

This is a section of [doi:10.7551/mitpress/11558.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.7551/mitpress/11558.001.0001)

Inventive Minds

Marvin Minsky on Education

By: Marvin Minsky

Edited by: Cynthia Solomon, Xiao Xiao

Citation:

Inventive Minds: Marvin Minsky on Education

By: Marvin Minsky

Edited by: Cynthia Solomon, Xiao Xiao

DOI: 10.7551/mitpress/11558.001.0001

ISBN (electronic): 9780262350273

Publisher: The MIT Press

Published: 2019



The MIT Press

Index

Page numbers in *italic* refer to figures.

- Abelson, Hal, xxiv, 37
- Abilities, 109–110
- Actions, purposeful or goal-based, 135
- Adams, Curt, 74–75
- AI Lab (MIT), xix–xx, xxv
- AI Lab (MIT) Logo Group, xxii, xxiv, xxvi
- Algebra, abstract, 50
- Ambitions, acquiring, 90–95
- Analogies, finding appropriate, 111
- Apple Logo, xxii
- Apprenticeships, 53–54
- ArcMac, xxv
- Aristotle, 92
- Arithmetic
- magic of, 4
 - questions children should ask about, 48
 - teaching, xxvii, 4, 41–42, 44–45
- Artificial intelligence (AI). *See also* “Education and Psychology” (Minsky)
- architecture, xxxii
 - background, xv, 130
 - existential risks of, xxxv
 - founding principles, xxxii
 - key insights of, xxxvii
 - pursuing, reasons for, xxxvii–xxxviii
 - social nature of, xxxv
- Atari Cambridge Research Lab, xxii–xxiii, xxiv, xxvi
- Atari Logo, xxii, xxv, 16
- Athletics, 115
- Attachment figures, 78, 92
- Augustine, 137
- BBN Technologies, xix
- Behavior-based theories, 131–140
- Bender, Walter, xxv, 99
- Bontá, Paula, xxv

- Brains, human. *See also* Minds
 compositional quality, xxxiv
 resources of, 105
- Bruner, Jerome, 62
- Bullying, 95, 117
- Celebrities, emulating, 88–89
- Chess-playing machine, 71
- Childhood
 carefree, 66–67, 88
 playfulness of, 104
- Children
 ambitions, acquiring, 90–95
 attention spans, 68
 bullying, 95, 117
 cognitive styles, diversity in,
 72–74
 development of, grade-based
 segregation and, 65–67
 goals, acquiring, 90–95
 infantile attitudes, 65–66
 intellectual, predicaments of,
 117–118
 interests, helping to pursue,
 94–95
 limitations, teaching, 81–83
 preparing for the future,
 53–55, 73
 as programmed computers,
 81–83, 86–87
 resourcefulness, 85
 self-image in, 87–90, 141
 socializing, 74–75
 typical, 72–74
- Cognitive maps, 81
- Cognitive science, 130
- Cognitive styles, 72–74
- Cognitive towers, 99, 105–106
- Combinatorics, 50
- Common sense, 123
- Competence, 130
- Computer literacy, 3
- Computers
 abilities of, 12–13
 compositional quality, xxxiv
 in education, role of, xxxvii
 explaining, 4
 limitations of, 25
 personal, precursors to, 30–34
 as potentially human, xxxvii
 potential of, xxxi–xxxii
 programmed, children as,
 81–83, 86–87
 promise of, 18
 TinkerToy, xxiv–xxv, 9, 30–31
 understanding, 10–11
- Computer science
 in the curriculum, 142
 importance of, 167n1
 Minsky on, xv
- Computer science education, xxiii
- Confessions* (Augustine), 137
- Constructing Modern Knowledge,
 xxiv, 60–61
- Constructionism, xxxvi, 140–141
- Construction sets. *See also specific sets*
 limitations of, 10
 magic of, 5, 16
 pre-purposing, success and, 25
- Crafts, physical fabrication, 115
- Creativity, xxxvi

- Critical thinking, learning, 151
- Critics, 107–109
- Curriculum
- computer science in the, 142
 - cybernetics in the, 140–142
 - psychology in the, 128–130
 - school structure and, 62
- Cybernetics
- background, 143
 - feedback loops, systems with, 142–144
 - founding principles, xxxii
 - inspiration from, 23–24, 130
 - projects, 144–151
 - psychology and, 130
 - teaching, instead of psychology, 140–144
 - working models of intelligence and, 23–24
- Debugging, 100–101
- Discomfort, enjoying, 137–138
- Division, 46
- Draw, learning to, 155–162
- Dropouts, 89–90
- Edtech, 101
- Education
- computer science in, 142
 - computers in, role of, xxxvii
 - cybernetics in, 140–142
 - “Effects of Grade-Based Segregation” (Minsky), 59, 65, 134
 - maker movement, 99–100
 - psychology in, 128–130
 - “Questioning General Education” (Minsky), xxxvi, 99, 103
 - standard model, limitations of, xxxvi
 - “Education and Psychology” (Minsky), 127
 - introduction, 121
 - on self-reflection, xxxvi
 - theme, xxxii
 - “Effects of Grade-Based Segregation” (Minsky), 65
 - on cognition, 134
 - introduction, 59
- Efforts, mindless, xxxiii
- Emotion Machine, The* (Minsky), xiii, xv, xxx, xxxii, 71–72, 79, 84–85, 88, 91, 94, 99–101, 105–107, 113
- Emotion-reason-aesthetics, distinctions among, 79
- Emotions, 137–140, 172n1
- Erector-Sets, 9, 116
- Evolution, understanding, 17
- Expertise
- developing, 104–105
 - diverse, 60
 - Minsky’s early areas of, 155–162, 174n2
 - negative, 57, 94, 112, 130
- Fabrications
- computational, 116–117
 - simulated, 116
- Failure, 94, 109, 139
- Failures, academic, 89–90
- Fake news, 124

- Feedback, 122
- Feedback loops, systems with, 142–144
- Feelings, 77, 137–140, 172n1
- Feurzeig, Wally, xix
- FischerTechnik, 10
- 50-minute hour, 68–72
- Force-sensing screens, xxii
- Four-voice music box, xviii, xx
- Freud, Sigmund, xviii, 113
- Fry, Stephen, 77
- Fugue, 37
 - defined, 170n1
 - improvising, 174n2
- Fun, hard, 25, 61, 101

- Games, teaching with, 42
- Gears, magic in, 78
- Geeks, 95, 117
- General Problem Solver (GPS), xxxii, 135–136, 142
- General Turtle, xxi
- Genesis Project, xxv–xxvi
- Genius, xxix
- Geometry, 46, 48
- Goals
 - achieving, 109–110
 - acquiring, 90–95
 - centrality of, xxxii–xxxiii
 - developing, social processes in, xxxiv
 - internalizing in education, xxxii
 - process-based, 142–143
 - thinking and, 135
- GP, programming language, 27–28
- GPS. *See* General Problem Solver (GPS)

- Grey Walter. *See* Walter, William Grey
- Grit, 89

- Hard fun, 25, 61, 101
- Heuristics, reflexive, xxxvi–xxxvii
- Hillis, Danny, xxiv–xxv, 30
- Hobbies
 - education vs., 104–105
 - flat, 114
 - focusing on, 106
 - mathematic concepts, thinking about, 114
 - Minsky on, 61
 - parental focus on, 104
 - vertical specialties vs., 114–116
- Honesty, intellectual, 25
- Hour of Code, 100

- Ideas
 - developing, 68–69
 - powerful, learning, 20, 22
 - power of, xxxi–xxxii
- If->Do* rules, 134–135
- If->Do->Then* rules, 135
- Impersonation, 85
- Imprimers
 - defined, xxxv, 92
 - internalized copies of, 78–79
 - “Learning from Role Models, Mentors, and Imprimers” (Minsky), xxix, xxxii, 77, 81
 - for value acquisition, 93
 - “Infinite Construction Kit, The” (Minsky), 3
 - afterword, 19

- quotes, 77
- secret of, xxxiii
- Intelligence
 - fixed, 132–133
 - importance of, 66
 - model component, 78
 - term usage, 109–110
 - working models of, 23–24
- Joystick, force-feedback, xxii
- Kay, Alan, xxii, xxiii–xxiv, 19
- Knowledge
 - same-level, 114
 - social construction of, 60
- Kubrick, Stanley, 157, 162
- Language
 - learning, 3
 - of mathematics, 52–53
- Laptops, precursors to, 30–34
- Lave, Jean, 60
- Learning
 - by animals, 91
 - diversity in, 72–74
 - efficient, 71
 - joyous struggles of, 25
 - by making, Minsky on, 62
 - negative in, 57
 - playful, 101
 - power of, 25
 - real, 25
 - reward-based, 128–130, 137–139
 - social nature of, xxxv
 - teaching, 127
 - “Learning from Role Models, Mentors, and Imprimers” (Minsky), 81
 - on goals, xxxii
 - introduction, 77
 - on problem solving, xxix
 - theme, xxxii
- Learning machines, 71–72
- Learning theory
 - behavior-based, 131–140
 - reward-based, 128–130
- “Learning to Draw” (Margaret Minsky), 155
- LEGO, 9–10, 116
- Letters, 11
- Lifelong Kindergarten Group, xxxv
- Literacy, computer, 3
- Literature, 11
- Logic, 49
- Logo
 - beginnings, xix, 78, 99
 - components of, 8
 - compositional quality, xxxiv
 - constructing from, 8
 - four-voice music box, xviii, xx
 - object-oriented, xxii
 - possibilities of, 13
- Logo Computer Systems Inc., xxi–xxii, xxv
- Logo Group (AI Lab, MIT), xix, xxii, xxiv, xxvi
- Logo turtle geometry, 24
- Logo turtle-graphics computer, xxi–xxii
- Logo turtles, programming, 27–29

- LogoWriter, xxv
Lorre, Chuck, 87–90
- Machines
chess-playing, 71
cultural prejudices against, xxxvii
mindful, creating, xxxvii
thinking of oneself as, 151–152
TinkerToy computer, 9, 30–31
- Magic, 124
- Magic tricks, 151
- Maker movement, 99–100
- Martian szneech, 11
- Mathematic concepts, thinking about, 114
- Mathematics. *See also* Arithmetic
bringing to life, 48–51
dislike of, 81
vocabulary of, 52–53
- Mathematics, learning
communities, 53–55
difficulty of, reasons for, xxxii–xxxiii
expertise, negative, 57
impoverished language of, 51
introduction, 37–40
mentors, 53–55
novelty over drudgery, emphasizing, 55–56
programming for, 27, 45–46
“What Makes Mathematics Hard to Learn” (Minsky), 41
introduction, 37
theme, xxxii
- Mathematics curriculum, historically, 44–45
- Mathematics education, improvements proposed by DOE, 171n5
- McCarthy, John, xviii–xix
- McCulloch, Warren, xix
- Meccano, xxxiv, 9, 116
- Mechanics, 49
- Memory, 10, 68–69
- Mental resources, 109–110
- Mentors
defined, 93
finding in network communities, 96–97
functions of, 94
“Learning from Role Models, Mentors, and Imprimers” (Minsky), xxix, xxxii, 77, 81
- MicroWorlds, xxv
- Mindlessness, xxxvii
- Mindlinking, 11
- Minds. *See also* Brains, human
cognitive towers of, 105–106
compositional quality, xxxiv
critics in, 107–109
explaining, 24
high-level credit-assignments, 132
multiplicity of parts, xxxv–xxxvi
preconceptions, suffering caused by, xxxviii
- Mindstorms* (Papert), 78
- Minsky, Margaret
background, xxvi
“Learning to Draw,” 155

- Minsky, Marvin
 accomplishments, xxix
 biography, xii–xiii
 characteristics, xxix–xxxii, 59,
 61, 63, 122–123
 expertise, early areas of, 155–
 162, 174n2
 fireside chats, 60–61
 genius, xxix
 on hobbies, 61
 illustrations of, xi, xvi, 20
 inspiration, xxx
 learning, approach to, xxxi
 on learning by making, 62
 legacy, 19, 63
 Papert and, xvii–xxiii, xix
 on problem solving, 61–62
 on school structure as a
 curricular impediment, 62
 Solomon and, xviii–xxiii
- Minsky essays
 “Education and Psychology”
 (essay 6), xxxii, xxxvi, 121,
 127
 “Effects of Grade-Based Segrega-
 tion” (essay 3), 59, 65, 134
 “The Infinite Construction Kit”
 (essay 1), xxxiii, 3, 19, 77
 “Learning from Role Models,
 Mentors, and Imprimers”
 (essay 4), xxix, xxxii, 77, 81
 “Questioning General Educa-
 tion” (essay 5), xxxvi, 99, 103
 “What Makes Mathematics Hard
 to Learn” (essay 2), xxxii, 37, 41
- Minsky essay themes
 goals, centrality of, xxxii–xxxiii
 multiplicity, xxxv–xxxvi
 networks as escape, xxxv
 other minds, xxxiv–xxxviii
 parts, construction from,
 xxxiii–xxxiv
 problem solving, xxxvi
 reflection, centrality of,
 xxxvi–xxxvii
 summary overview,
 xxxvii–xxxviii
- Mistakes, 57
- MIT Media Lab, xxiii, xxiv, xxxv
- MIT programming course 6.001,
 xxiv
- Modeling, computation
 providing, xxxvii
- Montessori, Maria, 21
- Multiplication table, 41–42
- Multiplicity, xxxv–xxxvi
- Music, composing, 114
- Music box, xviii, xx
- “Music Mind, and Meaning”
 (Minsky), 79
- “My not I” thinking, 124, 152
- Naming, 121–122
- Negroponte, Nicholas, xxiii, xxv
- Nerds, 95, 117–118
- Networks
 as escape, xxxv
 finding mentors in, 96–97
- Newell, Allen, 71, 90, 122, 135
- Nicomachean Ethics* (Aristotle), 92
- Note-taking, 70

- Novelty over drudgery,
emphasizing, 55–56
- Numbers
counting, 4
magic of, 77
- One Laptop per Child (OLPC),
xxiii, xxv, xxxi, xxxv
- Oppenheimer, Robert, 61
- Other minds
introduction, xxxiv–xxxviii
multiplicity, xxxv–xxxvi
networks as escape, xxxv
reflection, centrality of,
xxxvi–xxxvii
- Papert, Artemis, xxv
- Papert, Seymour, xii–xiv, xvi–xxiii,
xvii, xx, xxxvii, 8, 23–25, 32–
33, 59–62, 78, 81, 99–100, 109,
116–117, 122, 140, 156
- Papert’s principle, xviii
- Parts, construction from, xxxiii–
xxxiv, 12–17
- Perceptrons* (Minsky & Papert),
156–162
- Personal computers, precursors to,
30–34
- Physics, 46
- Piaget, Jean, xvii–xviii, xix, 60
- Piano, xxvi, 62, 174n2
- Play
hard fun, 25, 61, 101
work vs., 21, 67
- Plays, composing, 114
- PlayStation of the future, xxii
- Pleasure, 94, 137–140
- Pólya, George, 103
- Problem solving
abilities, talents, and mental
resources in, 109–110
analogies, finding appropriate,
111
critics in, 107–109
debugging in, 100–101
methods of, 84–87, 108
Minsky on, 61–62
negative expertise in, 112
nonstandard, xxxvi
real-world, 103
representations, selecting
appropriate, 111
reward-based, 132
self-models, constructing
realistic, 112–113
specialties, horizontal vs.
vertical, 114–117
- Programming
introducing, 124
learning, 100
learning mathematics through,
27, 45–46
storytelling and, 124
- Programming languages,
compositional quality, xxxiv
- Programs
advantages over construction
sets, 10
are societies, 12–18
magic of, 4–5, 16
Turing on, 13–14
- Psychology

- “Education and Psychology”
(Minsky), xxxii, xxxvi, 121, 127
in the primary school
 curriculum, 128–130
 teaching cybernetics instead of, 140–144
- “Questioning General Education”
(Minsky), 103
introduction, 99
on multiplicity, xxxvi
- Reasoning
 commonsense, 123
 teaching, 127
- Recipe following, 123
- Reflection
 centrality of, xxxvi–xxxvii
 in learning theory, 131
 in problem solving, 85
 self-conscious, 91
- Representations, selecting
 appropriate, 111
- Resignation, 85
- Resnick, Mitchel, xxv
- Resourcefulness, 113
- Reward-based learning, 128–130, 137–139
- Robots, projects with
 balancing and manipulation, 146
 cognition and reasoning, 149
 critical thinking, learning, 151
 expert systems, 150
 finite-state machines, 149–150
 Meccano sets, 9
 optimization and problem solving, 147
 performance systems, 148
 puzzles and game-playing, 149
 simulated vs. physical, 146
 visual recognition, 148
 voices and sound processing, 148
 walking, 144–145
- Role models
 athletes as, 115
 “Learning from Role Models, Mentors, and Imprimers” (Minsky), xxix, xxxii, 77, 81
- Roomba, 29
- Rumplestiltskin principle, 122
- Sahlberg, Pasi, 101
- Schools
 Finnish, 101
 goals for, 127
 purpose of, 81
- School structure, 62, 68–72
- Science, understanding, 17
- Scratch, xxv, xxxiv, xxxv
- Segregation, grade-based
 child development and, 65–67
 cognitive styles and, 72–74
 50-minute hour, 68–72
 justification for, 60, 65
 present-day, 60
 socialization and, 74–75
- Self-image, 87–90, 141, 152
- Self-models, constructing realistic, 112–113

- Self-reflection, xxxvi–xxxvii, 132, 152
- Shame, 92, 115
- Shannon, Claude, 30, 61
- Silverman, Brian, xxiv–xxv, 16, 30, 77
- Simon, Herbert A., 90, 122, 135
- Simulations, 15–16, 116, 124
- Sketchpad, 30–33
- Slagle, James, 121
- Smalltalk, xxiii–xxiv
- Socialization, grade-based
segregation and, 74–75
- Society of Mind, The* (Minsky), xiii, xv, xxx, xxxii, 24, 137
- Solomon, Cynthia, xviii–xxiii, xx, xxi, 32–33, 99–100
- SOM. See *Society of Mind, The* (Minsky)
- Sound
four-voice music box, xviii, xx
music, composing, 114
- Specialists, 94
- Specialties, horizontal vs. vertical, 114–117
- Sports, team-based, 115
- Stager, Gary, xxiv, 59
- Star Trek*, 77
- Statistics, 49–50
- Stories, composing, 114
- Storytelling, 123–125
- Students
ideas, developing, 68–69
Minsky on, xxxi
note-taking, 70
- Success, rewarding, 132
- Suffering, 138
- Sung, Phil, 44
- Sussman, Gerald, xxiv, 118, 122
- Sutherland, Ivan, 30, 32–33
- System parts, 24
- Tablets, precursors to, 30–34
- Talents, 109–110
- Teachers, good, xxxiii
- Teaching, Minsky on, xxvii
- TEM. See *Emotion Machine, The* (Minsky)
- Thinkers, internalizing, 19
- Thinking
computational ways of, power of, xxxvii
developing new ways of, 132
goal-directed, 135
good, 127
learning about, 121
with “my not I,” 124, 152
new ways of, developing, xxxvi
predicting, comparing, and planning in, 134–135
of self as computer, xxxvii
self-critical, 105, 118–119
skillful, xxxiii
about ways to think, 84–87
- Thinking about thinking, 132–134. See also Reflection, centrality of
feeling as a complement to, 77
ideas learned by, 121–122
introduction, 37–40
learning good ways for, xxvii
without thinking about thinking about something, xvi, 81–82
about ways to think, 84–87

- Thorndike, Edward L., 128
- Tic-tac-toe computer, xxiv–xxv, 9, 30
- Tigers, 11
- TinkerToys
- benefits of, xxxiv
 - components of, 4–6, 6, 21
 - computers from, xxiv–xxv, 9, 30–31
 - creating structures from, 5–7
 - limits, 30
 - parts, construction from, 21–23, 21, 22, 23, 24–25, 26
- Topology, 50
- Tortoises, 23–24, 27. *See also* Walter, William Grey; Turtles
- Travers, Mike, xxvi, xxix, 19
- Turing, Alan, 13–16
- TurtleArt, xxv
- Turtles
- beginnings, xix–xx
 - display, xix–xx
 - floor, xix–xx
 - robot, 23–24, 27
- “20 Things to Do with a Computer” (Papert & Solomon), 99
- 2001: A Space Odyssey*, 157, 162
- Values, acquiring, 91–93
- Van Loon, Henrik, 157
- Vector graphics, xxi–xxii
- Von Neumann, John, 61
- Vygotsky, Lev, 60
- Walter, William Grey, 23–24, 27–28
- Wenger, Etienne, 60
- “What Makes Mathematics Hard to Learn” (Minsky), 41
- introduction, 37
 - on answering questions, xxxii
 - theme, xxxii
- Winston, Patrick H., xxv–xxvi, 28, 121
- Words, 11
- Work vs. play, 21, 66–67
- Worry, 3
- Xiao Xiao, xxvi–xxvii

© 2019 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

This book was set in ITC Stone Serif Std by Toppan Best-set Premedia Limited. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Minsky, Marvin, 1927-2016, author. | Solomon, Cynthia, editor. | Xiao, Xiao, editor.

Title: Inventive minds : Marvin Minsky on education / Marvin Minsky ; edited by Cynthia Solomon and Xiao Xiao ; illustrated by Xiao Xiao.

Description: Cambridge, MA : MIT Press, [2018] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018011627 | ISBN 9780262039093 (hardcover : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Critical thinking--Study and teaching. | Thought and thinking--Study and teaching. | Learning, Psychology of. | Minsky, Marvin, 1927-2016

Classification: LCC LB1590.3 .M555 2018 | DDC 370.15/2--dc23 LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018011627>

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1