

## Accounting Historians Journal

A Publication of the Academy of  
Accounting Historians Section of the  
American Accounting Association

### MAIN ARTICLES

#### **Evolution of Other Comprehensive Income**

Robert Bloom

#### **A Historical Assessment of a Key Auditor Independence Policy: Auditing Your Own Work**

John D. Keyser

#### **U.S. Public Accounting Practice and Intergenerational Occupation Transfer 1850–1870**

Diane H. Roberts

### SALMAGUNDI

#### **Salmagundi: A Mixture or Assortment—A Potpourri**

William H. Black

#### **Richard K. Fleischman, Jr.: A Remembrance**

Robert Bloom

#### **The Chicago Group of Four That Changed Accounting Research**

Sadaharu Takeshima and George H. Sorter

#### **Marshall H. Twitchell: Selected Financial Records of a Vermont Carpetbagger in Louisiana**

David N. Herda and John N. Herda



**American  
Accounting  
Association**

Academy of  
Accounting Historians

# Accounting Historians

Journal

V.47 N.2 2020

**AMERICAN ACCOUNTING ASSOCIATION**  
Board of Directors

President	Elaine G. Mauldin, University of Missouri
President-Elect	Robert D. Allen, The University of Utah
Past President	Terry Shevlin, University of California, Irvine
Vice President–Finance	Mark S. Beasley, North Carolina State University
Vice President–Research & Publications	Mark L. DeFond, University of Southern California
Vice President–Education	Beth B. Kern, Indiana University
Director–Focusing on Membership	Ann C. Dzurainin, Northern Illinois University
Director–Focusing on International	Giorgio Gotti, The University of Texas at El Paso
Director–Focusing on Segments	Audrey A. Gramling, Oklahoma State University
Director–Focusing on Intellectual Property	Mary Harris Stanford, Texas Christian University
Director–Focusing on Academic/Practitioner Interaction	John Hepp, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

The American Accounting Association was founded in 1916 as the American Association of University Instructors in Accounting. Its present name was adopted in 1936. The Association is a voluntary organization of persons interested in accounting education, research, and practice.

**Membership in the Association is available at the following annual rates.**

**Full membership:**

The membership dues of \$345.00 include *Accounting Education News* and the online selection of all three Association-wide journals: *The Accounting Review*, *Accounting Horizons*, and *Issues in Accounting Education*. (This does not include Section journals.) Full members may also opt to receive hard copies of AAA journals for an additional cost:

The <i>Accounting Review</i> . . . . .	with Print Option	\$85.00	Total U.S. \$430.00
<i>Accounting Horizons</i> . . . . .	with Print Option	\$55.00	Total U.S. \$400.00
<i>Issues in Accounting Education</i> . . . . .	with Print Option	\$55.00	Total U.S. \$400.00
All three Association-wide journals . . . . .	with Print Option	\$195.00	Total U.S. \$540.00

**Associate membership:**

Full-time students are eligible for associate membership at \$100.00, which includes *Accounting Education News* and access to all three Association-wide journals: *The Accounting Review*, *Accounting Horizons*, and *Issues in Accounting Education*. (This does not include Section journals.) Members may also opt to receive hard copies of AAA journals for an additional cost. (Teaching Notes for *Issues in Accounting Education* are not available to students.)

The <i>Accounting Review</i> . . . . .	with Print Option	\$85.00	Total U.S. \$185.00
<i>Accounting Horizons</i> . . . . .	with Print Option	\$55.00	Total U.S. \$155.00
<i>Issues in Accounting Education</i> . . . . .	with Print Option	\$55.00	Total U.S. \$155.00
All three Association-wide journals . . . . .	with Print Option	\$195.00	Total U.S. \$295.00

In addition, AAA Section journals *Accounting Historians Journal*, *Accounting and the Public Interest*, *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, *Behavioral Research in Accounting*, *Journal of Emerging Technologies in Accounting*, *The Journal of the American Taxation Association*, *Journal of Financial Reporting*, *Journal of Forensic Accounting Research*, *Journal of Information Systems*, *Journal of International Accounting Research*, *The ATA Journal of Legal Tax Research*, and *Journal of Management Accounting Research* are available to all AAA members. Full members may belong to one or more Sections: Academy of Accounting Historians; Accounting, Behavior and Organizations; Accounting Information Systems; Accounting Programs Leadership Group; American Taxation Association; Auditing; Diversity; Financial Accounting and Reporting; Forensic Accounting; Gender Issues and Worklife Balance; Government and Nonprofit; International Accounting; Management Accounting; Public Interest; Strategic and Emerging Technologies; Teaching, Learning and Curriculum; and Two-Year College. Each Section assesses its own dues, which are collected by the Association.

Inquiries concerning membership, subscriptions, advertisements, permissions, and other matters related to the Association (other than submission of manuscripts) should be sent to American Accounting Association, 9009 Town Center Parkway, Lakewood Ranch, FL 34202.  
Telephone: (941) 921-7747 • Fax: (941) 923-4093 • Email: [Info@aaahq.org](mailto:Info@aaahq.org).

Notice of change of address should be mailed at least eight weeks in advance to ensure undelayed receipt of *Accounting Historians Journal*. There is no submission fee for the journal. Manuscripts should be submitted in electronic form. Detailed instructions can be found at <http://aaahq.allentrack.net>. The editorial offices can be reached using the information below:

William H. Black, Editor  
University of North Georgia  
Email: [william.black@ung.edu](mailto:william.black@ung.edu)

Editorial Office  
Chelsea Matthews  
Phone: (941) 556-4122  
Fax: (941) 923-4093  
Email: [chelsea.matthews@aaahq.org](mailto:chelsea.matthews@aaahq.org)

*Accounting Historians Journal* is indexed in Emerging Sources Citation Index (Web of Science) and Scopus.

**Accounting Historians Journal** (ISSN 0148-4184 print and ISSN 2327-4468 online) is published semiannually by the American Accounting Association, 9009 Town Center Parkway, Lakewood Ranch, FL 34202. General subscriptions are available at the annual rate of \$95.00 for a print copy. The member subscription rate for a hard copy is \$10.00. Electronic access is included with membership dues. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to **Accounting Historians Journal**, 9009 Town Center Parkway, Lakewood Ranch, FL 34202.

# EDITORIAL STAFF OF ACCOUNTING HISTORIANS JOURNAL

## EDITOR

WILLIAM H. BLACK, *University of North Georgia, Oakwood, GA, USA*

## ASSOCIATE EDITOR

MARTIN PERSSON, *University of Illinois, Champaign, Illinois, USA*  
STEPHAN FAFATAS, *Washington & Lee University, Lexington, VA, USA*

## EDITORIAL ASSISTANT

CHELSEA MATTHEWS, *American Accounting Association*

## PAST EDITORS

1974–1976 Gary J. Previts  
1977–1980 Gary J. Previts and Willard E. Stone  
1980–1983 Edward N. Coffman and Mervyn W. Wingfield  
1984–1985 Kenneth S. Most and Mervyn W. Wingfield  
1985–1987 Kenneth S. Most and Ashton C. Bishop  
1987–1988 Gary J. Previts and Ashton C. Bishop  
1988–1989 Gary J. Previts and Mary S. Stone  
1990–1994 Dale L. Flesher and William D. Samson  
1994–1997 Barbara D. Merino and Patti A. Mills  
1998–1999 Richard K. Fleischman and A.J. Cataldo  
2000–2001 Richard K. Fleischman and Hans J. Dykxhoorn  
2001–2005 Stephen P. Walker and Cheryl S. McWatters  
2006–2008 Richard K. Fleischman and Cheryl S. McWatters  
2009–2011 Richard K. Fleischman and Christopher Napier  
2012–2016 Gloria L. Vollmers

## EDITORIAL ADVISORY AND REVIEW BOARD

### AAHJ Editorial Board Members

C. RICHARD BAKER, *Adelphi University, Garden City, NY, USA*  
RON BAKER, *University of Guelph, Guelph, ON, Canada*  
ROBERT BLOOM, *John Carroll University, University Heights, OH, USA*  
KEES CAMFFERMAN, *Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, Netherlands*  
SALVADOR CARMONA, *Instituto De Empresa, Madrid, Spain*  
GARRY D. CARNEGIE, *Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology University, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia*  
IGNACE DEBEELDE, *Ghent University, Ghent, Belgium*  
JOHN R. EDWARDS, *Cardiff University, Cardiff, Wales, United Kingdom*  
DALE L. FLESHER, *University of Mississippi, University, MS, USA*  
TONYA FLESHER, *University of Mississippi, Oxford, MS, USA*  
WARWICK FUNNELL, *University of Kent, Canterbury, Kent, England*  
JAN HEIER, *Auburn University at Montgomery, Montgomery, AL, USA*  
ESTEBAN HERNANDEZ-ESTEVE, *Autonomous University of Madrid, Madrid, Spain*  
THOMAS A. LEE, *University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa, AL, USA*  
CHERYL S. MCWATTERS, *University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada*  
BARBARA D. MERINO, *University of North Texas, Denton, TX, USA*  
MARC NIKITIN, *University of Orleans, New Orleans, LA, USA*  
DAVID OLDROYD, *Newcastle University, Newcastle upon Tyne, United Kingdom*  
LEE PARKER, *Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology University, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia*  
GARY J. PREVITS, *Case Western Reserve University, Cleveland, OH, USA*  
ROBERT W. RUSS, *Northern Kentucky University, Highland Heights, KY, USA*  
MASSIMO SARGIACOMO, *University G d'Annunzio of Chieti-Pescara, Pescara, Italy*  
MARY S. STONE, *The University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa, AL, USA*  
TOMO SUZUKI, *University of Oxford, Oxford, United Kingdom*  
THOMAS N. TYSON, *St John Fisher College, Rochester, NY, USA*  
RICHARD G. VANGERMEERSCH, *University of Rhode Island, Kingston, RI, USA*  
GLORIA LUCEY VOLLMERS, *The University of Maine, Orono, ME, USA*  
STEPHEN P. WALKER, *The University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, United Kingdom*  
LUCA ZAN, *University of Bologna, Bologna, Italy*

## AMERICAN ACCOUNTING ASSOCIATION

### CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

Yvonne L. Hinson

### PUBLICATIONS DEPARTMENT

Stephanie Austin  
Nate Smith  
Peyton Fultz  
Chelsea Matthews  
David Twiddy  
Jan Kovarik (subcontracted)

### OTHER AAA STAFF

Steve Matzke  
Barbara Brady  
Shauna Bigelow  
Barbara Gutierrez  
Nancy Maciag  
Michele Morgan  
Connie O'Brien  
Michelle Russak  
Mark VanZorn  
Joe Parisi  
Suzanne Mullinnix  
Erlinda Jones  
Debbie Gardner  
Beverly Collins  
Stephanie Glaser  
Kelli Rickrode  
Jean Thompson  
Karen Toney  
Kelly Lee  
Pat Stein  
Mary Beth Gripshover  
Darlene Dobson

# Accounting Historians

December 2020

Journal

Volume 47

Number 2

## Main Articles

Evolution of Other Comprehensive Income Robert Bloom . . . . .	1
A Historical Assessment of a Key Auditor Independence Policy: Auditing Your Own Work John D. Keyser . . . . .	11
U.S. Public Accounting Practice and Intergenerational Occupation Transfer 1850–1870 Diane H. Roberts . . . . .	21

## Salmagundi

Salmagundi: A Mixture or Assortment—A Potpourri William H. Black . . . . .	35
Richard K. Fleischman, Jr.: A Remembrance Robert Bloom . . . . .	37
The Chicago Group of Four That Changed Accounting Research Sadaharu Takeshima and George H. Sorter . . . . .	41
Marshall H. Twitchell: Selected Financial Records of a Vermont Carpetbagger in Louisiana David N. Herda and John N. Herda . . . . .	47

