

THE ART OF ABDUCTION

THE ART OF ABDUCTION

Igor Douven

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2022 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

This work is subject to a Creative Commons CC BY-NC-ND license. Subject to such license, all rights are reserved.



The MIT Press would like to thank the anonymous peer reviewers who provided comments on drafts of this book. The generous work of academic experts is essential for establishing the authority and quality of our publications. We acknowledge with gratitude the contributions of these otherwise uncredited readers.

This book was set in EB Garamond by the author in Lua^AT_EX.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Douven, Igor, author.

Title: The art of abduction / Igor Douven.

Description: [Cambridge, Massachusetts] : Massachusetts Institute of Technology, [2022] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021031324 | ISBN 9780262046701 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Abduction (Logic) | Reasoning. | Practical reason. | Bayesian statistical decision theory.

Classification: LCC BC199.A26 D68 2022 | DDC 160—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021031324>

In memory of my father, Sjef Douven (1922–2018)

Contents

List of Figures	xii
List of Tables	xiii
Preface	xv
Acknowledgments	xix
1 Introduction	I
1.1 Why You Should Want to Know About Abduction	I
1.2 Two Common Misconceptions	13
1.3 Overview	25
2 What Is Abduction?	29
2.1 Abduction in the Wild	30
2.2 Deduction, Induction, Abduction	34
2.3 Abduction and Underdetermination	55
3 The Psychology of Abduction	69
3.1 Into the Mud	69
3.2 The New Paradigm and Bayesian Rationality	71
3.3 Explanation and Belief Change	83
3.4 Just Noise?	89
3.5 Explanatory Reasoning and Accuracy	94
3.6 Good-Enough and Second-Best Explanations	96
3.7 Should Philosophers Care?	100

4	Facing the Challenges	103
4.1	The Dynamic Dutch Book Argument Revisited	104
4.2	Abductive Reasoning and Practical Interests	117
4.3	Abduction and Our Epistemic Goal	122
4.4	Summary	131
5	A Closer Look at Scoring	135
5.1	Standard Scoring Rules and Truthlikeness	135
5.2	Truthlikeness and Inaccuracy Minimization	143
5.3	Truthlikeness and Impropriety	146
6	The Ecological Rationality of Abduction	157
6.1	The Justification of Abduction	157
6.2	Previous Defenses of Abduction	158
6.3	Simulating Explanatory Reasoning	168
6.4	Concluding Remarks	184
7	The View from Social Epistemology	189
7.1	The Hegselmann–Krause Model and Beyond	192
7.2	Further Generalizing Group Learning	201
7.3	Evolutionary Computing and Optimal Group Learning	206
7.4	Optimal Group Learning in Action	214
7.5	The Upshot	217
8	An Abductive Response to the Skeptic	221
8.1	The Skeptical Challenge	221
8.2	Mooreans and Russellians against the Skeptic	224
8.3	Evidence, Inference, and Expert Functions	231
8.4	How to Resolve the Skepticism Debate?	243
	Epilogue	253
	Appendices	
A	Proof of Theorem 4.1	265
B	Proof of Theorem 5.1	269

C Proof of Theorem 5.2	273
D Proof of Theorem 8.1	275
E Using Julia	279
References	301
Index	345

