

NOTES

Introduction

Epigraphs: Rabindranath Tagore, *Letters to a Friend. Rabindranath Tagore's Letters to C.F. Andrews* [1928] (New Delhi: Rupa, 2002), 119. Emphasis mine. Quoted from John G. Rudy, *Wordsworth and the Zen Mind* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996), 49. See Michel Deguy, *Recumbents: Poems* (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2005), 84.

- 1 Rodolphe Gasché, "Alongside the Horizon," in *On Jean-Luc Nancy: The Sense of Philosophy*, ed. Darren Sheppard, Simon Sparks, and Colin Thomas (London: Routledge, 1997), 136.
- 2 Martta Heikkilä, *At the Limits of Presentation* (Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2008), 103.
- 3 Jean-Luc Nancy, *Birth to Presence* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1993), 155–56.
- 4 Dictionary.com, s.v. "Trans," accessed March 13, 2016, <http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/trans>. For more on trans-habit, see my *Transcultural Poetics and the Concept of the Poet: From Philip Sidney to T. S. Eliot* (London: Routledge, 2016). Chapter 1 from this book elaborates what I theorize and mean by trans-habit.
- 5 Deguy calls this an "affair of fference," and we are in the midst of the agglomerated force of inter-ference, con-ference, de-ference, di-ference, and in-ference (suffix, *ferre*, "to carry"), in the words of Deguy, "quotable/Deference preference difference/Afference." See "Memorandum," in Michel Deguy, *Gisants* (Paris: Gallimard, 1985), translated as *Recumbents: Poems* (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2005).
- 6 See John Phillip Williams, "Hodos Infusion and Method," in *Romancing Theory, Riding Interpretation: (In)fusion Approach*, Salman Rushdie, ed. Ranjan Ghosh (New York: Peter Lang, 2012), 73.
- 7 See Karen Barad, "Intraactions," *Mousse*, 2012, 34.
- 8 See Gilles Deleuze, *Foucault*, trans. S. Hand (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1988), 23–44.

- 9 Tim Cresswell, *In Place/Out of Place: Geography, Ideology, Transgression* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996), 11.
- 10 Karen Barad, "Diffracting Diffraction: Cutting Together-Apart," *Parallax* 20, no. 3 (2014): 168.
- 11 Barad, "Diffracting Diffraction," 169.
- 12 Deleuze, *The Fold*, 76, 78.
- 13 See my *(In)fusion Approach: Theory, Contestation, Limits* (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 2006).
- 14 Elizabeth Grosz, *The Nick of Time* (Sydney: Allen and Unwin, 2004), 9.
- 15 Elizabeth Grosz, *Chaos, Territory, Art: Deleuze and the Framing of the Earth* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008), 8.
- 16 See Rene Girard's introduction to Michel Serres, *Detachment*, trans. Genevieve James and Raymond Federman (Athens: Ohio University Press, 1989), viii.
- 17 Robert Frost, "Mending Wall," accessed November 10, 2015, <http://www.poetryfoundation.org/poem/173530>.
- 18 Michel Serres, *Genesis*, trans. Genevieve James and James Nielson (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1995), 2.
- 19 Serres, *Genesis*, 3.
- 20 Serres, *Genesis*, 6.
- 21 See Michel Serres, *The Parasite*, trans. Lawrence R. Schehr (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982).
- 22 Gilles Deleuze, *The Logic of Sense*, trans. M. Lester and C. Stivale, ed. C. Boundas (New York: Columbia University Press, 1990), 37. Also see Gilles Deleuze, "How Do We Recognize Structuralism?" in *Desert Islands and Other Texts, 1953–1974*, trans. M. Taormina (New York: Semiotext(e), 2004), 170–92.
- 23 Deleuze, *Essays Critical and Clinical*, 133, 132.
- 24 Gilles Deleuze, and Félix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, trans. Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), 21.
- 25 Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 83.
- 26 Andy Merrifield, *Guy Debord* (London: Reaktion Books, 2005), 51.
- 27 Globalization as "unitotality" suppresses world-forming, which is indeed a conceptual catastrophe. See Jean-Luc Nancy, *The Creation of the World or Globalization*, trans. Françoise Raffoul and David Pettigrew (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2007).
- 28 Bruno Latour, "The Enlightenment without the Critique: A Word on Michel Serres's Philosophy," in *Contemporary French Philosophy*, ed. A. Phillips Griffiths (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), 90–91.

Introduction Continued

- 1 Louis Althusser, "Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses (Notes towards an Investigation)," *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays*, trans. Ben Brewster (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1972), 127–86. Paul de Man, "The Resistance to Theory," *The Resistance to Theory* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 3–20.
- 2 Michael Shermer, "Skeptic: Scientia Humanitatis," *Scientific American*, June 2015, 80. Shermer is publisher of *Skeptic* magazine.
- 3 Rens Bod, *A New History of the Humanities: The Search for Principles and Patterns from Antiquity to the Present* (Oxford University Press, 2014).
- 4 Wikipedia, s.v. "Donation of Constantine," accessed June 4, 2015, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Donation_of_Constantine.
- 5 Paul de Man, "The Resistance to Theory," 10.
- 6 Google "fake scientific papers" for a long list of websites on this topic, for example, an essay in *Nature* entitled "Publishers withdraw more than 120 gibberish papers" (<http://www.nature.com/news/publishers-withdraw-more-than-120-gibberish-papers-1.14763>, accessed June 3, 2015). Other fake papers claim to be based on scientifically conducted research that never occurred, for example, a recent, notorious one claiming with fake evidence that just talking to people will cure them in a few minutes of their opposition to gay marriage.
- 7 My Chinese correspondent cited the two sentences I have quoted here from the preface in Chinese to the Chinese translation of my *Fiction and Repetition*. They come originally from my "The Critic as Host," in *Deconstruction and Criticism*, ed. Harold Bloom (New York: Seabury Press, 1979), 251. The short paragraph from which these two sentences are drawn begins with an unequivocal assertion that "the word 'deconstruction' has misleading overtones or implications" (251). Any careful reader should see that my figure of the dismantled watch is an ironic parody of what many people mistakenly think deconstruction is.
- 8 See Wikipedia's entry for "pun" for a valuable entry on the different forms of *pun* along with a brief history of examples. *Paronomasia*, as the pun is called in Greek, itself contains a multiple pun on antithetical meanings, since the prefix "para," sometimes, as in this case, shortened to "par," means "beside; next to, near, from; against, contrary to." (Wikipedia, s.v. "Pun," accessed June 6, 2015, <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pun>.)
- 9 An immense number of editions of the Alice books exist. I cite the one I read as a child and still have in my library. It is much battered and worn from having been read by generations of children. It has the Tenniel illustrations, which were, and are, essential to my "rhetorical reading" of the two Alice books: Lewis Carroll, *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland and Through the Looking-Glass* (New York: A. L. Burt, n.d.), 12.
- 10 Carroll, *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland and Through the Looking-Glass*, 30–32.
- 11 "Then you should say what you mean,' the March Hare went on.

'I do,' Alice hastily replied; 'at least—at least I mean what I say—that's the same thing, you know.'

'Not the same thing a bit!' said the Hatter. 'You might just as well say that "I see what I eat" is the same thing as "I eat what I see"!' "

'You might just as well say,' added the March Hare, 'that "I like what I get" is the same thing as "I get what I like"!' "

'You might just as well say,' added the Dormouse, who seemed to be talking in his sleep, 'that "I breathe when I sleep" is the same thing as "I sleep when I breathe"!' " (Carroll, *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland and Through the Looking-Glass*, 82).

- 12 "Trolling 'Anthropos'—Or, Requiem for a Failed Prosopopeia," in *Twilight of the Anthropocene Idols*, ed. Tom Cohen, Claire Colebrook, and J. Hillis Miller (London: Open Humanities Press, 2016), 20–80.
- 13 de Man, *The Resistance to Theory*, 51.
- 14 de Man, *The Resistance to Theory*, 27–53; Paul de Man, *The Rhetoric of Romanticism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1984), 239–62.

Chapter 1: Making Sahitya Matter

Epigraphs: Anthony Earl of Shaftesbury, *Characteristics*, ed. John M. Robertson (London: Grant Richards, 1900), vol. I, 189; *Ontogeny and Phylogeny* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1977), 289.

- 1 Tagore, "Sadhana," in *The English Writings of Rabindranath Tagore*, ed. Sisir Kumar Das, vol. 2 (New Delhi: Sahitya Academy, 1999), 322–23.
- 2 Wai-Lim Yip, *Diffusion of Distances: Dialogues between Chinese and Western Poetics* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), 140–41.
- 3 Raghavan, "Sahitya," in *An Introduction to Indian Poetics*, ed. V. Raghavan and Nagendra (Bombay: Macmillan, 1970), 82.
- 4 Paul Hernadi, "Why Is Literature: A Coevolutionary Perspective on Imaginative Worldmaking," *Poetics Today* 23 (spring 2002): 22.
- 5 D. C. Lau, *Lao Tzu Tao Te Ching* (Harmondsworth, UK: Penguin Books, 1963), 3.
- 6 See D. C. Lau, *Lao Tzu Tao Te Ching*, accessed September 26, 2015, <http://terebeck.hu/english/tao/lau.html>.
- 7 Prabas Jiban Chaudhury, *Tagore on Literature and Aesthetics* (Calcutta: Rabin-dra Bharati, 1965), 12.
- 8 Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Judgment*, vol. 1 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1911), 59.
- 9 Chaudhury, *Tagore on Literature and Aesthetics*, 13. Tagore writes in "Sahityer Swarup": "There is no need in art to settle a problem, its business is to perfect its form. To untie the knot of a problem is an achievement of the intellect but to give perfection to some form is the work of creative imagination. Art dwells in this realm of imagination and not in the realm of logic" (45). I hope I have been able to problematize literary judgment as elucidation and the analysis of literature.

- 10 Tagore, *Personality* (London: Macmillan, 1945), 16.
- 11 Tagore, "Sristrir Adhikar," in *Rabindra Rachanabali* (Calcutta: Visva Bharati, 1965), 451.
- 12 For further elaboration, see Tagore's "Sahityer Pathe," in *Rabindra Rachanabali*, vol. 10, 435–561.
- 13 *Rabindranath Tagore: Selected Poems* (Delhi: Penguin Books, 1985).
- 14 Tagore, *Personality*, 17.
- 15 Tagore, *Personality*, 8.
- 16 Ghose, ed., *Angel of Surplus*, 101.
- 17 Tagore, *Personality*, 29.
- 18 Tagore, *Personality*, 69.
- 19 Chaudhury, *Tagore on Literature and Aesthetics*, 17.
- 20 Chaudhury, *Tagore on Literature and Aesthetics*, 38.
- 21 Chaudhury, *Tagore on Literature and Aesthetics*, 39.
- 22 Chaudhury, *Tagore on Literature and Aesthetics*, 39.
- 23 *Personality*, 83–84; Tagore, "The Religion of an Artist," cited in Chakravarty, *A Tagore Reader* (New York: Macmillan, 1961), 234.
- 24 Chakravarty, *A Tagore Reader*, 234–35.
- 25 Tagore, *Personality*, 60.
- 26 Ming Dong Gu, "The Divine and Artistic Ideal: Ideas and Insights for Cross-Cultural Aesthetic Education," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 42, no. 3 (fall 2008): 68.
- 27 Ming, "The Divine and Artistic Ideal," 68–69.
- 28 Yip, *Diffusion of Distances*, 205.
- 29 Arthur Danto, *The Philosophical Disenfranchisement of Art* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1986), 67.
- 30 Jacques Rancière, "The Politics of Literature," *SubStance* 33, no. 1 (2004): 14–15.
- 31 Rancière, "The Politics of Literature," 15.
- 32 Cleanth Brooks, *The Well Wrought Urn* (San Diego: Harcourt Brace, 1975), 72–73.
- 33 Robert Frost, "Birches," accessed October 14, 2015, <http://www.poetryfoundation.org/poem/173524>.
- 34 James Joyce, *Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* (New York: Viking, 1964), 169.
- 35 Thomas Mann, *The Magic Mountain* (New York: Knopf, 1955), 653.
- 36 See Thompson Clarke, "The Legacy of Skepticism," *Journal of Philosophy* 69 (1972): 754–69.
- 37 This approximates Annie Dillard's "Teaching a Stone to Talk," wherein Larry makes meaning by teaching a small stone to talk. The apparent absurdity of the proposition is denied when we come to understand Dillard's suggestions that talking is about attending to the silence that a stone has. See Dillard, "Teaching a Stone to Talk," in *Teaching a Stone to Talk* (New York: Harper Perennial, 1992), 87.

- 38 Dillard, "Teaching a Stone to Talk," 87.
- 39 Hans-Georg Gadamer, *Truth and Method* (New York: Continuum, 1998), 112–13.
- 40 Laurent Dubreuil, "What Is Literature's Now?" *New Literary History* 38, no. 1 (winter 2007): 66.
- 41 Martin Heidegger, "Hölderlin and the Essence of Poetry," in *Existence and Being*, ed. Werner Brock (London: Vision, 1968), 295–96.
- 42 Heidegger, "Hölderlin and the Essence of Poetry," 295–96.
- 43 Dubreuil, "What Is Literature's Now?," 66.
- 44 Heidegger, "Hölderlin and the Essence of Poetry," 310.
- 45 Rancière, "The Politics of Literature," 22.
- 46 Quoted from the preface in Arvind Sharma's *The Philosophy of Religion* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1995).

Chapter 2: Literature Matters Today

- 1 Simona Sawney, *The Modernity of Sanskrit* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008).
- 2 Alfred Lord Tennyson, "Tears, Idle Tears," accessed January 3, 2015, <http://www.poemhunter.com/poem/tears-idle-tears/>.
- 3 J. Hillis Miller, "Temporal Topographies: Tennyson's Tears," *EurAmerica* 21, no. 3 (1991): 29–45.
- 4 Paul de Man, "Conclusions: Walter Benjamin's 'The Task of the Translator,'" in *The Resistance to Theory* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 87–88.
- 5 Jacques Derrida, "Forcener le subjectile," in *Antonin Artaud: Dessins et portraits* (Paris: Gallimard, 1996), 55–108; Jacques Derrida, "To Unsense the Subjectile," in *The Secret Art of Antonin Artaud*, trans. Mary Ann Caws (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1998), 59–157.
- 6 J. Hillis Miller, *The Medium Is the Maker: Browning, Freud, Derrida, and the New Telepathic Ecotechnologies* (Brighton, UK: Sussex Academic Press, 2009).
- 7 Jacques Derrida, *Passions* (Paris: Galilée, 1993), 64–68; Jacques Derrida, "Passions: 'An Oblique Offering,'" in *On the Name*, ed. Thomas Dutoit (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1995), 28–30.
- 8 Jacques Derrida, "Envois," in *La carte postale: De Socrates à Freud et au-delà*, 5–273 (Paris: Flammarion, 1980), 212; Jacques Derrida, "Envois," in *The Post Card: From Socrates to Freud and Beyond*, trans. Alan Bass (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), 197.
- 9 French, 114–15; English, 104.
- 10 J. Hillis Miller, "Anachronistic Reading," *Derrida Today* 3 (10): 75–91.

- 11 Walter E. Houghton, *The Victorian Frame of Mind, 1830–1870* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1957); E. M. W. Tillyard, *The Elizabethan World Picture* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1943).
- 12 Paul de Man, “Conclusions,” 87–88; Walter Benjamin, “Die Aufgabe des Übersetzers,” in *Illuminationen: Ausgewählte Shrifte*, ed. Siegfried Unseld (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1955), 56–69; Walter Benjamin, “The Task of the Translator,” in *Illuminations*, trans. Hannah Arendt (New York: Schocken Books, 1969), 69–82.
- 13 Jacques Derrida, “This Strange Institution Called Literature,” in *Acts of Literature*, ed. Derek Attridge (London: Routledge, 1992), 44.
- 14 William Shakespeare, *Hamlet*, accessed January 4, 2015, <http://shakespeare.mit.edu/hamlet/full.html>.
- 15 John Milton, *Paradise Lost*, accessed January 4, 2015, <http://www.literature.org/authors/milton-john/paradise-lost/chapter-01.html>.
- 16 Jane Austen, *Pride and Prejudice*, accessed January 4, 2015, <http://www.pemberley.com/janeinfo/ppv1n01.html>.
- 17 William Wordsworth, “A Slumber Did My Spirit Seal,” accessed January 4, 2015, <http://www.poetryfoundation.org/poem/174822>.
- 18 Tennyson, “Tears, Idle Tears.”
- 19 Herman Melville, *Moby-Dick; or, the Whale*, accessed January 4, 2015, <http://etext.virginia.edu/etcbin/toccer-new2?id=Me12Mob.sgm&images=images/modeng&data=/texts/english/modeng/parsed&tag=public&part=1&division=div1>.
- 20 Anthony Trollope, *The Last Chronicle of Barset*, accessed January 4, 2015 at www.gutenberg.org.
- 21 W. B. Yeats, “The Cold Heaven,” accessed January 4, 2015, <http://www.poetryfoundation.org/poem/172059>.
- 22 Marcel Proust, *À la recherche du temps perdu*, accessed January 5, 2015, http://beq.ebooksgratuits.com/vents/Proust_A_la_recherche_du_temps_perdu_01.pdf.
- 23 Wallace Stevens, 2011. “Oak Leaves Are Hands,” accessed January 5, 2015, http://www.geegaw.com/stories/oak_leaves_are_hands.shtml.
- 24 Maurice Blanchot, “La voix narrative (le ‘il,’ le neutre),” in *L’Entretien infini* (Paris: Gallimard, 1969), 556–67; Maurice Blanchot, “The Narrative Voice (the ‘He,’ the Neutral),” in *The Infinite Conversation*, trans. Susan Hanson (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1993), 379–87.
- 25 For a wonderful essay contrasting Japanese and German personal pronouns as a topic in Yoko Tawada’s “Eine leere Flasche,” see John Namjun Kim, “Ethnic Irony: The Poetic Parabasis of the Promiscuous Personal Pronoun in Yoko Tawada’s ‘Eine leere Flasche’ (A Vacuous Flask),” *The German Quarterly* 83, no. 3 (2010): 333–52.
- 26 Paul de Man, “Sign and Symbol in Hegel’s Aesthetics,” in *Aesthetic Ideology*, ed. Andrzej Warminski (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996),

- 91–104; G. W. F. Hegel, *Enzyklopädie der philosophischen Wissenschaften*, in *Werke in zwanzig Bänden*, vols. 8–10 (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1979), 8:80, 8:74.
- 27 Nicholas Royle, “The ‘Telepathy Effect’: Notes toward a Reconsideration of Narrative Fiction,” in *The Uncanny* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003), 256–76.
- 28 Maurice Blanchot, “Les deux versions de l’imaginaire,” in *L’espace littéraire*, (Paris: Gallimard, 1955), 266–77; Maurice Blanchot, “Two Versions of the Imaginary,” in *The Gaze of Orpheus and Other Literary Essays*, trans. Lydia Davis (Barrytown, NY: Station Hill Press, 1981), 79–89; Maurice Blanchot, “Le chant des Sirènes,” in *Le livre à venir* (Paris: Gallimard, 1959), 7–34; Maurice Blanchot, “The Song of the Sirens,” in *The Book to Come*, trans. Charlotte Mandell (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003), 1–24.
- 29 Wolfgang Iser, *Das Fiktive und das Imaginäre: Perspektiven literarische Anthropologie* (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1991); Wolfgang Iser, *The Fictive and the Imaginary: Charting Literary Anthropology* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993).
- 30 Iser, *Das Fiktive*, 1991, 21; Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, 3.
- 31 Iser, *Das Fiktive*, 1991, 46; Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, 18.
- 32 Iser, *Das Fiktive*, 1991, 24; Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, 4.
- 33 Iser, *Das Fiktive*, 1991, 38; Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, 13.
- 34 Iser, *Das Fiktive*, 1991, 45; Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, 17.
- 35 Iser, *Das Fiktive*, 1991, 46; Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, 18.
- 36 Iser, *Das Fiktive*, 1991, 48; Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, 19.
- 37 Iser, *Das Fiktive*, 1991, 51; Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, 20–21.
- 38 Iser, *The Fictive*, 1993, xviii–xix; not in the German foreword.
- 39 Blanchot, “Le chant des Sirènes,” 1959, 22; Blanchot, “The Song of the Sirens,” 2003, 14.
- 40 See, for example, Blanchot’s important essay “Literature and the Right to Death,” in *The Work of Fire* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1995), 300–344; Maurice Blanchot, *La part du feu* (Paris: Gallimard, 1949), 291–331.
- 41 Blanchot, “Le chant des Sirènes,” 1959, 12–13; Blanchot, “The Song of the Sirens,” 2003, 6–7.
- 42 Blanchot, “Le chant des Sirènes,” 1959, 11–12; Blanchot, “The Song of the Sirens,” 2003, 5.
- 43 Homer, *Odyssey*, trans. Robert Fitzgerald (Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1963), 1.

Chapter 3: The Story of a Poem

Epigraphs: Mansour Àjami, *The Alchemy of Glory: The Dialectic of Truthfulness and Untruthfulness in Medieval Arabic Literary Criticism* (Washington, DC: Three

Continents Press, 1988); Wan Keping, *Spirit of Chinese Poetics* (Beijing: Foreign Language Press, 2008), 9; Joy Goswami, *Selected Poems: Joy Goswami* (New York: Harper Perennial, 2014), n.p.

- 1 Christopher Clausen, "Poetry in a Discouraging Time," *Georgia Review* 35, no. 4 (winter 1981): 703.
- 2 Dana Gioia, "Disappearing Ink: Poetry at the End of Print Culture," *Hudson Review* 56, no. 1 (spring 2003): 49.
- 3 Gioia, "Disappearing Ink: Poetry at the End of Print Culture," 49.
- 4 Clausen, "Poetry in a Discouraging Time," 708.
- 5 Dana Gioia, "Can Poetry Matter?" accessed August 16, 2015, www.danagioia.net/essays/ecpm.htm.
- 6 Edwin Muir, *The Estate of Poetry: Essays by Edwin Muir* (Minneapolis: Graywolf Press, 1993).
- 7 Wendell Berry, "The Specialization of Poetry," *Hudson Review* 28, no. 1 (spring 1975): 26.
- 8 Berry, "The Specialization of Poetry," 27.
- 9 Mary Oliver, "For the Man Cutting the Grass." *Georgia Review* 35, no. 4 (winter 1981): 733.
- 10 *Rasa* (Sanskrit: "essence," "taste," or "flavor," literally "sap" or "juice") is the "Indian concept of aesthetic flavour, an essential element of any work of visual, literary, or performing art that can only be suggested, not described. It is a kind of contemplative abstraction in which the inwardness of human feelings suffuses the surrounding world of embodied forms. The theory of *rasa* is attributed to Bharata, a sage-priest who may have lived sometime between the 1st century BCE and the 3rd century CE. It was developed by the rhetorician and philosopher Abhinavagupta (c. 1000), who applied it to all varieties of theater and poetry. The principal human feelings, according to Bharata, are delight, laughter, sorrow, anger, energy, fear, disgust, heroism, and astonishment, all of which may be recast in contemplative form as the various *rasas*: erotic, comic, pathetic, furious, heroic, terrible, odious, marvelous, and quietistic. These *rasas* comprise the components of aesthetic experience. The power to taste *rasa* is a reward for merit in some previous existence." *Rasa, Indian Aesthetic Theory*, accessed October 1, 2015, <http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/491635/rasa>.

"It may be pointed out here," writes Sushil Kumar De, "that [the] subtle conception of *Rasa* makes it difficult to express the notion properly in Western critical terminology. The word has been translated etymologically by the terms 'flavour,' 'relish,' 'gustation,' 'taste,' 'Geschmack,' or 'saveur'; but none of these renderings seems to be adequate. The simpler word 'mood,' or the term 'Stimmung' used by Jacobi may be the nearest approach to it, but the concept has hardly any analogy in European critical theory." See *History of Sanskrit Poetics*, 2nd ed. (Calcutta: Firma K. L. Mukhopadhyay, 1960), 2:135.

- 11 Lu Ji, "A Descriptive Poem on Literature," in *Early Chinese Literary Criticism*, ed. Sui-kit Wong (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Company, 1983), 40–41.
- 12 Jibanananda Das, *Kobiter katha* [The story of a poem] (Kolkata: Signet, 1994), 7–8. The translation is mine.
- 13 See Andrea Gerbig and Anja Muller-Wood, "Trapped in Language: Aspects of Ambiguity and Intertextuality in Selected Prose and Poetry of Sylvia Plath," *Style* 36, no. 1 (spring 2002): 82.
- 14 Eliseo Vivas, "What Is a Poem?" *Sewanee Review* 62, no. 4 (October–December 1954): 594.
- 15 J. A. Honeywell, "The Poetic Theory of Viśvanatha," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 28, no. 2 (winter 1969): 172.
- 16 Ramaranjan Mukherjee, "Doctrine of Dhvani in Practical Application," in *East West Poetics at Work*, ed. C. D. Narasimhaiah (New Delhi: Sahitya Akademi, 1994), 124.
- 17 Mukherjee, "Doctrine of Dhvani," 128–29.
- 18 James J. Y. Liu, *Language-Paradox-Poetics: A Chinese Perspective* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1988), 42.
- 19 Liu, *Language-Paradox-Poetics*, 48.
- 20 Keping, *Spirit of Chinese Poetics*, 16–17.
- 21 Keping, *Spirit of Chinese Poetics*, 71.
- 22 Keping, *Spirit of Chinese Poetics*, 76. Jiang Kui writes: "A poem depends entirely on the last line; this is like stopping a galloping horse. When both the meaning and the words come to an end, it is like 'overlooking the water to see off someone going home'; when the meaning comes to an end but the words do not, it is like 'spiralling with a whirlwind'; when the words come to an end but the meaning does not, it is like the returning boat on the Shan stream; when both words and the meaning have no ending, it is like [meeting] Wenbo Xuezi" (73).
- 23 Charles Simic, "Notes on Poetry and Philosophy," *New Literary History* 21, no. 1 (autumn 1989): 218.
- 24 Brett Bourbon, "What Is a Poem?" *Modern Philology* 105, no. 1 (August 2007): 32.
- 25 Bourbon, "What Is a Poem?" 35.
- 26 Bourbon, "What Is a Poem?" 39.
- 27 Bourbon, "What Is a Poem?" 39.
- 28 Vincent Colapietro, "A Poet's Philosopher," *Transactions of the Charles S. Peirce Society* 45, no. 4 (fall 2009): 553.
- 29 George Santayana, *Little Essays* (London: Constable, 1924), 140.
- 30 William H. Poteat, "What Is a Poem About?" *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 17, no. 4 (June 1957): 547.
- 31 Jacques Maritain, "Poetic Experience," *Review of Politics* 6, no. 4 (October 1944): 393.

- 32 K. D. Sethna, *Talks on Poetry* (Pondicherry: Sri Aurobindo International Centre of Education, 1989), 330.
- 33 D. Semah, "Muḥammad Mandūr and the 'New Poetry,'" *Journal of Arabic Literature* 2 (1971): 151.
- 34 Semah, "Muḥammad Mandūr and the 'New Poetry,'" 152.
- 35 See Jean-Jacques Lecercle, *Badiou and Deleuze Read Literature* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010), 100.
- 36 Maritain, "Poetic Experience," 398.
- 37 See Robert Frost, "The Figure a Poem Makes," accessed August 12, 2015, <http://www.mrbauld.com/frostfig.html>.
- 38 Holly Stevens, ed., *Letters of Wallace Stevens* (New York: Knopf, 1966), 319.
- 39 Samuel French Morse, ed., *Opus Posthumous* (New York: Knopf, 1957), 219–20.
- 40 Morse, *Opus Posthumous*, 226–27.
- 41 Wallace Stevens, *The Necessary Angel: Essays on Reality and the Imagination* (New York: Knopf, 1951), 58.
- 42 H. Stevens, *Letters of Wallace Stevens*, 544.
- 43 Aristotle writes: "The greatest thing by far is to be a master of metaphor. It is the one thing that cannot be learnt from others; and it is also a sign of genius, since a good metaphor implies an intuitive perception of the similarity in dissimilar." See Aristotle, *Poetics* (New York: Modern Library, 1954), 1459a, 255.
- 44 William Wordsworth, *The Prelude* [1850], book 2, "School Time," 11, 382–86.
- 45 Ali Asghar Seyed-Gohrab, ed., *Metaphor and Imagery in Persian Poetry* (Leiden: Brill, 2012), 9.
- 46 Michelle Yeh, "Metaphor and Bi: Western and Chinese Poetics," *Comparative Literature* 39, no. 3 (summer 1987): 245.
- 47 Yeh, "Metaphor and Bi," 246.
- 48 Kapil Kapoor, *Language, Linguistics, and Literature: The Indian Perspective* (Delhi: Academic Foundation, 1994), 126–27.
- 49 P. K. Mishra, trans., *Sahityadarpana* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1967), 10, 28.
- 50 Hyde Cox and Edward Connery Lathem, eds., *Selected Prose of Robert Frost* (New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1966), 77.
- 51 For more on this subject, see my "The Figure that Robert Frost's Poetics Make: Singularity and Sanskrit Poetic Theory," in *Singularity and Transnational Poetics*, ed. Birgit Kaiser (London: Routledge, 2015), 134–54.
- 52 Stevens writes in "Effects of Analogy": "A poet writes of twilight because he shrinks from noonday." Stevens, *The Necessary Angel*, 122.
- 53 Stevens, *The Necessary Angel*, 77.
- 54 Gadamer, *Truth and Method*, 238.
- 55 William H. Matchett, "What and Why Is a Poem?" *College English* 27, no. 5 (February 1966): 355.
- 56 Matchett, "What and Why Is a Poem?" 358.
- 57 H. G. Gadamer, "Composition and Interpretation," in *On the Relevance of the Beautiful* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 67.

- 58 H. G. Gadamer, "Reflections on My Philosophical Journey," *Philosophy of Hans-Georg Gadamer* (Chicago: Open Court, 1997), 39.
- 59 Gadamer, "Reflections on My Philosophical Journey," 39.
- 60 See Christopher Lawn, "Gadamer on Poetic and Everyday Language," *Philosophy and Literature* 25, no. 1 (April 2001): 113–26.
- 61 George Santayana, *Interpretations of Poetry and Religion* (New York: Scribner's, 1900), 255–56.
- 62 Manuel Durán, "Octavio Paz: The Poet as Philosopher," *World Literature Today* 56, no. 4 (autumn 1982): 594.
- 63 Jonathan Mayhew, "Jorge Guillén and the Insufficiency of Poetic Language," *PMLA* 106, no. 5 (October 1991): 1146–55.
- 64 Gérard Genette, *Mimologiques: Voyage en cratylie* (Paris: Seuil, 1976).
- 65 Daniel H. H. Ingalls et al., trans. and ed., *The Dhvanyaloka of Anandavardhana with the Locana of Abhinavagupta* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1990), 19.
- 66 G. T. Despande, *Indian Poetics* (Mumbai: Popular Prakashan, 2009), 259.
- 67 Despande, *Indian Poetics*, 260–61.
- 68 Ming Dong Gu, *Chinese Theories of Reading and Writing: A Route to Hermeneutics and Open Poetics* (Albany: State University of New York, 2005), 47.
- 69 Liu, *Language-Paradox-Poetics*, 84.
- 70 S. K. De, "Kuntaka's Theory of Poetry," in *An Introduction to Indian Poetics*, ed. V. Raghavan and Nagendra (Bombay: Macmillan, 1970), 51.
- 71 Sethna, *Talks on Poetry*, 317–18.
- 72 Poteat, "What Is a Poem About?," 550.
- 73 See Sri Aurobindo, *Future of Poetry: Letters on Poetry, Literature and Art* (Pondicherry: Sri Aurobindo Ashram, 1972).
- 74 Liu, *Language-Paradox-Poetics*, 81.

Chapter 4: Western Theories of Poetry

- 1 Wallace Stevens, *Opus Posthumous*, ed. Samuel French Morse (New York: Knopf, 1957), 219–20.
- 2 Wallace Stevens, *The Collected Poems* (New York: Vintage, 1990), 285–408.
- 3 Stevens, *The Collected Poems*, 288.
- 4 Aristotle, *The Poetics*, trans. W. Hamilton Fyfe (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1991), 1459a, 22:16–17, 90–91.
- 5 Wallace Stevens, *The Necessary Angel: Essays on Reality and the Imagination* (New York: Knopf, 1951); Wallace Stevens, *Opus Posthumous*.
- 6 Stevens, *Opus Posthumous*, 169.
- 7 Cleanth Brooks and Robert Penn Warren, *Understanding Poetry*, 4th ed. (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1976).

- 8 Paul de Man, "Conclusions: Walter Benjamin's 'The Task of the Translator,'" in *The Resistance to Theory* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 86, 88.
- 9 I have written elsewhere in detail about de Man's "The Resistance to Theory," which is in *The Resistance to Theory* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 3–20. See J. Hillis Miller, "Reading Paul de Man While Falling into Cyberspace: In the Twilight of the Anthropocene Idols," in *Twilight of the Anthropocene Idols*, ed. Thomas Cohen, Claire Colebrook, and J. Hillis Miller (London: Open Humanities Press, 2016), 126–93.
- 10 Stevens, *The Collected Poems*, 9–10.
- 11 Stevens, *The Collected Poems*, 372–78.
- 12 Stevens, *Opus Posthumous*, 179.
- 13 Walter Benjamin, "Die Aufgabe des Übersetzers," in *Illuminationen: Ausgewählte Schriften* (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1969), 67; Walter Benjamin, "The Task of the Translator," *Illuminations* (New York: Schocken Books, 1969), 80.
- 14 See Aristotle, *The Poetics*, 1457b, 14–15, 81–83: "Sometimes there is no word for some of the terms of the analogy but the metaphor can be used all the same. For instance, to scatter seed is to sow, but there is no word for the action of the sun in scattering its fire. Yet this has to the sunshine the same relation as sowing has to the seed, and so you have the phrase 'sowing the god-created fire.'" Theology appears here once more, in this case in Aristotle's example of what is called, though Aristotle does not use the word here, a catachresis. Jacques Derrida, in his magisterial "La mythologie blanche" (white mythology), by far the greatest twentieth-century essay on metaphor, makes much of this passage in Aristotle and of the general role in theories of metaphor of the diurnal rising and setting of the sun. See Jacques Derrida, "La mythologie blanche: La métaphore dans le texte philosophique," *Marges de la philosophie* (Paris: Les Éditions de Minuit, 1972), 247–324; Jacques Derrida, "White Mythology: Metaphor in the Text of Philosophy," in *Margins of Philosophy*, trans. Alan Bass (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), 207–71. It is tempting to make a detour into a reading of Derrida's wonderful essay, but that would add a great many more pages, perhaps a hundred or so, to this essay, and I have sworn to keep my eye on Stevens's poem.
- 15 Stevens, *The Collected Poems*, 165, 373. The full sentence that contains the phrase about metaphor as evasion is a self-exhortation that says the reverse of what is said about (and done with) metaphor in "The Motive for Metaphor": "Let's see the very thing and nothing else, / Let's see it with the hottest fire of sight. / Burn everything not part of it to ash. / Trace the gold sun about the whitened sky / Without evasion by a single metaphor." The hot fire of the sun is here transferred by metaphor to the poet's eyesight, his ability to see what is really there, without evasion, by a lambent refinement like the purifying of metal in a forge. The figure of a forge appears in "The Motive

for Metaphor,” though not explicitly in “Credences of Summer.” In the latter poem, the sky is whitened not just because a bright, sunny day does that, but because the sun purifies the sky of the blue of imagination, source of metaphorical evasions. Stevens’s locutions match the example in Aristotle about sun “sowing the god-created fire.” The sun, it might be said, is, in the Western tradition from Aristotle on, the closest thing you can have to a visible sign of that fatal, dominant X named at the end of “The Motive for Metaphor.” The reader will note that just as Aristotle imports a catachresis, *sowing*, to name what has no proper name, that is, “the actions of the sun in scattering its fire,” so Stevens evades the nameless brightness of the sun by calling it gold. Gold is the most precious of metals and the measure of all other values, as in “gold standard.” An exploration of these connections would take me far and would repay the doing, but would, once again (as have Aristotle, de Man, Derrida, and Stevens in his prose tempted me to let happen), divert me by way of attractive displacements and evasions from trying to see “The Motive for Metaphor” with the hottest fire of sight. So I desist, with difficulty.

- 16 A steel, by the way, is a small, cylindrical object made of serrated steel you hold in your hand as a tool to sharpen knives.

Chapter 5: More than Global

Epigraphs: See K. A. Subramania Iyer, ed., *The Vakyapadiya of Bhartrhari* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1977); Pheng Cheah, “What Is a World?: On World Literature as World-Making Activity,” *Daedalus* 137, no. 3 (summer 2008): 29; Tagore, “Visva-Sahitya” [1907], *Journal of Contemporary Thought* 34 (2011): 223, 213–25.

- 1 Djelal Kadir, “To Compare, to World: Two Verbs, One Discipline,” *Comparatist* 34 (2010): 5. Reminded of Édouard Glissant’s approach to problems of “world-totality,” I see a chaos in our tryst with the global. That tryst leads to the contradictions and conflicts of strange pairings and moorings and conglomerates. The harmony among such “relational identities,” working across borders, translocomoting through terrains of varied cultures, speaks both of intellectual vigilance, doubt, and opens the way to a proactive essence (the Deleuzian way). See Édouard Glissant, “The French Language in the Face of Creolization,” in *French Civilization and Its Discontents: Nationalism, Colonialism, Race*, ed. Tyler Stovall and Georges van den Abbeele (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2003), 108, 109, 112.
- 2 Wai Chee Dimock, “Planetary Time and Global Translation: ‘Context’ in Literary Studies,” *Common Knowledge* 9, no. 3 (fall 2003): 489.
- 3 See Jean-Luc Nancy, *The Creation of the World or Globalization* (Albany: State University of New York, 2007), 28, 50.
- 4 Karen Barad, “Diffracting Diffraction: Cutting Together-Apart,” *Parallax* 20, no. 3 (2014): 168. Also see Karen Barad, *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quan-*

- tum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2007).
- 5 Karen Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity: Toward an Understanding of How Matter Comes to Matter," *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 28, no. 3 (2003): 815.
 - 6 S. H. Rigby, *Marxism and History: A Critical Introduction* (Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 1998), 195.
 - 7 See Jean-Paul Martinon, "Im-Mundus or Nancy's Globalizing-World-Formation," in *Nancy and the Political*, ed. Sanja Dejanovic (Edinburgh University Press, 2015). I thank Professor Martinon for sharing this chapter with me.
 - 8 Victor Li, "Elliptical Interruptions," *CR: The New Centennial Review* 7, no. 2 (fall 2007): 148.
 - 9 Jean-Luc Nancy, *Being Singular Plural* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2000), xvi.
 - 10 Nancy, *Being Singular Plural*, xvi.
 - 11 Nancy, *Being Singular Plural*, 3.
 - 12 Martta Heikkilä, *At the Limits of Presentation: Coming-into-Presence and Its Aesthetic Relevance in Jean-Luc Nancy's Philosophy* (Helsinki: Helsinki University Printing House, 2007), 116.
 - 13 Zhang Longxi, *Mighty Opposites: From Dichotomies to Differences in the Comparative Study of China* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1998), 83.
 - 14 Henk Oosterling, "From Interests to 'Inter-esse': Jean-Luc Nancy on Deglobalization and Sovereignty," *SubStance* 34, no. 106 (2005): 85.
 - 15 Serres, *The Five Senses: A Philosophy of Mingled Bodies* (London: Continuum, 2008), 258, 240.
 - 16 Serres, *The Five Senses*, 262.
 - 17 Serres, *The Five Senses*, 264.
 - 18 Serres, *The Five Senses*, 271.
 - 19 For a detailed analysis of the development of comparative world literature program and studies, see *Comparative Literature in the Age of Multiculturalism*, ed. Charles Bernheimer (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1995); A. Owen Aldridge, *The Reemergence of World Literature: A Study of Asia and the West* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1986); Robert J. Clements, *Comparative Literature as Academic Discipline: A Statement of Principles, Praxis, Standards* (New York: Modern Language Association of America, 1978); Claudio Guillén, *The Challenge of Comparative Literature*, trans. Cola Franzen (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993); John Pizer, *The Idea of World Literature: History and Pedagogical Practice* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2006); John David Pizer, "Toward a Productive Interdisciplinary Relationship: Between Comparative Literature and World Literature," *Comparatist* 31 (May 2007): 6–28; Emily Apter, *The Translation Zone: A New Comparative Literature* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University

- Press, 2006), 41–64; David Damrosch, *What Is World Literature?* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003); Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, *Death of a Discipline* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003); Steven Totosy de Zepetnek, ed., *Comparative Literature and Comparative Cultural Studies* (West Lafayette, IN: Purdue University Press, 2003).
- 20 Jonathan D. Culler, “Whither Comparative Literature?” *Comparative Critical Studies* 3, nos. 1–2 (2006): 89.
 - 21 Fernando Cabo Aseguinolaza, “Dead, or a Picture of Good Health?: Comparatism, Europe, and World Literature,” *Comparative Literature* 58, no. 4 (fall 2006): 419.
 - 22 Jonathan Arac, “Anglo-Globalism?” *New Left Review* 1, no. 6 (July–August 2002): 35–45.
 - 23 The concern is about resurrecting literature from the fuss and fizz of world literature. I want to see it freed from the uncritical comparative modes of doing literature, from Franco Moretti’s sweeping categorizations, and from the seeming authority of acknowledged universals of “global literature.” Anders Pettersson’s observations come very close to my concerns here: “Not only do I think that Moretti fails to analyze the concept of world literature, and that he fails, a fortiori, to derive a method for the study of world literature from the analysis, but I already regard it as a mistake to pose the question of what world literature ‘is’ as a factual question.” “Transcultural Literary History: Beyond Constricting Notions of World Literature,” *New Literary History* 39, no. 3 (2008): 473.
 - 24 See Lesley Sharpe, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Goethe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002); Fritz Strich, *Goethe and World Literature* (New York: Hafner, 1949); Alec G. Hargreaves, Charles Forsdick, David Murphy, *Transnational French Studies: Postcolonialism and Littérature-monde* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2010); John D. Pizer, *Imagining the Age of Goethe in German Literature, 1970–2010* (Rochester: Camden House, 2011); Elke Sturm-Trigonakis, *Comparative Cultural Studies and the New Weltliteratur* (West Lafayette, IN: Purdue University Press, 2013).
 - 25 Zhang Longxi, *Unexpected Affinities: Reading across Cultures* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2007), 55.
 - 26 See Rosi Braidotti, *Transpositions: On Nomadic Ethics* (Cambridge: Polity, 2006).
 - 27 Steven G. Yao, “The Unheimlich Maneuver; or the Gap, the Gradient, and the Spaces of Comparison,” *Comparative Literature* 57, no. 3 (summer 2005): 252.
 - 28 Nicholas Royle, *Veering: A Theory of Literature* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2011), 3.
 - 29 Royle, *Veering*, 4.
 - 30 Paul Celan, *Collected Prose*, trans. Rosemarie Waldrop (Manchester, UK: Carcanet, 1986), 35.

- 31 Didier Coste, "Is a Non-Global Universe Possible?: What Universals in the Theory of Comparative Literature (1952–2002) Have to Say about It," *Comparative Literature Studies* 41, no. 1 (2004): 47.
- 32 Tagore, "Visva-Sahitya," 213.
- 33 Tagore, "Visva-Sahitya," 214 (my emphases).
- 34 Tagore, "Visva-Sahitya," 217.
- 35 Bill Ashcroft, "Transcultural Presence," *Storia della Storiografia* 55 (2009): 76. Also see Ranjan Ghosh and Ethan Kleinberg, eds., *Presence: Philosophy, History, and Cultural Theory for the 21st Century* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2013).
- 36 Jean-Luc Nancy, *The Birth to Presence* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1993), 2.
- 37 Nancy, *The Birth to Presence*, 4.
- 38 Wai Chee Dimock, "A Theory of Resonance," *PMLA* 112, no. 5 (1997): 1061.
- 39 T. R. Sharma, *Toward an Alternative Critical Discourse* (Shimla: Indian Institute of Advanced Study, 2000), 10–11.
- 40 Raimundo Pannikar, "What Is Comparative Philosophy Comparing?" In *Interpreting Across Boundaries: New Essays in Comparative Philosophy*, ed. Gerald J. Larson and Eliot Deutsch (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1988), 116–36. He writes: "Diatopical hermeneutics is an art as much as a science, a praxis as much as a theory. It is a creative encounter, and there is no blueprint for creativity" (133). The more than global does not have any blueprint either.
- 41 G. N. Devy, *After Amnesia: Tradition and Change in Indian Literary Criticism* (London: Sangam Books, 1992), 78–82.
- 42 For more on these lines, see Ranjan Ghosh, "Institutionalised Theory, (In) fusion, Desivad," *Oxford Literary Review* 28 (2006): 25–36.
- 43 Dorothy Wordsworth, *Journals of Dorothy Wordsworth*, 2 vols. (New York: Macmillan, 1941), April 15, 1802, 1:131.
- 44 William Wordsworth, *The Poetical Works of William Wordsworth*, 2d ed. (Oxford: Clarendon, 1952–59), 2:507n, 187.
- 45 Urs Stäheli, "The Outside of the Global," *CR: The New Centennial Review* 3, no. 2 (summer 2003): 14.
- 46 See S. Radhakrishnan, *Principal Upanisads* (New Delhi: HarperCollins, 2006).
- 47 Steve Odin, *Process Metaphysics and Hua-yen Buddhism: A Critical Study of Cumulative Penetration vs. Interpenetration* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1982), 5.
- 48 See Michel Deguy, "Apparition du nom," in *Actes* (Paris: Gallimard, 1966), 245–47. Also see Jacques Derrida, "Comment nommer," in *Le poète que je cherche à être*, ed. Yves Charnet (Paris: Table Ronde, 1996), 189.
- 49 Arthur Rimbaud, "Je est un autre." In *Illuminations* (New York: New Directions, 1957), xxvii.
- 50 Sankaracarya, *Brahma Sutra Bhasya*, trans. Swami Gambhirananda (Advaita Ashram, 2000).

- 51 Rabindranath Tagore, "Sense of Beauty." In *Angel of Surplus*, ed. Sisir Kumar Ghose (Calcutta: Visva-Bharati, 1978), 54.
- 52 B. C. Hutchens, *Jean-Luc Nancy and the Future of Philosophy* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005), 12.
- 53 Hutchens, *Jean-Luc Nancy and the Future of Philosophy*, 38.
- 54 Oosterling, "From Interests to 'Inter-esse,'" 86, 88.
- 55 See James J. Y. Liu, *Language-Paradox-Poetics: A Chinese Perspective* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1988), 21; emphasis mine.
- 56 Quoted from John G. Rudy, *Wordsworth and the Zen Mind* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996), 28.
- 57 "Criticism must be transcendental, that is, must consider literature ephemeral and easily entertain the supposition of its entire disappearance," Ralph Waldo Emerson, journal, May 18, 1840, quoted in *The Fateful Question of Culture*, ed. Geoffrey Hartman (New York: Columbia University Press, 1997), 5.
- 58 Nancy, *Hegel: The Restlessness of the Negative* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2002), 44.
- 59 Oosterling, "From Interests to 'Inter-esse,'" 94–95.
- 60 Hutchens, *Jean-Luc Nancy and the Future of Philosophy*, 51.

Chapter 6: Globalization and World Literature

- 1 Karl Marx and Friedrich Engels, "The Communist Manifesto," accessed January 24, 2015, <http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1848/communist-manifesto/>.
- 2 Claire Colebrook, in an essay entitled "A Globe of One's Own: In Praise of the Flat Earth," which I have seen in manuscript, sent me back to Satan's space-travel in Milton. Her essay has been provocative for me in other ways, too, as have recent manuscript essays on "Critical Climate Change" by Tom Cohen.
- 3 See J. Hillis Miller, "Tales out of (the Yale) School," in *Theoretical Schools and Circles in the Twentieth-Century Humanities: Literary Theory, History, Philosophy*, ed. Marina Grishakova and Silvi Salupere (New York: Routledge, 2015), 115–32.
- 4 Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature*, trans. Dana Polan (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986).
- 5 David Damrosch, *What Is World Literature?* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003), 5.
- 6 Damrosch, *What Is World Literature?*, 4–5.
- 7 Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Conversations with Eckermann*, ed. J. K. Morehead, trans. John Oxenford (London: Everyman, 1930), 132. The conversations with Eckermann originally occurred between 1823 and 1832.
- 8 *King Lear*, 4.6.16.
- 9 Paul de Man, "Genesis and Genealogy (Nietzsche)," in *Allegories of Reading: Figurative Language in Rousseau, Nietzsche, Rilke, and Proust* (New Haven, CT: Yale

- University Press, 1979), 79–101; Andrzej Warminski, “Reading for Example: A Metaphor in Nietzsche’s Birth of Tragedy,” in *Readings in Interpretation: Hölderlin, Hegel, Heidegger* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), xxxv–lxi; Andrzej Warminski, “Terrible Reading (Preceded by ‘Epigraphs’),” in *Responses: Paul de Man’s Wartime Journalism* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989), 386–96; Carol Jacobs, “The Stammering Text: The Fragmentary Studies Preliminary to The Birth of Tragedy,” in *The Dissimulating Harmony: The Image of Interpretation in Nietzsche, Rilke, Artaud, and Benjamin* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1978), 1–22; Thomas Albrecht, “A ‘Monstrous Opposition’: The Double Dionysus and the Double Apollo in Nietzsche’s Birth of Tragedy,” in *The Medusa Effect: Representation and Epistemology in Victorian Aesthetics* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2009), 51–70.
- 10 Friedrich Nietzsche, “Vom Nutzen und Nachtheil der Historie für das Leben,” in *Sämtliche Werke*, ed. Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari (Munich: Walter de Gruyter, 1988), 1:243–334; Friedrich Nietzsche, “On the Utility and Liability of History for Life,” in *Unfashionable Observations*, vol. 2 of *The Complete Works*, 83–167 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1995).
 - 11 Friedrich Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy and The Case of Wagner*, trans. Walter Kaufmann (New York: Vintage, 1967), 110; Friedrich Nietzsche, “Die Geburt der Tragödie,” in *Sämtliche Werke*, ed. Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari (Munich: Walter de Gruyter, 1988), 1:9–156. The German original of the citation is on p. 116.
 - 12 Harold Bloom, *The Anxiety of Influence: A Theory of Poetry* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1973).
 - 13 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 111.
 - 14 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 143; Nietzsche, “Die Geburt der Tragödie,” 155.
 - 15 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 143.
 - 16 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 143.
 - 17 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 143.
 - 18 T. S. Eliot, “Burnt Norton,” in *The Collected Poems and Plays: 1909–1950* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1952), 118.
 - 19 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 143.
 - 20 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 143.
 - 21 Jacobs, “The Stammering Text”; Friedrich Nietzsche, “Nachgelassene Fragmente, 1869–1874,” in *Sämtliche Werke*, ed. Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari (Munich: Walter de Gruyter, 1988), 7:269–331.
 - 22 Jacobs, “The Stammering Text,” 20–22.
 - 23 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 130.
 - 24 Warminski, in “Reading for Example,” discusses catachresis in his reading of a metaphor in *The Birth of Tragedy* (liii–lxi).

- 25 *Jenseits von Gut und Böse*, in *Sämtliche Werke*, vol. 5, ed. Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari, 9–243 (Munich: Walter de Gruyter, 1988), 182. I have used Beebee’s unidentified translation.
- 26 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 110–11.
- 27 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 113–14.
- 28 Here appears again the figure of the tame shore as against the dangerous ocean of universal knowledge, or, in this case, the icy current of existence. “Knowledge” and “existence” are by no means the same, however. The import of the metaphor is reversed in the second example, as happens with so much else in the language of *The Birth of Tragedy*. In the first citation, universal Socratic knowledge is seen as bad, debilitating. In the second citation, man is seen as too timid to entrust himself, as he should do, to the icy waters of existence.
- 29 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 113.
- 30 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 144.
- 31 Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, 144.
- 32 George Eliot, *Middlemarch* (Harmondsworth, UK: Penguin, 1974), 229. The Cabeiri were a group of Samothracian fertility gods, the note in the Penguin *Middlemarch* tells me, with Casaubon-like learning.
- 33 Eliot, *Middlemarch*, 96.

Chapter 7: Reinventing the Teaching Machine

Epigraphs: Jacques Derrida, “Where a Teaching Body Begins and How It Ends,” in *Who Is Afraid of Philosophy?: Right to Philosophy I*, trans. J. Plug (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2002), 77; Fredric Jameson, *The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1981), 45.

- 1 Marjorie Garber, *Academic Instincts* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003), 53.
- 2 Garber, *Academic Instincts*, 60.
- 3 Marjorie Garber, “Good to Think With,” *Profession* (2008): 12.
- 4 Garber, “Good to Think With,” 13.
- 5 Suzanne Clark, “Discipline and Resistance,” in *Margins in the Classroom: Teaching Literature*, ed. Kostas Myrsiades and Linda S. Myrsiades (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press, 1994), 122.
- 6 See Joseph Epstein, *Alexis de Tocqueville: Democracy’s Guide* (New York: HarperCollins, 2006), 119.
- 7 Also see Ranjan Ghosh, ed. *In Dialogue with Godot: Waiting and Other Thoughts* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2013), where I have provided a new reading of *Waiting for Godot* (“Waiting upon Each Other: Work and Play in Waiting for Godot”) from an (in)fusionist perspective, keeping Hindu philosophy as the pervasive paradigm of intervention.

- 8 Rukmini Bhaya Nair, "Dissimilar Twins," in *The Lie of the Land*, ed. Rajeswari Sunder Rajan (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1992), 265–66.
- 9 Roland Barthes noted that interdisciplinary approaches "consist in creating a new object, which belongs to no one." See Garber, "Good to Think With," 72. Also see Theodor Adorno, *Kant's Critique of Pure Reason*, ed. Rolf Tiedemann, trans. Rodney Livingstone (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2001).
- 10 Louis Menand, "Dangers within and without Author(s)," *Profession* (2005): 14.
- 11 Douglas Steward, "Taking Liberties: Academic Freedom and the Humanities," *Profession* (2008), 167; emphases mine.
- 12 Rey Chow, "The Old/New Question of Comparison in Literary Studies," *ELH* 71 (2004): 303.
- 13 Terry Eagleton, *Against the Grain: Selected Essays, 1975–1985* (London: Verso, 1986), 139.
- 14 Vilashini Cooppan, "Ghosts in the Disciplinary Machine: The Uncanny Life of World Literature," *Comparative Literature Studies* 41 (2004): 21.
- 15 John M. Koller, "Dharma: An Expression of Universal Order," *Philosophy East and West* 22 (1972): 134.
- 16 Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan, *The Hindu View of Life* (New Delhi: Indus, 1993), 56.
- 17 J. A. B. van Buitenen, "Dharma and Moksha," *Philosophy East and West* 7 (1957): 35–36.
- 18 *Samkhya-Karika*, verse 1, accessed August, 21, 2015, http://www.ivantic.net/Moje_knjige/karika.pdf.
- 19 Samuel Beckett, *Proust* (New York: Grove Press, 1931), 48. The problem is that there is no Russellian spirit as evidenced in "Free Man's Worship," or the spirit that Camus tries to foreground that suggests the effort to face agony, absurdity, vacuity, and "unpleasure" with stolid boldness. All references to the play are from *Endgame* (London: Faber, 1970).
- 20 Baruch Spinoza, *Works of Spinoza*, ed. and trans. R. H. M. Elwes, 2 vols. (New York: Dover, 1955), 2:3.
- 21 A. C. Danto, *Mysticism and Morality* (New York: Penguin Books, 1976), 56.
- 22 Rabindranath Tagore, *Sadhana* (Madras: Macmillan, 1979), 40.
- 23 Samuel Beckett, *Endgame* (London: Faber, 1970), 48.
- 24 Beckett, *Endgame*, 23.
- 25 Beckett, *Endgame*, 24.
- 26 See Karen Horney, *Neurosis and Human Growth* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1950). She clarifies the responsibility of consciousness where the "real self" forms the central inner core and becomes the deep source of growth. The question arises as to the extent to which Hamm and Clov have realized the significance of a generative center of being. A growth that combines both the vertical and the horizontal axes points to a harmonious development and unfolds itself sufficiently on the road of a self-enriching dharma of existence. For more pertinent references to Gita, see S. Radhakrishnan, *The Bhagavad Gita* (New Delhi: HarperCollins, 2011), especially sections 14, 16, and 18.

- 27 See Hannah Arendt, *The Life of the Mind* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1978).
- 28 William E. Hocking, *Human Nature and Its Remaking* (New York: AMS Press 1976), 118–23.
- 29 Tagore, *Sadhana*, 57.
- 30 Beckett, *Endgame*, 47.
- 31 Beckett, *Endgame*, 33.
- 32 See Abraham H. Maslow, *Religions, Values, and Peak Experiences* (New York: Penguin, 1976); also by the same author, *Further Reaches of Human Nature* (New York: Viking, 1970).
- 33 Beckett, *Endgame*, 26.
- 34 Beckett, *Endgame*, 19.
- 35 Herman Keyserling, *From Suffering to Fulfilment*, trans. Jane Marshall (London: Selwyn and Blount, 1938), 122–24, 250–51, 257–58.
- 36 Beckett, *Endgame*, 43.
- 37 Beckett, *Endgame*, 28.
- 38 Beckett, *Endgame*, 28.
- 39 Mario Puglisi, *Prayer*, trans. Bernard M. Allen (New York: Macmillan, 1929), 211.
- 40 Thomas Nagel, *Mortal Questions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 14.
- 41 For Beckett, any perception of the “core” is problematic and very difficult to define. The “essence” of a thing remains elusive and defies formalization. Instances of this order are plentifully available in *The Unnamable* (1953). The sense of a fundamental unity is sorely lacking, which means that the metaphysical experiences of several of his protagonists are devoid of stability, permanence, and a transcendental joy. There is, thus, a relishing of passivity, an aspiration to revel in the freedom from the cardinal compulsion to cogit, “the great classical paralysis” (Molloy in *Three Novels* by Samuel Beckett [London: John Calder, 1956], 140). The inability to define the nature of reality and the virtual inexpressibility of the core of reality are the two issues that have primarily troubled me here; this means that the two characters cannot have the strength of the intellect to thrash out a significant view of the world. It is the “ordering” of the experiences and formalization of the chaos within that cry sorely for attention; despite the dim prospect of its eventual realization, the dharma of existence demands this inner reconstruction, which is what I ascribe to the inner emigration.
- 42 Beckett, *Endgame*, 25.
- 43 In the English translation, the boy is feared as “a potential procreator.” There is a fearful possibility of his living on as the boy pushes at the horizons of a refigured dharma of existence where the possibility of a new order of life, a new cycle, and a new earth come to the fore, threatening to obviate the hith-

- erto adharmic, existential coils. I believe that the significance of the “small boy” is more emphatically expressed in the French version.
- 44 Rabindranath Tagore, *Gitanjali* (London: Macmillan, 1921), 23.
- 45 K. Burch, *Eros as the Educational Principle of Democracy* (New York: Peter Lang, 2000), 180; see Gilbert Ryle, *The Concept of Mind* (London: Hutchinson, 1949).
- 46 Jane Gallop, “The Historicization of Literary Studies and the Fate of Close Reading,” *Profession* (2007): 181–86.
- 47 Jody Norton, “Guerrilla Pedagogy: Conflicting Authority and Interpretation in the Classroom,” *College Literature* 21, no. 3 (October 1994): 141.
- 48 Norton, “Guerrilla Pedagogy,” 141.
- 49 Tejeswani Niranjana, “Siting the Teacher,” in *The Lie of the Land*, 206.
- 50 Marshall Gregory, “Do We Teach Disciplines or Do We Teach Students? What Difference Does It Make?” *Profession* (2008): 127.
- 51 See Adnan M. Wazzan, “Arabia in Poetry,” *Islamic Studies* 29, no. 1 (spring 1990): 93.
- 52 Yeats, “Note to the Only Jealousy of Emer,” in *The Variorum Edition of the Plays of W. B. Yeats*, ed. Russell K. Alspach (New York: Macmillan, 1966), 568.
- 53 Gregory Ulmer, *Applied Grammatology: Post(e)-Pedagogy from Jacques Derrida to Joseph Beuys* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1985), 169.
- 54 Shoshana Felman, “Psychoanalysis and Education: Teaching Terminable and Interminable,” *Yale French Studies* 63 (1982): 23.
- 55 Felman, “Psychoanalysis and Education,” 30.
- 56 See Roger I. Simon, *Teaching against the Grain: Texts for a Pedagogy of Possibility* (New York: Bergin and Garvey, 1992), 97.

Chapter 8: Should We Read or Teach Literature Now?

- 1 James Joyce, *Finnegans Wake* (New York: Viking Press, 1947), 303.
- 2 An enormous literature published over the last decades tracking this transformation exists. Among recent books and essays are Marc Bousquet, *How the University Works: Higher Education and the Low-Wage Nation* (New York: New York University Press, 2008); Christopher Newfield, *Unmaking the Public University: The Forty-Year Assault on the Middle Class* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2008); Frank Donoghue, *The Last Professors: The Corporate University and the Fate of the Humanities* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1998); Jeffrey J. Williams, *How to Be an Intellectual: Essays on Criticism, Culture, and the University* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2014). All these have extensive bibliographies. Peggy Kamuf, “Counting Madness,” in *The Future of the Humanities: U.S. Domination and Other Issues*, a special issue of *Oxford Literary Review*, ed. Timothy Clark and Nicholas Royle, vol. 28 (2006): 67–77.

- 3 Quoted in Frank Donoghue, "Prestige," in *Profession* (New York: Modern Language Association of America, 2006), 156.
- 4 Richard C. Levin, "The Rise of Asia's Universities," January 31, 2010, The Royal Society, London, England, accessed April 29, 2016, <http://communications.yale.edu/president/speeches/2010/01/31/rise-asia-s-universities>.
- 5 See Mat Honan, "Fast, Loud, and Mostly True: Inside the All-New Buzz-Fueled American Media Machine," *Wired Magazine*, 23, no. 1 (January 2015): 67.
- 6 See Sam Frank's fascinating essay about one facet of the digital revolution, the springing up of visionary prophets predicting, among other things, a dangerous robotic future powered by computers. It is dangerous because the computers may begin thinking for themselves and turn against their human creators: "Come with Us If You Want to Live: Among the Apocalyptic Libertarians of Silicon Valley," *Harper's*, January 2015, 26–36.
- 7 A recent report, published April 2015, by a committee of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, *The State of the Humanities: Higher Education 2015* (available online at http://www.humanitiesindicators.org/binaries/pdf/HI_HigherEd2015.pdf) takes a somewhat more cheerful view, emphasizing, for example, that there has been no increase in the percentage of adjuncts and part-time faculty in the humanities (it is already over 70 percent), the increased number of students who do humanities as a second major, and an increase in course credits in the humanities even as the humanities' share of undergraduate degrees has been shrinking. The report is primarily based on statistical surveys, however. It would be interesting, for example, to know just what the content of those courses typically is. How many are in English composition, which is what most adjuncts in English departments primarily teach?
- 8 See Paul Krugman, "Tidings of Comfort," *New York Times*, December 26, 2014.
- 9 Jacques Derrida, *L'Université sans condition* (Paris: Galilée, 2001); Jacques Derrida, "The University without Condition," in *Without Alibi*, ed. and trans. Peggy Kamuf, 202–37 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2002).
- 10 "What, me worry?" is the motto of that iconic nonworrier, Alfred E. Neuman, in *Mad Magazine*. See the Wikipedia entry for *Mad Magazine*.
- 11 Donoghue, "Prestige," 20.
- 12 John Keats, "On Sitting Down to Read King Lear Once Again," accessed September 6, 2010, <http://www.poemhunter.com/poem/on-sitting-down-to-read-king-lear-once-again/>.
- 13 Howard Foster Lowry, ed., *The Letters of Matthew Arnold to Arthur Hugh Clough* (London: Oxford University Press, 1932), 96.
- 14 For a proposal for such courses, see David Pogue's interview of John Palfrey, Harvard Law School professor and codirector of Harvard's Berkman Center for Internet and Society (accessed September 6, 2010, <http://www.nytimes.com/indexes/2010/07/22/technology/personaltechemail/index.html>).
- 15 W. B. Yeats, *The Variorum Edition of the Poems*, ed. Peter Allt and Russell K. Alspach (New York: Macmillan, 1977), 316.

- 16 J. Hillis Miller, "W. B. Yeats: "The Cold Heaven,'" in *Others* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001), 170–82.
- 17 The saying ("Die Rose ist ohne warum; sie blühet weil sie blühet") is cited in the original German by Jorge Luis Borges, "La cábala," *Siete Noches* (Mexico City: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1980), 120–21; Jorge Luis Borges, "The Kabbalah," *Seven Nights*, trans. Eliot Weinberger (New York: New Directions, 1984), 94. See also Angelus Silesius, *The Cherubic Wanderer*, trans. Maria Shradly (New York: Paulist Press, 1986).
- 18 A. Norman Jeffares, *A Commentary on the Collected Poems of W. B. Yeats* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1968), 146.
- 19 Yeats, *Variorum Edition of the Poems*, 269.
- 20 Paul de Man, "The Resistance to Theory," in *The Resistance to Theory* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), 11.

Chapter 9: The Ethics of Reading Sahitya

Epigraphs: B. J. Hiley and F. David Peat, eds., *Quantum Implications: Essays in Honour of David Bohm* (London: Routledge, 1991), 350; Georges Bataille, *Eroticism*, trans. M. Dalwood (London, 1987), 19.

- 1 Derek Attridge, ed., *Acts of Literature* (London: Routledge, 1992), 5.
- 2 Mikhail M. Bakhtin, *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*, ed. Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist, trans. Vern W. McGee (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986), 170.
- 3 Elizabeth Grosz, *Chaos, Territory, Art*, 9.
- 4 G. Deleuze and F. Guattari, *What Is Philosophy?*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Graham Burchell (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994), 206.
- 5 Oswald de Andrade and Leslie Bary, "Cannibalist Manifesto," *Latin American Literary Review* 1, no. 38 (July–December 1991): 36.
- 6 Andrade and Bary, "Cannibalist Manifesto," 38, 39.
- 7 Andrade and Bary, "Cannibalist Manifesto," 38.
- 8 Kenneth David Jackson, "A View on Brazilian Literature: Eating the Revista de Antropofagia," *Latin American Literary Review* 7, no. 13 (fall–winter 1978): 3.
- 9 Rachel Galvin, "Poetry Is Theft," *Comparative Literature Studies* 51, no. 1 (2014): 20.
- 10 For some interesting documentation of Arnold's engagement with the Orient, see Martin William and R. Jarrett-Kerr, "Arnold Versus the Orient: Some Footnotes to a Disenchantment," *Comparative Literature Studies* 12, no. 2 (June 1975): 129–46.
- 11 V. S. Seturaman, "The Scholar Gipsy and Oriental Wisdom," *Review of English Studies* 9, no. 36 (November 1958): 413.
- 12 Seturaman, "The Scholar Gipsy and Oriental Wisdom," 412.
- 13 R. H. Super, ed., *The Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1960–1977), 1:215.

- 14 Super, *The Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold*, 6:168.
- 15 Arnold, "On the Modern Element in Literature," *The Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold*, 1:21.
- 16 Quoted in Brendan Rapple, "Matthew Arnold and Comparative Education," *British Journal of Educational Studies* 37, no. 1 (February 1989): 58.
- 17 See Donald D. Stone, "Matthew Arnold and the Pragmatics of Hebraism and Hellenism," *Poetics Today* 19, no. 2 (summer 1998): 185.
- 18 Shirley Robin Letwin, "Matthew Arnold: Enemy of Tradition," *Political Theory* 10, no. 3 (August 1982): 338.
- 19 Brenda Machosky, "Fasting at the Feast of Literature," *Comparative Literature Studies* 42, no. 2 (2005): 290.
- 20 Machosky, "Fasting at the Feast of Literature," 304.
- 21 Friedrich Nietzsche, *The Gay Science*, trans. Walter Kaufmann (New York: Vintage, 1974), 382.
- 22 Edmund Husserl, "Philosophy as a Rigorous Science," in *Husserl: Shorter Works*, ed. Peter McCormick and Frederick A. Elliston (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1981), 196.
- 23 See Mitchell Waldrop, *Complexity: The Emerging Science at the Edge of Chaos* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1993), 146.
- 24 Ian Stewart, *Does God Play Dice?: The Mathematics of Chaos* (Cambridge, MA: Blackwell, 1989), 17.
- 25 John L. Casti, *Complexification: Explaining a Paradoxical World through the Science of Surprise* (New York: HarperCollins, 1994), 276; see also 170.
- 26 Ralph Waldo Emerson, "Nature," in *Selected Writings*, ed. Brooks Atkinson (New York: Random House, 1950), 20.
- 27 Karen Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity: Toward an Understanding of How Matter Comes to Matter," *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 28, no. 3 (2003): 810.
- 28 Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity," 815.
- 29 Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity," 815.
- 30 Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity," 817.
- 31 Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity," 817.
- 32 David Baird, *Thing Knowledge: A Philosophy of Scientific Instruments* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 145.
- 33 Baird, *Thing Knowledge*, 146.
- 34 Robert Frost, "For Once, Then, Something," accessed September 19, 2015, <http://www.poetryfoundation.org/poem/173528>.
- 35 Graham Harman, "The Well-Wrought Broken Hammer: Object Oriented Literary Criticism," *New Literary History* 43, no. 2 (2012): 201–2.
- 36 The connections between Harman's object-oriented ontology and that ethics of sahitya as explicated in this chapter need further elaboration, which I hope to bring out someday. Some interesting recent additions to this line of scholarship dealing with humanities and OOO come from Richard Grusin,

- ed., *The Non Human Turn* (Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press, 2015); Ming Xie, ed., *The Agon of Interpretations: Towards a Critical Intercultural Hermeneutics* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014); Timothy Morton, “An Object-Oriented Defense of Poetry,” *New Literary History* 43, no. 2 (spring 2012): 205–24; Brian Kim Stefans, “Terrible Engines,” *Comparative Literature Studies* 51, no. 1, *Special Issue: Poetry Games* (2014): 159–83.
- 37 Charles E. Scott, *Living with Indifference* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2007), 5.
- 38 Lisa Robertson, “The Present,” in *R’s Boat* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010), accessed September 15, 2015, <https://www.poets.org/poetsorg/poem/present>.

Chapter 10: Literature and Ethics

- 1 Matthew Arnold, “The Study of Poetry,” *Poetry and Criticism of Matthew Arnold*, ed. A. Dwight Culler (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1961), 306. “The Study of Poetry” was first published in 1880 as the general introduction to a four-volume anthology, *The English Poets*.
- 2 This essay is available as chapter 6 of J. Hillis Miller, *An Innocent Abroad: Lectures in China* (Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press, 2015).
- 3 Anthony Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, Oxford World’s Classics edition (London: Oxford University Press, 1961).
- 4 Anthony Trollope, *An Autobiography*, ed. David Skilton (Harmondsworth, UK: Penguin Books, 1996), 32.
- 5 Trollope, *An Autobiography*, 33.
- 6 Trollope, *An Autobiography*, 33.
- 7 Trollope, *An Autobiography*, 33.
- 8 Trollope, *An Autobiography*, 115.
- 9 Trollope, *An Autobiography*, 96, 97.
- 10 Trollope, *An Autobiography*, 95. The whole paragraph about *Framley Parsonage* in *An Autobiography*, 94–95, gives Trollope’s mature judgment of that novel. It will be discussed later in this chapter.
- 11 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 514.
- 12 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 293.
- 13 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 229.
- 14 Trollope, *An Autobiography*, 94.
- 15 Trollope, *An Autobiography*, 95.
- 16 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 126, 127–28.
- 17 This, by the way, is an example of Trollope’s constant, covert use of unidentifiable citation or allusion. It echoes a passage many Victorian readers would perhaps have recognized, that is, what Sydney Carton says in Dickens’s *A Tale of Two Cities* (published in 1859, a year before *Framley Parsonage* began to appear in periodical form), book 2, chapter 4: “I care for no man on earth and

no man on earth cares for me.” Both Dickens and Trollope, however, may be echoing some folksong, popular song, or common saying. *Framley Parsonage* also contains, in my judgment, many covert echoes of Sir Walter Scott’s *The Bride of Lammermoor*. Many of Trollope’s readers would have known Scott’s novel. Lucy Robarts is not called Lucy for nothing, since that is the name of Scott’s heroine. Many parallels exist between the plots of the two stories. Lucy Robarts may be referring ironically to Scott’s Lucy when, in a response to Fanny Robarts’s question about how Lucy can joke about Lady Lufton’s opposition to her marriage to Lord Lufton, she says: “I ought to be pale, ought I not? And very thin, and to go mad by degrees? I have not the least intention of doing anything of the kind” (Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 385). Or perhaps Trollope is satirically echoing Donizetti’s opera, *Lucia di Lammermoor* (1835), based on Scott’s novel, with its famous aria sung by Lucia in her madness.

- 18 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 229.
- 19 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 145.
- 20 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 180.
- 21 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 283.
- 22 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 286.
- 23 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 447.
- 24 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 501, 502.
- 25 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 524.
- 26 See J. L. Austin, *How to Do Things with Words*, 2d ed., ed. J. O. Urmson and Marina Sbisa (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980). See also J. Hillis Miller, *Speech Acts in Literature* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2001).
- 27 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 346.
- 28 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 483.
- 29 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 268.
- 30 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 180–81.
- 31 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 229.
- 32 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 288, 289.
- 33 See Immanuel Kant, “On a Supposed Right to Lie from Altruistic Motives” (1797), translation by Lewis White Beck in *Immanuel Kant: Critique of Practical Reason and Other Writings in Moral Philosophy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1949; reprinted by New York: Garland Publishing Company, 1976).
- 34 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 339.
- 35 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 346.
- 36 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 343.
- 37 The Wikipedia entry for “The King and the Beggar-Maid” mentions *Framley Parsonage* as one place among a great many in Western literature where the beggar-maid story appears.
- 38 Trollope, *Framley Parsonage*, 288–89.
- 39 See “conjure” in the *Oxford English Dictionary*.