

This is a section of [doi:10.7551/mitpress/14201.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.7551/mitpress/14201.001.0001)

Copyright's Broken Promise

How to Restore the Law's Ability to Promote the Progress of Science

By: John Willinsky

Citation:

Copyright's Broken Promise: How to Restore the Law's Ability to Promote the Progress of Science

By: John Willinsky

DOI: [10.7551/mitpress/14201.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.7551/mitpress/14201.001.0001)

ISBN (electronic): 9780262371483

Publisher: The MIT Press

Published: 2022

OA Funding Provided By:

- Author
- MIT Press Direct to Open

OA Funding from Author

OA Funding from MIT Press Direct to Open



The MIT Press

Index

Page numbers in *italics* refer to figures.

- Abaluck, Jason, 5n13
Abbasi, Kamran, 5n13
Abelson, Hal, 33
Abrams, Howard B., 123, 123n67, 124
Abrams v. United States, 103–104, 104n93
Academia.edu, 36, 36n18
Academic exception, 114–115n34, 114–117
Academic freedom, 46, 115, 148, 156–157
Academic malfeasance, 114
Access versus incentives trade-off, 106–107
Accountability, 139
ACS. *See* American Chemical Society
Act to Amend and Consolidate the Acts Respecting Copyright (1909), 121–122nn56–57
Adams, John, 69
Advanced Research Projects Agency (ARPA), 29
Albee, Barbara, 85n42, 87n44, 91n60
Alfonseca, Kiara, 156n17
Alliance for Taxpayer Access, 48
Alperin, Juan Pablo, 24n68, 25n70, 35n14, 152, 152n3
American Academy of Arts and Sciences, 69
American Association of Universities, 39n28
American Association of University Professors (AAUP), 116n39, 116
American Chemical Society (ACS), 55, 55nn90–91, 84
American Geophysical Union v. Texaco Inc., 71, 71n43, 80–81nn30–31, 81
American Philosophical Society, 60, 60n2, 69, 69n37
American Psychological Association (APA), 44, 55–56, 56n92
American Society of Composers, Authors, and Publishers (ASCAP), 90, 117n43, 121, 130–131nn14–15, 134n23, 158
Amyot, Didier, 24n68
AnalystSuccess.com, 98
Anderson, Kent, 25n73, 43n46
Andraka, Jack, 25, 25n73
Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, 54n87
Annual Reviews, 95
Anti-intellectualism, 156–157
Antitrust laws, 90
APA. *See* American Psychological Association
APCs. *See* Article processing charges
Archambault, Éric, 24n68
ARL. *See* Association of Research Libraries
Armstrong, Henry, 77n17
ARPA. *See* Advanced Research Projects Agency

- ARPANET, 29
- Arrow, Kenneth J., 89–90n54, 154n11
- Article processing charges (APCs), 31, 49, 50, 52, 55, 56, 83, 91, 92
 budgeting for, 142
 cost structures, 53
 payment of, 125
 predatory publishers and, 100, 157
 pricing patterns, 87
- Articles of Confederation, 59
- Art monographs, 148–149
- ArXiv.org, 31
- ASCAP. *See* American Society of Composers, Authors, and Publishers
- Aspesi, Claudio, 98n75
- Association for Computing Machinery, 74n4
- Association for Molecular Pathology v. Myriad Genetics, Inc.*, 117–118n45
- Association for Psychological Science (APS), 74n4
- Association of American Publishers, 17n45
- Association of American Universities, 47n63
- Association of Research Libraries (ARL), 47–48, 47n63, 48n67
- Association of University Presses (AUP), 54, 54nn84–85, 55, 55nn88–89
- Astronomical Society of London, 110n13
- Aswad, Jem, 121n59
- Atlas, Scott W., 1, 1n1, 4–5, 156
- Attribution, 109, 119, 139
- Audio Home Recording Act of 1992, 14n32
- AUP. *See* Association of University Presses
- Authors Alliance, 81–82n33
- Authors Guild v. Google*, 81
- Authors Guild v. Hathitrust*, 81
- Availability rights, 147
- Baker, W. O., 76–77nn11–12
- Band, Jonathan, 131n16
- Bangladesh, 96
- Barch, Karen, 54n87
- Barendt, Eric, 115n35
- Barkley, Dean, 6n15
- Barrett, Amy Coney, 72, 72n46
- Barrett, Devlin, 101n87
- Barros, Tiago, 101n83
- Basic Books v. Kinko's Graphics*, 81
- Baucus, Max, 6n15
- Bautista-Puig, Nuria, 26n76
- Bayazit, Kumsal, 29, 29–30n1, 30, 44
- Bayh–Dole Act of 1980, 20–21, 117–118n45
- Beall, Jeffrey, 100, 100n80
- Begich, Mark, 6n15
- Beijing Audiovisual Treaty, 146n53
- Bell, Tom W., 132n18
- Benkler, Yochai, 32n9
- Bently, Lionel, 146n56
- Bepress, 87n44, 98
- Berghahn Books, 95
- Bergstrom, Theodore C., 85n42
- Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Works, 109n12, 119, 119n54, 129, 146nn53–54
 three-step test, 145–146
- Berne Convention Implementation Act of 1988, 119n52
- Besen, Stanley M., 134n23, 137n34
- Biagioli, Mario, 110nn14–15, 111–112, 111–112nn17–19, 112nn21–22, 112n24, 114n32
- Biden, Joe, 18
- Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, 46–47, 58, 58n100, 142n42
- Bill for the Promotion of the Useful Arts. *See* Patent Act of 1790
- Bingaman, Jeff, 6n15
- Binkley, Robert C., 75, 75n7
- BioMed Central, 31, 50, 52
- BioRxiv.org, 36, 156n15
- Björk, Bo-Christer, 13n29, 37n21
- BMI. *See* Broadcast Music Inc.
- Bodleian Library, 19
- Bodley, Thomas, 19
- Bohannon, John, 101n86, 123n65
- Bonito Boats, Inc. v. Thunder Craft Boats, Inc.*, 108n9

- Boren, David, 6n15
 Bornmann, Lutz, 142–143n45
 Bosch, Stephen, 85n42, 87n44, 91n60
 Bosman, Jeroen, 88n50
 Boudry, Christophe, 96n71
 Bourdieu, Pierre, 20n59, 114n31
 Boyce, Bert R., 40, 40nn30–32
 Boyd, Julian P., 63nn11–14
 Boyle, James, 32n9, 33
 Boyle, Robert, 111n18
 Bracha, Oren, 65n24
 Bradley, Bill, 6n15
 Brainard, Jeffrey, 95n69
 Brand, Stewart, 9n21
 Brandeis, Louis D., 17
 Brembs, Björn, 87n47
 Breyer, Stephen, 77–78, 78nn18–22, 129n7
 Broadcast Music Inc. (BMI), 90, 117n43, 121, 130–131n14, 158
 Brock, Bill, 6n15
 Brown, Patrick O., 37
 Brundy, Curtis, 95
 Buck, Solon J., 75, 75n7
 Budapest Open Access Initiative, 34, 34nn12–13, 48
 Bugbee, Bruce W., 59–60nn1–2
 Buranyi, Stephen, 83n38
 Burger, Warren E., 66n25, 68n34
 Burgstaller-Muehlbacher, Sebastian, 111–112n19
 Butler, Brandon, 131n16
 Cabells Predatory Reports, 100–101, 100n81
Cambridge University Press v. Patton, 81, 81–82n33
 Canadian Political Science Society, 57
 Cancer Moonshot program, 45
 Candeub, Adam, 121n59
 Carandini, Matteo, 87, 87n48
 Cardozo, Benjamin N., 7, 7n18
 Carlson, Chester Floyd, 21–22, 75
 Carr, David, 2n6
 Carroll, Michael W., 42–43, 42–43nn43–45, 43–44n47, 80n28, 111n16, 124, 124–125nn73–74, 125
 Carter, David J., 48n64
 CCC. *See* Copyright Clearance Center
 Center for Scientific Integrity, 129n10
 CERN, 49
 Chesley, Kate, 1n2
 Chi, Youngsuk, 44, 44n48
 Christou, Corilee, 81n32
 Citation economy, 108
 Citations, 80, 107–110
 Clark, William, 113n29
 Clarke, Roger, 9n21
 Clinton administration, 22–23
 CMOs. *See* Collective management organizations
 cOAlition S, 46–47, 94, 141n41 as model, 141
 Cobey, Kelly D., 99n77
 Cohen, I. Bernard, 60n3, 66n25, 67n31
 Cohen, Noam, 51n74
 Cold War, 76
 Cole, Dan, 26n74, 102n91
 Collective management organizations (CMOs), 130–133, 130nn12–13, 132n20
 international, 145
 music industry, 148
 Collective rights organizations, 131n16
 Commercial exploitation, 157
 Committee to Investigate Copyright Problems Affecting Communication in Science and Education, 76n11, 77
 Competency approach, 50
 Compulsory licensing. *See* Statutory licensing
 Computer Software Rental Amendments Act of 1990, 13
 Congressional intent, 57
 Consent decrees, 90, 117n43, 121, 158
 Consumer harm, 122–123
 Conyers, John, 45
 Cooke, Chris, 121–122n61
 Copyright Act Amendment (1856), 128n4

- Copyright Act of 1790, 65, 65n23, 66n27
 categories of works, 128
 as not covering periodicals or newspapers, 41
 types of works covered by, 66–67
- Copyright Act of 1842, 110n13
- Copyright Act of 1909, 79, 115, 120n56
 statutory licensing and, 120, 127
- Copyright Act of 1976, 77, 79–80nn27–28, 82n34, 108nn8–9, 109nn11–12, 111n17, 116n38, 128nn2–3, 128n5, 129n9
 ambiguity of, 82
 categories of works, 128
 citations and, 108–109
 fair use and, 15, 79
 photocopying and, 80, 110
 proposed reform, 4, 7–9, 128–149
 restrictions on publishers, 6
 section 108, 80
 shortcomings of, 109–110
 statutory licensing and, 121
- Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 80–81, 81n32
- Copyright economy, 106
- Copyright enforcement, 15
- Copyright exemption, 38, 40–41
- Copyright infringement, 75, 78–79, 144
- Copyright Principles Project (CPP), 14n34
- Copyright royalty judges, 121
 in proposed amendment, 133, 137–138, 139, 141, 155, 157
- Copyright Royalty Tribunal, 121
- Copyright Society of the USA, 75, 75n5, 77n15, 117
- Cornell University, 31
- Corporate authorship, 111–112n19
- Corredoira, Rafael A., 20–21n61
- Cost neutrality, 94
- Counting Online Usage of Networked Electronic Resources. *See* Project COUNTER
- Covey, Denise Troll, 35n17
- COVID-19, 4, 111–112
 attitude toward research after, 151
 copyright suspension and, 124–125
 embargo periods for research, 46n55
 genomic sequencing shared, 2n6
 limits to open access policies, 3n9
- Creative Commons licensing, 7, 16, 33n11, 139n38
 functions of, 33–34
 origins of, 33
- Crenshaw, Kimberlé Williams, 156n16
- Critical race theory, 156–157
- Crossref, 131–132, 132n18
- Crow, Raym, 25nn71–72, 48, 48n65, 49n69, 95n69
- Csiszar, Alex, 23, 23n66, 77n17, 110n13, 113n30
- CTEA. *See* Sonny Bono Copyright Term Extension Act of 1998
- Cunningham, Will, 56n93
- Dahrooge, Jillian J., 8n19
- Dal Bó, Ernesto, 143n46
- Dalrymple, Dana, 12n27
- Dalton, Elizabeth D., 37n21
- Daniel, Katherine, 54n86
- Danziger, Robert S., 21n62
- DARPA. *See* Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency
- Data analytics, 96, 98, 157
- Databases, 15, 30, 110, 144n48
- Davenport, Coral, 18nn50–51
- David, Paul A., 19, 19nn55–56, 155n14
- Davis, Jonathan, 96n73, 98n74
- Davis, Philip M., 25n70
- Davis, Susan, 85n41
- Decullier, Evelyne, 110n15
- Dedeurwaerdere, Tom, 13n29
- Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency (DARPA), 61
- De Knecht, Siccó, 98n75
- Delgado, Ray, 114n33
- Denton, William, 107n6
- Deschamps, Philippe, 24n68
- Diamond open access, 88, 103

- Digital Millennium Copyright Act (DMCA), 14–15, 14n31, 56n93, 109n12, 110
- Digital rights management (DRM), 15
- Directory of Open Access Journals, 100
- DMCA. *See* Digital Millennium Copyright Act
- Doctorow, Cory, 51n73
- Domingo, Marc, 101n83
- Douglass, Frederick, 64, 64n18
- Douthat, Ross, 5n14
- Dreyfuss, Rochelle Cooper, 132n20, 144n48
- DRM. *See* Digital rights management
- Dutfield, Graham, 110n14, 146n55, 148n60
- Edwards, Caroline, 49
- EFD. *See* Essential Facilities Doctrine
- Egger, Matthias, 101n83
- Einhorn, Michael A., 90n58
- Eisen, Michael B., 37, 39n29
- Elbakyan, Alexandra, 101–102, 102n88
- Eldred, Eric, 32
- Eldred v. Ashcroft*, 70–71, 71n42–43, 71n45
- Electronic Commerce Directive of 2000, 56n93
- Elsevier, 13n29, 17n46, 29, 33n11, 44n48, 51n73–74, 82, 89, 92–93n62, 96n72
- absence from OASPA, 51
- acceptance of open access, 50
- acquisitions by, 36, 83, 87n44
- change in open access stance, 51–52
- COVID-19 and, 3
- diversification by, 98n74
- diversification of, 96, 98
- lawsuits by, 36, 144
- lobbying by, 51
- market share, 84, 85
- open access article percentage, 91
- open access policies, 58, 89
- opposition to open access, 44
- pricing, 123
- profit of, 87–88, 87n48
- ScienceDirect database, 144n48
- Sci-Hub and, 101
- transformative agreement negotiations, 93–94
- Embargo periods, 35, 43, 74, 113
- lifting of, 45–46
- EMBO Press, 140–141n39
- Endowments, 19n54
- Environmental impact, 139
- Equal protection, 64
- Esanu, Julie M., 12n27
- Esposito, Joseph J., 54nn86–87
- Essential Facilities Doctrine (EFD), 89n52, 123n66
- Estelle, Lorraine, 140–141n39
- European Commission, 148
- European Union, 148
- Evans, Ian, 58n100
- Evans, Luther H., 59–60n1
- Eve, Martin Paul, 49, 82–83n36
- Exclusive rights, 9, 147
- Fair compensation, 88, 90
- Fair Copyright in Research Works Act (2009, proposed), 45, 45n51
- Fair use, 15, 76, 78, 109, 124
- codification of, 82n34
- in statutory law, 79–80
- Fared use, 132n18
- Farley, Ashley, 24n68
- Fazel, Ismaeil, 100n82
- Feal, Rosemary G., 56
- Feather, John, 67n30
- Federalist Papers*, 118n50
- Federal Trade Commission (FTC), 90, 90n56
- predatory publishers and, 99–100
- Federation of American Societies for Experimental Biology, 102n89
- Feist Publications, Inc. v. Rural Telephone Service Co.*, 40
- Feldman, Noah, 72n47
- Feldstein, Andrew P., 144n47
- Filippov, Sergey, 15n36
- First, Harry, 132n20
- First Amendment, 32, 103, 148
- Fischman, Gustavo, 35n14

- Fitzgerald, Sarah Rose, 123n69
 Fitzpatrick, Kathleen, 56
Folsom v. Marsh, 79–80
 Foong, Cheryl, 147, 147n57
 Foster, Michael, 23
 Fox, Christopher, 44
 Fox, Justin, 44n48, 96n72
 Frank, Martin, 45
 Franklin, Benjamin, 60, 60n3, 64, 69
 Frantsvåg, Jan Erik, 88n50
 Freeman, Leonard M., 114
 Free market, 123
 Frischmann, Brett M., 26n74, 102n91
 Fromer, Jeanne C., 61n6
 Frye, Brian L., 129n6
 FTC. *See* Federal Trade Commission
 Funk, Cary, 18n49
 Fyfe, Aileen, 82–83n36, 105–106,
 106nn1–2, 110n13, 113n30
- Gadd, Elizabeth, 35n17
 Galison, Peter, 112n22, 112n24,
 114n32
 Gallagher, Richard, 25nn71–72,
 49n69, 95n69
 Garfield, Eugene, 109n10, 110n15
 Garrison, Ellen, 44
 Gasaway, Laura N., 40n30
 “Gentlemen’s agreement,” 75–76
 Germany, 92–93
 Gervais, Daniel, 13n29, 80n29,
 112–113, 112–113nn25–28, 130,
 130nn12–13, 131n17, 136n30,
 145n50, 145n52
 Getty, Christopher, 114–115n34
 Gibson, William, 24
 Gin, Elaine B., 147n58
 Gingras, Yves, 26n75
 Ginsburg, Jane C., 66–67,
 66–67nn28–29, 81n31, 109,
 109n12, 117, 117n44, 137n35,
 144n48, 146n56
 Ginsburg, Ruth Bader, 70–71
 Ginsparg, Paul, 30–31, 30n2,
 31nn4–5, 35
 Global IP agreements, 145
 Global South, 49–50, 88, 148
- Goldfarb, Brent D., 20–21n61
 Goldstein, Paul, 118n50
Goldstein v. California, 66n25,
 68n34
 Google, 41–42n40
 Google Books, 130n11
 Gordon, Wendy J., 73, 73n2
 Gorski, David, 156n15
 Gorsuch, Neil, 72
 Gotanda, Neil, 156n16
 Gowers, Timothy, 101
 Grady, Denise, 4n12
 Graf, Chris, 53, 53n82
 Graham, Kayla, 50n71
 Gray, Jonathan, 82–83n36
 Greco, Albert N., 7n17
 Green, June, 32
 Greene, Jeremy A., 41n38
 Greenwald, Bruce, 62n8, 154,
 154nn8–12
 Grossmann, Alexander, 87n47
 Grudniewicz, Agnes, 99n77
 Grunberg, Isabelle, 12n27
 Guédon, Jean-Claude, 34n12
 Guibault, Lucie, 15n36
 Guyatt, Nicholas, 64n18
- Habibie, Pejman, 100n82
 Hagemann, Melissa, 34
 Hajjem, Chawki, 26n75
 Hamilton, Alexander, 60, 60n3
 Hancock, John, 69
 Handke, Christian, 15n36
 Hansen, Jennifer, 142n42
 Hargreaves, Ian, 15n36
 Harnad, Stevan, 26n75, 30, 30n3, 47,
 47n61
 Harris, Shane, 101n87
 Hartwell, Edith, 75n6
 Harvard University, 116
 Haustein, Stefanie, 84n40, 88n49
Hays v. Sony Corp., 116, 116n38
 Hefferon, Meg, 18n49
 Held, Michael J., 38n24
 Hendricks, Ginny, 132n18
 Henry, Claude, 107, 107n4,
 147–148nn59–60, 148

- Herper, Matthew, 25n73
 Hersch, Gemma, 51n75
 Hilton, John, III, 144n47
 Hilty, Reto M., 148n61
 Hiltzik, Michael, 94n66
 Himmelstein, Daniel S., 101n85
 Hinchliffe, Lisa Janicke, 95n69
 Hirtle, Peter B., 76n10
 Hobson, Charles A., 62n10
 Holdren, John P., 45n54
 Holmes, Oliver Wendell, Jr., 103–104
 Horowitz, Irving Louis, 82, 82n35
House Report on the Berne Convention Implementation Act of 1988, 119
 Hovenkamp, Herbert, 13n30
 Howard Hughes Medical Institute, 46–47
 Hsu, Hua, 122n62
 Hudson, Amy, 144n47
 Hudson, Blake, 26n74, 102n91
 Humanities Commons, 56
 Human right to know, 10, 153
 Hungary, 92–93
 Hunt, Gaillard, 63n15
- Incentives and innovations, 139–140
 Independent scholar-publisher journals, 91
 India, 96
 Information Access Alliance, 48n64
 Institute for Scientific Information, 109n10
 Intellectual freedom, 55
 Intellectual property, 6, 112, 114
 governance of, 147
 reforms, 154
 Intellectual property clause, 8n19, 32n8, 66n25, 70n40, 112n20
 drafting of, 61
 purpose of, 10, 66
 satisfaction of, 69–70
 text of, 59
International News Service v. Associated Press, 17, 17n48
 International publishing, 144–145
- Internet, 13–14, 22–23, 61, 110, 121
 costs and, 123–124
 libraries and, 48
 origins of, 29
 “Iron law of consensus,” 57–58
- Jakobsson, Frida, 92–93n62
 Janis, Mark D., 13n30
 Jasanoff, Sheila, 17, 17n47
 Jaschik, Scott, 56nn94–95
 Jefferson, Thomas, 62–63, 62nn10–11, 63n13, 64, 65, 69
 Jiang, Zhehan, 123n69
 Johns, Adrian, 112n22
 Johnson, Courtney, 18n49
 Johnson, K. G., 100n79
 Johnson, Rob, 124n70
 Johnson, Rozelle Parke, 75n6
 Johnson, Samuel, 11, 11n26
 John Wiley & Sons, 29–30n1, 50, 52n81, 89, 96n72, 98
 acquisitions by, 87n44, 90n57
 international agreements, 92
 open access policies, 52–53
 Joint Committee on Materials for Research of the American Council of Learned Societies, 75n8
- Jones, David S., 41n38
 Jones, Richard H., 112n23
 Jones, Richard M., 45n53
 Joseph, Heather, 48
 JSTOR, 51n74, 122–123
 Juul, 2n4
- Kaiser, David, 10n22
 Kaiser, Joselyn, 46n55
 Kaplan, Sheila, 2n4
 Katz, Ariel, 132n20
 Kaul, Inge, 12n27
 Kavanaugh, Brett, 72
 Kennedy, Brian, 18n49
 Kennedy, Pagan, 24n67
 Khanna, Saurabh, 100n82, 157n19
 Khoo, Shaun Yon-Seng, 87n46
 Kilby, Pamela A., 114–115n34
 Kim, Seojin, 20–21n61
 Kim, So Young, 20n57

- Kim, Yoonhoo, 20n57
 Kirby, Sheila N., 134n23, 137n34
 Knott, Anne Marie, 20–21n61
 Knowledge, as public good, 12n27, 155
 Knowledge economy, 76
 Knowledge Unlatched program, 54
 Koehlmoos, Tracey Pérez, 96n70
 Kohls, Alexander, 49n68
 Kolata, Gina, 99n78
 Korkeamäki, Timo, 13n29
 Kramer, Bianca, 88n50
 Kramer, S. D., 102n90
 Kripke, Saul, 114n31
 Kulish, Nicholas, 77n17
 Kwall, Roberta Rosenthal, 109n12
 Kwon, Diana, 36n19, 92–93n62
 Kwong, Laura H., 5n13
- Land, Edwin H., 21
 Landes, William, 106, 106n3
 Langlais, Pierre-Carl, 88n50
 Larivière, Vincent, 3n9, 24n68, 84n40, 88n49
 Latin America, 25n70, 35n14, 152
 Latour, Bruno, 108n7
 Learning society, 154
 Ledford, Heidi, 4n11
 Lee, Robert Stephen, 59–60n1, 73n1
 Lemley, Mark A., 13n30
 Leptin, Maria, 140–141n39
 Lessig, Lawrence, 32–33, 33n10, 70–71, 71n44, 158–159, 158–159nn20–22
 Libraries. *See* Research libraries
 Library of Congress, 121n58
 Library Publishing Coalition, 50, 98–99
 Liebowitz, Stan J., 73n1
 Lim, Daryl, 73n1, 89, 89–90nn52–54, 122–123, 122n64, 123n66, 124
 Lindelöw, Camilla Hertel, 92–93n62
 Link, Albert N., 21n62
 Lippman, Alexandra, 110n15
 Lipsky, Abbott B., Jr., 89n52
 Litman, Jessica, 14n34, 32n9, 57–58, 57nn89–99, 82, 82n34, 108n8
- Lockridge, Kenneth A., 68n33
 Luby, Stephen P., 5n13
 Lunney, Glynn S., Jr., 80, 80n29, 137n34
 Lynch, Ros, 15n36
- Mabe, Michael, 124n70
 Machlup, Fritz, 26n74
 MacKenzie, Lindsay, 98n74
 Madison, James, 59–61, 60n3, 62n10, 63, 64, 68, 118n50
 Madison, Michael J., 26n74, 102n91
 Madrigal, Alexis C., 123n65
 Maggio, Lauren, 152, 152–153nn4–7
 Maisonneuve, Hervé, 110n15
 Marcus, Ruth Barcan, 114n31
 Market-based pricing, 121
 Market failure, 73, 88, 103, 118
 of journalism, 151–152
 responses to, 95–99
 Market mechanisms, 122
 Marrakesh Treaty, 146n53
 Martens, Bertin, 15n36
 Martin, Mirta, 144n47
 Martin-Sancho, Laura, 111–112n19
 Matsunaga, Naoko, 111–112n19
 Matthews, David, 3n99
 Matthias, Lisa, 24n68
 Maxwell, Robert, 83
 Mayor, Susan, 94n66
 McCabe, Mark J., 26n77, 87n45
 McCabe, Michael, 87
 McDougall-Waters, Julie, 105–106, 106nn1–2
 McDow, Kelly, 117
 McKenzie, Lindsay, 142n44
 McPhee, John, 75n6
 McSherry, Corynne, 114n32
 Medical journals, 41
 MedRxiv.org, 36
 Mega, Emiliano Rodríguez, 94n66
 Meindertsma, Jessica, 37n23
 Mele, Salvatore, 49n68
 Merges, Robert P., 14n31, 123–124, 123n68, 124nn70–72
 Merkel-Sobotta, Eric, 31n6
 Merton, Robert K., 19–20, 20nn57–59

- Mervis, Jeffrey, 17n46, 114n32
- Meyer, Mark L., 111n18, 125n74
- Michael, Ann, 29–30n1, 90n57
- Microphotography, 75
- Miranda, Robert N., 83n39
- Mitchell, Joshua N., 69, 69n39
- MLA. *See* Modern Languages Association
- MLA Commons, 56
- Moderna, 4n12
- Modern Languages Association (MLA), 56
- Moher, David, 99n77
- Mongeon, Philippe, 84n40, 88n49
- Monopolies, 59, 61, 62–63, 66, 104, 140
 - copyright induced, 71
 - government sanctioned, 154
 - journal, 83
 - legal, 89
- Monopoly maintenance, 90
- Monopoly pricing, 8, 23, 40, 120, 146
- Moore, Samuel A., 46n59
- Moorhead, Laura, 152, 152–153nn4–7
- Moral rights, 119
- Morrill Land-Grant Acts of 1862 and 1890, 61, 61n7
- Morrison, Heather, 134n22
- Moscon, Valentina, 148n61
- Moxham, Noah, 106nn1–2, 113n30
- Mueller-Langer, Frank, 27n78
- Mundy, Martha, 108n7
- Music collectives, 143
- Music industry, 8–9, 81, 90, 120–122, 124, 155
 - copyright reform, 127
 - as example, 148
- Music Modernization Act of 2018. *See* Orrin G. Hatch–Bob Goodlatte Music Modernization Act of 2018
- Mutz, Rüdiger, 142–143n45
- Naim, Kamran, 25nn71–72, 49n69, 95n69
- National Academies in the United States, 36
- National Association of Book Publishers, 75–76, 75n8
- National Institutes of Health (NIH), 18, 31–32, 43–44n47, 113, 117–118n45, 125
 - budget increases, 151
 - embargo periods and, 46n55
 - fair use claims, 80
 - federal funding for, 38
 - origins of, 61
 - public access policy, 42–46, 51, 91
 - statutory licensing and, 117
 - taxpayer rights to research, 39n29
- National Science Foundation, 76
- Netherlands, 43n46, 46n55, 58n100, 98
- New York Public Library, 21, 75
- Nicol, Aurore, 24n68
- NIH. *See* National Institutes of Health
- Nonfiction, 107, 143, 148
- Norlander, Bree, 24n68
- Normative structure of science, 20n57
- Norway, 92–93
- OASPA. *See* Open Access Scholarly Publishers Association
- Ocampo, Paul, 26n76
- O'Connor, Anahad, 10n22
- O'Connor, Sandra Day, 40, 108n9
- O'Donnell, James J., 31n5, 47, 47nn61–62
- OERs. *See* Open educational resources
- Ojala, Marydee, 100n79
- Okediji, Ruth L., 12, 12n28, 15, 15nn36–37, 71n44, 90n55, 110–111, 111n16
- Okerson, Ann Shumelda, 31n5, 47, 47nn61–62
- OLH. *See* Open Library of Humanities
- Olson, Thomas P., 57, 57n96
- Olsson, Lisa, 92–93n62, 93n65
- Online media, 123
- Open access
 - COVID-19 and, 1–3
 - current state of, 24–27
 - defined, 2

- Open access (*continued*)
 delivery time, 8
 faculty and researcher support for,
 36–37
 financial viability of APCs, 50
 forms of, 2n5, 25n71
 further implications of, 5
 growth rate, 91–95
 implementation of, 93
 increasing support for, 7
 investment in, 125
 library sponsored, 48–50
 moral obligations, 95–96
 origins of, 30–35
 rate of growth, 6
 strategies, 91
 types of, 91n61
- Open access articles
 citations of, 26–27
 readership of, 24–25, 152
- Open Access Scholarly Publishers
 Association (OASPA), 51, 100
- Open educational resources (OERs),
 144
- Open infrastructure, 88
- Open Journal Systems, 40n32, 50
- Open Library of Humanities (OLH),
 49
- Open Research Funders Group, 142
- Open science, 1, 4
 origins of, 19
- Open Society Foundations, 34
- Open textbook projects, 144
- Opting out, in proposed amendment,
 148
- O'Reilly, Andrew, 1n3
- Originalism, 72
- Orphan works, 14n33
- Orr, Richard, 25n70, 91n61, 152,
 152n2
- Orrin G. Hatch–Bob Goodlatte
 Music Modernization Act of
 2018, 8–9, 8n19, 13, 121, 121n58,
 133n21, 134–136nn24–28,
 136–138nn31–35
 as model, 133, 149
- Österlund, Lovisa, 92–93n62
- Ownership, 33
- Ozaygen, Alkim, 27n79
- Pache, Lars, 111–112n19
- Page charges, 83
- Paine, Thomas, 68n33
- Pallante, Maria A., 16, 16nn39–43,
 118nn46–49, 122n63
- Papillon, Martin, 57n96
- Pastukhov, Dmitry, 122n62
- Patent Act of 1790, 65, 65n22, 66,
 66n26
- Patents, 20–21, 66, 117, 154
- Pear, Robert, 32n7
- Peer review, 50, 101, 113, 157
- Peeters, Frank Vrancken, 29–30n1
- Peller, Gary, 156n16
- Pergamon Press, 83
- Periodical Price Survey, 91
- Permitted-but-paid use, 117
- Peterson, Andrea, 51n72, 52n76
- Pettit, Emma, 156n17
- Pew Higher Education Roundtable,
 47n63
- Pfizer, 4n12
- Pharmacy, 24
- Photocopying, 22, 74, 75, 79, 103,
 105, 106
 copyright reform and, 77–78
 fair use and, 110
 origins of, 77
- Physics, 35
- Piketty, Thomas, 10–11, 10–11nn23–25
- Pinckney, C. C., 61, 62
- Pinel, Clémence, 106n2
- Piwowar, Heather, 24–25nn68–70,
 26n76, 35n16, 91n61, 152, 152n2
- PKP. *See* Public Knowledge Project
- Plan S, 46–47, 46–47nn57–60, 138n37
- Plan S Price Transparency Framework,
 140–141n39
- PLOS. *See* Public Library of Science
- Plumer, Brad, 18nn50–51
- Podolsky, Scott H., 41n38
- Pollack, Andrew, 117–118n45
- Pollack, Malla, 67–68, 68nn32–34
- Pooley, Jefferson, 93, 93n64, 98n74

- Porter, Michael E., 20n60
- Posner, Richard, 106, 106n3
- Pottage, Alain, 108n7
- Pound, Ezra, 67n30
- Predatory publishers,
99–101nn77–83, 99–103, 157
- Press publishers, legal category for,
152
- Preston, John, 83, 83n38
- Priem, Jason, 24n68, 25n70, 91n61,
152, 152n2
- Priest, Eric, 114–115n34, 115n37,
116, 116n42
- Printing Act of 1895, 38
- Private foundations, 46
- Proctor, Robert, 10n22
- Profit motive, 71
- Project COUNTER (Counting Online
Usage of Networked Electronic
Resources), 132, 132n19
- Proudman, Vanessa, 88n50
- Provencher, Françoise, 24n68
- Public Access to Science Act (2003,
proposed), 37–39, 38n27
- Public broadcasting, 121
- Public health, 147
- Public interest, 147
- Public Knowledge Project (PKP),
40n32, 49, 88, 98, 100n82, 102n91,
125
- Public Library of Science (PLOS), 37,
38n24, 39n29, 50
- Public utilities, 41–42n40
- Publishers' Protections Study: Notice
and Request for Public Comment,
151–152
- Publishing costs, 94, 120, 140–141
- PubMed Central, 32, 43–44nn46–47,
125
deposits required by NIH, 42–43
operational costs, 43
- Pure publish deals, 94
- Purper, Benjamin, 52n78
- Pyne, Derek, 100n79
- Quotations, 109
- Qureshi, Fatima, 93n65
- Rachal, William M. E., 60n2
- Rate court, 117n43
- Raustiala, Kal, 41n39
- Ray, Victor, 157n18
- Read-and-publish agreements, 53, 92,
93
alternatives to, 94–95
- Ready market, 81
- Rebout, Lise, 24n68
- Reciprocal agreements, 148
- Reed, Christopher S., 15n38, 122n62,
131n17
- Reese, R. Anthony, 144n48
- Regulatory capture, 143
- Reich, Margaret, 39n29
- Reichman, Jerome H., 12, 12n28,
13n29, 15, 15nn36–37, 71n44,
90n55, 110–111, 111n16
- Reller, Tom, 52
- RELX, 44n48
- Research
economics of, 19
expense of, 9
investment in, 17
role of copyright in, 41–42
- Research exemption, 114–115n34
- Research4Life (R4L), 95–96
- Research foundations, 83
- Research funders, 8, 94, 120, 125,
127, 131, 133, 140
in proposed amendment, 134,
135, 137, 138, 141–142,
148–149
- ResearchGate, 36, 36n18
- Research journals, 105–106
growth of, 142–143
pricing structure, 85
- Research libraries, 47–50, 54, 74, 92,
95, 120, 125
costs to, 86, 103, 155
financial viability of, 154
international, 141
open access and, 87
photocopying and, 76, 80
in proposed amendment, 138, 141
scholarly publishing by, 98–99
serials crisis and, 85–87, 103

- Research licensing collective, proposed, 132–133, 135–137, 140, 143, 155
- Research publications, 117, 120
 authorship and, 111
 designation of, 129–130
 as distinct category of work, 9, 128, 147
 as global public good, 155
 versus other forms of writing, 106
 statutory licensing and, 127
- Research publications registry, proposed, 130, 133, 134–135, 143, 155, 157
- Research Works Act (2011, proposed), 51
- Retraction Watch*, 129n10
- Review articles, 39
- Reynolds, Regina, 100n79
- R4L. *See* Research4Life
- Right of remuneration, 152
- Rights management organizations, 81, 156
- Rights management system, 132n18
- Right to research, 1
- Riva, Laura, 111, 111–112n19
- Roberge, Guillaume, 24n68
- Roberts, John, 72
- Romaine, Sion, 85n42, 87n44, 91n60
- Roscoe, Jonathan, 37n21
- Rosen, Zvi S., 129n8
- Rosenbloom, Jonathan, 26n74, 102n91
- Ross, Deborah, 109n12
- Røttingen, John-Arne, 94, 94n68, 138n37
- Royal Geological Society, 113n30
- Royal Society of London, 23, 55, 105–106, 110n13
- Royalties, 14
- Rusk, Matthew, 142n43
- Rutland, Robert A., 60n2, 62n10
- Sabo, Martin Olav, 37
- SAGE, 50, 89, 98
 market share, 85
- Saini, Angela, 10n22
- Salop, Steven C., 134n23, 137n34
- Samberg, Rachael G., 70
- Sample, Ian, 86n43
- Samuelson, Pamela, 14–15, 14–15nn34–35, 22, 22n65, 32n9, 129, 130n11, 147n57
- Sandler, Chanani, 116n39
- Scheiding, Tom, 83n37
- Scheufen, Marc, 27n78
- Schiermeier, Quirin, 94n66
- Schneider, Leonid, 46n58
- Scholarly market, 123
- Scholarly publications review board, proposed, 134
- Scholarly publishers
 conflicting interests of, 103
 copyright enforcement and, 15
 costs for, 155
 international, 144–145
 lawsuits by, 78
 open access policies, 50–55
 percentage of copyright revenue, 17
 resistance to open access, 43–46, 51
 statutory licensing proposal, 127
 trade publishing and, 148
- Scholarly publishing, 73–74, 114
 acquisitions within, 87
 CMO for, proposed, 131
 commercialization of, 82–90, 103
 financial model, 6
 increasing support for open access, 7
 by libraries, 98–99
 stakeholders, 30, 127
- Scholarly Publishing and Academic Resources Coalition (SPARC), 48
- Scholarly publishing review board, proposed, 130, 133
- Scholarly societies, 55–57, 74, 93, 105–106
 journal publishing and, 82
 publishing surpluses, 139
- Schonfeld, Roger, 54n86, 93n64
- Science
 Cold War and, 76–77
 as distinct type of work, 128
 framers of Constitution and, 60
 misuse of, 10

- open access seen as threat to, 44
 production of, 11–12
 as public good, 10, 11–12,
 12nn27–28
 public regard for, 18
 use of term, 11
- Science Advisory Committee, 76–77
- Sci-Hub, 99, 101–102, 102n92,
 122–123, 139
 lawsuits against, 144
- SCOAP. *See* Sponsoring Consortium
 for Open Access Publishing in Particle Physics
- Scott, John T., 21n62
- Selection bias, 26n75
- Self-archiving allowances, 91
- Senate Subcommittee on Patents,
 Trademarks, and Copyrights, 76n11
- Serials crisis, 85–87
- Severin, Anna, 101n83
- Shadow libraries, 99, 101
- Shapin, Steven, 107n5, 111n18,
 112n21
- Shared infrastructure, 102n91
- Shavell, Steven, 40, 40–41nn33–37
- Shen, Helen, 110n15
- Shu, Fei, 3n9
- Sidak, J. Gregory, 89n52
- Sisario, Ben, 8n19
- Siwek, Stephen E., 17n44
- Slavery, 63–64, 63n16
- Smith, Richard, 96n70
- Snyder, Christopher, 26n77
- Social media, 5
- Social science, 36
- Social Science Research Council, 75n8
- Social Sciences Research Network
 (SSRN), 36, 36n18
- Society of European Stage Authors
 and Composers, 130–131n14
- Software, 140
- Solum, Lawrence B., 67n31
- Sonny Bono Copyright Term Extension
 Act (CTEA) of 1998, 32,
 70–71
- Sony Corp. of America v. Universal
 City Studios, Inc.*, 4n10, 4
- Soros Foundation, 77n17
- SPARC. *See* Scholarly Publishing and
 Academic Resources Coalition
- Sponsoring Consortium for Open
 Access Publishing in Particle Physics
 (SCOAP), 49, 125, 141
- Sponsorships, 19n54
- Spoof, Robert, 119n51
- Sprigman, Christophe, 41n39
- Springer Nature, 27, 29–30n1, 31, 50,
 52n80, 82, 89
 international agreements, 92
 market share, 84, 85
 open access policies, 52
 pricing, 123
- SSRN. *See* Social Sciences Research
 Network
- Statute of Anne (UK), 59–60n1, 65,
 65n24, 67n30, 105
- Statutory licensing, 73, 78
 benefits to libraries, 120
 benefits to publishers, 120
 as best for the advancement of
 knowledge, 157–158
 concerns about, 117–118
 defined, 9
 as extension of rights, 118–119
 government reluctance to use,
 117–118
 music industry and, 8–9
 potential reversibility of, 158
 proposed model, 133–139
 recommendation for, 127–149
 related considerations, 139–149
 relief for financial duress, 143
 use of term, 9n20
- Sterling, Bruce, 74n3
- Stern, Marc A., 12n27
- Stern, Scott, 20n60
- Stevens, John Paul, 4
- Stiglitz, Joseph E., 12n27, 62n8, 107,
 107n4, 147–148nn59–60, 148,
 154–155, 154–155nn8–13
- Storer, Norman, 20n57
- Strandburg, Katherine J., 26n74,
 102n91
- Straumsheim, Carl, 46n56

- Strinzel, Michaela, 101n83
- Suber, Peter, 2n5, 7, 7n17, 45n52, 48, 48n66
- Subscribe-to-open model, 7, 25n71, 94–95
- Subscribe-to-open programs, 49
- Subscription monopolies, 43
- Subscriptions, 18, 93, 103, 141
 - cost structures, 53
 - monopoly pricing, 8
 - price increases, 91
 - pricing, 146
 - revenues, 7
- Sugimoto, Cassidy, 3n9
- Sunstein, Cass, 64, 64nn19–20
- Supreme Court, 33, 70–71, 117–118n45, 120
- Surveillance publishing, 98n74
- Susman, Thomas M., 48n64
- Suthersanen, Uma, 110n14, 146n55
- Swartz, Aaron, 51n74
- Sweden, 53, 92–93, 92–93n62
- Sweeney, David, 94, 94n68, 138n37
- Takedown notices, 36, 56
- Tananbaum, Greg, 142, 142n44
- Tancock, Christopher, 89n51
- Taverne, M. P., 43n46
- Taxpayers, 38–39, 48, 153
- Taylor & Francis, 36, 50, 82n35, 89, 96n72
 - market share, 84, 85
- Teacher exception. *See* Academic exception
- Tebbel, John, 66–67n28
- Technological inversion, 71n44
- Technological protection measures (TPMs), 15, 111
- Television, 122
- Temple, Karen A., 119nn53–54
- Templeton World Charity Foundation, 46–47
- Tennant, Jonathan P., 27n80
- Tenopir, Carol, 37n21
- Thatcher, Sanford G., 54, 54n86
- Thomas, Clarence, 72
- Thomas, Katie, 4n12
- Thomas, Kendall, 156n16
- Tilden Trust, 21n63
- Title-creation-and-acquisition model, 83–84
- To Amend and Consolidate the Acts Respecting Copyright, 127n1
- Toler, Laura, 94n67
- TPMs. *See* Technological protection measures
- Tracz, Vitek, 31
- Trade publishing, 143–144, 148
- Trade Related to Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS) Agreement, 12, 145–146nn51–53, 147, 147n58
- Transformative agreements, 53, 92, 93
- Transparency, 139, 156
- TRIPS Agreement. *See* Trade Related to Intellectual Property Rights Agreement
- Troscow, Samuel E., 34n13, 38nn25–26, 39nn28–29
- Trump, Donald, 74, 74n4, 151
 - “war on science,” 6
- Trump administration, 45
- Uhlir, Paul F., 12n27, 13n29
- Uniformity cost, 124
- United Kingdom, 59–60n1
- United Nations, 145
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 153
- University of California, 53, 58, 58n100, 93–94
- University of California Press, 54
- University of Utrecht, 37
- University open access mandates, 116
- University open access repositories, 125
- University presses, 53–55, 93
- Unpublished works, 129
- US Constitution
 - fugitive slave clause, 63, 63n16
 - intellectual property clause (*see* Intellectual property clause)
 - interpretation of, 64
 - preamble, 68–69, 69n36
 - purpose of copyright in, 3, 4

- slavery and, 63–64
 use made of, 64
 US Constitutional Convention, 59, 62
 US Copyright Office, 16, 117–118, 122
 moral rights and, 119
 notices of inquiry, 151–152
 US Department of Defense, 29
 US Department of Justice, 121
 Ussi, Gino, 58
- Vaccines, 4
 Valcke, Peggy, 15n36
 Valdivia, Walter D., 21n62
 Van Norden, Richard, 142–143n45
 Varlejs, Jana, 82n35
 Varmus, Harold, 31–32, 32n7, 37, 38n24
 Vaver, David, 146n56
 Ventry, Dennis J., 93–94
Verizon Communications v. Trinko, 89–90n54
 Verses, Judy, 29–30n1
- Waelbroeck, Patrick, 27n78
 Wallace, David Foster, 107, 107n6
 Walterscheid, Edward C., 62nn9–10, 68n33
 Wang, Xianwen, 26n75
 “War on science,” 6
 Warren, Kiara, 144n47
 Washington, George, 65, 65n21
 Wasserman, Lee, 10n22
 Watkinson, Anthony, 124n70
 Web-based delivery, 87
Weinstein v. University of Illinois, 115, 115n37, 117
 Weissmann, Heidi S., 114
Weissmann v. Freeman, 114, 114n32
 Wellcome Trust, 2, 3
 Wenyon, Michael, 21, 21nn63–64
 Westbrook, Elaine, 94
 Wheeler, G. W., 19n54
- White House Office of Science and Technology Policy, 45
White-Smith Music Publishing Company v. Apollo Company, 120, 120n55
 Wiley, David, 144n47
 Wiley-Blackwell, market share, 84, 85
 Williams, B. J., 115
 Williams & Wilkins, 78
Williams & Wilkins Company v. the United States, 78, 78–79nn23–26, 80, 81
Williams v. Weisser, 115, 115n36
 Willinsky, John, 2n5, 35n14, 65n23, 95n69, 100n82, 142n43, 152–153nn4–7, 157n19
 WIPO. *See* World Intellectual Property Organization
 WIPO Copyright Treaty (1996), 146–147
 WIPO Internet Treaties, 146n53
 Wirtén, Eva Hemmungs, 77n13, 77n16
 Wise, Alicia, 140–141n39
 Woolston, Chris, 37n22
 Work made for hire, 115
 World Health Organization, 95
 World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO), 12, 96, 145, 145nn49–51
 World Trade Organization (WTO), 145n51, 147
 World Wide Web, 29
 WTO. *See* World Trade Organization
- Xerox, 22, 75, 77
- Yin, Xin, 111–112n19
 Yost, David, 41–42n40
 Yuan, Shuofeng, 111–112n19
- Zerhouni, Elias, 43
 Zimmerman, Diane, 132n20

© 2023 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

This work is subject to a Creative Commons CC BY-NC-ND license.

Subject to such license, all rights are reserved.



The MIT Press would like to thank the anonymous peer reviewers who provided comments on drafts of this book. The generous work of academic experts is essential for establishing the authority and quality of our publications. We acknowledge with gratitude the contributions of these otherwise uncredited readers.

This book was set in Sabon by Scribe Inc. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Willinsky, John, 1950– author.

Title: Copyright’s broken promise : how the law now impedes the “progress of science” and how it can be fixed / John Willinsky.

Description: Cambridge, Massachusetts : Massachusetts Institute of Technology, [2023] | Includes bibliographical references and index. | Summary: “How US Copyright law should be reformed to ensure open access to research and scholarship”—Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022003112 (print) | LCCN 2022003113 (ebook) | ISBN 9780262544412 (paperback) | ISBN 9780262371476 (epub) | ISBN 9780262371483 (pdf)

Subjects: LCSH: Copyright—United States. | Open access publishing.

Classification: LCC KF2994 .W55 2023 (print) | LCC KF2994 (ebook) | DDC 346.7304/82—dc23/eng/20220801

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022003112>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022003113>

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1