of the elaborate Flamboyant transept window there—showed that French experts continued to work in Scotland, but little evidence remains to reconstruct their careers in the same detail as Morrow’s.

In the same years, churches in trading centers such as Bruges and Brussels suggested cylindrical piers for the arcading of Aberdeen and Dunkeld Cathedrals as well as the monumental Y-tracery on the west front of St. Mary’s, Haddington. A similar window at St. Mary’s, Dundee, was also centered above a round-headed portal with a trumeau as part of an axial west tower, finished by 1495. Fawcett convincingly attributes its square telescopic massing and balustrades to Netherlandish towers like that at Amerongen.

Disappointingly, he does not similarly explore possible precedents for Scotland’s beloved crown steeples in his final chapter, “The Last Years of the Middle Ages, 1500–1560,” despite correctly placing them among “earlier continental European experiments in making stone appear as light as could be achieved” (378). A closer look at the use of flying buttresses to create dematerialized pyramidal superstructures would have pointed once again to trading cities like Mechelen, where Andries Keldermans had probably planned a dramatic west tower for St. Rombout’s from the 1470s. Also, Fawcett’s suggestion that St. Michael’s destroyed crown steeple opposite the palace of Linlithgow may have reflected the imperial ambitions of James V would have found support from the crown-capped spire finished in 1513 for the election church of the Holy Roman Empire, St. Bartholomew’s in Frankfurt.  

This criticism, however, amounts to asking for a different book, though it does suggest the sort of further scholarship that such a comprehensive survey enables. Fawcett introduces Scottish churches of the Middle Ages into the larger European narrative of Gothic architecture, but only a few monuments, such as Glasgow Cathedral and Melrose Abbey, genuinely rivaled their Continental counterparts. The balance of his case studies reveal a conservative building culture with constrained ambitions and resources. Only the traceried cusps under the narrow round-headed lights signal the late date of the Aberdeen

frontispiece. Parish churches rarely expanded laterally to add arcades, a signifier of architectural prestige and a wealthy laity in medieval England. More typically, Scottish donors of the later Middle Ages who wanted space for burials or private masses paid to extend the local chancel and perhaps established a college of clerics. Even better-funded campaigns, like that at Bothwell undertaken by the Earls of Douglas from 1398, consisted only of a simple rectangular vessel covered by a pointed barrel vault. In the Highlands and Western Isles, ornament and scale become scarcer still, even at cathedrals like Lismore. Yet Fawcett gives them all due attention and finds a place for each one in what will be the definitive textbook on Scottish medieval churches for years to come.

Jeffrey A. K. Miller
London

Notes

John Goodall
The English Castle, 1066–1650
New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2011, 480 pp., 250 color and 100 b&w illus. $75, ISBN 97803001105

John Goodall has written what is perhaps the most important, authoritative, and scholarly book on English castles for a generation ago by a “military” perspective. In the last thirty years, numerous writers have questioned this view, and drawn attention to the social, cultural, and aesthetic aspects of castles. The resulting debate has been in part a generational one, and has often produced more heat than light. Part of the reason discussion has not always been fruitful lies in its supporting theoretical parameters and a failure to question those parameters. At play has been an architectural modernism (the function of castles is assumed, and form must follow function); a false framing of the debate in terms of either defense or symbolism—or a reinscription of this unhelpful divide in the observation that “both” were important; and a failure to unpack key theoretical terms that are at stake, such as status, aesthetics, and culture.

Goodall’s mode of exposition is often narrative and implicit rather than analytical
The disciplinary emphasis on architectural history also comes out in the relative lack of discussion of the landscape context of the castle. There is less emphasis on motte and bailey, and on smaller and timber castles in general. One of the key developments in the last two decades has been the archaeological recognition of “designed landscapes” surrounding castles and elite houses of the Middle Ages, challenging the notion that these were somehow an invention of the Renaissance, but there is little mention of them in The English Castle (the famous and much-discussed example of Bodiam gets less than a sentence on page 314).1

A reader might also wonder about the second word of this book’s title. Anglo-Saxon precursors to the castle are discussed thoughtfully; Norman castles are primarily presented with reference to their antecedents and contemporaries in Normandy. We then move to the castles of the conquest of Wales and of Ireland. Goodall comments that “the Anglo-Norman conquest of Ireland strictly lies outside the scope of this narrative” (165), but proceeds to discuss the largest of Ireland’s castles nevertheless. The famous castles of Edward I’s conquest of Wales, and various structures in Scotland, are also discussed. It is typical that Goodall’s deep scholarship leads him to explore the links between “England,” northern France, and the British Isles as essential to a full understanding of castles; his deconstruction of the parallel of Caernarvon with Constantinople and his preferred thesis of Caernarvon as referencing a Romano-British past are exciting. Goodall does not go on, however, to grasp the nettle of understanding the role of the castle in materializing what is “English” as a constructed and contested category, rather than reflecting an identity that is essential and assumed.

All these comments are meant as part of an ongoing discussion of where castle studies might go now rather than as criticisms of what is in this volume. John Goodall has written a stunning book. It is both the product of meticulous scholarship and packed with fresh ideas, and it is beautifully produced. The English Castle is a pleasure to pick up, the sort of resource one can turn to again and again, read a passage or scan an illustration at random, and learn something new or gain an original insight every time. My copy already has a cracked spine from repeated returns to it, and my students gave it rave reviews when I used it as a set text last year. Every student of castles must read and inwardly digest this book, and so must every scholar of architectural history.

Note
1. The definitive discussion is Oliver Creighton, Designs upon the Land: Elite Landscapes of the Middle Ages (Woodbridge, UK: Boydell, 2009).


This admirable, innovative volume offers a unique panorama of archaeology and the traffic in antiquities generated in Ottoman lands during the essential formative period of the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. While it does not discuss Ottoman Egypt and Palestine (whose inclusion might have doubled the page count), Scramble for the Past engages strategically with archaeology and its institutions in modern-day Turkey, as well as Lebanon, Iraq, Syria, and Greece. The book’s editors and contributors analyze activities by English, French, German, and Austrian scholars and archaeologists at home and abroad. Further, and crucially, they break new ground by considering the motivations of the Ottoman peoples and government, rescuing them from the more common role of largely passive or picturesque backdrop for Western narratives of discovery.

In their introductory essay, “Archaeology and Empire,” the editors state as their goal to challenge the view that “scientific archaeology” constitutes “a purely disinterested realm of scholarship” (25). Instead, this volume provides an impressive roster of the often buried and less than purely scientific or objective interests that motivated Western archaeological discovery in this portion.