INTRODUCTION

ELIZABETH A. PRITCHARD

In the past two decades, scholarly attention to Pentecostalism has increased significantly in an effort to address this fastest-growing sector of contemporary Christianity. At the turn of the twenty-first century, followers of Pentecostal Christianity number 345 million to 523 million, with an estimated 9 million conversions annually. Overwhelmingly, growth is evidenced outside of the West, with women constituting 75 percent of the membership (Anderson 2004: 11; Robbins 2004: 117). Amid this astonishing growth, Pentecostal belief and practice continues to reflect variety, complexity, and even paradox. Pentecostals eschew worldly affairs, categories, and structures, yet they are also known to be avid participants in political elections and citizenship campaigns.[1] Some Pentecostal churches embrace sober and simple lifestyles; still others accumulate significant wealth, as well as extensive and diverse media holdings. Pentecostal gender discipline suggests a revamping of patriarchal domestic relationships yet empowers women with spiritual authority and prompts men to forgo significant gender prerogatives.

Given this explosive growth, obvious appeal to women, and global reach, the moment seemed exactly right for academics to gather together to reflect on these trends. The essays in this volume are drawn from a symposium held at Bowdoin College that brought together leading and emerging scholars in Africana, religious, and feminist studies, as well as history, anthropology, sociology, and ethnomusicology, to discuss

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

Pentecostalism's appeal to Black women in settings as wide-ranging as Brazil, Ghana, Grenada, Haiti, Mozambique, Nigeria, Rwanda, the United States, and Zambia. The variety of these contexts showcases Pentecostalism's reach, as well as its adaptability to specific cultural and political formations.[2] Although missionary entanglements with US churches continue, local agentive processes of religious appropriation and transformation have been present from the start (Corten and Marshall-Fratani 2001: 16). The flows of Pentecostal people and ideas scramble colonial "center-periphery" templates; they crisscross lines between former colonies and establish South-South relations. Indeed, this diversity is also reflected in the fact that not all of the authors use the term "Pentecostal." Some use "evangelical" or "Neo-Pentecostal," the latter referring to more recent trends emphasizing "health and wealth," spiritual warfare and deliverance, and the extensive use of media. Others use the designations "spirit-filled" or "sanctified." "Pentecostal" is perhaps best understood, then, as signaling a "family resemblance" among convictions and practices. This resemblance largely pertains to "the working of gifts of the spirit" (Anderson 2004: 13), which include healing, prophesizing, and speaking in tongues.[3]

The primary rationale for a volume focused on Black women and Pentecostalism in diaspora is a sense that, although Black women constitute a substantial proportion of the world's Pentecostals, there has been a dearth of explorations of their experiences, theologies, and innovations in diverse contexts. In addition to fleshing out the complex subjectivities of Black women, then, the contributors to this volume place them at the center of scholarship on Pentecostalism to explore the interosculation of gender and race, as well as class, religion, and nation. This aim reflects the insights and commitments of intersectionality theory, as coined by Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw (1989) and reflected in Black feminist sources dating to the nineteenth century.[4] According to various contributors to this theory, people experience structural inequalities, as well as sources of identification, as simultaneous, miscible, or interlocking rather than as discrete categories. Intersectionality analyses challenge the presumption that one form of domination or identification is more foundational or explanatory than another; they also contest monolithic readings of identity that deny intragroup differences. However, it is only very recently that theorists of intersectionality have considered addressing religion (see Goldschmidt

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

and McAlister 2004; Singh 2015). Some of this neglect is certainly attributable to a presumption of secularity whereby religion is regarded as an axis of oppression necessitating resistance on the part of fully emancipated subjects. At the same time, the reluctance to engage with religion reveals the gender-, class-, and race-based aspects of conventional understandings of religion and secularity. As Gayatri Spivak (2012: 396) suggests, "The separation of Church and State and the separation of the public and the private are too race- and class-specific and indeed gender-specific to hold up a just world." Similarly, Marie Griffith (1997: 205), writing about secular feminists' lack of engagement with spirit-filled women's movements, has noted that "general hostility toward religious and cultural 'backwardness' is fueled by interests that are profoundly class-based."

The second rationale for this volume is our conviction that taking into account Black women's diasporic dislocations sheds new light on the political implications of Pentecostalism. These dislocations challenge modern secular pretensions of clearly delimited subjects, nations, and religions. They belie the presumption that all the world's inhabitants are citizens whose bodies and interests are equally and sufficiently claimed and protected by sovereign states and their vaunted "rule of law." Black women across the globe—variously disenfranchised and displaced or disaffected by racism, misogyny, corruption, civil war, neoliberal privatization, poverty, and climate change—continue to cultivate diverse modes of mobilization and to enter fraught negotiations with the media sensations afforded by globalization. Spirit work signifies and expresses their *struggle*, not just in cosmologies, churches, individuals, and households, but within and among nation-states and their migrant corridors. To this end, we insist that a major appeal of Pentecostalism to Black women worldwide consists in its being the proximate and preeminent opportunity for these women to engage what Lauren Berlant (1997: 81), albeit in a different context, refers to as "undead desires to form a live relation to power." For instance, accounting for her shift from a Baptist to a Pentecostal congregation, Mrs. W., whom Arthur Fauset describes as "a middle-aged colored woman," declared that she needed "more power."[5] This lived engagement with the Pentecostal "gift of power" undoubtedly reflects the specificities of particular contexts, yet it betrays a consistent and resolute focus on detecting and dispelling disabling power and cultivating enabling power (Hardesty 1999: 49).

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

The massive growth of a transnational religious population enamored with power was not supposed to happen. In the modern secular context, power was to be centralized and monopolized by "states," while "religions," never really privatized, were nonetheless downgraded to various edifying projects of meaning making, self-fashioning, and cultural heritage. State and religion were to be fully extricated and confined to their respective jurisdictions; possessive spirits were to be sent packing; liminal and festive orgies were to be curtailed; and boundaries were to be installed all around to prevent the indiscriminate mixing that would confound the aspirations of rational actors, nation-states, and capitalist markets.[6] According to Charles Taylor, rational actors or secular subjects are not "enchanted" but "buffered." Taylor's buffered self is in contrast to the purported "premodern self" who was susceptible to random flows of power and influence, both spiritual and demonic. He writes:

> Modern Westerners have a clear and firm boundary between mind and world, even mind and body. . . . For the modern, buffered self, the possibility exists of taking a distance, disengaging, from everything outside the mind. . . . As a bounded self, I see the boundary as a buffer, such that the things beyond don't need to "get to me," to use the contemporary expression. That's the sense of my use of the term "buffered" here. *This self can see itself as invulnerable, as master of the meanings that things have for it.* (Taylor 2011: 40–41, emphasis added; see also Taylor 2007: 300–301; Taylor 2011: 39–42)

Taylor's (2007: 423) description of buffered subjects is incongruent with his acknowledgment of the "penetration" everywhere of electronic media. Moreover, we are not convinced that modernity affords inviolable boundaries, feelings of invulnerability, or mastery of meanings. Indeed, where or who is the modern West in the constantly shifting context that is the postcolonial diaspora, with its transnational circuits of migration and media? We repudiate conceptions of modern subjectivity that are uninformed and undifferentiated with regard to class, race, gender, sexuality, and nation.

The essays gathered here highlight how Pentecostals forge "connections [that] chafe against the realpolitik of geopolitical mappings" and make "hemispheric linkages within the deepest epistemic and affective logics of empire and violence." In doing so, they draw attention to "shared

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

cosmologies of suffering which bring together [for instance] displaced mothers" (Chatterjee 2009, quoted in Swarr and Nagar 2010: 46). These connections reflect how Pentecostals' affective attachments alternately mediate, mirror, and remedy the injustices, deprivations, and opportunities posed by the diasporic dislocations of modernity. Black women's bodies, in particular, continue to be points of production for the antagonisms of civil war, neoliberal capitalist exploitation, and racist stigmatization. Thus, we insist that even the personal and domestic settings for the labors of spirit power—dress and comportment, housekeeping and parenting, infidelity and abuse, fertility and death—are to be understood against the backdrop of the inequities and conflicts produced by state formation and failure. This insistence is a reflection of one of the lessons of intersectionality: that sources and practices of identity are inextricably linked to, and thus reflect and respond to, political and economic structures.

In contrast to Taylor's account of modern subjects, Pentecostals imagine "spirit" not as a safely contained, distant, or transcendent divinity, but as a power pulsing through and linking individuals. Spirit power is not a sacred trust, then, but "a reservoir of signs at the disposal of individuals" who have no need of or access to extensive and costly credentialing systems. In spirit-filled practice, religion as an embodied "chain of memory" entailing calendric ritual observance has given way to more expressive and ephemeral performances tied to the social and political changes wrought by neoliberal capitalist modes of production (Hervieu-Lèger 2000: 168; see also Hervieu-Lèger 2000: 59, 137, 172–73). These characteristics of Pentecostalism evidence John Modern's version of secularism, whereby individuals are porous vessels subject to "forces . . . neither visible nor strictly corporeal" (Modern 2011: 34, 46). Such forces cannot be critically overcome or even entirely exorcised; they can only be caught and channeled through continually refashioned circuits of connectivity.

In shifting our attention from the racial, class, and gender assumptions and aspirations of the "modern West" to the diasporic contexts of postcolonial Africa, we find much that contradicts the conventional suppositions of the secular: religions are not confined to private or so-called sacred spaces, clearly marked congregations, or unidirectional flows from authorized people and hegemonic centers. These instances do not indicate the persistence of a premodern and enchanted Africa as against a secular modern West. Rather, they indicate the inadequacy of standard

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

models of secularity and the need to rethink binary relations of state and religion, public and private, political and spiritual. We might consider, for instance, the extent to which religions—in a postcolonial diasporic context—have become secular or "worldly," circulating as signs, constituting various publics, and making up for state failure or neglect.

For instance, we suggest that Pentecostal gatherings can be seen as performances of what Michael Warner (2002: 26) calls "collective public intimacy." They tacitly contest bourgeois publics that are predicated on relative strangerhood and on distanciation from the body's particularities. Pentecostal media stage expressive publics that rely on affect rather than deliberation, textual mastery, or academic authority. Thus, Pentecostal publics appear to qualify as to what Warner (2002: 26) calls a counter-public—that is, a public that is in "tension with a larger public. . . . Discussion within such a public is understood to contravene the rules obtaining in the world at large, being structured by alternative dispositions or protocols, making different assumptions about what can be said or what goes without saying." Our focus on gender and race—specifically, our attention to the related, albeit diverse, perceptions, aspirations, and actions of Black women—highlights the extent to which Pentecostal churches and para-churches provide opportunities for marginalized people to speak and to do so in multitudinous ways. Pentecostal publics also qualify, then, as specific instantiations of what Nancy Fraser refers to as "subaltern counterpublics." For Fraser (1990: 67), these publics are "parallel discursive arenas where members of subordinated social groups invent and circulate counterdiscourses, which in turn permit them to formulate oppositional interpretations of their identities, interests, needs." Pentecostal worship services are hardly venues of escape; they are, as Ruth Marshall-Fratani (2001: 90) notes, evidence of "a conscious project of creating—modern, functional spaces and forms of association." These gatherings—which use media technology and eschew narrow boundaries of locality—are virtual worlds in which spiritual affiliation seeks to neutralize the antagonisms and anxieties of unbuffered selves.

We share with proponents of "lived religion" a focus on religion's role in contexts of dislocation and struggle: "The study of lived religion has attended with particular care to moments of conflict, dissonance, and displacement. . . . [It] has focused chiefly on people whose lives have been

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

ruptured by social, political and historical circumstances, and such work highlights multiple creative uses of religion in the midst as well as the aftermath of those dynamic changes" (Griffith and Savage 2006: xvii). At the same time, we think that the contemporary flows of people and media are reshaping religion such that "lived religion" conjures an erstwhile stability or continuity that is not reflective of diasporic contexts. The transnational flows and forums of Pentecostal missionaries, migrants, and media celebrities resemble better what Peggy Levitt refers to as "religious assemblages." Levitt derives the idea of religious assemblages from philosophical theories predicated on the image of the rhizome (Deleuze and Guattari 1987: 21). In botany, a rhizome is a plant whose nodes or extensions behave as roots, allowing for extensive lateral growth. As a philosophical idea, it represents entities that are nonhierarchical in that they afford multiple entry points, affiliations, and offshoots, with no definitive origin or singular root. Levitt borrows this idea to convey religious affiliations that entail "contingent clustering" and myriad "sites of encounter" and that make for an "unruly, clumsy collection that is constantly on the move." Levitt is particularly concerned to capture the dynamism and opportunism of religious activity in a context of global movement. Although the movements may not be subject to control and resist centralization, they are constrained, and thus uneven. Levitt describes the process this way: "new overlays land on pockmarked geographies, enabling some things to travel easily while inhibiting others" (Levitt 2013: 160, 165, 169). Levitt's theory has affinities with Amit Rai's theory of "media assemblages." Rai challenges readers to think of media as the "contested production of sensation," rather than simply methods of information delivery or a series of representations that are finished products reflecting hierarchies of power. Accordingly, such contested productions are events or scenes of circulation of "a predictable but patterned trajectory of present conforming to past but open to future mutations." Rai's theory is useful to scholars of diasporic Pentecostals insofar as it captures the dynamism of spirit-filled stagings and directs attention to Pentecostal "ecologies of sensation"—that is, to the passionate attachments of various populations (Rai 2009: 2–3).

By way of illustration, consider the following scenes. The first two come from a praise and worship service at the Pentecostal Revival Church, a largely Ghanaian church in southern Amsterdam, the Netherlands, on

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

Pentecost, May 27, 2012.[7] The service (in English, Dutch, and Akan/ Twi) was held in a large performance hall, used regularly by the church. One of the special guests that day was the Evangel Concert Orchestra of Evangel University (Assemblies of God, Springfield, Missouri), which was wrapping up an extended tour through major European cities. Larry Dissmore, the director, explained that although their repertoire of African American spirituals would be unknown to the various residents of Europe, it was a particularly fitting gift from his American institution. (Dissmore did not, however, acknowledge the orchestra's overwhelmingly White membership.) He added that although the audience would not know the songs, they would find familiar their rhythms and laments. The large assembly listened politely as the orchestra and chorus performed the spirituals. When they finished, the Ghanaian pastor, Emmanuel Koney, announced to his American guests that now they were going to be treated to *true* African music and dance. At that point, the crowd roared with delight and jumped up to sing and dance in a decidedly joyous fashion.

Another special guest the same day was the Ghanaian actress Mercy Asiedu. She paid tribute to the authority of the minister, but then in song and dance playfully put him in his place, to the energetic affirmative responses of the women in the hall. Her mischievous energy and their supportive cheers lent tangible support to Diane Austin-Broos's (1997: 235) contention that patriarchy in large urban Pentecostal churches largely consists of "set pieces" that are "overtaken by the practice of women."[8] Moreover, the impromptu performance served to confirm Nicole Toulis's (1997: 235) observation that within spirit-filled churches women use their expressive power to monopolize a service, despite being excluded from the role of "pastor."[9] Indeed, Asiedu then proceeded to sing several songs from her gospel recordings, while the pastor wove in and out of rows upon rows of people, hawking her CDs.

The third scene is lifted from the fact and fiction that is Asiedu's celebrity. As she demonstrated at the church in Amsterdam, Asiedu is deft at riffing on gender expectations and performances; she has a wonderfully comic routine on YouTube in which she plays a rapper bossing around her male assistant and boldly challenging another female rapper to a song contest.[10] Rather than simply competing against each other, however, the women combine their critical and comedic talents to putting the hapless

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

male assistant through his paces. Asiedu is best known, however, as a television actress who is particularly adept at playing women who simmer and scheme at the limitations foisted on them by patriarchal relationships and dead-end jobs. Asiedu has a complex international media presence. She has been pressured to respond to rumors about infidelity with her co-stars on Ghanaian TV and in film, and she has been ridiculed for not mastering English. Yet she was also the recipient of an award at the USA-African Gospel and Movie Achievement Awards Night held at the Bronx location of the Apostolic Church International in March 2012, an event hosted by an agency dedicated to "rebranding" Africa.

These scenes show how Pentecostal religious assemblages unsettle boundaries of nation, gender, race, class, religion, and entertainment. More specifically, they raise a number of questions about the meaning of "Africa" in postcolonial diasporic contexts. Who may lay claim to the legacy of "African" culture or aesthetics? How is it that White American Pentecostals perform African American spirituals as emblematic of America for their European audiences? Why are some Pentecostals invested in staging performances of what is "authentically" African while others are "rebranding" Africa? For some Pentecostals, it is imperative to celebrate African music and dance that is unaligned with the particular brutalities of slavery in the Americas. For others, "Africa" signifies "traditional" religion that is variously figured as pagan, idolatrous, or demonic. What these instances indicate, however, is that Pentecostal invocations of "Africa" encapsulate political imaginaries that challenge, as well as reflect, hegemonic narratives centered on "the modern West."

These scenes also highlight the provisionality and tensions of Pentecostal gender performances in diasporic media. In some cases, the glamour of celebrity acts as a solvent on reified gender roles; in others, it attracts additional scrutiny of unconventional women. Who was the recipient of the award? Asiedu the gospel singer or Asiedu the YouTube rapper? Asiedu playing the scheming wife or Asiedu the beleaguered headliner of the Ghanaian gossip pages? Increasingly, the macro- and micro-movements and positionings of Pentecostal bodies are simultaneously lit up by the spectral presence of media assemblages. Consequently, having committed to wide-ranging media circuits, Pentecostals cannot presume to consistently control the messages relayed by the aggregate of their transnational ecologies of sensation.

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

In insisting on modern subjects as "buffered," Taylor ignores the political and economic inequalities and instabilities that make for a contemporary postcolonial context of people, data, and capital on the move.[11] Although the fact that people migrate to gain access to resources, to escape war and persecution, and to secure employment is not peculiar to modernity, the modern movements of people—one of the defining characteristics of what is termed "globalization"—are unprecedented in scope and intensity. Given these pressures, we resist the reading of "diaspora" as an archipelago of liminal spaces infused with nostalgia. Scholars must take care to avoid theories that rhetorically romanticize the movement of peoples as reflecting open-endedness and dynamism rather than idolatrous or dogmatic closure. Wallace Best (2005: 1) has remarked, "Blacks have long connected their freedom to the ability to move, to change place or spatial direction, recognizing that, as Ralph Ellison [1980: 133] put it, 'geography is fate.'"[12] Yet it is precisely by paying heed to race, gender, and class that one avoids a simple conflation of mobility and emancipation. The advantages afforded by insertion in transnational networks must be considered along with the uneven pressures, deprivations, and insecurities that compel and attend such movements. We salute our fellow theorists when they insist that religions are not "reified substances," but we are skeptical when religions are *generalized*, *catalogued*, and *defined* as "crossings" in keeping with "a cultural moment in which movement and relation seem important" (Tweed 2006: 22, 54, 59). Scholars need to be careful not to "naturalize" or de-historicize the movements of religious bodies—movements that vary historically as exile, crusade, expulsion, slavery, or circulating commodities in global capitalism.

Pippa Norris and Ronald Inglehart (2012) have argued that, as long as there is the existential insecurity and social and economic stratification that accompanies neoliberal capitalism (of which increasing migration and decreasing support for public safety nets are prime characteristics), there will be a need for religion. Pentecostals have developed these transnational assemblages alongside nation-states that are variously racist, punitive, negligent, depleted, or corrupt. Such contexts engender and exacerbate profound inequities within states and among states, prompting surplus populations to seek alternative structures of social and economic support, shared imaginaries of belonging and possibility, robust narratives of denunciation and exorcism, and markers of prestige and moral

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

glamour (whether of privation or prosperity). Pentecostals' demands for and practices of spiritual, physical, and material well-being testify to their pragmatic detachment from and implicit critique of the state, as well as their efforts to supplement modern states' ongoing retreat from public services.

Having delineated the broader context that calls into question Taylor's description of modern secular subjects as invulnerable to multitudinous currents of power, we turn now to the question as to the dimensions and efficacies of Pentecostal power. The preoccupation with delimiting real and authentic power or agency from its fake and presumably atavistic sources and deluded claimants is a rarely acknowledged, though foundational, characteristic of secular modernity. Moreover, it is also central to the Pentecostal project. Webb Keane (2007: 54) observes that Pentecostals share with European colonialists and anthropologists a sense of "the moral danger of mislocated agency." Thus, an immanent critique of Pentecostal claims to offering "technologies for accessing power" is entirely appropriate (Meyer 2012: 107). Pentecostals supply implicit normative criteria for evaluating power in their touting self-overcoming, healing, victory, and prosperity. Their visions of salvation include bodily and material needs and the righting of relationship. This does not mean, however, that spirit power is incontestably a boon to the well-being of the women who cultivate a relationship to it, although this inconsistency is certainly not peculiar to spirt-filled technologies of power.

Power, whether understood as spiritual or material, is the production of effects in the world; power makes things happen. Power draws on and acts on various media, and its measure is always relative. Some people may gain power at the expense of others; some people are adept at sharing power. As we made clear at the start of this introduction, there are undoubtedly asymmetrical relationships of power in the world. The challenge is to illuminate these asymmetries, even as we draw attention to the varieties and transmutations of power. The question is not just *who* gets to wield power but what *kind* of power is wielded. Indeed, asymmetries of power are kept in place by a number of factors, including assumptions about the relative efficacy of various forms of power. For instance, the distinction between religion and state is frequently described in terms of their respective powers. John Locke argued that religion (he referred to "church") and state employ *persuasive* power; the state alone

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

employs *punitive* power. For Joan Scott, the difference is, confusingly, both quantitative and qualitative; political power is both greater than and fundamentally different from religious power. She writes, "The relationship between the political and the religious is asymmetrical . . . states have coercive power that *exceeds* any influence religion may have." She also makes a distinction, which she does not explain, between *political* power and *spiritual* power (Scott 2010: 96, 102). Scott's attempt to distinguish degrees and kinds of power hints at the challenge of doing justice to the various registers and relationships of power. Certainly, possession of wealth or armed force affords ample opportunity for effective action in the world; at the same time, it should not be assumed that these forms of power necessarily subsume or trump others. Scholars must consider the interrelations among different categories of power, how certain forms of power justify other forms of power as well as attract or cascade into one another—for instance, the ways in which political power seeks moral authorization and the fact that religious patronage systems may yield employment opportunities, as well as significant wealth and social and political status.

To study Pentecostals in general, and Black Pentecostal women in particular, requires, we suggest, sensitivity to the full range of power's frequencies: persuasive and coercive, material and spiritual, subtle and palpable, hidden and ostentatious, injurious and expansive, exploitative and accountable. Insofar as the communities we study recognize different categories of power, scholars must be wary of predetermining their distinctions or relationships. For instance, scholars ought not to dismiss spirit power as "soft" or "feminine" (much like religion in relation to the political or the state) and thus as lacking in reality or authority. Dorothy Hodgson (2005: x) describes the challenge as "how to reconcile the moral world with the material one, how to incorporate and analyze spiritual forms of power with political and economic ones, and how to understand the relationship of spirituality to the production, reproduction, and transformation of gender relations." In the context in which Hodgson raises this challenge, she talks about how Maasai women lamented their disenfranchisement from political and economic power even as they prided themselves as guardians of the moral order and their special relationship to the deity. Thus, the Maasai women distinguished these domains of power even as they criticized their loss of political and economic power

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

as contradictory to their moral authority and to the moral order more generally. The Maasai women refused to downgrade moral authority in relation to political and economic power. Similarly, Pentecostal technologies for securing a "live relation to power" should not be dismissed as unrelated to political and economic contexts. Who is truly convinced of the efficacy, transparency, and justice of contemporary political fields such that Pentecostal struggles and remedies appear so obviously inadequate? Moreover, the Pentecostal claim that much of the world's problems and afflictions are attributable to spiritual malaise is not peculiar to Pentecostals. It has affinities with contemporary, albeit controversial, trends in US domestic and foreign policy. For instance, the rationalization of eliminating welfare provisions to break a purported "culture of dependency"; the provision of private faith-based initiatives to apply the "deep-redeeming power" of religion to intransigent social and economic inequities; and, internationally, the contention, on the part of neoconservative political economists, that development is a "state of mind" or attitude.

The implicit political theology of Pentecostals is that the spirit is no discriminator of persons. The conviction that "spirit goes where it listeth" is a harbinger of its egalitarian promise. As Maria W. Stewart claimed in 1832, "Just as God had given black people the gift of the Holy Spirit, surely they were owed their freedom and wages" (quoted in Cooper 2011: 72). In teaching that sin does not inhere in people, but that all people may be (indeed, must be) made new or born again, Pentecostals undercut justifications for hierarchical governing structures (including that of gender) and dislodge the stigmas of race and poverty.[13] As Cheryl Townsend Gilkes (2001: 47) astutely observes, "accommodation to racism is, in the context of the preaching of the Sanctified Church, an accommodation to sin." Of course, a capricious power is always available for corruption, and the lack of a *justification* for hierarchical structures does not necessarily mean that there will be no de facto hierarchical structure. Scholars must be careful to note the distinction between, on the one hand, the potentially subversive power of a democratization of charisma and, on the other, the institutionalization of political power that is constituted by and accountable to "the people." This distinction is crucial to Marshall-Fratani's study of Nigerian Pentecostalism. For her, Pentecostalism is a "political spirituality," the aim of which is renewal and an end to corruption through self-overcoming. The postcolonial social imaginary in Nigeria is one of

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

disorder: of contending, predatory, violent, and hidden power. In this particular context, there is no authoritative way to detect where political, economic, or spiritual power comes from—whether it is divine or satanic. Consequently, spiritual warfare is *the* field of experience, it is the form of power. In her estimation, and again in the *context* she studies, Pentecostalism fails to create new modes of sociability predicated on trust, promise, and guarantee. Instead, it lends a pervasive sense of insecurity, volatility, and capriciousness to events and relationships (Marshall 2009: 18–27).

In a comment that bears repeating for the purposes of this volume, Toulis (1997: 215) admonishes her readers about the "need to put aside the preoccupation with visible office as power and a preconceived idea of who is a 'liberated Black woman.'" Given their restriction from various forms of official power, Black women have long had to take power where they could find or make it. Hence, they have had to be variously opportunistic, improvisational and pragmatic. As Gilkes (2001: 45) has written, "Within the Sanctified Church, black women have created for themselves a variety of roles, careers, and organizations with great influence but with variable access to structural authority." Such roles have included church mother, evangelist, exhorter, missionary, prayer band leader, deaconess, and teacher. One would be in error to suppose that such roles did not produce real power for these women, even if this power did not also entail the elimination of the gender, racial, class, and heteronormative privileges that constrain these same women's lives.

To attend a spirit-filled performance is to witness transformation: communal visceral memories shaken lose, reserved people gesticulating and shouting praise, singers tapping into and radiating ambient sound. This transformation draws from and inculcates a susceptibility to emotional reformation: enjoining exuberant clapping, training mournful weeping, imbuing dread and suspicion, or making alert and watchful. Such emotional reformation is simultaneously a mobilization: a willingness to stand apart, to call out, to set out, to get ready. Whereas we distinguish *feeling* powerful or empowered from *having* power, we would not dismiss the significance of the former, and we would insist on the need to be thoughtful as to the criteria we use to distinguish various kinds of power and their effects (see Becker 2005: 156). These more complicated renderings of power reflect key insights from Black feminist scholarship more broadly, including the significance of nonlinear and narrative knowledge

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

that resists treatment as a "commodity to be extracted and traded" and the recognition that all subjects are simultaneously disciplined, as well as capacitated and resistant (May 2015: 20). In what follows, then, we invite readers to consider, critically, the multitudinous ways power pulses through Pentecostal performances: realigning gender and race, heralding the end of the world, linking hemispheres, electrifying singers and audiences, disciplining female workers, and anointing celebrities and politicians.

DESCRIPTION OF THE CHAPTERS

Whereas Pentecostal and evangelical churches have refrained from using the category of race while insisting on the equality of all people before God, in part I, "Saving Race," John Burdick and Elizabeth McAlister highlight the divergent ways "race" figures in these churches. Burdick interviews Brazilian gospel singers who not only identify as Black (*negro*), but who insist that their Blackness, albeit read differently from the points of view of women and men, is central to God's salvific action in the world. In the Haitian context, McAlister notes the ways in which race is disconnected from skin color and particular colonial histories of missionary work, yet festers in condemnations of demonic and idolatrous "African" traditions.

John Burdick's chapter, "Voices of God: Blackness and Gender in a Brazilian Black Gospel Music Scene," addresses surprising developments among evangelical Protestants who avidly embrace the gifts of the spirit, and especially spiritual warfare. As Burdick notes, these Christians have tended to downplay worldly identities such as race and to focus on the equality of all people before God. Relatedly, they have stressed the primacy of converting each individual soul rather than eradicating social and structural limitations to lived equality. In addition, celebrations of Black identity (or *negro*) have largely been the province of practitioners of Afro-Brazilian religion, which these evangelicals regard as the work of the devil. Nonetheless, Burdick has found that Afro-Brazilian evangelical singers of "Black gospel" have developed a Black identity politics that both pushes back against their religious tradition's hostility to Black identity politics and invites critique of the Brazilian state's myth of racial democracy. In addition, he carefully sifts through the ways in which gender

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

inflects performers' understandings of human vulnerability to Satan and their respective roles in salvation history.[14]

Elizabeth McAlister's "Race, Gender, and Christian Diaspora: New Pentecostal Intersectionalities and Haiti," takes up the issue of evangelical/Pentecostal notions of Christian citizenship. The setting for her analysis is the contemporary prominence of the Revival/Third Wave/Spiritual Warfare movement in Haiti. In this case, transcendent Christian citizenship ("in this world, but not of it")—which relativizes all notions of national belonging, given the preeminence of membership in and ambassadorship on behalf of God's kingdom—is juxtaposed with a very specific reading of and prescription for Haiti's efforts at nation building. As McAlister carefully explicates, this juxtaposition belies a series of overlapping tensions. Rather than enjoining Christian membership in the City of Peace, this revival movement, begun by the American C. Peter Wagner from Fuller Seminary, envisions Christians as prayer warriors engaged in a spiritual warfare between the forces of good and evil. In this cosmology, Haitian Vodou is regarded as one of Satan's strongholds amid an extensive kingdom that includes all African ancestral and spirit traditions. Rather than providing consistent uplift in a context of multiple or perhaps chronic diaspora, then, Third Wave Christian citizenship contracts into a racialized, gendered, and heteronormative narrative of Haiti's struggle for nationhood.

What McAlister's analysis brings to light is the necessity of tracing the complicity of theological frameworks in racial constructions. The division of people into distinct races placed along a hierarchy of valuation is difficult to imagine in the absence of a theological framework, the terms of which encompass the extremes of good and evil. This is what makes McAlister's phrase "theo-geographies" so insightful and useful in a diasporic context. The diversity of spirit-filled people and their explicit avowals that *all* are God's people suggests that Pentecostalism is a truly postcolonial phenomenon. Nonetheless, as McAlister points out, leaders of the Third Wave may no longer correlate evil with dark skin, but they do correlate it with Haitians' stubborn attachment to their African history and culture. Thus, even if racialization is loosed from physiognomy, its insidious classifications can always adopt (or have already adopted) another guise: region, culture, desire, sex, or class.

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

Women's bodies are frequently the field of political and cultural production and contestation, and Black women's involvement with Pentecostalism is no exception. "Women and the Afro-Brazilian Pentecostal War in Mozambique," Linda van den Kamp's chapter in part II, "Scrutinizing and Sanctifying the Body," studies the ways in which Brazilian Pentecostalism in Mozambique enlists women's bodies in the aftermath of civil war and protracted political battles over traditionalist and progressive gender practices. In contrast, Deidre Helen Crumbley's "'Dressed as Becometh Holiness': Gender, Race, and the Body in a Storefront Sanctified Church" focuses on the ways in which the strict gendered dress codes of a Sanctified church founded and led by "Mother Brown" reflect Black women's desire to recoup a sense of control over and sacrality within their bodies.

Van de Kamp analyzes the ways in which spiritual warfare is made tangible in the lives of its female converts in Mozambique. The women attracted to Afro-Brazilian Pentecostalism are hoping to banish demons seeking revenge in the aftermath of Mozambique's violent fifteen-year civil war. These demons prevent women from marrying and conceiving. The spiritual obstacles to women enjoying positive and productive familial relationships reflects not only civil war traumas (including widespread rape), but also ongoing conflicts over women's appropriate roles and their obligations to extended kin, which have been exacerbated by women's increasing economic independence in urban areas and especially the capital, Maputo. In addition, post-civil-war nation building has led to debate and ambivalence regarding traditional culture and especially belief in and remedies for spirits. For the missionizing Brazilians, the project to free these women is part and parcel of their strenuous efforts to exorcise (forever) elements of African culture. These are the ongoing conflicts that lend poignancy to the spiritual warfare undergone by Pentecostal female converts. Moreover, they also account for van de Kamp's finding that Pentecostal women report increased tensions in their lives and eventual alienation from kin as a result of their involvement with the Afro-Brazilian churches. Far from curbing male privileges and establishing peaceable domestic partnerships, Pentecostalism in Mozambique appears to create recurrent cycles of stress, doubt, and anxiety in the women involved. Thus, rather than overcoming the spirits, the Afro-Brazilian churches succeed in convincing the women that they must engage in continuous

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

struggle with the spirits without and inside—a situation that exacerbates a lack of trust but facilitates the ascetic individualism associated with market discipline.

Crumbley analyzes how considerations of race trouble the reading that Sanctified churches' dress codes serve to reflect and reinforce asymmetrical power relationships between men and women. In her study of a small Philadelphia church, Crumbley models a multifaceted understanding of Pentecostal fashions. As Crumbley notes, male saints were indistinguishable from their worldly counterparts, whereas female saints donned long skirts and head coverings for maximum coverage. Although women in this church are no longer restricted to wearing white for church services, they still do not cut their hair, and they still keep it covered in public. This raises interesting questions about the Pentecostal attribution of power and sexuality to Black women's hair, an attribution that is delightfully subversive in the American context of the perceived imperative for Black women to relax or straighten their hair (see Byrd and Tharps 2002; Craig 2002).

The case may bring to readers' minds that of Lizzie Robinson, the first overseer of the Women's Department of the Church of God in Christ (COGIC), who insisted that women could teach but not preach and that they must adhere to modest and almost uniform clothing (Butler 2007: 34–54, 80, 174n7). It is, of course, plausible to conclude that deflecting attention from their bodies and the erotic valence presumed to surround them has made it easier for Black women to claim leadership in churches and society.[15] One wonders, then, whether the rise in body-conscious, fashionable, and ornamental dress among some Pentecostal women has been offset by increasing emphasis on male headship and women's leadership role being circumscribed by the designation "pastor's wife." This suggests that Pentecostal women continue to perform a high-stakes balancing act. According to Bernice Martin, there is an "implicit deal" for women in Pentecostalism: "a substantive shift towards greater gender equality will be tolerated so long as women are not seen to be publicly exercising formal authority over men." Pentecostalism, she concludes, is a modernizing egalitarian impulse "albeit inside a formal patriarchal casing" (Martin 2001: 54–55).

Although many Pentecostal churches and spirit-filled ministries prohibit women from holding official leadership positions, their spiritual

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

authority is central to the salvific work of these churches and ministries. In the particular cases under consideration in part III, "Sonic Power," women's wailing and singing, respectively, are deployed to reestablish a relationship with a God who seems to have forsaken the world or to have ignored the fervent prayers of the faithful. These paired essays reveal how women continually broaden the parameters and spaces of spirit-filled worship, as well as the productive tensions between discipline and spontaneity and the present world and the world to come.

Paula Aymer's research adds another circuit to the global tracks of Pentecostal prayer networks—this time a voluntary route of passage from Africa to the Caribbean. In her chapter, "West African and Caribbean Women Evangelists: The Wailing Women Worldwide Intercessors," Aymer analyzes the efforts of a worldwide interdenominational missionary organization, Waling Women Worldwide (www), which seeks to exploit conventional feminine characteristics even as it trains women to become ruthless masculinized warriors. She focuses in particular on a Nigerian band of evangelizing women's efforts to recruit women in Grenada. These women advocate constant intercessionary prayer in a style that is intensely emotional (sorrowful and fearful wailing). The key biblical text that justifies their efforts is Jeremiah 9:17: "Thus saith the Lord of hosts, consider ye and call the mourning women . . . and send for cunning women; that they may take up a wailing for us." (Coincidentally, this is the same biblical passage Lizzie Robinson used on her initial round through Tennessee, Arkansas, and Texas organizing Bible Bands [see Butler 2007: 45].)[16]

As Aymer notes, the success of this group of Nigerian women is rather surprising. In addition to significant class differences, the Nigerian women bring to Grenada an emphasis on a heteronormative nuclear family model that is at odds with the predominance of single motherhood in the Caribbean. Moreover, the www affirms an eschatological vision of a civil society in ruins and of a judgmental Father God who requires appeasing and softening. (Only the sound of wailing women can soften the heart of a stern and apparently disappointed figure.) This theology is in rather sharp contrast to the friendlier, more empathetic, and sometimes feminine Jesus that features in Pentecostal theology. This eschatological vision also requires training the Caribbean women to shift away from focusing on domestic relationships and recounting personal testimonies

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

of salvation to concentrating on and interceding amid a *global* context of sin and terror.

Judith Casselberry moves beyond the hermeneutics of the Pentecostal body's surface to analyze the kinds of messages that are conveyed by women's bodies in motion, singing, laboring, and even sprinting. In "'The Kingdom in the Midst': Sounding Bodies, Aesthetic Labor, and the End Times," Casselberry studies liturgical performances in which women's bodies run, sing, pray, mourn, and labor. In doing so, Casselberry implies the limitations of the protocols of gendered liturgical space whereby men may claim authority at the pulpit while women rise and make their stand amid the community. In the scenes she reconstructs, Casselberry suggests the various stages and locations of women's liturgical and theological authority. Moreover, in a context in which Pentecostals are routinely portrayed as seeking and expecting salvation *now*, Casselberry highlights the eschatological tension, the "already and not yet" captured by their interpretive practices. In the community she studies—a church in the Church of Our Lord Jesus Christ of the Apostolic Faith denomination in Queens, New York—women make choices about how to read God's will regarding past events and events yet to be disclosed. In both instances, women express their faith and confidence in God's promise to fully heal and gather together all saints' bodies, despite the realities of paralysis and death. The women become exegetes of God's will and word and, in turn, offer their spiritual gifts (their work, their words) as supplemental texts. In a context of voiced doubt and confusion, these women's actions are *liturgy*—that is, "public service." They increase the repertoire of signs available for getting on in the world and for imagining, and even feeling, the promised redemption, albeit without directly altering configurations of power or dissolving the tension of present realities and anticipated futures.

How does spirit power compare with or interact with state models and institutions? This is the subject that unites part IV, "Modeling the State." In "A Critical Approach to Concepts of 'Power' and 'Agency' in Ghana's Charismatic (or Neo-Pentecostal) Churches," an account of Neo-Pentecostal churches in Accra, Ghana, Jane Soothill finds that these churches model themselves on state patronage relationships that reinforce the wealth and influence of elite men and women. In contrast, Laura Premack's chapter, "Bless Us with Children: Pregnancy, Prosperity, and Pragmatism in Nigeria's Christ Apostolic Church," finds that

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

Nigerian Pentecostal women's demand for varied and reliable maternal care drove both church and state resources toward the building of such institutions in the middle decades of the twentieth century

Soothill's chapter extends and problematizes the scholarly consensus that Pentecostal and charismatic Christianity in the global South empowers its female adherents. According to Soothill, this empowerment is evident in three key areas: the provision of leadership roles, the message of social change and the tools to change destructive male behavior, and the emphasis on individuation and self-development. Soothill digs deeper to examine the precise contours of this empowerment in the Ghanaian context. What she notices is that religious rhetoric and practice has tended to mirror political rhetoric and practice. The state has adopted the international gender development agenda and thus promotes women's equality. So, too, the Pentecostal and charismatic Christian churches promote spiritual equality and the democratization of charisma (while retaining an ideology of gender complementarity).[17] Yet women's political and religious leadership has been largely spectacular or iconic—cultivating a mass public of adulation, submission, and consumption. Political First Ladies are mirrored by pastors' wives. Consequently, power—political and spiritual—remains highly concentrated among an elite rather than democratically distributed. Soothill challenges scholars to avoid declarations of a generalized empowerment for women in Pentecostal practice by showing how elite women's tremendous power is coincident with the powerlessness of many.

Premack argues that central to the success of divine healing churches in Nigeria was and is their focus on *alafia*, a Yoruba term that means "peace" and encompasses health, success, and prosperity. Although the prosperity gospel of what is frequently referred to as Neo-Pentecostalism has prompted significant controversy with regard to both its claims to biblical support and its perpetuating or exacerbating disparities of wealth and power, Premack argues that, in the Nigerian context, prosperity is understood holistically to include material goods but is signified primarily in people and, especially, in the blessing that is children. Although much scholarship on the emergence and spread of divine healing churches in Nigeria has focused on male leadership, Premack seeks to offset that disparity by highlighting not only the fact that women provided the majority of membership and support for divine healing churches, but also

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

that women's understandings and experiences of well-being or prosperity drove the popularity and institutionalization of such churches in Nigeria. Premack focuses on fertility and maternity centers sponsored by the Christ Apostolic Church (CAC) in the 1950s and 1960s. In opening these centers, the male leaders of the CAC sought to counter government criticism and interference; to invest in midwife training for women in order to compete with the colonialist-initiated health clinics; and to keep the church viable. Premack's analysis corrects the androcentric reading of Christianity in Nigeria, undercuts conventional readings of colonial regimes as instituting the separation of reproduction from governance, and highlights the pragmatic bent of Nigerian divine healing churches.

NOTES

1. Pentecostals have frequently envisioned themselves not as "worldly" but as "set apart" and their struggles as taking place against a sinful world. Nonetheless, some scholars of American Afro-Pentecostalism argue for an emerging trend toward increased engagement with the world. One key rationale for such a shift, they argue, is the emergence of a Black middle class since the civil rights era (see Yong and Alexander 2011: 6).
2. Here we find ourselves agreeing with Kevin Lewis O'Neill who prefers to speak in terms of an international or transnational rather than global Pentecostalism. He reasons that Pentecostals refer to nation and national citizenship and that the "actual movement of Christianity in the world is remarkably uneven." He adds: "Christians and discourses of Christianity flow across borders and between nations rather than saturate the world evenly" (see O'Neill 2009: 174, 176).
3. For a reading of the common feature of divine healing in Pentecostalism, see Gunther Brown 2011.
4. For analysis of the historical antecedents on intersectionality, see May 2015.
5. Clarence E. Hardy III, "Church Mothers and Pentecostals in the Modern Age," in Yong and Alexander 2011: 83, quoting the Arthur Huff Fauset Collection, Special Collections Department, Van Pelt Library, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, box 5, folder 96, n.p.
6. For detailed critiques of the assumption that secularization entails the privacy of religion, see Casanova 1994; Pritchard 2014.
7. See http://www.pentecostrevival.nl. The Pentecost Revival Church in Amsterdam is part of the International Convention of Faith Ministries founded in 1979 with headquarters in Arlington, Texas. Early leaders included Kenneth Hagin, Jerry Savelle, Kenneth Copeland, and Fred Price, all of whom pledge their support for the Word of Faith movement.

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest

8 Austin-Broos (1997: 235) continues: "And even in the small rural churches where patriarchy seems to prevail, women as the active members of a church can withhold their tithes, the pastor's wage." On the economic power of the overwhelming female majority in the Sanctified church, see also Gilkes 2001: 53. On the relative power of ordained and non-ordained, Butler writes, "There is the power of ordination, but there is greater power in controlling the ordained" (2007: 6).

9 Toulis (1997: 235) notes that this monopolization may also occur through speaking in tongues, prophesizing, or giving testimony. See also Toulis 1997: 239.

10 See "Kyeiwaa vs. Mercy Asiedu," video clip posted May 27, 2100, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CaRBanuq14w.

11 As Arjun Appadurai (2001: 5) remarks, "It has now become something of a truism that we are functioning in a world fundamentally characterized by objects in motion. These objects include ideas and ideologies, people and goods, images and messages, technologies and techniques. This is a world of flows."

12 Best is describing the desire for African Americans to participate in the Great Migration from the South to the North (1915–52).

13 Marla Fredericks (2012: 397–99) notes a shift in focus from race to class as Neo-Pentecostals seek to address a global public. She cites Bishop T. D. Jakes in particular.

14 Burdick's account suggests that Brazilian Black Gospel women singers perform a kind of exorcism of the sins of slavery and racism, similar to what Austin-Broos (1997) describes.

15 For an analysis of the ways in which bodiliness and eroticism stubbornly adhered to perceptions of African American women preachers, see Best 2005: 101–27.

16 Women's Bible Bands, started by the Baptist missionary Joanna P. Moore in 1884, were designed to teach literacy in general and biblical literacy in particular. They became key venues of African women's literacy, leadership, and networking from their founding through the first two decades of the twentieth century (Butler 2007: 16–25).

17 Martin (2001: 54) describes the democratic promise of Pentecostalism this way: "Whatever the organizational hierarchy may imply about the locus of religious authority, the sacred is not so easily reined in in the Pentecostal tradition. The Spirit 'goeth where it listeth' and lights indiscriminately upon women, the young, the poor, the unlettered, the marginalized of every kind." Nonetheless, the democratic promise of Pentecostalism is compromised by an enduring gender complementarity that entails asymmetrical status. "It establishes an *experience* of greater gender equality," she writes, without destroying what [Salvatore] Cucchiari (1990) has felicitously called 'gender integrity,' that is, the possibility of experiencing the gendered self as a 'good *woman*' or a 'good *man*.'"

Downloaded from http://read.dukeupress.edu/books/book/chapter-pdf/678850/9781478002116-001.pdf
by guest