

# 9 LONGING FOR CONNECTION CHRISTIAN EDUCATION AND EMERGING URBAN LIFESTYLES IN BOTSWANA

ASTRID BOCHOW

EDUCATED PROFESSIONALS' EMOTIONS  
IN A CONTEXT OF SOCIETAL CHANGE

A discussion with a group of sociology students at the University of Botswana in 2011 revealed the emotional weight that decisions about family and all related decisions have for the young generation of educated professionals in Gaborone, Botswana's capital. I had given a lecture in a class on gender during one of my visits to Botswana, and a vibrant discussion unfolded afterward. I asked young educated people about their aspirations in life, and soon the discussion ventured into the topics of family planning, gender roles, and work. It took an unexpected emotional turn when one male student confessed, "In my church they teach me I am a man and therefore I am a provider. I have responsibilities! I want my wife to stay at home." His statement motivated one of the female students to speak. She became visibly emotional during her statement, with her tensed body posture, her husky voice, and tears in her eyes expressing desperation, pain, and anger. She told the group that her boyfriend wanted to marry her, but she was adamant that she did not want to. She believed that his plan was to entice her into the relationship, eventually having a child together, only to leave her after she had given in and accepted his proposal. "My church prohibits

entering marriage early. We first have to make a living before we can have a family. I have been the child of a single mother and have suffered throughout my childhood. I knew my father; he had a family. He never acknowledged that I was his child and to see him there with this other family—I don't want to become like my mother! I don't want to marry early!" she exclaimed. The others in the group were visibly moved by her outburst, attempting to assuage her sorrow and anger and soothe her. One of the other young women suggested that her fellow student should try to forgive, and that she was now punishing her boyfriend for what her father had done to her. It was obvious that the speaker herself was surprised by her sudden outburst of emotions and allowed her fellow student to calm her down. The group discussion came to an end (field notes, March 3, 2011).

This group discussion was one of the many occasions on which I witnessed how urban educated youth in Gaborone expressed anxieties, fear, and experiences of pain related to marriage and family life. Remarkably, both students called upon the teachings of their respective Christian churches, which would allow them to break away from the suffering of their past by living marriage and parenthood in different ways than their parents. By doing so, they expressed not only their anxieties and their personal histories of pain but also their hopes for a different (and more positive) future. The students did not specify the denominations of their churches, but their anxieties and hopes regarding family life resembled many Pentecostal discourses on marriage and the family that I recorded throughout my fieldwork in Gaborone in 2009 and 2011. The incident shows that Pentecostal discourses on the family impress young educated people in Gaborone who exhibited ambitions to join the lifestyles of a newly emerging socioeconomic group of professionals with stable and considerable income residing in the capital city of Botswana, one of the few middle-income countries in sub-Saharan Africa.

The rise of these new socioeconomic groups demarcates one of the great changes Botswana has gone through in the past thirty years: On the one hand, these changes concern the introduction of new wealth starting in the 1980s with the processing of minerals. This led to the formation of new professional groups relating to a long-standing history of education and professionalism induced by Christian mission churches, of which the London Mission Society was the first, followed by the Anglican Church, Seventh Day Adventists, and the Roman Catholic Church in the twentieth century, originating from both African and European countries. Currently,

half of Botswana's population is considered by international standards to be "middle class" and an estimated 29 percent are considered to be "stable" (nonfloating) (Mmegi 2015).<sup>1</sup>

The strict economic definition of "middle class" in the study cited here might be misleading with regard to the diversity of socioeconomic backgrounds, styles of consumption, and religious affiliations embodied by persons in this growing social collective (Ncube and Lufumpa 2014). However, many of these individuals have been shown to share a cosmopolitan outlook regarding family life, professional ethics, leisure time activities, and political orientation and thus can be regarded as part of what has been termed the "global middle classes" (Heiman, Freeman, and Liechty 2012). Writing about urban people with well-paying jobs, I prefer to use the more descriptive term "educated professionals." By this I mean people who hold a university degree and who are employed in accord with their qualifications in either the private or the public sector. Sometimes these employees are referred to as people with "white-collar jobs" (cf. Stephanie Newell 2002), a term that is not common in Gaborone. In Botswana the majority of these new groups of educated professionals reside in the cities, of which Gaborone is the largest, with an estimated 231,000 inhabitants in a country with slightly more than 2 million inhabitants.<sup>2</sup>

On the other hand, the lifestyles and worldviews of this growing number of urban educated professionals have been shaped significantly by the HIV pandemic. A wave of deaths caused by HIV/AIDS did more than have a lasting impact on the demographic composition of the society and its household structures (Ingstad 1994); local and transnational responses to HIV/AIDS also introduced new technologies and politics of relating to oneself and to others, as well as new forms of education intended to reform existing gender and sexual relations (cf. Heald 2006; van Dijk 2013). Finally, widespread experiences of HIV-related illness and death had strongly impacted the ethics of care and family relations in both rural and urban settings (Klaitz 2010; Livingston 2003).

Taken together, these transformations brought about social mobility, for instance, with regard to the distribution of wealth and status and new professional opportunities, but also closures and ruptures, as, for instance, the lack of care due to HIV-related deaths. Because the majority of educated professionals reside in Gaborone, the capital is a place of intensification of social tensions and of emotions evolving in this situation (see the introduction to this volume). In this chapter, I will argue, following Sara Ahmed, that the family became an "object of emotions" saturated with many, par-

tially conflicting emotions in the lives of members of the middle class in Botswana. By providing education and later counseling, Pentecostal churches, following the example of mission churches, have been instrumental in this historical process by training educated professionals into new models of marriage and family life and attaching these to economic and social success. I will explore this historical process in three sections. The first will show how Christian education first in schools and later in the framework of counseling by pastors introduced educated professionals to a passion for education and progress while also teaching them family planning, which became decisive for their economic performance. Second, I show that Christian education imagined the family as a space of social security and protection, which appealed to the anxieties of educated professionals in view of accelerating pressures introduced by growing expectations to join the conspicuous consumption associated with urban lifestyles since the 1980s. Finally, I argue that some Pentecostal churches in Gaborone encourage their members to cut off bonds of care with their relatives from the rural area who are in need, especially those children within the wider network of kin who have lost their parents. Taken together, I argue that Christian, and recently more particularly Pentecostal, ways of family life are both inclusive, as their teaching shows ways to join the urban middle classes, and exclusive, as they teach members how to cut off relations of care with the wider family.

#### THE CULTURAL POLITICS OF EMOTIONS AND THE RECONFIGURATION OF SOCIAL FIELDS

As has been laid out in the introduction to this volume, emotions can be regarded as complex formations that comprise both cognitive elements and bodily sensations (Ahmed 2013, 5) and arise particularly in situations of cultural and social change (see Gluckman 1972). They are therefore a valuable methodological tool to research specific forms of social positioning of individuals or groups toward a certain social or cultural domain, and particularly in contexts of social transformation.

In her book *The Cultural Politics of Emotions*, Ahmed (2013) examines emotions as triggers of collective mobilizations and how these mobilizations delineate new objects of emotional concern. Her argument is thus well suited to understand the emergence of emotions in shifting social situations, as we find them in Botswana with regard to the emotions articulated by educated professionals about family life. As argued in the introduction to this volume, with reference to Ahmed's object-theory, emotions or af-

fects are constitutive of the emergence of new social fields (cf. Ahmed 2013, 7): they shape social fields and are also shaped by the conflicts and tensions that arise in them, such as in the case of the earlier vignette where emotions constitute the object: the family. The ideal of the family evokes certain feelings and by doing so it changes what “family” represents. In other words, emotions directed toward the family come to encompass an entire social world and its objects.

The emotional object that I will examine here is how members of the middle class in Botswana talk and feel about the “family.” In modern sociology, the transformation of family relations in Europe has been described as being marked by the *emotional intensification* of relationships between both spouses and their children, on the one hand, and the disentanglement between production and the household, on the other (Giddens 1992). In fact, studies on the so-called global middle classes show that such an ideal of the modern family has inspired many of the currently emerging middle classes worldwide to fashion and refashion their everyday life (C. Freeman 2012; Jones 2012; Katz 2012; Zhang 2012; Pauli 2010). These studies explore the contestations around gender roles and around the expectations of families and kin with regard to who people should marry, when they have children, and how they would live (Oppong 1981). In my contribution I am interested in showing the ambivalence of emotions attached to the ideal of the Pentecostal model of family that stresses premarital chastity and the unity of spouses.

Second, according to Ahmed, objects may encapsulate a long history of desires, anxieties, pleasures, or pains, which she attributes to historical processes of the production of social inequalities (Ahmed 2013, 11; see also the introduction to this volume). This history of inequality is enclosed in emotional objects so that some of them are saturated with their historical values. These emotions become what Ahmed calls “sticky” (17). An example of sticky emotions and sticky objects is the concern expressed in public imaginaries about migrants or refugees as intruding others from whom the community needs to be protected (Ahmed 2004, 134); this example reveals how discourses are constantly demarcating boundaries between nonfamiliar subjects or groups and belonging to (imagined) communities. Emotions therefore come to stand for histories of exclusion.

Ahmed’s considerations about the configuration of social fields through emotions may become productive for understanding the emotions of educated professionals in Gaborone as these emerge in the context of a trans-

forming society. However, the histories of educated professionals are histories not only of exclusion but also of social advancement and possible integration into new types of wealth flowing into the economy. In fact, these considerations coalesce strikingly with Biehl and Locke's reading of Deleuze and their "anthropology of becoming." These authors attribute great transformative power to desires over power and control and point out how people invent "fields of action and significance" (Biehl and Locke 2010, 317). Emotions therefore may be a driving force in the reconfiguration of social fields, in my case the urban middle classes in Gaborone.

Many authors describe the city as a space of marked poverty where experiences of exclusion forge emotions such as fear and anger (see the introduction to this volume); others describe postcolonial cities as places of emerging opportunities that concern both income opportunities and personal freedom and new privileges (Akyeampong 2000b; Little 1975; Bochow and van Dijk 2012). The urban space of Gaborone, however, can be seen as a space of intensification of *ambivalent* processes of emerging wealth, on the one hand, and the experience of loss and lack of support, on the other: all economically important bodies such as the Southern African Development Community, the headquarters of banks, and Debswana, the world's leading diamond producer by value, to name a few, are located here. In addition, five shopping malls have been built in the past fifteen years, which are the places where urban professionals spend their leisure time shopping, dining, and meeting friends. Driving through the city, one is also constantly reminded of the HIV/AIDS pandemic by large signs advertising prevention. In addition, visible signs of loss and suffering due to HIV/AIDS are long queues of cars on the roads leading to the cemeteries on Saturday, the funeral day.

As I will argue later, Christianity enhanced the openings of social fields of urban wealth in Botswana in many ways. By enabling education in mission schools, it opened new life paths alongside the teaching of new emotional models regarding the family. In the following I will show how Christian school education uniting voices of mixed denominations contributed to constituting the family as an object of desire and aspiration, but also anxiety and pain, throughout the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. In addition, Pentecostal counseling enabled educated professionals to navigate complex emotions of desire, anxiety, and fear that are attached to social mobility and the emergence of new wealth in the midst of the HIV pandemic.<sup>3</sup>

I visited Gaborone, Botswana's capital city, several times in the years 2009 and 2011. Many friends, colleagues, and interview partners became visibly moved during our conversations, interviews, and discussions on family life, HIV/AIDS, and reproductive medicine. The family was an overarching topic that popped up in many conversations even if these were not directed toward my research *per se*. People shared their pain, their loss, anger, desperation, and loneliness, but also their hopes, desires, inspirations, and aspirations. While interview partners were often imbued with emotions, I often was, too. I rarely interrupted their story line when it got emotional, for instance, a long narrative on an unhappy marriage that ended with a divorce. Other times, emotions were not necessarily expressed only by spoken words but sometimes also by things that remained unsaid, for instance, by a sudden change of mood or sentences that ended in silence. These affective moments drew me into my interlocutors' stories and narratives. In these cases when sadness seemed to cut the flow of words, I rarely insisted on asking further questions and often did not ask about certain kinds of "important information," such as when and how people had tested HIV-positive, whether they had communicated about their status, or even banal questions regarding their parents' professions. I also paused from taking notes because listening to my interlocutors' narratives and avoiding hurting them further with a misdirected word or glance required all my attention. (I took notes after the interview.) In that sense, emotions often took over the interview and structured the story lines I got to hear. Nevertheless, these moments of shared emotions drew me into my conversation partners' stories and explanations and gave me a sense that I "understood" their lives. In my writing I intend to recall and analyze these shared affective moments.

Church life importantly shapes the social life of many people in Gaborone, especially urban professionals. These people often live in single houses with gardens and rarely know or interact with their neighbors. They interact in extended and geographically widespread social networks, and church activities have become an important leisure time activity for them—next to shopping. Many of my friends and colleagues who were central for my research come from a Christian background of diverse denominations, many of them Catholics or Anglicans. These two churches belong to the missions that entered Botswana in the nineteenth century and are now attended by many of the educated professionals in Gaborone, especially the Catholic Church, which runs one of the top-performing secondary schools in the country. Others

were committed members of a Pentecostal-Charismatic church or belonged to one of the many so-called African Independent Churches.

Pentecostal churches came to Botswana first in the 1980s and have attracted many of the educated professionals until today. Next to Pentecostal churches, African Independent Churches are strong in the southern African region. They were founded mostly during the first half of the twentieth century and were seen to embody resistance (Comaroff 1985). Currently, they differ considerably in their religious praxis as well as in discourses about the family and gender relations (for an example of the “masculine cult” of one African Independent Church, cf. Werbner 2011). In Botswana, mainline churches’ and Pentecostal discourses and ethics featured heavily in educated professionals’ views on the world and were part of general discourses on the family, intimacy, and personal suffering. In my ethnography I will therefore focus on these discourses and practices.

I interacted with people in many contexts, including different kinds of churches, two private hospitals in Gaborone, and the University of Botswana. When I met people to conduct formal interviews, I asked them to sign a consent form, assuring them I would maintain their anonymity, which many of them welcomed as a sign of a “good research practice.” I spoke with educated urbanites from a wide range of professions, such as teachers, academics, pastors, and civil servants, as well as university students and educated people who were no longer (or had never been) employed. The sample thus reflects the heterogeneity of socioeconomic backgrounds prevalent among those urban educated professionals.

MAKING THE CHRISTIAN FAMILY:  
TEACHING EMOTION AND THE FORMATION OF  
NEW SOCIOECONOMIC GROUPS (1930–1965)

In this section I show how Christian education in colonial Botswana not only has established a new sense of professionalism with particular emotional attitudes toward work and careers but also has reconfigured educated professionals’ emotional way of relating to marriage and family life. Formal education was brought to Botswana, by then Bechuanaland, by Christian missionaries settling there. It started with the foundation of Kudumane, the first training center for evangelists run by the London Missionary Society, in the 1840s and continued to be in the hands of missionaries throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. From the very beginnings of their educational projects, missionaries placed a strong emphasis on religious teach-



ing and evangelization and made an effort to reform the marriages and family life of local populations. A history book used in all four public secondary schools in Gaborone reports on struggles between local populations, especially chiefs, and missionaries over the content to be taught in schools. The topics of family, sexuality, and gender relations featured strongly in missionary teachings. In contrast, according to history schoolbooks, local populations aspired to learn English and subjects that were considered more “useful,” such as technical skills (Tlou and Campbell 1984, 194–196).

Contestations over education continued throughout the colonial period. These concerned funding of schools and teachers, as well as struggles over the syllabus. From the beginning of the twentieth century, local governments (*dikgosi*; seTswana for “chiefs” or “elders”) started to support missionary schools with donations. Throughout the nineteenth century, regional power struggles between missionaries of the Dutch Reformed Church and the London Missionary Society and local *dikgosi* influenced the development of single educational projects of a grand style, for instance, the Bakgatla National School in Mochudi founded in 1920. Secondary education, which was nonexistent until 1948, started with the building of the Moeng College in Mafekeng, today South Africa. The first secondary school founded by the British was the Gaborone Secondary School, which did not open until 1965, one year before independence. Those who wanted to acquire higher education had to go to South Africa or Lesotho (Tlou and Campbell 1984, 294–295).

As a result, by the time of independence, in 1966, there were only a few graduates in the country (Werbner 2004, 22–24). These early educated professionals exhibited strong ethics of obligation toward their communities, punctuality, and godliness. In addition, they married earlier and had children later in life than their peers. Take, for instance, Mma Musi, who was eighty-four years old when I interviewed her in September 2011.<sup>4</sup> As she continued school, Mma Musi’s life became very different from the life of her siblings and neighborhood friends. She was the first one of seven siblings who continued school. Most of her mates went to South Africa for jobs as domestic workers or in the mines. Others became pregnant at an early age and stayed home. Earning money was attractive for those who went to South Africa after finishing primary education. They could afford to marry and build houses, and some of them invested in cattle. They felt that by working in South Africa, they had a quick and easy start at becoming an adult and a respected member of their society.

A similar situation applied to those who became pregnant early. An early

childbirth proved their fertility, and women were proud of having shown their ability to have children. In addition, having a child gave them the status of female adulthood. The anthropologist Isaac Schapera, who undertook research among Tswana-speaking people at the beginning of the twentieth century, noticed a tendency for women to have children long before they married their children's father or someone else. The overall postponement of marriage in people's life courses was triggered by male labor migration but also by the increase of *lobola* (bride-price), which made it impossible for young men to marry early (Schapera 1933).

In contrast to her peers, Mma Musi recalled, she had a passion for education. She enjoyed going to school and loved books. "I always liked my books!" she stated. She also enjoyed going to Sunday church services and early morning prayers in school. In our interview she vividly remembered the Irish woman who taught her, mentioning that she adored her strictness, accuracy, and punctuality. This woman played a crucial role in Mma Musi's personal and professional development, recommending that Mma Musi continue with her schooling.

Mma Musi followed her teacher's advice and went to the teacher's training college in Lesotho. After completing college, she married her husband at the age of twenty and completed her training years as a teacher in Molepolole. During the first few years of their marriage, her husband worked as a teacher in Ramotswa while Mma Musi was in Molepolole until eventually both of them were transferred to Gaborone. Mma Musi did not dwell on the emotional weight of these three years in which they were separated; however, the couple's difficulties and their anxieties regarding when they would be able to start their life together were apparent through her sparse references to this period. Only when they stayed together in Gaborone did the couple have their first child, at which time Mma Musi was twenty-five years old. She did not talk about her family's reaction to the couple's family planning issues, but other couples among these early educated people who likewise postponed childbirth in the first years of their marriage narrated how they had to resist pressure from their families. One seventy-year-old teacher recalled her family saying, "You marry before you have children?! Are you crazy? How do you know that you can have children?" (interview, September 23, 2011). "We followed Christ. We believe that we should first marry and then have children," explained Mma Musi. In addition, it was important for the couple that both had finished their education so that they could rely on two incomes.

Passion for education and her admiration for strictness, punctuality, and

professionalism continued to inspire Mma Musi, who became a teacher and later headmistress of a secondary school. Throughout our interview, she stressed her dedication to discipline and the quality of education. Mma Musi was one of those early educated professionals who were already working and in office at the time of Botswana's independence in 1966. They were well equipped to build the administration, as well as the educational and health systems of the young republic. Their skills and knowledge were greatly needed, as their number was limited. These early "white-collar workers" further came to witness and administer Botswana's economic boom in the 1980s caused by the processing of minerals. Many of these individuals came to occupy leading positions with a great deal of responsibility (Werbner 2004). They became statesmen and politicians but also university teachers, public figures, or headmasters, and managed to build a fairly well-functioning welfare state, often praised as the "African miracle" (Acemoglu, Johnson, and Robinson 2002).

Considering the narrative of Mma Musi's life, one recognizes that it was shaped by her passion for education and her admiration for her first teacher's strictness, as well as her teacher's sense of punctuality and godliness. These passions and virtues led Mma Musi to choose a career and life path that were unusual at the time. She presented her emotional decisions as mainly resisting temptations and desires for quick money and quick fulfillment of motherhood. On the emotional side, the account of her life appeared as almost coolheaded and planned. Later in life, her leading position brought not only responsibilities but also considerable wealth as compared with others in her community. Mma Musi's narrative is a good example of how educated professionals of her generation managed their emotions in order to obtain higher education and acquire a middle-class lifestyle. As mostly self-professed good Christians, these early professionals had lifestyles that centered on monogamous marriage with fewer children; their affluence and their cosmopolitan orientation, knowledge, and skills came to embody progress and prosperity in Botswana's blossoming economy since the 1980s.

FAMILY AND PAIN: CHRISTIAN ETHICS, PENTECOSTAL  
TEACHING, AND THE ANXIETIES OF THE EDUCATED  
URBANITES (FROM THE 1980S)

After independence, new professional groups emerged in Botswana primarily due to the increase in secondary and higher education.<sup>5</sup> Throughout the twentieth century, Christianity, and Pentecostalism in particular, con-

tinued to provide guidance and inspiration to the aspiring middle classes, especially beginning in the 1980s, when Botswana blossomed economically. From that time onward, highly trained personnel were needed not only to work in the mines but also to continuously expand governmental administration and services such as specialized medical services, health insurance, and education. Since the 1980s, the government of Botswana has invested in education and expanded both its educational system and its health care system, enabling free access to primary education and health care for all citizens. From that time, the building of the educational system took off: with the objective of enabling universal access to education, the government increased the number of primary schools in the country from 251 in 1966 to 654 in 1991 and the number of secondary schools from none in 1966 to 169 in 1991 (Weeks 1993, 51), thereby enhancing the social mobility of many people in Botswana through education.

Christian influence in education remained strong throughout the postcolonial period, as is apparent in a subject called today moral education. Before the educational reform in 1984, this subject was called Bible studies, highlighting the Christian legacy of Botswana's educational system. Moral education is one of the main subjects in primary and secondary education until today, with a syllabus determined by a committee of experts, most of whom are Christians from various denominations. One member of this committee was Professor Joseph Gaie, a theologian at the University of Botswana and a member of the Zion Christian Church, the most influential and in terms of membership the largest African Independent Church in Botswana. In a conversation Professor Gaie told me how the committee designed the actual syllabus for the subject moral education. Other individuals on the committee were members of the Dutch Reformed Church, the Catholic Church, the Lutheran Church, or a Pentecostal church. As a result of the work of this committee of mixed denominations, the syllabus does not exhibit a strong influence of one single denomination, although teaching materials may do so. Teaching ensures a *popularization* of Christian ideals and ethics, which means they are accessible for large parts of the population, namely, all those who go to school.<sup>6</sup>

The first units on moral education to be taught in secondary schools are dedicated to family matters, sexual ethics, and issues of gender equality. Alongside ethics of equality and chastity, the units promote the image of the family according to which marriage and childbirth within marriage appear as an emotionally secure space. For instance, textbooks in moral education for secondary schools discuss the consequences of teenage pregnancies



**Key idea:** Teenage pregnancies can ruin lives.

FIGURE 9.1. The consequences of teenage pregnancy. Source: Kgathi, Saganabeng, and Seretse (2006, 28).

not only as a probable interruption of educational careers, and a cause of desperation due to economic hardship but also as emotionally devastating. With this emphasis on chastity, such books show a similarity to Pentecostal teaching.<sup>7</sup> One book used in secondary schools in Botswana, published by Heinemann, points out the anger of parents and boyfriends when they learn of a pregnancy, often leading to a breakup on the part of the male partner, who leaves the teenage girl and the baby without financial support. For instance, under “effects of pregnancy on the girl,” the authors list the following: “You would be expelled from school” and “Your family might not want anything to do with you. This may lead to resorting to prostitution in order to survive.” They then stress, “Everything is ruined” (Kgathi, Saganabeng,

and Seretse 2006, 27). Figure 9.1 depicts the threat of isolation teenage girls face when they become pregnant. It shows a young girl with a baby who needs to leave school, is pushed away by her family, and sits in front of an empty bowl looking for food. Later material in the book presents the family as the core social space of emotional and financial support. A break with the family means, therefore, complete “ruin,” attaching high emotions to family life and its failures.

The passage indicates that living as a family with both parents under one roof and getting sponsored and supported by them not only privileges young people in their start to life, such as allowing them to receive better education, but also provides protection and emotional security. By producing this image, Christian education fosters the anxieties and insecurities of educated urbanites in the context of increasing monetarization of social relationships in the wake of Botswana’s economic boom. Scholars have pointed out the enormous anxieties that were created by this rapid development of wealth in contemporary urban Botswana (Livingston 2009). They described the pressure that many of these urban professionals feel to meet the expectations of peers, families, and kin, for instance, by celebrating lavish weddings (van Dijk 2010), sending their children to private schools, building or buying their own houses, and driving a brand-new car. In their ways of dressing, living, and using their leisure time, they are inspired by glossy magazines edited in South Africa or the United States and often spend their holidays in Johannesburg, New York, or London.

In addition to these popularized Christian ethics taught in school, Pentecostal churches and teachings offer solutions for how to handle these insecurities and anxieties of the urban educated professionals and offer guidance and inspiration for these aspiring middle classes in how to reach their goals. Take, for instance, Steven, aged thirty-two, whom I met in a fast-food restaurant in Gaborone where we sat outside to enjoy a beverage. Steven presented himself as an ambitious and socially upward-oriented man who had been brought up in a rural area. He had enjoyed secondary education at a Christian-run secondary school and at the time I spoke with him was working as a sales manager for one of the few companies in Botswana. Christian teaching at school not only had provided him with knowledge and a valuable academic degree but also had inspired him in his future personal development. He was married with two children, and, being a member of the Baptist Church, he emphasized that he had wanted to have children only within marriage.

Before Steven met his wife, he told me, he had another girlfriend. “But I

did not like how this one was behaving!" I could hear the anger in his voice when he shared his memories with me: "She sort of tried to press me into fatherhood. I did not like this. I had been the only son of a single mother. I didn't know my father. As a child I suffered from this feeling of having been neglected by my father. I had sworn that I would never do this to my own children. I wanted to be a good father to my children." As a consequence, he decided he wanted to have children only after he married. The teaching he received during childhood, and later the teaching and counseling of his church, introduced him to a new vision of life and inspired him for a future of social success and marital stability in Botswana's blossoming economy. Family planning and the timing of childbirth had been part of the plan. The teaching of his church provided the couple with technologies for modeling their emotional life in a way that fit the dream of the middle-class family. He told me that he and his wife had sat together and discussed how many children they would be able to raise. Considering their two incomes and their living expenses, they had decided that two children were enough. They also decided to have them within two years so that his wife would not need to stop working for a longer period. In our conversation, Steven was proud of the fact that he and his wife managed to have the two children born two years apart. "You invest in marriage; you invest and plan," he said. Their church, in this case the Baptist Church, provides them with counseling and knowledge on how to manage their household's finances as well as family planning, all designed to master the emotional and financial challenges of their marriage (interview, August 23, 2011). Steven's biographical narrative exemplifies the influence of Christian churches on members who hope to achieve the lifestyles of urban middle classes. Teaching family planning as a social technique to manage limited resources, Christian churches not only exert moral control over their members but also turn initial anxiety and pain into a motivation to change one's life.

PROTECTING THE HOME:  
PENTECOSTALISM AND EXCLUSIVE PARENTHOOD

Over the course of the four years that I visited Botswana, I developed a cordial relationship with Dorothy (who was thirty-two years old when I first met her). She and her husband, Herbert, were Christians and emphasized partnership and equality in decision making, an approach that seemed to work well for them. For instance, they narrated how they took care of some

of their dying relatives together and how they protected themselves against getting infected with HIV through their work as caregivers. Dorothy used to work as a teacher and was then enrolled in a PhD program at the University of Botswana. She was also a member of the International Pentecostal Church that I visited from time to time. When I talked to Dorothy in 2011, she was facing a difficult situation because her twin sister had died some months earlier, during my absence. The death of her sister not only made Dorothy sad but also had changed her personal situation. She told me that she was thinking about what to do with her sister's daughters: "I am especially concerned about the youngest daughter. She is still very young and misses her mother terribly." She would love to take the girl to her own house and raise her, and she would like to do this soon. "I resemble my twin sister and I believe it would help the girl to get over the death of her mother if she could live with me," she explained. However, her husband did not like the idea. Another niece of Dorothy's was already staying with them, and they also had three children of their own. Her husband thought there already were enough people in the house. "If Herbert says no, it's no!" said Dorothy.

I pointed out to Dorothy the specificity of this situation, and that a decision should be made in favor of a young girl who mourned her mother. I suggested Dorothy should seek the advice of her pastor because I knew that pastors were respected authorities who often mediated between spouses. In fact, she had already discussed this issue with her pastor. He supported her husband and reminded Dorothy: "In a marriage you discuss things. This home is for you and your husband. You should not allow your relatives' people to stay with you" (field notes, March 13, 2011). The pastor highlighted the primacy of the married couple over claims of relatives and kin. He therefore spoke to the Pentecostal paradigm according to which the home needs spiritual and material protection (Frahm-Arp 2012).

Many educated professionals face the problem of having to take care of orphans within their extended family. In her study on orphans and adoption in the wake of Botswana's HIV crisis, Bianca Dahl (2009, 2010) describes the ambivalent position of churches regarding adoption: on the one hand, churches defend adoption programs in the name of charity and compassion; on the other hand, she observed reservations vis-à-vis adoption among people within the church as they are common in Botswana. In fact, in my research on families many of my interlocutors had accepted children of their brothers or sisters into their households. However, the relationship between stepparents and their adopted or fostered children mostly remained a distant



one, often evoking tensions and pain. Therefore, the ambivalent positions of pastors related to an overall rejection of allowing children into the family who were not “one’s own.”

Take, for instance, the story of Mirjam, a fifty-five-year-old woman who has remained childless. During the first years of their marriage, she and her husband had tried hard to conceive. The couple were both earning very good salaries, and they desperately wished for a child who could inherit their large property. Throughout their married life they had accepted children of some of their relatives into their household. One was the daughter of a late brother of Mirjam’s husband; another was the son of her late sister. Both of these adults had died of HIV/AIDS. Over the years they developed a cordial relationship with these young people who lived in their house, with her late sister’s son especially becoming close to them. Mirjam reported that they interacted freely and shared their meals. When this nephew enrolled at the university, they bought him his own apartment and bought his first car. Nevertheless, she would not expect him to take care of them in their old age. “It is only your own son that you would expect—he is his own,” she tried to explain her situation without finishing the sentence.

The fact that the couple had shared their everyday life with their nephew, and despite their considerable and generous support even after he had left their house, they did not consider him obligated to take care of them in old age (field notes, March 12, 2010). A feeling of distance was conveyed throughout her narrative, and I sensed that the relationship was a friendly one based on mutual obligation; however, warmth and sympathy were lacking. Concluding from discussions on adoption and HIV orphans, I sensed that among urban educated professionals, parenthood is valued only for one’s biological children. For instance, other conversation partners reported traumatic experiences when, in a quarrel, children detected that their foster parents were not their “real” (i.e., biological) parents. According to the conviction and experience of my interlocutors, lifelong care and support, offering someone a home, and enabling access to private education could not replace the strong bond that existed between biological parents and their children.

Churches supported local parental values. When I discussed the question of adoption and fosterage with Pastor Seithamo from the Apostolic Church Mission, he explained that the church advised its members not to adopt children from their late relatives. He spoke of these children as “being foreigners” and explained: “You never know what these foreigners bring to the house” (interview, March 24, 2009). In fact, one of my interlocutors

reflected on this feeling of estrangement when she reported about tensions with one of her husband's nieces they had accepted into their household after the death of the girl's mother. "She is brought up in the village and even the way she communicates is different. At the beginning she was very shy," narrated Nadine, who had a good job in one of Botswana's ministries. "And I encouraged her to talk to us. Now, she talks a lot and I sometimes wish she would not talk that much. Also, my son is very jealous. He insisted that I should not spend as much money on her education as on his" (interview, October 8, 2010).

According to Pastor Seithamo, fostered children are seen as strangers. In his view, they bring tensions and jealousy into the house and embody death and loss. In his narrative he insinuated that these children could bring social malaise as well as spiritual threats. With a different habitus and communication style, they also might embody poverty and backwardness, as the situation with Nadine's niece illustrates. The clear position on excluding a late relative's children from the home appeals to the Pentecostal paradigm of the home as a social space in need of social and spiritual protection, which Dorothy's pastor had also supported. It helps (aspiring) middle-class individuals in Botswana to navigate their own desires to create a home and keep up with the rising costs of urban lifestyles, for instance, concerning education and the increasing demands on them to financially support children of relatives who have died, presumably from HIV/AIDS. Pastors support the ties between biological children and their parents but encourage urban households to cut ties with children in need from their late relatives in the countryside. This tendency could be observed in many situations among educated urbanites, who illustrate how parenthood is newly evaluated through Christian discourses and practices in the wake of HIV/AIDS. These discourses help educated professionals to draw and maintain clear lines between themselves and their own nuclear families and other relatives in need; Christian discourses on parenting become a source of exclusion in the context of social disruption brought forward by HIV/AIDS and its related deaths.

#### CONCLUSION: THE CULTURAL POLITICS OF EMOTIONS OF URBAN EDUCATED PROFESSIONALS

This chapter has shown how Christianity has contributed to the production of the family as an object of emotions alongside the history of wealth and education in Botswana. Through education, and in teachings and counsel-

ing in churches, “the family” became an object of many, sometimes contradictory, emotions related to desires, ambitions, and aspirations that Christian marriages of early educated professionals required: to relate to values of professionalism; controlling emotions; dedication to planning; and companion marriage. Family life came to be associated with promises of social, spiritual, and emotional security, along with being a source of anxiety when people saw their desires unfulfilled. By showing ways to overcome disappointment and pain and teaching people how to manage and control emotions, Christian teaching, and Pentecostal teaching in particular, enables educated professionals to reach their goal of having a stable family, being able to take care of their children, and attaining financial security. Christian churches thus work toward inclusion of those people with middle-class aspirations who feel otherwise excluded from middle-class lifestyles.

In addition, by providing clear tools and guidance on how to acquire an urban lifestyle, including a working marriage and a secure home, Pentecostal teaching supports members of the urban middle classes in Gaborone in drawing and maintaining lines between themselves and their relatives living under precarious conditions. This is most impressively shown in relation to the question of care for orphaned relatives and their integration into the households of urban professionals.

Pain, anxiety, desire, and hope enfold in the contexts of social transformations that are situated between opportunities for education and career advancement opening up in Botswana’s blossoming economy and the rupture and closure brought about by demographic transformation related to the HIV pandemic and a wave of deaths caused by it. Here, Pentecostal teaching fulfills an ambivalent role: on the one hand, Christian education nourishes the anxieties of educated professionals by showing how failing families may cause failing life prospects and school dropout, leading to poverty and even prostitution. In Botswana’s economic boom of the past thirty years, many people attained urban lifestyles marked by consumption and new modes of emotions tied to family life. By fashioning family as a source of emotional, financial, and spiritual protection as well as a source of love and personal fulfillment, Pentecostal teachings also introduce new forms of suffering and experiences of personal pain. By creating “the family” as an emotional object, Pentecostal churches fashion the emotional styles of members of the urban middle classes in Gaborone, with all the complexities that are involved in becoming a successful urban African in the twenty-first century.

## NOTES

My research was made possible by the support of the Fritz-Thyssen Foundation and the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology, Halle, and was conducted with the permission of the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs, the Ministry of Health, the Gaborone Private Hospital (Dr. Music and Dr. Eaton), and the Bokamoso Private Hospital (Dr. Abebe). I thank all the institutions and people involved who have supported my research, both financially and intellectually. Pearl Sechele and Abigile and John Hamathi also assisted me greatly during my research. I especially thank John Hamathi for his inspiring words and his help in establishing connections with the right people; I also thank Sethunya Mosime, Godisan Mokoodi, and Treasa Galvin from the Department of Social Science, and Musa Dube and Francis Nkomasana from the Department of Theology and Religious Studies at the University of Botswana. Last but not least, I would like to thank Rijk van Dijk from the University of Leiden, who introduced me to these colleagues.

1. In the study cited here, the definition of “middle class” is a narrow one, focusing on spending power. People who can afford to spend twenty U.S. dollars a day are considered to be “nonfloating” middle classes; people who spend two dollars a day are considered to be “middle classes.”

2. The population was recorded to be about 1.6 million in 2001 and had grown to roughly about 2 million in 2011 (Central Statistical Office 2001; Census Office 2011). There were, however, a number of problems related to counting the population. One concerns the possible exclusion of male household members who were absent at the time of recording due to labor migration. Another concerns the exclusion of migrants from other African countries, for instance, from Zimbabwe, who represent a considerable workforce in Botswana (Buthali 2003).

3. Christian discourses have been observed to play an important role in navigating the experience of both poverty and death in urban Botswana. In his monograph on male prophets of the Eloyi cult in Gaborone, Richard Werbner (2011) shows how Christianity enables urban men without a regular income to make a living and develop specific forms of male urban religiosity. Fred Klaitz's (2010) monograph on a small church founded by a female prophet discusses the changed rituals and discourses of love and care in Christian practices of healing among Gaborone's poor inhabitants.

4. The following is taken from an interview I conducted with Mma Musi on September 14, 2011, when I visited her in her home.

5. This is quite unusual compared with other African countries where new wealth was generated by trading communities. Since the economic boom in the 1980s, these professional groups have been seen to form the “new emerging middle classes” (Ncube and Lufumpa 2014). Botswana's diamonds fed the large administrative and welfare apparatus of the country.

6. Compare with Niklas Luhmann (1986) for a similar point on the popularization of the model of romantic love in the twentieth century.

7. Note, however, that the emphasis on sexual discipline is not exclusive to Pentecostal teaching.