
Copyright's Broken Promise

That Congress shall have Power . . . to promote the Progress of Science and useful Arts, by securing for limited Times to Authors and Inventors the exclusive Right to their respective Writings and Discoveries.
—U.S. Const. art. I, § 8, cl. 8

The case that this book makes for reforming US copyright law so that it supports universal open access to research publications has five parts:

1. Scholarly publishing’s principal stakeholders (including the big publishers) are now in agreement that “open access” to research publications will do more to promote scientific progress than the subscription journal system of the print era.
2. This open access consensus is not well served by a Copyright Act that encourages restricting, rather than opening, access to research, which means that the law falls short of its original intent “to promote the Progress of Science.”
3. Rather than reform the act, stakeholders have pursued legal and extra-legal work-arounds—with embargoes, final drafts, illegal copies, Creative Commons (CC) licenses—that are failing to deliver universal open access with all due speed and at a fair price.
4. So why not legislate statutory licensing (long used with music copyright) for research publications in which research’s institutional users and funders are required to fairly compensate scholarly publishers for immediate open access?
5. Such a legislative fix is not too much to request of a Congress that has enacted nearly sixty digital-era reforms of the Copyright Act for everything but science, with some reforms working internationally, which is the goal of this initiative.

Copyright's Broken Promise

How to Restore the Law's Ability to Promote the Progress of Science

John Willinsky

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2023 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

This work is subject to a Creative Commons CC BY-NC-ND license.

Subject to such license, all rights are reserved.



The MIT Press would like to thank the anonymous peer reviewers who provided comments on drafts of this book. The generous work of academic experts is essential for establishing the authority and quality of our publications. We acknowledge with gratitude the contributions of these otherwise uncredited readers.

This book was set in Sabon by Scribe Inc. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Willinsky, John, 1950– author.

Title: Copyright’s broken promise : how the law now impedes the “progress of science” and how it can be fixed / John Willinsky.

Description: Cambridge, Massachusetts : Massachusetts Institute of Technology, [2023] | Includes bibliographical references and index. | Summary: “How US Copyright law should be reformed to ensure open access to research and scholarship”—Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022003112 (print) | LCCN 2022003113 (ebook) | ISBN 9780262544412 (paperback) | ISBN 9780262371476 (epub) | ISBN 9780262371483 (pdf)

Subjects: LCSH: Copyright—United States. | Open access publishing.

Classification: LCC KF2994 .W55 2023 (print) | LCC KF2994 (ebook) | DDC 346.7304/82—dc23/eng/20220801

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022003112>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022003113>

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

This one's for Sebastian, Dylan, Reya, Finn, and Jack, as well as their world

Contents

Acknowledgments ix

Bibliographic Note xi

1 A Realistic Proposal 1

2 Open Access Consensus 29

3 The Constitution's Intellectual Property Clause 59

4 Scholarly Publishing's Market Failure 73

5 Law and Scholarship 105

6 A Copyright Amendment for Science 127

Epilogue: Toward a Global Public Good 151

Index 161

This is a section of [doi:10.7551/mitpress/14201.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.7551/mitpress/14201.001.0001)

Copyright's Broken Promise

How to Restore the Law's Ability to Promote the Progress of Science

By: John Willinsky

Citation:

Copyright's Broken Promise: How to Restore the Law's Ability to Promote the Progress of Science

By: John Willinsky

DOI: 10.7551/mitpress/14201.001.0001

ISBN (electronic): 9780262371483

Publisher: The MIT Press

Published: 2022

The open access edition of this book was made possible by generous funding and support from the author, and MIT Press Direct to Open



The MIT Press

© 2023 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

This work is subject to a Creative Commons CC BY-NC-ND license.

Subject to such license, all rights are reserved.



The MIT Press would like to thank the anonymous peer reviewers who provided comments on drafts of this book. The generous work of academic experts is essential for establishing the authority and quality of our publications. We acknowledge with gratitude the contributions of these otherwise uncredited readers.

This book was set in Sabon by Scribe Inc. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Willinsky, John, 1950– author.

Title: Copyright’s broken promise : how the law now impedes the “progress of science” and how it can be fixed / John Willinsky.

Description: Cambridge, Massachusetts : Massachusetts Institute of Technology, [2023] | Includes bibliographical references and index. | Summary: “How US Copyright law should be reformed to ensure open access to research and scholarship”—Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022003112 (print) | LCCN 2022003113 (ebook) | ISBN 9780262544412 (paperback) | ISBN 9780262371476 (epub) | ISBN 9780262371483 (pdf)

Subjects: LCSH: Copyright—United States. | Open access publishing.

Classification: LCC KF2994 .W55 2023 (print) | LCC KF2994 (ebook) | DDC 346.7304/82—dc23/eng/20220801

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022003112>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022003113>

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1