

COVID-19 Transmission and Children: The Child Is Not to Blame

Benjamin Lee, MD, William V. Raszka, Jr, MD

Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) presents arguably the greatest public health crisis in living memory. One surprising aspect of this pandemic is that children appear to be infected by severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2), the virus that causes COVID-19, far less frequently than adults and, when infected, typically have mild symptoms,¹⁻³ although emerging reports of a novel Kawasaki disease-like multisystem inflammatory syndrome necessitate continued surveillance in pediatric patients.^{4,5} However, a major question remains unanswered: to what extent are children responsible for SARS-CoV-2 transmission? Resolving this issue is central to making informed public health decisions, ranging from how to safely re-open schools, child care facilities, and summer camps down to the precautions needed to obtain a throat culture in an uncooperative child. To date, few published data are available to help guide these decisions.

In this issue of *Pediatrics*, Posfay-Barbe et al⁶ report on the dynamics of COVID-19 within families of children with reverse-transcription polymerase chain reaction-confirmed SARS-CoV-2 infection in Geneva, Switzerland. From March 10 to April 10, 2020, all children <16 years of age diagnosed at Geneva University Hospital (*N* = 40) underwent contact tracing to identify infected household contacts (HHCs). Of 39 evaluable households, in only 3 (8%) was a child the suspected index case, with symptom onset preceding illness in adult HHCs. In all other households,

the child developed symptoms after or concurrent with adult HHCs, suggesting that the child was not the source of infection and that children most frequently acquire COVID-19 from adults, rather than transmitting it to them.

These findings are consistent with other recently published HHC investigations in China. Of 68 children with confirmed COVID-19 admitted to Qingdao Women's and Children's Hospital from January 20 to February 27, 2020, and with complete epidemiological data, 65 (95.59%) patients were HHCs of previously infected adults.⁷ Of 10 children hospitalized outside Wuhan, China, in only 1 was there possible child to adult transmission, based on symptom chronology.⁸ Similarly, transmission of SARS-CoV-2 by children outside household settings seems uncommon, although information is limited. In an intriguing study from France, a 9-year-old boy with respiratory symptoms associated with picornavirus, influenza A, and SARS-CoV-2 coinfection was found to have exposed over 80 classmates at 3 schools; no secondary contacts became infected, despite numerous influenza infections within the schools, suggesting an environment conducive to respiratory virus transmission.⁹ In New South Wales, Australia, 9 students and 9 staff infected with SARS-CoV-2 across 15 schools had close contact with a total of 735 students and 128 staff.¹⁰ Only 2 secondary infections were identified, none in adult staff; 1 student in primary school was potentially infected by a staff member, and 1 student in high

Department of Pediatrics, Larner College of Medicine, University of Vermont, Burlington, Vermont

Opinions expressed in these commentaries are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the American Academy of Pediatrics or its Committees.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1542/peds.2020-004879>

Accepted for publication Mar 18, 2020

Address correspondence to William V. Raszka, Jr, Department of Pediatrics, University of Vermont, Larner College of Medicine, 89 Beaumont Ave, Given Courtyard N210, Burlington, VT 05405.

E-mail: william.raszka@med.uvm.edu

PEDIATRICS (ISSN Numbers: Print, 0031-4005; Online, 1098-4275).

Copyright © 2020 by the American Academy of Pediatrics

FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE: The authors have indicated they have no financial relationships relevant to this article to disclose.

FUNDING: No external funding.

POTENTIAL CONFLICT OF INTEREST: The authors have indicated they have no potential conflicts of interest to disclose.

COMPANION PAPER: A companion to this article can be found online at www.pediatrics.org/cgi/doi/10.1542/peds.2020-1576.

To cite: Lee B and Raszka WV. COVID-19 Transmission and Children: The Child Is Not to Blame. *Pediatrics*. 2020;146(2):e2020004879

school was potentially infected via exposure to 2 infected schoolmates.

On the basis of these data, SARS-CoV-2 transmission in schools may be less important in community transmission than initially feared. This would be another manner by which SARS-CoV-2 differs drastically from influenza, for which school-based transmission is well recognized as a significant driver of epidemic disease and forms the basis for most evidence regarding school closures as public health strategy.^{11,12} Although 2 reports are far from definitive, the researchers provide early reassurance that school-based transmission could be a manageable problem, and school closures may not have to be a foregone conclusion, particularly for elementary school-aged children who appear to be at the lowest risk of infection. Additional support comes from mathematical models, which find that school closures alone may be insufficient to halt epidemic spread¹³ and have modest overall impacts compared with broader, community-wide physical distancing measures.¹⁴

These data all suggest that children are not significant drivers of the COVID-19 pandemic. It is unclear why documented SARS-CoV-2 transmission from children to other children or adults is so infrequent. In 47 COVID-19-infected German children, nasopharyngeal SARS-CoV-2 viral loads were similar to those in other age groups, raising concern that children could be as infectious as adults.¹⁵ Because SARS-CoV-2 infected children are so frequently mildly symptomatic, they may have weaker and less frequent cough, releasing fewer infectious particles into the surrounding environment. Another possibility is that because school closures occurred in most locations along with or before widespread physical distancing orders, most close contacts became limited to households, reducing opportunities for children to become

infected in the community and present as index cases.

Almost 6 months into the pandemic, accumulating evidence and collective experience argue that children, particularly school-aged children, are far less important drivers of SARS-CoV-2 transmission than adults. Therefore, serious consideration should be paid toward strategies that allow schools to remain open, even during periods of COVID-19 spread. In doing so, we could minimize the potentially profound adverse social, developmental, and health costs that our children will continue to suffer until an effective treatment or vaccine can be developed and distributed or, failing that, until we reach herd immunity.^{16,17}

ABBREVIATIONS

COVID-19: coronavirus disease
HHC: household contact
SARS-CoV-2: severe acute
respiratory
syndrome
coronavirus 2

REFERENCES

1. CDC COVID-19 Response Team. Coronavirus disease 2019 in children - United States, February 12–April 2, 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep*. 2020;69(14):422–426
2. Dong Y, Mo X, Hu Y, et al. Epidemiology of COVID-19 among children in China. *Pediatrics*. 2020;145(6):20200702e
3. Wu Z, McGoogan JM. Characteristics of and important lessons from the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) outbreak in China: summary of a report of 72 314 cases from the Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention. *JAMA*. 2020;323(13):1239–1242
4. Riphagen S, Gomez X, Gonzalez-Martinez C, Wilkinson N, Theocharis P. Hyperinflammatory shock in children during COVID-19 pandemic. *Lancet*. 2020;395(10237):1607–1608
5. Verdoni L, Mazza A, Gervasoni A, et al. An outbreak of severe Kawasaki-like disease at the Italian epicentre of the

- SARS-CoV-2 epidemic: an observational cohort study [published online ahead of print May 13, 2020]. *Lancet*. 2020. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31103-X
6. Posfay-Barbe K, Wagner N, Gauthey M, et al. COVID-19 in children and the dynamics of infection in families. *Pediatrics*. 2020;146(2):e20201576
7. Wu Q, Xing Y, Shi L, et al. Co-infection and other clinical characteristics of COVID-19 in children. *Pediatrics*. 2020;146(1):e20200961
8. Cai J, Xu J, Lin D, et al. A case series of children with 2019 novel coronavirus infection: clinical and epidemiological features [published online ahead of print February 28, 2020]. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa198
9. Danis K, Epaulard O, Bénét T, et al; Investigation Team. Cluster of coronavirus disease 2019 (Covid-19) in the French Alps, February 2020 [published online ahead of print April 11, 2020]. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa424
10. National Centre for Immunisation Research and Surveillance. *COVID-19 in Schools - The Experience in NSW*. New South Wales, Australia: National Centre for Immunisation Research and Surveillance; 2020
11. Cauchemez S, Valleron A, Boëlle P, Flahault A, Ferguson N. Estimating the impact of school closure on influenza transmission from Sentinel data. *Nature*. 2008;452(7188):750–754
12. Litvinova M, Liu Q, Kulikov E, Ajelli M. Reactive school closure weakens the network of social interactions and reduces the spread of influenza. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*. 2019;116(27):13174–13181
13. Zhang J, Litvinova M, Liang Y, et al. Changes in contact patterns shape the dynamics of the COVID-19 outbreak in China [published online ahead of print April 29, 2020]. *Science*. 2020. doi:10.1126/science.abb8001
14. Ferguson N, Laydon D, Nedjati-Gilani G, et al. Impact of Non-Pharmaceutical Interventions (NPIs) to Reduce COVID-19 Mortality and Healthcare Demand. London, United Kingdom: Imperial College London; 2020
15. Jones TC, Muhlemann B, Veith T, et al. An analysis of SARS-CoV-2 viral load by patient age. Research network zoonotic infectious diseases. 2020. Available at: https://zoonosen.charite.de/fileadmin/user_upload/microsites/m_cc05/virologie-ccm/dateien_upload/Weitere_

Dateien/analysis-of-SARS-CoV-2-viral-load-by-patient-age.pdf. Accessed April 30, 2020

16. Christakis D. School reopening-the pandemic issue that is not getting its due [published online ahead of print

May 13, 2020]. *JAMA Pediatr*. 2020. doi: 10.1001/jamapediatrics.2020.2068

17. Esposito S, Principi N. School closure during the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic: an

effective intervention at the global level? [published online ahead of print May 13, 2020]. *JAMA Pediatr*. 2020. doi:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2020.1892