," in *Film and the End of Empire*, ed. Lee Grieveson and Colin McCabe (London: BFI, 2011), 273; Anderson, *Technologies of History*, 73.

50. Maha Maamoun, conversation with the author, April 26, 2013; Film Festival Rotterdam program notes, 2012.

51. Iman Hamam, "Al-Momia/The Mummy: Shadi Abdel Salam, 1969," in *The Cinema of North Africa and the Middle East*, ed. Gönül Dönmez-Colin (London: Wallflower Press, 2007), 34.

52. Akira Mizuta Lippit, "The Shadow Archive (a Secret Light)," *Atomic Light (Shadow Optics)* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), 13–21.

53. Philippe Azoury, "And Gary Cooper Rode Off into the Desert ... From the Rex to the Rif: A History of Movies in Tangier Told by Their Audience," in *Album: Cinémathèque de Tanger*, ed. Omar Berrada and Yto Barrada (Barcelona and Tanger: Institut de Cultura de la Ajuntament de Barcelona and Cinémathèque de Tanger, 2011), 110–114.
54. *Ibid.*, 132.
55. In 1994 a man's beheaded body was left on the steps of an Algiers movie theater. Flyers warned, "An example to all those who violate the morality of Islam." Robert Fisk, *The Great War for Civilization* (London: Fourth Estate, 2005), 670.
56. Ratiba Hadj-Moussa, *Sphère publique et télévision par satellite au Maghreb: genre, critique ordinaire, identités* (Grenoble: Presses Universitaires de Grenoble, forthcoming).
57. Elisabeth Lequeret, "Le pays des salles perdues," *Cahier du Cinéma* (February 2003): 32–34; "Dialogue de sourds entre la Cinémathèque algérienne et l'entreprise," *La Tribune*, February 26, 2014.
58. Lina Khatib, *Lebanese Cinema: Imaging the Civil War and Beyond* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2008), 25–26. Mohamed Soueid performed his lecture in Beirut in 2010 in Arabic and English, the latter under the title "Nostalgie de la Poussiere," and in New York in 2012 as "Written on the Dust." Available on Arteeast's YouTube channel.
59. Nadia Yaqub, "Azza El-Hassan and Impossible Filmmaking in Israel/Palestine," in *Resistance in Contemporary Middle Eastern Cultures: Literature, Cinema and Music*, ed. Karima Laachir and Saeed Talajooy (New York: Routledge, 2013), 159–160.
60. Najwa Najjar, "How Cinema Helped Me to Survive in Palestine," *Guardian*, April 18, 2008.
61. See Walid Ra'ad, "Civilizationally, We Do Not Dig Holes to Bury Ourselves," in *Stuff It: The Video Essay in the Digital Age*, ed. Ursula Biemann (Zürich: Institute for Theory of Art and Design, 2003), 34–45.
62. Amad, *Counter Archive*, 22 and *passim*.
63. Nohad Topalian, "Lebanese Documentary Uses Familiar Faces to Explore History," *Al-Shorfa*, June 9, 2012.
64. Townhouse Gallery, press release, April 1, 2013..
65. Allam uses the words *khudam television*, television services, though elsewhere he uses the French term *archive*.
66. "My Nineties" is gorgeously documented in a book in Arabic, available at http://issuu.com/moallam/docs/90s_web/1, accessed May 29, 2014. Clips of the programs can be seen thanks to the art organization Medrar at <http://www.medrar.org/projects/medrar-tv>.
67. Omar, 26.
68. Mahmoud Sabit, conversation with the author, June 25, 2012.

69. Sabit recommends Jacob Landau, *Parliaments and Parties in Egypt* (Haifa: University of Haifa, 1953).
70. Stéphanie Latte Abdallah, "Regards, visibilité historique et politique des images sur les réfugiés palestiniens depuis 1948," *Le mouvement social*, 219–220, 2–3 (2007): 65–91, cited in Laure Fourest, "Un cinéma palestinien «en mal d'archive,»" *Ateliers d'Anthropologie*, 36 (2012): paragraph 10.
71. Viktor Mayer-Schönberger, *Delete: The Virtue of Forgetting in the Digital Age* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2011), 61.
72. Giovanna Fossati, *From Grain to Pixel: the Archival Life of Film in Transition* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2009), 106–131.
73. Wanda Strauven, "Media Archaeology: Where Film History, Media Art, and New Media (Can) Meet," in *Preserving and Exhibiting Media Art: Challenges and Perspectives*, ed. Julia Noordegraaf, Cosetta G. Sabra, Barbara Le Maître, and Vinsenz Hediger (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2013), 69–71, 74.
74. Laura U. Marks, "Loving a Disappearing Image," *Cinémas* (Fall 1997): 93–112; reprinted in *Touch: Sensuous Theory and Multisensory Media* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2002), 91–110.
75. Rasha Salti, "Archive Fever: A Conversation between Naem Mohamien, Maha Maamoun and Rania Stephan," *Manifesta Journal* 14, no. 1 (March 2012): 29.
76. Sheyma Buali, "Digital, Aesthetic, Ephemeral: The Shifting Narrative of Uprising," *Ibraaz* (November 2012).
77. Michel Foucault, "Lives of Infamous Men," in *Power: Essential Works of Foucault, 1954–1984*, ed. Paul Rabinow (New York: New Press, 2000), 3: 175.
78. *Ibid.*, 159.
79. Lynne Huffer, "Foucault's Ethical *Ars Erotica*," *SubStance* 38, no. 3 (2009): 138.
80. Mathew Gagné, "Queer Beirut Online: The Participation of Men in Gayromeo.com," *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 8, no. 3 (Fall 2012): 113–137.
81. Marks, *The Skin of the Film*, chap. 1.
82. Hend Alawahi, correspondence with the author, August 9, 2014.
83. On the tensile strength of unfolding, see Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity*, 246–251.
84. Al-Jurjani, *Asrâr al-balaghah* [The secrets of eloquence], quoted in Kamal Abu Deeb, *Al-Jurjani's Theory of Poetic Imagery* (Warminster: Aris and Phillips, 1979), 278.
85. Joana Hadjithomas and Khalil Joreige, "On the Lebanese Rocket Society," *e-flux journal*, 2013.
86. *Ibid.* On the imaginal realm see chapter 15, note 54.

87. The disputed area, which both Lebanon and Israel claim as part of their Exclusive Economic Zone, measures 854 square kilometers. Israel hired companies to drill for natural gas in the Mediterranean in 2005, while Lebanon plans to start exploring only in 2015. Simon Henderson, "Israel and Lebanon at Odds over Offshore Border," *Washington Institute*, July 13, 2011; "Lebanon's Oil Fields Expected to Exceed Israel," *Ya Libnan*, April 26, 2013; Matt Nash, "Is Israel Stealing Lebanon's Gas? Bassil's Latest Concerns Seem More Like an Attempt to Pressure Miqati," *NOW Lebanon*, July 8, 2013.

Chapter 9

1. Elizabeth Grosz, "Chaos, Cosmos, Territory, Architecture," in *Chaos, Territory, Art: Deleuze and the Framing of the Earth* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008), 1–24.
2. *Ibid.*, 21.
3. Hala Elkoussy, interview with the author, April 26, 2013.
4. Ismail Fayed, "Nostalgia in Cairo: Hala Elkoussy's 'Journey around My Living Room,'" *Muftah*, May 14, 2013.

Chapter 10

This chapter includes a revised version of the catalogue essay "Performance and Its Other Side: Hassan Khan's *The Hidden Location*," for *A Space*, Toronto (2005).

1. Referring to my argument here in an earlier version of this chapter, Omnia El Shakry characterized it as "a Goffmanesque conception of the individual and society—that is to say, the distinction between public performance and the cavernous interiority of private selves so favored by Western theorists." Omnia El Shakry, "The Hidden Location: Art and Politics in the Work of Hassan Khan," *Third Text Asia: Special Issue on Arts, Scholarship and the Arab/Muslim World* 1, no. 2 (2009): 71–85. This hasty accusation of Orientalism is quite unfair. Khan's work inspired me to suggest a model of subjectivity that activates in public and becomes latent in private, something quite different from a conception of subjectivity as deep interiority.

Chapter 11

An earlier version of part of this chapter appeared as "Mounir Fatmi's Abstracting Winds," *Milennium Film Journal*, 53 (Fall/Winter 2010).

1. Mounir Fatmi, interview on *Hard Head//Tête dure* (2008), DVD compilation issued by Lowave, Paris. Fatmi's works are also distributed by Heure Exquise!
2. Farid Zahi, "Introduction: image et modernité au Maroc," in *D'un regard, l'autre: L'art et ses médiations au Maroc* (Rabat: Éditions Marsam, 2006), 11–12.
3. Oliver Leaman, *An Introduction to Classical Islamic Philosophy*, 2nd ed. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 147.

4. Salman Rushdie, *The Satanic Verses* (London: Viking, 1988); *Joseph Anton* (Toronto: Knopf, 2012).

Chapter 12

This chapter is inspired by conversations with Kareem Lotfy in Cairo in June 2012. Part of it appeared as “Arab Glitch,” in *Uncommon Grounds: New Media and Visual Practice in the Middle East and North Africa*, ed. Anthony Downey (I.B. Tauris/Ibraaz, 2014); published with permission.

1. See Laura U. Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity: An Islamic Genealogy of New Media Art* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2010).
2. ‘Ala Younis, “À propos de l’artiste Mohssin Harraki,” curatorial note for “Oltre mésures et programmes radio,” La Galerie, Contemporary Art Center of Noisy-le-Sec, July 22, 2011.
3. Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity*, 163–165, 230–235, 254–262.
4. Roy Samaha, exhibition text for *A Secret of Secrets* (2013).
5. Jananne Al-Ani in conversation with Nat Muller, “Technologies of History,” *Ibraaz Platform 7* (June 2014): 3.
6. Eitan Freedenberg, at a discussion of the film with Jason Middleton and his students at the University of Rochester, March 5, 2014.
7. “The Surface of Spectral Shattering,” Townhouse Gallery, May 31–June 25, 2014, gallery text.
8. Jahd Khalil, “An Artwork of Scales and Planes,” *Mada Masr*, June 10, 2014.
9. Olga Goriunova and Alexei Shulgin, “Glitch,” in *Software Studies: A Lexicon*, ed. Matthew Fuller (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2008), 114.
10. “Power Cutoffs Threaten Egyptian Lives,” *Your Middle East*, June 14, 2013.
11. Mahmoud Salem, “Sisi’s camouflage campaign unravels in election’s final hours,” *Al Monitor*, May 28, 2014.
12. “Two Bombs Exploded underneath an Electricity Tower in the Delta City of Monufiya, North of Cairo, on Friday, the State-Run Middle East News Agency Reported,” *Mada Masr*, August 15, 2014.
13. Goriunova and Shulgin, “Glitch,” 115–116.
14. Nayiri Boghossian, “Copyright Protection in the Arab World,” *Newsletter of the Abu Dhabi International Book Fair*, September 29, 2010, 12–13.
15. Charbel Nassar, “Le patrimoine culturel immatériel au Liban à la lumière de l’expérience internationale,” report commissioned by Modern Heritage Observatory, September 2013, <http://www.modernheritageobservatory.org>.
16. Paige Kollock, “Piracy Greeted with Collective Yawn in Lebanon,” *NOW Lebanon*, June 6, 2010.

17. Lawrence White, "Disillusioned," in *Insights into Syrian Cinema*, ed. Rasha Salti (New York: ArteEast, 2006), 57.
18. Lucas Hilderbrand, *Inherent Vice: Bootleg Histories of Videotape and Copyright* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009), 23; Ramon Lobato, *Shadow Economies of Cinema: Mapping Informal Film Distribution* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012).
19. Ammar Bouras, untitled text, in *There & Back. Africa*, ed. Carlos María Martínez (Madrid: La Casa Encendida, 2005), n.p.
20. Adlène Meddi, "A Painful Artwork on Algeria's Dark Decade," *Mash'allah News*, February 24, 2011.
21. Robert Fisk, *The Great War for Civilization* (London: Fourth Estate, 2005), 666–669.
22. Anthony Downey, "The Video That Exploded: A Conversation between Roy Samaha and Anthony Downey," *Ibraaz* (November 2012): 51.
23. In fact, the film screened and won awards at the Gulf Film Festival, Ayyam Cinema Beirut, Rotterdam Arab Film Festival, and Dubai International Film Festival and was shown on Emirates TV.
24. Sadie Plant, *Zeros and Ones: Digital Women and the New Technoculture* (New York: Doubleday, 1997); Carol Bier, "Pattern Power: Textiles and the Transmission of Mathematical Knowledge," in *Appropriation, Acculturation, Transformation: Textile Society of America 9th Annual Symposium 2004*, ed. Inez Brooks-Myers, Susan Tselos, and Carol Bier (Middletown, DE: Textile Society of America, 2004; CD-ROM).
25. Bob Brodsky and Toni Treadway, "Experimental Film on the Digital Doorstep," *Moving Image* 12, no. 1 (2012): 99.
26. Annette Ittig, "Ziegler's Sultanabad Carpet Enterprise," *Iranian Studies* 25, no. 1/2 (1992): 127.
27. Helen Stuhr-Rommerein, "Living in a Digital World," *Egypt Independent*, October 7, 2012.
28. Peter Galison, "Images Scatter into Data, Data Gather into Images," in *Iconoclasm: Beyond the Image Wars in Science, Religion and Art*, ed. Peter Weibel and Bruno Latour (Karlsruhe: ZKM, 2002), 300–322.
29. For more on nonorganic life in textile and digital media, see chapter 10 of Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity*.
30. Yasmine Allam, "Khaled Hafez and the Art of Revolution—from Premonition to Stockholm Syndrome," *Contemporary Practices: Visual Arts from the Middle East* 10 (2011): 127.
31. On the ethics of the animal encounter in this work, see Adrienne Evans, "Strange to Herself: Getting Close Becomes Serious Work for Mounira Al Solh," student essay for my course Media Art in the Arab World, Simon Fraser University, November 2013, in "Dossier on Media Art in the Arab World," <http://www.sfu.ca/sca/programs/art-culture-studies>.
32. Ahmed Elshaer, comments on his 2010 artwork *Reissue* at <http://www.ahmedelshaer.com>.

33. Omar Kholeif, "The Case for Egyptian Media Art: Ahmed Basyony: Media Artist or Martyr?" *Contemporary Practices: Visual Arts from the Middle East* 10 (2011): 74–79.

Chapter 13

This chapter is a substantial revision of "Getting in Touch: Palestinian Video from Haptic Image to Networked Space," in *Palestinian Video Art: Constellation of the Moving Image*, ed. Bashir Makhouf (Jerusalem: Palestinian Art Court, 2013).

1. Laura U. Marks, "Video Haptics and Erotics," *Screen* 39, no. 4 (1998): 343.
2. *Ibid.*, 345.
3. Anna Ball, "Impossible Intimacies: Towards a Visual Politics of 'Touch' at the Israeli-Palestinian Border," *Journal for Cultural Research* 16, no. 2–3 (2012): 175–195.
4. Laura U. Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity: An Islamic Genealogy of New Media Art* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2010), 133.
5. Nadia Yaqub, "Azza El-Hassan and Impossible Filmmaking in Israel/Palestine," in *Resistance in Contemporary Middle Eastern Cultures: Literature, Cinema and Music*, ed. Karima Laachir and Saeed Talajooy (New York: Routledge; 2013), 153.
6. See, for example, Larry Gross, John Stuart Katz, and Jay Ruby, eds., *Image Ethics: The Moral Rights of Subjects in Photographs, Film, and Television* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988); Larry Gross, John Stuart Katz, and Jay Ruby, eds., *Image Ethics in the Digital Age* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2003); Susan Sontag, *Regarding the Pain of Others* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2003); and Ariella Azoulay, *The Civil Contract of Photography*, trans. Rela Mazali and Ruvik Danieli (New York: Zone Books, 2008).
7. Yaqub, "Azza El-Hassan and Impossible Filmmaking," 157.
8. Azoulay, *Civil Contract of Photography*, chap. 2.
9. Charles Sanders Peirce, "Logic as Semiotic: The Theory of Signs," in *Philosophical Writings of Peirce*, ed. Justus Buchler (New York: Dover, 1955), 99.
10. Laura U. Marks, "Enfolding-Unfolding Aesthetics, or the Unthought at the Heart of Wood," in *Technology and Desire: The Transgressive Art of Moving Images*, ed. Rania Gaafar and Martin Schulz (Karlsruhe: ZKM and London: Intellect Books), 151–161.
11. Thanks to Elysia Bourne for pointing this out.
12. This doesn't include those dumb postproduction effects that make a digital video look like a scratched film.
13. See Rosalind Krauss, *A Voyage on the North Sea: Art in the Age of the Post-Medium Condition* (London: Thames and Hudson, 2000); D. N. Rodowick, *The Virtual Life of Film* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2007); and for a useful summary of these and other arguments,

Temenuga Trifonova, "The Twilight of the Index," *Cinema: Journal of Philosophy and the Moving Image* 2 (2011): 61–89.

14. Laura Allsop, "Colourful Shadows and Reel Journeys: Tarzan and Arab in Conversation with Laura Allsop," *Ibraaz*, May 2, 2012.

15. Omar Kholeif, "Good Intentions Gone Wrong: Gaza as Metaphor in the Work of Tarzan and Arab," in *Palestinian Video Art*, ed. Bashir Makhoul (Jerusalem: Palestine Art Court, 2013), 110–120.

16. Jad Abi Khalil, in a conversation at Beirut DC on June 26, 2014.

17. Bashir Makhoul, "Locations, Transmissions and the Constellation of Palestinian Video Art," in *Palestinian Video Art*, 22.

18. Abir Boukhari, "Curator's Statement," *Arab Shorts: Independent Short Films and Media Art* (Cairo: Goethe-Institut Kairo, 2012), 111.

19. Grahame Weinbren, "Navigating in the Ocean of Streams of Story," *Millennium Film Journal*, 28 (1995).

20. Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity*, 144.

21. *Ibid.*, 145.

22. Alexander Galloway and Eugene Thacker, *The Exploit: A Theory of Networks* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2007), 20.

23. In 2014 a number of Israeli intelligence officers refused to serve in such operations. Peter Beaumont, "Israeli Intelligence Veterans Refuse to Serve in Palestinian Territories," *Guardian*, September 12, 2014.

24. Gilles Deleuze, "Postscript on the Societies of Control," translator not credited, *October* 59 (Winter 1992), 5; Lev Manovich, "The Poetics of Augmented Space," *Visual Communication* 5 (June 2006): 221.

25. Gareth Evans, "Israeli Surveillance: Technologies of the Future," *Army Technology*, February 3, 2010.

26. Sobhi al-Zobaidi, "Tora Bora Cinema," *Jump Cut*, no. 50 (Spring 2008).

27. Gilles Deleuze, *Cinema 1: The Movement-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Barbara Habberjam (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 205.

28. Shaina Anand, discussion at the Robert Flaherty Film Seminar, Colgate, NY, June 17, 2004.

29. Shaina Anand, e-mail to the author, July 17, 2014.

Chapter 14

1. Kuniichi Uno, "Variations on Cruelty," in *The Genesis of an Unknown Body*, trans. Melissa McMahon (Helsinki: n-1 Publications, 2012), 35.

2. Sherif El-Azma, "The Psychogeography of Loose Associations," *e-flux journal* 10 (November 2009): 5.
3. Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *Anti-Oedipus*, trans. Robert Hurley, Mark Seem and Helen R. Lane (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), 286–288 and passim.
4. El Azma, "Psychogeography of Loose Associations," 9.
5. Sherif El-Azma, interview with the author, June 10, 2012.
6. Kaelen Wilson-Goldie, "Sherif El-Azma," *Bidoun*, 17 (Spring 2009).
7. Uno, "Variations on Cruelty."
8. Nigel Ryan, "Merely Players: Federico Sangirardi Quinto di Wardal," *Al-Ahram Weekly*, March 12, 2003.
9. Gilles Deleuze, *Cinema 2: The Time-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Robert Galeta (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989), 168.
10. El Azma, interview with the author.

Chapter 15

Part of this chapter appears in *Paragraph*, 38:1, ed. Nicholas Chare and Elizabeth Watkins (Spring 2015).

1. On the embodied turn in cinema theory, see, for example, Vivian Sobchack, *The Address of the Eye* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1992); Vivian Sobchack, *Carnal Thoughts: Embodiment and Moving Image Culture* (Berkeley: University of California, 2004); Laura U. Marks, *The Skin of the Film: Intercultural Cinema, Embodiment, and the Senses* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000); Martine Beugnet, *Cinema and Sensation: French Film and the Art of Transgression* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007); Tiago de Luca, *Realism of the Senses in World Cinema: The Experience of Physical Reality* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2013).
2. Viola Shafik, "Resisting Pleasure? Political Opposition and the Body in Arab Cinema," in *Resistance in Contemporary Middle Eastern Cultures*, ed. Karima Laachir and Saeed Talajooy (New York: Routledge, 2013), 121–137.
3. Annemarie Jacir, "I Wanted That Story to Be Told," interview with Ferial Ghazoul, Moustafa Bayoumi, Hamid Dabashi, and Mark Westmoreland, *Alif: Journal of Comparative Poetics*, no. 31 (2011): 247.
4. Eyal Sivan's documentary film *Jaffa, the Orange's Clockwork* (2010) documents this history with careful attention to labor relations during the British Mandate.
5. On the "cruel" and transformative character of this translation, see Alexandra Lukes, "The Asylum of Nonsense: Antonin Artaud's Translation of Lewis Carroll," *Romanic Review* 104, no. 1–2 (2013), 105–126.

6. Carroll's poem reads simply, "It would be better to obey."
7. Central to many European, Arabic, and Persian philosophies, this idea that all entities but God suffer from a relative lack of being was articulated by Abu 'Ali al-Husayn ibn Sinâ (980–1037) in the metaphysics of his *Al-Shifa'* (The healing) in the concept of univocity of being, in which an essence (God) is in itself indifferent toward existence or nonexistence. The philosophical debate between being and existence has historically undergone vast permutations. However, the concept of being in Islamic philosophy is etymologically richer than the Latinate version. The Arabic verb *wujûd* means not just being but finding, experiencing, and engendering. One can argue that it expresses a concept of being as process. See Parviz Morewedge, "The Neoplatonic Structure of Some Islamic Mystical Doctrines," in *Neoplatonism and Islamic Thought*, ed. Parviz Morewedge (Albany, NY: SUNY Press, 1992); Lenn Evan Goodman, *Avicenna* (New York: Routledge, 1992), 62; and Sajjad H. Rizvi, *Mulla Sadra and Metaphysics: Modulation of Being* (London: Routledge, 2009), 43–47.
8. Kuniichi Uno, "Variations on Cruelty," *The Genesis of an Unknown Body*, trans. Melissa McMahon (Helsinki: n-1 Publications, 2012), 35.
9. *Ibid.*, 35.
10. Elena del Rio, *Deleuze and the Cinemas of Performance: Powers of Affection* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), 27, 114–116.
11. On the affect of unfolding, see Laura U. Marks, *Enfoldment and Infinity: An Islamic Genealogy of New Media Art* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2010), 249–251, and chapter 13 in this book.
12. Rosi Braidotti, "Sustainable Ethics and the Body in Pain," *Nomadic Theory: The Portable Rosi Braidotti* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2011), 302–303.
13. Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, "How Do You Make Yourself a Body without Organs?" *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, trans. Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), 160.
14. See Joana Hadjithomas and Khalil Joreige, "Latency," in *Home Works: A Forum on Cultural Practices in the Region*, ed. Christine Tohme and Mona Abou Rayyan (Beirut: Ashkal Alwan, 2003), 40–45.
15. Baruch Spinoza, *Ethics*, Part III, "On the Origin and Nature of the Emotions," Prop. LVI; Gilles Deleuze, *Spinoza, Practical Philosophy*, trans. Robert Hurley (San Francisco: City Lights Books, 1988), 88.
16. Spinoza, *Ethics*, Part III, Prop. II.
17. Spinoza's doctrine enjoins obedience to God, the very thing Artaud rejects, insofar as it "teaches us to act solely according to the decree of God, and to be partakers in the Divine nature, and so much the more, as we perform more perfect actions and more and more understand God" (*Ethics*, Part I, Prop. XLIX). Yet this divine obedience is not blind servitude but a manner of discovering one's powers.

18. Deleuze, *Spinoza, Practical Philosophy*, 74, 85.
19. Mai Al-Nakib, "Disjunctive Synthesis: Deleuze and Arab Feminism," *Signs* 38, no. 2 (Winter 2013): 459–482.
20. Samir Kassir, *Being Arab*, trans. Will Hobson (London: Verso, 2006).
21. Al-Nakib, 478.
22. I'm sure other teachers will relate as much as I do to these moments when, at the limits of discourse, the body returns with a vengeance!
23. Hazem Zohny, "Stammer: Freaky, Philosophical Art," *Egypt Independent*, March 4, 2010; Angela Harutyunyan, "Stammering as a (Non) Representational Paradigm: Shady Elnoshakaty's *Stammer 2007–2010*," *Contemporary Practices: Visual Arts from The Middle East* 7 (2010).
24. Allese Thompson Baker, "Shady Elnoshokaty Talks about *Stammer*," *Artforum*, March 12, 2012.
25. See Sobchack, *Address of the Eye*.
26. Gilles Deleuze, *Cinema 2: The Time-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Robert Galeta (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989), 166.
27. Laura U. Marks, "Affective Analysis," in Patricia Ticineto Clough and R. Joshua Scannell, eds., section on affect and sensation for *International Handbook of Interdisciplinary Research Methods*, ed. Celia Lury (forthcoming, Routledge).
28. Stephanie Bailey, "The Making of ... Sophia Al-Maria," *Art Asia Pacific*, no. 90 (September/October 2014).
29. Gulf Labor: Who's Building the Guggenheim Abu Dhabi? is a project initiated in 2011 by a collective of artists and others to fight for the protection of the rights of migrant workers hired to build and maintain museums on Saadiyat Island in Abu Dhabi. The Coalition for Fair Labor at NYU pressured New York University to protect the rights of construction workers at the university's Abu Dhabi campus, with some success. Lebanese advocates for migrant workers include Caritas Lebanon Migrant Center, founded in 1994, and the Insan Association, founded in 2000. On legal developments, see Human Rights Watch, "2014 World Report: Lebanon," <http://www.hrw.org/world-report/2014/country-chapters/Lebanon>.
30. Deleuze, *Cinema 2: The Time Image*, 189.
31. Ibid.
32. Amrita Pande, "From 'Balcony Talk' and 'Practical Prayers' to Illegal Collectives: Migrant Domestic Workers and Meso-Level Resistances in Lebanon," *Gender and Society* 26 (2012): 382.
33. Farid Zahi, "Art, islam et modernité: Le corps dans la peinture marocaine," in *D'un regard, l'autre: L'art et ses médiations au Maroc* (Rabat: Éditions Marsam, 2006), 78; my translation.
34. Jamal J. Elias, *Aisha's Cushion: Religious Art, Perception, and Practice in Islam* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2012), 210–212.

35. Ibid., 212–215; Rizvi, *Mulla Sadra and Metaphysics*, 85–87.
36. William C. Chittick, “The View from Nowhere: Ibn Al-‘Arabi on the Soul’s Temporal Unfolding,” in Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka, ed., *Timing and Temporality in Islamic Philosophy and Phenomenology of Life* (New York: Springer, 2007), 5.
37. Walid El Khachab, “Face of the Human and Surface of the World: Reflections on Cinematic Pantheism,” *Intermedialités* 8 (Fall 2006): 121–134.
38. Zahi, “Art, islam et modernité,” 78–79; my translation.
39. Farid Zahi, “Métamorphose du corps: Le corps et le genre dans la culture arabe,” *Le corps de l’autre: Essais sur l’image, le corps et l’altérité* (Tunis: Wassiti Editions, 2012), 13.
40. Frédéric Lagrange, “The Obscenity of the Vizier,” in *Islamicate Sexualities: Translations across Temporal Geographies of Desire*, ed. Kathryn Babayan and Afsaneh Najmabadi (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2008), 167, 187–188.
41. Chad Elias, “The Libidinal Archive: A Conversation with Akram Zaatari,” *Tate Papers* 19 (March 12, 2013): 17.
42. Joseph Pearson, “Limits of Discussion: The Rhetoric of Homosexuality and Gender in Middle Eastern Video Art,” in *Indicated by Signs: Contested Public Space, Gendered Bodies, and Hidden Sites of Trauma in Contemporary Visual Art Practices*, ed. Aleya Hamza and Edit Molnar (Bonn: Bonner Kunstverein and Goethe-Institut Kairo, 2010), 104.
43. See Joseph Massad, *Desiring Arabs* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007); Valerie Traub, “The Past Is a Foreign Country? The Time and Place of Islamicate Sexuality Studies,” in *Islamicate Sexualities*, 17–20; and Tarek Al-Ariss, *Trials of Arab Modernity: Literary Affects and the New Political* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2013), 117–120.
44. Zahi, “*Metamorphose du corps*,” 14–15.
45. Leslie Pierce, *Morality Tales: Law and Gender in the Ottoman Court of Aintab* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003).
46. Lacking habeas corpus, the family find themselves in the situation of thousands of Lebanese whose relatives disappeared during the civil war of 1975–1990: without the proof that their husband, brother, or father is dead, they are unable to mourn properly. This is also a central issue in Hadjithomas and Joreige’s feature *A Perfect Day* of 2006.
47. <http://hadjithomasjoreige.com/ramad-ashes/>.
48. Gilles Deleuze, *Cinema 1: The Movement-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Barbara Habberjam (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 73.
49. Edouard Naville, introduction to *The Book of the Dead*, trans. Helen Mary Tirard (New York: E. S. Gorham, 1910), 48–49.
50. Rachid Belghiti, “Dance and the Colonial Body: Re-choreographing Postcolonial Theories of the Body,” doctoral dissertation, University of Montréal 2012, 138.

51. This is not to state that in fact women who have had their clitoris removed do not have pleasure in sex. Many assert that they do, like the North African sexual educator living in Germany in Claudia Richarz and Ulrike Zimmermann's documentary *Vulva 3.0* (2013), who both affirms that she enjoys sex and averts more prurient questioning.

52. Turk may have been motivated less by piety than by a need to manage her public image. She was imprisoned on a vice charge in 1996, and though she maintained that she was innocent, after that, audiences would cluck in disapproval when she appeared onscreen. Andrew Hammond, *Pop Culture Arab World: Media, Arts, and Lifestyle* (Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 2005), 139.

53. Samir Farid, "Creative Censorship," *Al-Ahram Weekly Online*, November 16–22, 2006.

54. The imaginal realm is a concept of Eastern Islamic philosophy, as well as Sufism, most thoroughly expressed in the work of Mulla Sadra Shirazi (1571–1640). It is a visible and audible but intangible realm, more real than matter, in which prophesies and true dreams take form as emanations from God. Contemporary Muslim thinkers such as Mohammed Arkoun turn it into a conception of social imagination that would account for the way people's collective wishes bring the unthinkable into the thinkable. See Mohammed Arkoun, "Rethinking Islam Today," *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 588 (July 2003): 31–32.

55. Spinoza, *Ethics*, Part III, Prop. XXXII.

56. Nicolas Puig, "Egypt's Pop-Music Clashes and the 'World-Crossing' Destinies of Muhammad 'Ali Street Musicians," in *Cairo Cosmopolitan: Politics, Culture, and Space in the New Globalized Middle East*, ed. Diane Singerman and Paul Amar (Cairo: Cairo American University in Cairo Press, 2006), 528–531.

