

Reply to “Comment on Eoalpine (Cretaceous) evolution of the Oman Tethyan continental margin: insights from a structural field study in Jabal Akhdar (Oman Mountains) by J.P. Breton et al.” (GeoArabia, 2004, v. 9, no. 2, p. 41-58) by D.R. Gray and R.T. Gregory (GeoArabia, 2004, v. 9, no. 4, p. 143-147)

Jean-Paul Breton, François Béchenec, Sylvain Richoz,
Laure Moen-Maurel and Philippe Razin

In their comments on our paper (Breton et al., 2004), Gray and Gregory (2004) provided constructive remarks and new information regarding the geodynamic model of the Oman Tethyan margin. We thank them for their interest in our paper and reply to their comments. The new information provided by Gray and Gregory (2004) only concerns the As Sifah subwindow, the lower unit of the lower slab (see Note below). This information does not pertain to the ocean-directed subduction that started in early Turonian and involved the autochthon represented by the Jabal Akhdar and Saih Hatat windows. Because of tectonic continuity between the internal and external zones of Saih Hatat and Al Jabal Al Akhdar, the Turonian subduction involved the upper slab as a single tectonic unit. In Breton et al. (2004), we explained the arguments that demonstrate this fact, which was previously established by several authors (Le Métour, 1988; El-Shazly and Coleman, 1990; Le Métour et al., 1990, 1995; Rabu et al., 1993; Wendt et al., 1993; Miller, 1998; Miller et al., 1998, 1999, 2002). Breton et al. (2004) added the new interpretation that the Muti Formation facies is a typical intra-continental wildflysch.

Gray and Gregory (2004) argue that the lower slab, separated from the upper slab by a regional ductile shear-zone, is characterised by: (1) a specific stratigraphic history (with Carboniferous sediments); (2) a distinct tectonic and metamorphic history (subduction below the Arabian Plate that started at 130 Ma); and (3) an exotic paleogeographic setting, away from the plate margin. Our geodynamic interpretation of the evolution of the northern Oman margin during the Late Cretaceous attempted to incorporate all the known data in a simple geodynamical model. We are aware of its uncertainties and are prepared to modify it to account for any new robust information. In our opinion the new datings of Gray and Gregory are not reliable and require a complex geodynamic model, which does not fit with the well-documented regional geology of the region. The following points briefly explain our reasons for this conclusion.

Age of the Protolithe of the Lower Slab

Gray et al. (paper in preparation provided by D. Gray) do not consider the possibility for the protolithe of the meta-tuffite to be of volcano-sedimentary origin. In such a case the analysed zircons could be detrital, and therefore older than the host-rock.

All the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values curves show positive values for Carboniferous and Permian (Grossman, 1994; Ekart et al., 1999; Hayes et al., 1999; Prokoph and Veizer 1999; Scholle 1995). The closest negative values before and after this period occur in Devonian and Triassic, which contradicts the age provided by the zircons. In the high-grade metamorphic context of the lower slab (blueschist to eclogite facies), the negative values obtained from calcschist samples (Gray et al., in preparation), may not represent primary signatures but rather the result of secondary decarbonation reactions in the presence of siliciclastic components (Kaufman and Knoll, 1995; Sharp et al., 1995). These reactions start from the greenschist facies and produce very light carbonate in the system.

Note: Gray et al. (2004) use the term “upper plate” and “lower plate” for the two tectonic units that are separated by a regional ductile shear-zone identified in the internal zone of Saih Hatat (Miller, 1998; Miller et al., 1998, 1999, 2002). To avoid confusion with the main tectonic plates (in particular with the use of upper plate and lower plate in the asymmetric rifting model of Wernicke, 1985), we prefer to use “upper slab” and “lower slab”. The term “slab” indicates the smaller scale of these units in comparison to “plate”.

Timing of Peak Eclogite Facies Metamorphism

The U–Pb SHRIMP dating method on zircon (absolute punctual analyses interpreted on the Concordia diagram) is in principle considered a suitable dating method. The resulting ages often converge with stratigraphic data for non-metamorphic volcanites, or refine metamorphism ages given by indirect information over a wider time bracket.

This is not the same for the Sm–Nd method on garnets, which is an isochron approach with uncertainties and concerns regarding: (a) chemical and isotopic equilibrium on rocks partially or totally reworked, (b) cooling conditions, (c) hydrothermal influence, and (d) contamination. In some instances the age-dating results, based on this method, may be completely erratic. When comparing U–Pb ages and Sm–Nd ages of Alpine and Himalayan eclogites (Luais et al., 2001), Alpine ophiolites (Costa and Caby, 2001) and Granites of Corsica (Poitrasson et al., 1998), it appears that the Sm–Nd ages are the most questionable and have the highest geological interpretation uncertainty. This seems to also be the case for the As Sifah eclogite, for which an U–Pb age of 82 Ma is determined (Gray et al., 2004). This is slightly younger than the Santonian age of the top of the subducted Muti Formation and close to the 80 Ma dating of the metamorphic peak in the upper slab (El-Shazly and Lanphere, 1992) that seems to represent the end of the subduction.

The mono-phased growth of a single generation of zircons suggests for us that the metamorphic peak was reached about 10 million years after subduction had started and was followed by fast exhumation (cooling and pressure decrease). If the zircon age represents a retrograde step, zircons should show zoning with a heart of older age representing the metamorphic peak. Gray et al. (2004) discuss the interpretation of the Sm–Nd 110, 109 ± 15 Ma age and review the known problems related to this method, such as (i) closure of garnet Sm–Nd system, (ii) contamination by inclusions, (iii) equilibrium of components, and (iv) decay constant. Nevertheless they conclude the suitability of this age and use it to date the metamorphic peak of eclogite.

Based on similar examples found in the literature, we estimate that the Sm–Nd method lacks robustness and the 110, 109 ± 15 Ma age attributed to the metamorphic peak of the As Sifah eclogites is not meaningful. Therefore, the hypothesis of a subduction that started at 130 Ma is not realistic, as we will show below.

Possible Exotic Nature of the Lower Slab

Even if the age of the outcropping sediments of the lower slab is Late Carboniferous, it doesn't imply that the lower slab is exotic and was originally an out-of-the-margin microplate. In fact, the wedge-shaped erosion of the autochthon B occurring at the Cenomanian–Turonian boundary and reaching the Triassic Mahil Formation at the latitude of Muscat, may have completely removed the Permian Saiq Formation northeast of Muscat and exhumed an hypothetical Carboniferous graben located within the continental plate margin.

In addition, if the lower slab had been originally separated from the upper slab by an oceanic crust (which is implied, if its origin is outside of margin), the shear-zone presently marking the tectonic superposition contact should be a major suture lined by remnants of oceanic lithosphere. This suture should be overlain by crystalline basement of the upper slab. However this is contrary to the field observations which indicate that the ductile shear-zone juxtaposes directly the two covers and cuts down to the upper slab sequence towards the southwest. To the northeast, the upper slab can then wedge with a tip located at a maximal distance of about ten kilometres northeast of Muscat. The shear zone seems to be only a cutting-down additive under-thrust through the continental margin, with only about several tens of kilometres of displacement (Breton et al., 2004; Figures 8d and 8e).

Hypothesis of a Subduction Initiated in Tithonian-Berriasian

During the Tithonian–Berriasian times the majolica facies covered the whole northeastern part of the Oman continental platform (Rayda Formation), and the distal platforms of the Hawasina Basin (Le Métour et al., 1995). This facies is widespread through the Tethys region from Cuba, the Cap-Verde

Islands, the Alpine-Mediterranean Tethys to Indonesia (Bernoulli and Jenkins 1974; Bosellini and Winterer 1975; Le Nindre et al., 2003). Thus this facies is not related to a specific evolution of the Oman margin. It is coeval with a general progressive deepening of the basin to a medium depth without terrigenous sediment supply, which could have been due to an eustatic sea-level rise (Rousseau et al., 2005). In any case, this facies does not have the character of a back-subduction flexural basin. The east-west paleogeographic evolution of the Jurassic facies (Sahtan Group) from western Al Jabal Al Akhdar to eastern Saih Hatat, may be related to the rifting that led to the opening of the Owen oceanic basin to the east of Oman (Loosveld et al., 1996). The majolica facies could be the consequence of the thermal subsidence of the passive continental margin.

A subduction that lasted between about 140 and 110 Ma (estimated peak of the high-pressure/low-temperature metamorphism) followed by an exhumation that started at 80 Ma, highlights the difficulty in maintaining a high-pressure/low-temperature assemblage during 20–30 million years without thermal relaxation. Gray et al. (in preparation) invoke the requirement for a "descending cool footwall" during this period. With this hypothesis, four distinct subductions are necessary to account for all the phenomena:

- (1) a continental verging subduction starting at about 140 Ma and ending at 110 Ma (lower slab);
- (2) a continental verging subduction also starting at about 140 Ma or thereafter and lasting up to 80 Ma (necessary for cooling footwall);
- (3) the verging southeast intraoceanic subduction, starting at about 100 Ma and becoming obduction, ending at 80 Ma (Samail Nappe); and
- (4) the NE-verging intracontinental subduction, starting at 93 Ma and ending at about 80 Ma (upper slab).

Such a system of subduction events seems unnecessarily complex when compared with the sequential cross-sections of Breton et al. (2004, Figure 8).

Western Lateral Extension of Intracontinental Subduction

As correctly noted by Gray and Gregory, we were not sufficiently specific in interpreting the lateral evolution of the western part of the intracontinental subduction. Following our interpretation, the rapid "dying-out" west of the Saih Hatat dome involves the lower slab block only. This is because its impingement would have triggered the crustal over-thickening responsible of the Saih Hatat doming at the end of the exhumation. It is clear that the subducted area of the upper slab extended westward at least to the western limit of the Hawasina Window, and perhaps up to the inferred southward extension of the Dibba transform.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This discussion is based on research supported by the Research Directorate of BRGM. We thank Dr. Hilal Al-Azri, Director General of Minerals, Ministry of Commerce and Industry of Oman, for his support. We thank Aymon Baud and Jean Marcoux, who provided important information. We also thank GeoArabia's editors.

REFERENCES

- Bernoulli, D. and H.C. Jenkins 1974. Alpine, Mediterranean, and Central Atlantic Mesozoic facies in relation to the early evolution of the Tethys. In, R.H. Dott and R.H. Shaver (Eds.), *Modern and Ancient Geosynclinal Sedimentation*. Society of Economic Paleontologists and Mineralogists, Special Publication no. 19, p. 129-160.
- Bosellini, A. and E.L. Winterer 1975. Pelagic limestone and radiolarite of the Tethyan Mesozoic: a genetic model. *Geology*, v. 3, p. 279-282.
- Breton, J.P., F. Béchenec, J. Le Métour, L. Moen-Morel and P. Razin 2004. Eoalpine (Cretaceous) evolution of the Oman Tethyan continental margin: insights from a structural study in Jabal Akhdar (Oman Mountains). *GeoArabia*, v. 9, no. 2, p. 41-58.
- Costa, S. and R. Caby 2001. Evolution of the Ligurian Tethys in the Western Alps: Sm/Nd and U/Pb geochronology and rare-earth element geochemistry of the Montgenevre ophiolite, France. *Chemical Geology*, v. 175, nos. 3 and 4, p. 449-466.
- Ekart, D., T.E. Cerling, I.P. Montanez and N.J. Tabor 1999. A 400 million year carbon isotope record of pedogenic carbonate: implications for paleoatmospheric carbon dioxide. *American Journal of Science*, v. 299, no. 10, p. 805-827.

- El-Shazly, A.K. and R.G. Coleman 1990. Metamorphism in the Oman Mountains in relation to the Semail Ophiolite emplacement. In, A.H.F. Robertson, M.P. Searle and A.C. Ries (Eds.), *The Geology and Tectonics of the Oman Region*. Geological Society of London, Special Publication no. 49, p. 473-493.
- El-Shazly, A.K. and M.A. Lanphere 1992. Two high-pressure metamorphism events in NE Oman: evidence from $^{40}\text{Ar}/^{39}\text{Ar}$ dating and petrological data. *Journal of Geology*, no. 100, p. 731-751.
- Gray, D.R. and R.T. Gregory 2004. Comment on "Eoalpine (Cretaceous) evolution of the Oman Tethyan continental margin: insights from a structural field study in Jabal Akhdar (Oman Mountains)" by Jean-Paul Breton et al., *GeoArabia*, v. 9, no. 4, p. 143-147.
- Gray, D.R., M. Hand, J. Mawby, R.A. Armstrong, J.McL. Miller and R.T. Gregory 2004b. Sm-Nd and zircon U-Pb ages from garnet-bearing eclogites, NE Oman: constraints on high-P metamorphism. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, v. 222, p. 407-422.
- Gray, D.R., R.T. Gregory, R.A. Armstrong and I. Richards (in preparation, 2004). U-Pb SHRIMP evidence for late Carboniferous Neo-Tethys rifting, NE Oman with consequences of a possible outboard micro-plate for Arabian margin tectonics. *Geology*.
- Grossman, E.L. 1994. The carbon and oxygen isotope record during the evolution of Pangea: Carboniferous to Triassic. In, G.D. Klein (Eds.), *Pangea: Paleoclimate, Tectonics, and Sedimentation during Accretion, Zenith, and Breakup of a Supercontinent*, Volume 288. American Geological Society Special Paper, p. 207-228.
- Hayes, J.M., H. Strauss and A.J. Kaufman 1999. The abundance of C13 in marine organic matter and isotopic fractionation in the global biogeochemical cycle of carbon during the past 800 Ma. *Chemical Geology*, v. 161, nos. 1 to 3, p. 103-125.
- Kaufman, A.J. and A.H. Knoll 1995. Neoproterozoic variations in the C-isotopic composition of seawater: stratigraphic and biogeochemical implications. *Precambrian Research*, v. 73, p. 27-49.
- Le Métour, J. 1988. *Géologie de l'Autochtone des Montagnes d'Oman: la Fenêtre du Saih Hatat*. Thesis, Docteur es-Sciences, Pierre and Marie Curie University, Paris 6; Bureau de Recherches Géologiques et Minières, Document no. 129, 420 p.
- Le Métour, J., D. Rabu, M. Tegye, F. Béchenec, M. Beurrier and M. Villey 1990. Subduction and obduction; two stages in the Eo-Alpine tectonometamorphic evolution of the Oman Mountains. In, A.H.F. Robertson, M.P. Searle and A.C. Ries (Eds.), *The Geology and Tectonics of the Oman Region*. Geological Society of London, Special Publication no. 49, p. 327-339.
- Le Métour, J., J.C. Michel, F. Béchenec, J.-P. Platel and J. Roger 1995. *Geology and Mineral Wealth of the Sultanate of Oman*. Ministry of Petroleum and Minerals, Directorate General of Minerals, Oman, 285 p.
- Le Nindre, Y.-M., D. Vaslet, J. Le Métour, J. Bertrand and M. Halawani 2003. Subsidence modeling of the Arabian Platform from Permian to Paleogene outcrops. *Sedimentary Geology*, v. 156, p. 263-285.
- Loosveld, R.J.H., A. Bell and J.J.M. Terken 1996. The tectonic evolution of interior Oman. *GeoArabia*, v. 1, no. 1, p. 28-51.
- Luais, B., S. Duchene and J. DeSigoyer 2001. Sm-Nd disequilibrium in high-pressure, low-temperature Himalayan and Alpine rocks. In, P. Philippot and N.M. Arnaud (Eds.), *Exhumation of High-pressure Rocks; Kinetic, Thermal and Mechanical Constraints*. *Tectonophysics*, v. 342, nos. 1 and 2, p. 1-22.
- Miller, J.McL. 1998. The structure, metamorphism and $^{40}\text{Ar}/^{39}\text{Ar}$ geochronology of northeast Saih Hatat, Oman: implications for the formation and preservation of high-pressure rocks. Unpublished PhD thesis, Monash University, Clayton, Melbourne, Australia.
- Miller, J.McL., D.R. Gray and R.T. Gregory 1998. Exhumation of high-pressure rocks, north-eastern Oman. *Geology*, no. 26, p. 235-238.
- Miller, J.McL., R.T. Gregory, D.R. Gray and D.A. Foster 1999. Geological and geochronological constraints on the exhumation of a high-pressure metamorphic terrane, Oman. In, U. Ring, M.T. Brandon, G.S. Lister and S.D. Xillett (Eds.), *Exhumation Processes: Normal Faulting, Ductile Flow and Erosion*. Geological Society of London, Special Publication no. 154, p. 241-260.
- Miller, J.McL., D.R. Gray and R.T. Gregory 2002. Geometry and significance of internal windows and regional isoclinal folds in northeast Saih Hatat, Sultanate of Oman. *Journal of Structural Geology*, no. 24, p. 359-386.
- Poitrasson, F., J.-L. Paquette, J.-M. Montel, C. Pin and J.-L. Duthou 1998. Importance of late-magmatic and hydrothermal fluids on the Sm-Nd isotope mineral, systematics of hypersolvus granites. *Chemical Geology*, v. 146, nos. 3 and 4, p. 187-203.
- Prokoph, A. and J. Veizer 1999. Trends, cycles and nonstationarities in isotope signals of Phanerozoic seawater. *Chemical Geology*, v. 161, nos. 1 to 3, p. 225-240.
- Rabu, D., P. Nehlig, J. Roger, F. Bechenec, M. Beurrier, J. Le Métour, C. Bourdillon de Grissac, M. Tegye, J.-J. Chauvel, C. Cavelier, H. Al-Hazri, T. Juteau, D. Janjou, B. Lemiere, M. Villey and R. Wyns 1993. Stratigraphy and structure of the Oman Mountains. Document du Bureau de Recherches Géologiques et Minières, no. 221, 262 p.
- Rousseau, M., G. Dromart, J.-P. Garcia, F. Atrops and F. Guillochau 2005. Jurassic evolution of the Arabian Platform edge in the central Oman Mountains. *Journal of the Geological Society of London*, v. 162, p. 349-362.
- Sharp, Z.D., M. Frey and K.J.T. Livi 1995. Stable isotope variations (H, C, O) in a prograde metamorphic Triassic red bed formation, central Swiss Alps. *Schweizerische Mineralogische und Petrographische Mitteilungen*, v. 75, p. 147-161.
- Scholle, P.A. 1995. Carbon and sulfur isotope stratigraphy of the Permian and adjacent intervals. In, P.A. Scholle, T.M. Peryt and D.S. Ulmer-Scholle (Eds.), *The Permian of Northern Pangea*. Springer-Verlag, Volume 1, p. 133-149.
- Wendt, A.S., P. D'Arco, B. Goffé and R. Oberhänsli 1993. Radial cracks around a-quartz inclusions in almandine: constrains on the metamorphic history of the Oman Mountains. *Earth Planetary Science Letters*, no. 114, p. 449-461.
- Wernicke, B. 1985. Uniform-sense normal simple shear of the continental lithosphere. *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, v. 22, p. 108-125.

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Jean-Paul Breton is a Structural Geologist with the French Bureau de Recherches Géologiques et Minières (BRGM). He holds a PhD in Structural Geology from the University of Paris (1972). He joined BRGM in 1972, working on structural studies applied to geological mapping, mineral exploration, underground storage and geotechnics in France, Europe, Africa and, from 1981 to 1992, in Saudi Arabia. Jean-Paul made a significant contribution to the conception and implementation of the Tectonic Map of France at the 1:1,000,000 scale (1st Edition, 1981). Since 1993, he has been the local representative of BRGM in Oman and, since 2002, is in charge of a scientific research program related to the geodynamics of the southern edge of the Arabian Plate.

jp.breton@brgm.fr



François Béchenne is a Geological Expert with the Bureau de Recherches Géologiques et Minières (BRGM). He received his Doctoral of science degree from the University Pierre et Marie Curie (Paris 6) in 1987. Since joining BRGM in 1978, François was mainly in charge of geological mapping projects, especially in Oman, but also in France and Africa. He is affiliated with the Geological Society of France (SGF) and is interested in the geology of the Middle East Region.

f.bechenne@brgm.fr



Sylvain Richoz is a Research Scientist at the Geological Museum of Lausanne. He obtained a PhD at Lausanne University in 2004. Sylvain's main areas of interest are stratigraphy, stable isotope geochemistry and sedimentology. Since 2000, he has been extensively involved in the chemio-stratigraphy of Upper Permian to Middle Triassic in the Neotethyan realm, and specially in the reconstruction of the sedimentary history of the early Oman margin.

sylvain.richoz@unil.ch



Laure Moen-Maurel has been leading reservoir modelling projects for the TOTAL Geosciences Division since 2000. Previously, Laure acquired over 12 years of experience in petroleum exploration, working for the Geological Survey of Canada (Institute of Sedimentary and Petroleum Geology), Petro-Canada, Elf, or as a consultant, dealing with basin analysis and structurally complex plays (Foothills, fractured reservoirs, deep delta fold-and-thrust belts, inversion tectonics). She graduated from the University of Paris and holds a PhD in Structural Geology from the University of Calgary (1987).

laure.moen-maurel@total.com



Philippe Razin is Professor of Geology at the University of Bordeaux, France. He received his Doctoral of science degree from the University of Bordeaux in 1989 and joined the Bureau de Recherches Géologiques et Minières as an expert in sedimentology and basin synthesis. Philippe was involved in various projects (mapping, water and mineral exploration, geotechnics, 3-D modelling). He moved to the University of Bordeaux in 1997, where he teaches sedimentary and structural geology, geodynamics and field mapping. His research activities concern relations between tectonic and sedimentation, in collaboration with BRGM, IFP, IFREMER and oil companies.

razin@egid.u-bordeaux.fr

