Evolution of faint radio sources in the VIDEO-XMM3 field

K. McAlpine,1* M. J. Jarvis1,2 and D. G. Bonfield3

1Department of Physics, University of the Western Cape, Private Bag X17, Bellville 7537, South Africa
2Department of Physics, University of Oxford, Denys Wilkinson Building, Keble Road, Oxford OX1 3RH, UK
3School of Physics, Astronomy and Mathematics, University of Hertfordshire, College Lane, Hatfield AL10 9AB, UK

Accepted 2013 August 27. Received 2013 August 5; in original form 2013 May 27

ABSTRACT
It has been speculated that low-luminosity radio-loud active galactic nuclei (AGN) have the potential to serve as an important source of AGN feedback, and may be responsible for suppressing star formation activity in massive elliptical galaxies at late times. As such the cosmic evolution of these sources is vitally important to understand the significance of such AGN feedback processes and their influence on the global star formation history of the Universe.

In this paper, we present a new investigation of the evolution of faint radio sources out to \(z \sim 2.5\). We combine a 1 square degree Very Large Array radio survey, complete to a depth of 100 \(\mu\)Jy, with accurate 10 band photometric redshifts from the following surveys: Visible and Infrared Survey Telescope for Astronomy Deep Extragalactic Observations and Canada–France–Hawaii Telescope Legacy Survey. The results indicate that the radio population experiences mild positive evolution out to \(z \sim 1.2\) increasing their space density by a factor of \(~3\), consistent with results of several previous studies. Beyond \(z \sim 1.2\), there is evidence of a slowing down of this evolution. Star-forming galaxies drive the more rapid evolution at low redshifts, \(z < 1.2\), while more slowly evolving AGN populations dominate at higher redshifts resulting in a decline in the evolution of the radio luminosity function at \(z > 1.2\). The evolution is best fitted by pure luminosity evolution with star-forming galaxies evolving as \((1 + z)^{2.47 \pm 0.12}\) and AGN as \((1 + z)^{1.18 \pm 0.21}\).

Key words: galaxies: active – galaxies: evolution – radio continuum: galaxies.

1 INTRODUCTION
The study of the evolution of faint radio sources has taken on new significance in recent years due to the realization that active galactic nuclei (AGN) play an important role in shaping the star formation properties of the galaxies they inhabit (for a review see Cattaneo et al. 2009). As it is now believed that every galaxy harbours a central supermassive black hole, this interplay between AGN accretion and star formation, as well as the cosmic evolution of AGN, have become vitally important to the process of understanding galaxy formation and evolution. Evidence which point to a link between these processes include the tight correlations found between black hole mass and both stellar bulge mass (Kormendy & Richstone 1995; Magorrian et al. 1998; McLure & Dunlop 2002) and velocity dispersion (Ferrarese & Merritt 2000; Gebhardt et al. 2000; Tremaine et al. 2002) in galaxies in the local universe. While on cosmological scales the increase in star formation density at higher redshifts is accompanied by a corresponding increase in the number density of actively accreting supermassive black holes (Merloni, Rudnick & Di Matteo 2007). Furthermore, incorporating AGN ‘feedback’ in semi-analytic models of galaxy formation produces galaxies whose predicted properties are in better agreement with observations (Bower et al. 2006; Croton et al. 2006) particularly at the bright end of the luminosity function (LF). Despite these promising indications many open questions remain about the nature and significance of such postulated AGN ‘feedback’ processes and how they proceed as a function of cosmic time.

At \(\mu\)Jy levels, radio surveys become increasingly dominated by star-forming galaxies and low-luminosity AGN (e.g. Simpson et al. 2006; Seymour et al. 2007; Huyyn et al. 2008; Smolčić et al. 2008; Padovani et al. 2009). As radio waves are unaffected by dust extinction, future deep radio surveys can overcome many of the selection biases present in optical and X-ray surveys and offer new insights into the coevolution of these populations out to high redshifts.

Efforts to clarify the nature of the \(\mu\)Jy radio population have already revealed that its composition is more complex than previously believed. It has become widely accepted that radio-loud AGN are in fact powered by two fundamentally different modes of accretion (e.g. Evans et al. 2006; Hardcastle, Evans & Croston 2007). The most powerful radio-loud AGN are typically powered by radiatively efficient accretion of cold gas on to a geometrically thin, optically thick accretion disc (e.g. Novikov & Thorne...
1973; Shakura & Sunyaev 1973). This type of accretion powers optical- and X-ray-selected quasars and produces high-excitation emission lines in the host galaxy spectra. Consequently, radio sources powered by this mode of accretion are referred to as high-excitation radio galaxies (HERGs). Low-luminosity AGN are more frequently powered by radiatively inefficient (Best & Heckman 2012) accretion of warm gas (Hardcastle et al. 2007) from the intergalactic medium on to a geometrically thick accretion disc. These low-excitation radio galaxies (LERGs) do not exhibit accretion related X-ray emission (Hardcastle, Evans & Croston 2006) or mid-infrared emission from an obscuring nuclear torus (Ogle, Whysong & Antonucci 2006), which is postulated to hide this X-ray emission from view at certain orientations in quasars (Urry & Padovani 1995). Following the terminology of Croton et al. (2006), these two modes of accretion are referred to as ‘quasar’ and ‘radio’ modes, respectively. While LERGs and HERGs are present at all luminosities, LERGs are more prevalent at low radio luminosities with HERGs becoming the dominant population at luminosities $>10^{26}$ W Hz$^{-1}$ (Hardcastle, Evans & Croston 2009; Herbert et al. 2010, 2011; Best & Heckman 2012; Hardcastle et al. 2013).

Further complications arise from the discovery that in addition to star-forming galaxies and radio-loud AGN, the μJy radio population also contains a significant contribution from sources that traditionally were classified as radio-quiet AGN (Jarvis & Rawlings 2004; Simpson et al. 2006; Wilman et al. 2008; Padovani et al. 2009; Wilman et al. 2010), where the radio emission is much fainter than typical for radio loud AGN, i.e. in the case of quasars. They exhibit a radio-to-optical light ratio $<10$ (see e.g. Kellermann et al. 1989) and are powered by a radiatively efficient accretion mode similar to that in HERGs. Currently, the contribution from radio-quiet AGN is estimated to be in the region of 25 per cent (Padovani et al. 2009).

Both modes of AGN accretion have a postulated associated mechanism of feedback which results in star formation quenching in the host galaxy. In the radiatively efficient ‘quasar’ accretion mode, feedback occurs as a result of quasar-driven winds which systematically remove gas from the galaxy; star formation and accretion activity terminate abruptly as this process depletes their local fuel supply (Silk & Rees 1998; Di Matteo, Springel & Hernquist 2005; Cattaneo et al. 2009).

In the radiatively inefficient ‘radio’ accretion mode, the bulk of the energy from the AGN is emitted as kinetic energy in jets, with very little radiative output from a central accretion disc (Merloni & Heinz 2007). These sources accrete at much lower rates and consequently the total energy output from these AGN is lower than in the radiatively efficient case. However, depending on how efficiently the kinetic energy in the jets is converted to heat in the interstellar gas, these AGN may still have considerable potential to influence the star formation properties of the galaxies they inhabit as well as their larger scale environments (e.g. McNamara et al. 2000; Birzan et al. 2004). Using a scaling relationship between radio luminosity and mechanical heating powers derived from cluster observations, Best et al. (2006) demonstrated that the time-averaged energetic output of ‘radio’-mode accretors was indeed sufficient to counter cooling losses in massive, red galaxies. In this mode, the AGN is fuelled by direct accretion of the hot interstellar gas and is also the source of gas heating. As such AGN feedback in this mode has the potential to set up a stable feedback loop where the accretion rate is automatically adjusted by the available supply of hot gas (Allen et al. 2006; Best et al. 2006; Hardcastle et al. 2007).

A key piece of evidence in determining the relative significance of both types of AGN feedback is an accurate determination of the cosmic evolution of the radio sources whose jets are speculated to be enormously influential via this ‘radio’-mode accretion. It is already well established that powerful radio AGN undergo very rapid evolution with their number densities increasing by a factor of $\sim$1000 to redshifts of $\sim$2 (Longair 1966; Laing, Riley & Longair 1983; Dunlop & Peacock 1990; Wilott et al. 2001), with evidence of a decline in their number density taking place beyond $z \sim 3$ (Jarvis & Rawlings 2000; Jarvis et al. 2001; Wall et al. 2005; Rigby et al. 2011). While current studies of the lower luminosity, predominantly LERG, radio population indicate that they experience much milder positive evolution, with density enhancements of the order 2–10 out to $z \sim 1.2$ (Clewley & Jarvis 2004; Sadler et al. 2007; Donoso, Best & Kauffmann 2009; Smolčić et al. 2009b; Strazzullo et al. 2010; McAlpine & Jarvis 2011; Padovani et al. 2011). Recent work by Best & Heckman (2012) suggests that the observed mild evolution at low radio luminosities may be primarily driven by the evolution of a small number low-luminosity HERGs. They find that LERG populations experience little or no evolution out to $z \sim 0.3$, while HERGs are strongly evolving at all luminosities, but only contribute a small fraction of the low-luminosity radio population.

A further division in evolutionary behaviour has been observed between radio-quiet and radio-loud AGN. Studies by Padovani et al. (2009) and Simpson et al. (2012) find very little evidence of evolution in the low-luminosity radio-loud sources and evidence for stronger evolution in the radio-loud AGN. This possibly provides further evidence of a link between the radio-quiet AGN and the HERG sources which are believed to be powered by the same radiatively efficient accretion mode and may suggest that it is these ‘quasar’-mode accretors which undergo the strongest evolution.

This paper presents a new investigation of the evolution of low-luminosity radio sources out to $z \sim 2.5$. Details of the radio observations and multiband photometry used in this study are presented in Sections 2 and 3. The cross matching procedure is outlined in Section 4. A description of the photometric redshifts used to construct the radio LF is presented in Sections 5. While Section 6 presents our results, and our conclusion and discussion are presented in Section 7. We use AB magnitudes throughout this paper and assume a cosmology of $H_0 = 70$ km s$^{-1}$ Mpc$^{-1}$, $\Omega_m = 0.3$ and $\Omega_{\Lambda} = 0.7$.

## 2 RADIO DATA

This work utilizes the radio survey completed by Bondi et al. (2003) using the Very Large Array (VLA). These observations cover 1 square degree centred at $\alpha(J2000) = 2^{h}26^{m}00^{s}$ and $\delta(J2000) = -4^\circ30'00''$ with nine pointings. They were taken in the VLA B-configuration and have a full width at half-maximum synthesized beamwidth of approximately 6 arcsec, while the final mosaicked image has a background rms noise level of $\sim17$ μJy.

A catalogue of 1054 radio sources whose peak fluxes exceed 60 μJy was extracted from the mosaicked image using the Astronomical Image Processing Software (AIPS) Search and Destroy task. To minimize the contribution of spurious sources to the final catalogue, sources were retained as real detections only if their peak flux to local noise ratios is $>5$. Multiple component radio sources are identified in the image by assuming that their components meet the following three criteria, they are separated by $<18$ arcsec, have peak flux ratios $<3$ and all components have a peak flux $>0.4$ mJy beam$^{-1}$, only 19 multiple component sources are identified in the field. Further details of the calibration, catalogue extraction and multicomponent classification procedures are outlined in Bondi et al. (2003).

Further observations of this field were performed by Bondi et al. (2007) using the Giant Metrewave Radio Telescope (GMRT) at
610 MHz. The GMRT observations covered the whole square degree of interest with five pointings observed for \(\sim 5.5 \) h each, resulting in a 5\( \sigma \) limiting flux density of \(\sim 200 \) \(\mu\)Jy. These GMRT observations were used to obtain spectral index estimates of the VLA radio sources after matching within a 3 arcsec tolerance. Throughout this paper, wherever a spectral index estimate is required, e.g. in the case of determining radio luminosities, we use the estimates from Bondi et al. (2007). For the 269 sources not detected by the GMRT at 610 MHz, we assume a standard spectral index of \(\alpha = -0.7\).

\section{MULTIBAND PHOTOMETRY}

The square degree of VLA radio observations has been observed with the VISTA Deep Extragalactic Observations (VIDEO; Jarvis et al. 2013) survey. The VIDEO survey is a 12 square degree survey over three fields with the Visible and Infrared Survey Telescope for Astronomy (VISTA) whose objective is to study the formation and evolution of galaxies and galaxy clusters from the present day to \(z \sim 4\). The survey provides photometry in the \(\mathcal{Z}, Y, J, H\) and \(\mathcal{K}_\text{s}\) bands to 5\(\sigma\) depths (2 arcsec apertures) of 25.7, 24.6, 24.5, 24.0 and 23.5 mag, respectively. This field also coincides with the Canada–France–Hawaii Telescope Legacy Survey D1 field (CFHTLS D1; Ilbert et al. 2006) which provides additional photometry in the \(i^\prime, g^\prime, r^\prime, i^\prime, z^\prime\) optical bands to depths of 26.5, 26.4, 26.1, 25.9 and 25.0.

\section{CROSS-MATCHING}

Single component radio sources were matched to their infrared counterparts using the likelihood ratio (LR) technique (de Ruiter, Arp & Willis 1977; Sutherland & Saunders 1992; Ciliegi et al. 2003). The LR technique is a commonly used method to associate low-resolution radio observations with higher resolution optical or infrared observations. In brief, it calculates the ratio of the probability that a given source and counterpart are related to the probability that they are unrelated. This probability takes into account the positional accuracy of the near-infrared and radio observations as well as the magnitude distributions of the background infrared sources and the radio source counterparts. Full details of the cross-matching procedure between the VIDEO survey and the Bondi et al. (2003) VLA observations are discussed in McAlpine et al. (2012).

The procedure resulted in a cross-matched catalogue of 942 radio sources whose counterparts are brighter than \(\mathcal{K}_\text{s} \sim 23.8\). This represents a completeness of 91.0 per cent, the percentage of misidentified counterparts in this catalogue is predicted to be very low at the level of \(\sim 0.8\) per cent.

Multiple component radio sources were associated with their counterparts via visual inspection. These sources are less suited to the LR method used for single component sources as the likely position of the counterpart source and the associated errors on this position are poorly constrained. There are 19 multiple sources in this field and only nine of these were associated with an infrared counterpart.

\section{PHOTOMETRIC REDSHIFTS}

Photometric redshifts for the combined VIDEO and CFHTLS data sets have been determined using the publicly available code \texttt{LE PHARE} (Ilbert et al. 2006). This code derives photometric redshifts via a spectral energy distribution (SED) fitting method. It operates by shifting a set of input template SEDs, assumed to be representative of the true SED profiles of the observed sources, to a range of redshifts and fitting these to the observed photometry. The redshift of the best-fitting template is then adopted as the best photometric redshift estimate.

The accuracy of the photometric redshifts was assessed by comparing with spectroscopic redshifts in the Visible MultiObject Spectrograph (VIMOS) Very Large Telescope (VLT) Deep Survey (VVDS; Le Fèvre et al. 2005), which is a deep spectroscopic survey limited to \(I_{\text{AB}} \sim 24.0\). Comparing to sources with very secure spectroscopic redshifts and excluding sources identified as quasars, the sample has a normalized median absolute deviation (NMAD) in \(\Delta z = |z_{\text{phot}} - z_{\text{spec}}|\) of \(\sigma \sim 0.025\), where \(z_{\text{spec}}\) are the spectroscopic redshifts for the 73 sources identified as quasars in the VVDS survey. These were classified as quasars due to the presence of broad emission-line features in their spectra. Only sources with secure redshifts were retained for comparison. There is a clearly discernible threshold in Fig. 1, at \(z_{\text{phot}} = 0.22\), below which the photometric redshifts are unreliable. Reassuringly, the photometric redshifts of the remaining objects appear to be well correlated with spectroscopic redshift, although there is a larger spread in \(\sigma\) than for the general galaxy population. This quasar sample has an NMAD in \(\Delta z = |z_{\text{phot}} - z_{\text{spec}}|\) of \(\sigma \sim 0.10\), and \(\sim 7.3\) per cent of the sample are catastrophic outliers with \(\Delta z = |z_{\text{phot}} - z_{\text{spec}}| > 5\sigma\).

As Fig. 1 indicates that quasars with \(z_{\text{phot}} < 0.22\) may be unreliable, we attempted to identify such potentially problematic sources

\footnote{\url{http://www.cfht.hawaii.edu/~arnouts/LEPHARE/lephare.html}}
Evolution of faint radio sources

1087

Figure 1. Photometric versus spectroscopic redshifts for objects identified as quasars in the VVDS. The sample has an NMAD in \( \Delta z_{\text{spec}} \) of \( \sigma = 0.10 \) and approximately 7.3 per cent of the objects are 5\( \sigma \) outliers. Photometric redshifts below the \( z_{\text{thresh}} \) level, plotted as a dashed line, are clearly not reliable. Dotted lines are plotted at 1\( \sigma \). The error bars represent the 1\( \sigma \) errors derived from distribution of \( \chi^2 \) values as a function of \( z \) as described in Section 5.3.

in our sample. Candidate quasars were identified based on their SExtractor (Bertin & Arnouts 1996) CLASS_STAR parameter which provides a measure of how well resolved an object is in the infrared images. A criteria of CLASS_STAR > 0.8 identified 78 potential quasars in the VLA survey and eight of these have photometric redshifts of \(<0.22\). To determine the effect of these potentially poor redshift estimates on our conclusions, we calculate the radio luminosity function (RLF) in Section 6 both including and excluding these eight sources and find the results of our analysis to be unchanged.

5.2 Redshift distribution

The redshift distribution of all radio sources with counterparts in the VIDEO survey is presented in Fig. 2. Objects with spectroscopic redshifts in the VVDS survey are plotted in black. A notable feature of this plot is a large peak in the distribution at redshifts of \( z \sim 0.2–0.4 \). The origin of this peak is unclear as there are no corresponding large peaks in the redshift distribution of the full VIDEO infrared catalogue. Objects with poor photometric redshift estimates in the VIDEO survey were found to be preferentially associated with bluer colours (Jarvis et al. 2013). To determine whether the large peak at \( z \sim 0.2–0.4 \) could be caused by a failure in the photometric redshift estimation process, we compare the colour distribution of radio sources with \( 0.2 < z_{\text{phot}} < 0.4 \) to the colour distribution of near-infrared sources whose \( \Delta z_{\text{spec}} > 0.15 \). It is clear from Fig. 3 that the low-redshift radio sources do not occupy the bluer region of the \( g - i \), \( J - K \) colour diagram associated with poor-redshift estimates, tending to suggest that these estimates are reasonably reliable and the observed peak is a real feature of the radio sources in this field. There is also a small peak visible in the spectroscopic redshifts in Fig. 2 at \( z \sim 0.2–0.4 \) that adds weight to our assertion that the photometric redshifts are reliable.

The feature at \( z \sim 0.2–0.4 \) could plausibly be due to large-scale structure within this relatively small field. We note that there are six known X-ray clusters at \( z = 0.262, 0.266, 0.293, 0.301, 0.307 \) and 0.345 (Pacaud et al. 2007; Adami et al. 2011) in this field which are at least partially responsible for an increase in the galaxy density within this redshift range. However, we also note that we expect there to be an overdensity of radio sources around this redshift range due to the fact that star-forming galaxies can be detected to \( z \sim 0.4 \) in our radio data, whereas beyond this redshift the radio source population becomes dominated by AGN, as is apparent from the Square Kilometer Array Design Studies (SKADS) simulations shown in Fig. 2.

5.3 Photometric redshift errors

Comparison with spectroscopic redshifts provides an important characterization of the variance and fraction of failures in the photometric redshift estimates; however, this process cannot be used to identify the photometric redshifts in the full sample which are most likely to be unreliable. Extra information regarding the reliability of individual redshift estimates can be extracted by considering whether the fitting procedure used to produce it was well
constrained by the available photometry or not. A measure of the uncertainty in the photometric redshift estimate can thus be obtained directly from the $\chi^2$ distribution obtained when fitting the template to the observed photometry. A redshift probability density function (PDFz) is constructed from the $\chi^2$ values as PDFz $\propto \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\chi^2\right)$.

The 1σ confidence intervals are predicted by determining the redshifts corresponding to an increment in the $\chi^2$ value of $\Delta \chi^2 = 1$, while 3σ errors are determined at $\Delta \chi^2 = 9$.

Errors produced by this method do not account for intrinsic uncertainties in the photometry not included in the measured photometric errors such as those caused by blending or the presence of bright neighbours, nor can they account for inadequacies in the input template library. They are nevertheless useful indicators of reliability in the absence of spectroscopic data, and Ilbert et al. (2006) demonstrated that 68 and 92 per cent of the spectroscopic redshifts are located within the 1σ and 3σ errors, respectively. Fig. 4 presents the errors estimated from the $\chi^2$ fitting for the radio sources in this sample. This figure demonstrates that the uncertainty in the fitting procedure, and consequently the redshift estimates, increases significantly towards higher redshifts. This is to be expected due to the larger errors on faint photometry towards high-redshift objects as well as the possibility that the locally observed, empirical templates used in the SED-fitting procedure are not sufficiently representative of these high-redshift objects. These larger errors towards higher redshifts are accounted for in our determination of the RLF via Monte Carlo simulations which account for the probability distribution in $z_{\text{phot}}$ for each radio source.

Figure 4. The 1σ errors on photometric redshift estimates as a function of redshift.

6 RADIO LUMINOSITY FUNCTION

We determine the RLF for the full population of radio sources in six redshift bins using the standard $\frac{\pi}{\Omega}$ method (Schmidt 1968). Inclusion in the final cross-matched sample depends on the source exceeding the flux limits of both the radio and near-infrared surveys; thus, the final maximum observable redshift $z_{\text{max}}$ is calculated as $\min(z_{\text{radio}}, z_{\text{IR}})$, where $z_{\text{radio}}$ and $z_{\text{IR}}$ represent the maximum observable redshifts of the source in the radio and infrared surveys, respectively. We estimate the maximum $z_{\text{IR}}$ by redshifting the best-fitting SED template from the photometric redshift estimation procedure and determine the redshift where the template becomes fainter than our imposed magnitude limit of $K_s = 23.8$. Similarly, for the radio sources, we estimate their intrinsic luminosity assuming the standard spectral index based $k$-correction and determine the redshift at which they drop below the VLA survey flux limit.

Fig. 5 presents the RLF in six redshift bins in the interval $z = 0–2.5$, the error bars in the plot incorporate both the errors due to the sample size per bin as well as the uncertainties in the photometric redshift estimates. The latter were estimated using Monte Carlo simulations by constructing 1000 possible realizations of the PDFz of the photometric redshifts, calculating the RLF for each of the realizations and determining the median and standard deviation of these simulated RLFs. Including the effects of uncertainty in the photometric redshifts is particularly relevant in the high-redshift bins as Fig. 4 indicates that these errors increase substantially at $z > 1.4$. In order to account for sample variance in a field of 1 square degree, we determine the variance in the number of sources $>100$ Jy in 100 1 square degree fields in the SKADS simulations (Wilman et al. 2008, 2010; see also Heywood, Jarvis & Condon 2013). This variance was determined for each of the redshift bins considered in Fig. 5 and added in quadrature to the errors due to photometric redshift uncertainties. The calculated variances are reported in Table 1.

Table 1. The variance on the number of radio sources above 100 Jy in a 1 square degree field as function of redshift, determined from the SKADS simulations (Wilman et al. 2008, 2010).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>$z$</th>
<th>($\sigma$ per cent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.1–0.35</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.35–0.6</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.6–0.9</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.9–1.2</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2–1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8–2.5</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5. RLF in six redshift bins to $z \sim 2.5$. The error bars incorporate the uncertainty in photometric redshifts, estimated via Monte Carlo simulations. The dashed yellow line represents the change in the RLF which occurs at the highest redshifts assuming that the unmatched radio sources in the VIDEO survey have a redshift distribution similar to the faintest sources, $K_s > 23.5$, in the SXDF (Simpson et al. 2012) field. The solid black line represents the local LF of Mauch & Sadler (2007) with the contribution of star-forming galaxies and AGN represented by the dotted and dashed lines, respectively.
The RLF in this work is compared to the local RLF determined by Mauch & Sadler (2007) using NRAO VLA Sky Survey (NVSS; Condon et al. 1998) radio sources with spectroscopic redshifts from the 6 degree Field Galaxy Redshift Survey (Jones et al. 2004). The Mauch & Sadler (2007) LF is constructed from separate fits to the LF of star-forming galaxies and AGN, and the individual contributions of these two populations are plotted as dotted and dashed lines in Fig. 5, respectively. It is clear that the local RLF is dominated by star-forming galaxies and AGN contributions at low and high luminosities, respectively, with the division falling at roughly \(10^{23}\) W Hz\(^{-1}\). There is a large discrepancy between the VLA-VIDEO local RLF determined in this work and that of the Mauch & Sadler (2007) star-forming galaxy LF at low luminosities (reduced \(\chi^2 = 5.9\)). This discrepancy is probably caused by the large concentration of objects in the VLA-VIDEO survey in the range \(z \sim 0.2-0.4\) (see Fig. 2), which can easily be explained by sample variance at these low redshifts, where our volume is relatively small. The absence of higher luminosity radio sources in the lowest redshift bin, due to the small sky area, precludes us from making a direct comparison with the local AGN LF.

### 6.1 Evolution of combined star-forming and AGN population

Fig. 5 appears consistent with a fairly rapid increase in the space density of radio galaxies up to redshifts of \(z \sim 1.2\), with hints of a possible slowing down of this process between redshifts \(z = 1.2-2.5\). To quantify these broad evolutionary trends, we initially use models of both pure density and pure luminosity evolution of the combined star-forming and AGN RLF, such that:

\[
\Phi_{\text{PDE}}(z) = (1 + z)^{\alpha_{\text{SF}}}(\Phi_{\text{SF}} + \Phi_{\text{AGN}}) \tag{1}
\]

\[
\Phi_{\text{PLE}}(z) = \Phi_{\text{SF}} \left(\frac{L}{(1+z)^{\alpha_{\text{SF}}}}\right) + \Phi_{\text{AGN}} \left(\frac{L}{(1+z)^{\alpha_{\text{AGN}}}}\right), \tag{2}
\]

where \(\Phi_{\text{SF}}\) and \(\Phi_{\text{AGN}}\) are the star-forming and AGN LF of Mauch & Sadler (2007), respectively. \(\Phi_{\text{PDE}}(z)\) and \(\Phi_{\text{PLE}}(z)\) are the evolved LF at redshift \(z\) assuming pure density and pure luminosity evolution, respectively. Such models are clearly limited in their ability to accurately represent the behaviour of the three sub-classes of potentially independently evolving radio sources present in the sub-mJy VLA-VIDEO sample. The parametrization simply provides a convenient means to quantify the overall strength and sense of the evolution taking place at different cosmic times.

Based on the tentative evidence in Fig. 5 that the evolutionary behaviour of these sources changes at a redshift of \(\sim 1.2\), we fitted six possible evolutionary scenarios to the data, the first is a pure density evolution model with a single \(\alpha_{d}\) parameter for the entire redshift range from \(z \sim 0-2.5\). The second is of pure density evolution out to a redshift of \(z = 1.0\) and no further evolution taking place beyond this and the third fits independent pure density evolution parameters \(\alpha_{d1}\) and \(\alpha_{d2}\) in the redshift \(z \sim 0-1.2\) and 1.2-2.5 ranges. We repeat the fitting procedure for these three scenarios assuming pure luminosity evolution. To avoid the fit being biased by the large discrepancy between the VLA-VIDEO RLF and the Mauch & Sadler (2007) RLF at low redshifts, we excluded the \(z < 0.35\) points from the fit.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>(\alpha_{d1})</th>
<th>(\alpha_{d2})</th>
<th>(\chi^2)</th>
<th>Reduced (\chi^2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PDE Model 1</td>
<td>1.28 ± 0.88</td>
<td></td>
<td>34.61</td>
<td>1.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDE Model 2</td>
<td>1.53 ± 0.11</td>
<td>0 ± 0</td>
<td>36.48</td>
<td>1.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDE Model 3</td>
<td>1.38 ± 0.17</td>
<td>0.23 ± 0.16</td>
<td>33.63</td>
<td>1.46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recent results from Simpson et al. (2012) identified tentative evidence of a decline in the RLF of radio sources at redshifts \(>1.5\) in the luminosity range \(10^{24} - 10^{25.5}\) W Hz\(^{-1}\) (see their fig. 11); however, the VLA-VIDEO RLF consistently increases with redshifts even beyond \(z \sim 1.2\). Rigby et al. (2011) also identify a luminosity-dependent turnover in the LF, with lower luminosity objects experiencing a decline in their number densities at lower redshifts than their high-luminosity counterparts. Their results imply a turnover at \(z > 0.7\) for objects with luminosities in the \(10^{25} - 10^{26}\) W Hz\(^{-1}\) range, which is at a slightly lower redshift than seen in the VIDEO-VLA RLF. The points in Fig. 5 do not betray any hint of such a luminosity-dependent effect. However, the use of a single flux-density limited sample restricts our investigation to a narrow luminosity range in each redshift bin hampering any attempt to confirm this.

### 6.2 Evolution of separate star-forming and AGN populations

AGN and star-forming populations may evolve independently from one another and there is some evidence that low-luminosity AGN evolve more slowly than star-forming galaxies up to \(z \sim 1.2\) (e.g. Smolčić et al. 2009a,b). Fig. 5 indicates that at low redshifts, we are primarily probing luminosities dominated by star-forming galaxies, whereas at higher redshifts, the radio source population is dominated by contributions from AGN. Thus, the observed decline in the evolution of the LF towards higher redshifts (\(z > 1.2\)) could be explained if the AGN population evolved more slowly than the star-forming galaxies in the \(z <1.2\) interval. To further investigate the separate contributions of star-forming galaxies and AGN to the evolution of the total RLF, we fit a two component model of pure density and pure luminosity evolution. This model allowed the star-forming and AGN populations to evolve independently such that:

\[
\Phi_{\text{PDE}}(z) = (1 + z)^{\alpha_{\text{AGN}}} \Phi_{\text{AGN}} + (1 + z)^{\alpha_{\text{SF}}} \Phi_{\text{SF}} \tag{3}
\]

\(\sim 3\) over the local values. The independent \(\alpha_{\text{SF}}\) and \(\alpha_{\text{AGN}}\) determined in model 3 imply an increase in space density towards earlier cosmic times but are also consistent with the scenario of no evolution beyond \(z \sim 1.2\) (within 2\(\sigma\)). A constant positive evolution across the entire redshift range provides a better fit to the data in the pure density evolution case, while a slower evolution beyond \(z \sim 1.2\) is a better fit for pure luminosity evolution.

Recent results from Simpson et al. (2012) identified tentative evidence of a decline in the RLF of radio sources at redshifts >1.5 in the luminosity range \(10^{24} - 10^{25.5}\) W Hz\(^{-1}\) (see their fig. 11); however, the VLA-VIDEO RLF consistently increases with redshifts even beyond \(z \sim 1.2\). Rigby et al. (2011) also identify a luminosity-dependent turnover in the LF, with lower luminosity objects experiencing a decline in their number densities at lower redshifts than their high-luminosity counterparts. Their results imply a turnover at \(z > 0.7\) for objects with luminosities in the \(10^{25} - 10^{26}\) W Hz\(^{-1}\) range, which is at a slightly lower redshift than seen in the VIDEO-VLA RLF. The points in Fig. 5 do not betray any hint of such a luminosity-dependent effect. However, the use of a single flux-density limited sample restricts our investigation to a narrow luminosity range in each redshift bin hampering any attempt to confirm this.
Figure 6. The RLF in six redshift bins to \( z \sim 2.5 \). The local LF from Mauch & Sadler (2007) is plotted as a blue solid line. The contributions from star-forming galaxies and AGN to the local RLF are plotted as black dotted and dashed lines, respectively. The green solid line represents the evolved LF of the best-fitting evolutionary scenario, namely pure luminosity evolution with \( \alpha_{l1} = 1.90 \) and \( \alpha_{l2} = 0.26 \).

Table 4. Results of fitting independently evolving star-forming and AGN LF to the RLF, both pure density evolution (PDE) and pure luminosity evolution (PLE) are considered.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SF</th>
<th>AGN</th>
<th>( \chi^2 )</th>
<th>Reduced ( \chi^2 )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PDE</td>
<td>3.50 ± 0.40</td>
<td>1.16 ± 0.09</td>
<td>24.52</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLE</td>
<td>2.47 ± 0.12</td>
<td>1.18 ± 0.21</td>
<td>20.64</td>
<td>0.89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[
\Phi_{\text{PLE}}(z) = \Phi_{\text{SF}}\left(\frac{L}{(1+z)^{\alpha_{\text{SF}}}}\right) + \Phi_{\text{AGN}}\left(\frac{L}{(1+z)^{\alpha_{\text{AGN}}}}\right).
\]

Fitting separate \( \alpha_{l} \) and \( \alpha_{d} \) values for AGN and star-forming galaxies resulted in much lower reduced \( \chi^2 \) values than the single component model in Section 6.1. The AGN population was found to evolve more slowly than the star-forming population; thus, confirming that the AGN are responsible for the slower evolution beyond \( z \sim 1.2 \) detected in the single component fit. The results of the fit are presented in Table 4, and Fig. 7 compares the best-fitting two component model with the measured RLF.

6.2.1 Template Classification

The template fitting used in Section 5 to derive photometric redshifts can be used to distinguish galaxies which are star forming from those with predominantly old stellar populations. As the low-luminosity radio AGN population is dominated by LERGs (Best & Heckman 2012) which are preferentially hosted in red passively evolving galaxies (Baldi & Capetti 2008; Herbert et al. 2010; Smolčić & Riechers 2011; Best & Heckman 2012), a template based classification scheme can be used to roughly separate the radio population into its AGN and star-forming components. The photometric redshift fitting procedure is based on templates interpolated from six observed spectra, an elliptical, two spirals and irregular galaxy as well as two observed starburst templates. We identified AGN in the radio population as sources redder than the spiral galaxy templates. The resulting AGN and star-forming RLFs, shown in Figs 8 and 9, were found to be consistent with the fit presented in Fig. 7 for these two populations out to \( z \sim 1.2 \). At higher redshifts, this agreement breaks down and a large fraction of the AGN at \( z > 1.2 \) are associated with bluer star-forming templates.

There are several possible reasons for this; fainter photometry and greater uncertainty in the level of dust-extinction towards high-redshift objects make it harder to accurately constrain their intrinsic underlying SEDs. Thus the colour classification at these redshifts may no longer be reliable. A second possibility is raised by the results of Janssen et al. (2012), who demonstrate that in the local universe a subpopulation of LERGs is hosted in blue star-forming galaxies, with these blue LERGs becoming increasingly important at higher radio powers. Thus, it is possible that the contribution of such blue LERGs increases towards higher redshifts, rendering the initial assumption that all AGN are hosted by red passive galaxies.
Evolution of faint radio sources

Figure 7. RLF in six redshift bins to z ~ 2.5. The local LF from Mauch & Sadler (2007) is plotted as a blue solid line. The contributions from star-forming galaxies and AGN to the local RLF are plotted as black dotted and dashed lines, respectively. The green solid line represents the best fit to the data when allowing the AGN and star-forming RLF to evolve independently. The best-fitting model is pure luminosity evolution with $\alpha_{\text{AGN}}^{\text{l}} = 1.18$ and $\alpha_{\text{SF}}^{\text{l}} = 2.47$. The green dotted line is the evolved RLF of star-forming galaxies and the green dashed line is the evolved RLF of AGN.

invalid. Furthermore, towards higher redshift, we are probing towards higher luminosities, increasing the contribution of HERGs which are also preferentially hosted in galaxies with bluer colours (Best & Heckman 2012).

6.3 Unmatched radio sources

We considered whether excluding the 103 radio sources without reliably identified counterparts in the VIDEO survey is likely to significantly alter the RLF calculated in this paper. We achieve this by making use of redshift information available for radio sources in the Subaru/XMM–Newton Deep field (SXDF). Simpson et al. (2012) have acquired complete redshift information (505/509 sources have redshifts) for this field by combining spectroscopic and photometric redshifts from existing deep optical and infrared photometry from Subaru (Furusawa et al. 2008) and the United Kingdom InfraRed Telescope Infrared Deep Sky Survey (Lawrence et al. 2007) Ultra Deep Survey (UDS). As the unmatched counterparts to the VIDEO VLA survey are likely to be fainter than the adopted limits of $K_s = 23.8$, we made the simplifying assumption that their redshift distribution could be approximated by that of the faintest, $K_s > 23.5$, radio sources in the SXDF field. This is unlikely to be an exact match for the redshift distribution of the unmatched radio sources which appear to be fainter than the limiting magnitude of the UDS survey used in Simpson et al. (2012), but is the most complete redshift information available at present.

The RLF calculated by including these non-identified radio sources via Monte Carlo simulations was found to be consistent with the RLF presented in Fig. 5 in all but the highest redshift bin. At the highest redshifts, the LF increases slightly when incorporating the unmatched sources, this slight increase is indicated by the dashed yellow line in Fig. 5. Thus, including the unmatched sources results in stronger evolution being measured for AGN in the two component fit and stronger evolution at $z > 1.2$ for the combined RLF in the single component fit. The fitted values remain consistent with those reported in Table 4 within the errors.

7 CONCLUSIONS

This paper has presented a new determination of the RLF for the VLA-VIDEO survey field using reliably identified sources with $\sim 10$ band photometric redshifts out to $z \sim 2.5$. The LF broadly implies an increase in the space density of low-luminosity ($< 10^{26}$ W Hz$^{-1}$) radio sources by a factor of $\sim 3$ in the $z = 0$–1.2 range and is consistent with slightly slower evolution out to $z \sim 2.5$. Star-forming galaxies appear to drive the stronger evolution at $z < 1.2$, while at higher redshifts low-luminosity AGN dominate the sample, and their relatively weaker evolution results in the observed slowing down of the evolution of the RLF at $1.2 < z < 2.5$.

Interpreting and comparing these results to previous studies is complicated as the radio population at these lower flux densities contains contributions from radio-loud and radio-quiet AGN as well
as star-forming galaxies, and these populations may all evolve independently. Previous investigations by Clewley & Jarvis (2004), Sadler et al. (2007) and Donoso et al. (2009) of large samples of bright NVSS and Faint Images of the Radio Sky at Twenty-centimeters radio samples, with flux limits of a few mJy, imply that the low-luminosity population \(<10^{25}\) W Hz\(^{-1}\) increases by a factor of \(\sim 2\) in the \(z = 0–0.55\) range. These studies also found evidence that the strength of the evolution taking place increases towards higher luminosities. Further support of a luminosity-dependent behaviour was presented in Rigby, Best & Snellen (2008), who found slightly stronger positive evolution for a smaller, fainter sample of Fanaroff-Riley I (FRI; Fanaroff & Riley 1974) objects to redshift \(\sim 1\). Their results imply density enhancements of \(\sim 5–9\) for sources brighter than the \(10^{25}\) W Hz\(^{-1}\) threshold. As this work used morphologically identified FRI candidates, their sample is free from contamination from star-forming galaxies and these three studies should be primarily sensitive to evolution taking place in radio-loud AGN. The evolution found for AGN in the VIDEO field is slightly less than that found by Sadler et al. (2007) and Rigby et al. (2008), but similar to levels detected by Donoso et al. (2009); however, these works all probe the AGN evolution at low redshifts where the constraints on the AGN in our study are primarily at \(0.9 < z < 2.5\).

There have also been several characterizations of the evolution of radio sources using very deep surveys over smaller fields, these utilize a variety of criteria to separate contributions from the different underlying populations present at fainter flux densities. Their results are thus affected by uncertainties in the completeness and contamination produced by the specific classification method employed in each case, and the use of different classification methods on a per study basis also complicates attempts to make direct comparisons between them. A summary of the results of these deeper narrower studies, which probe the LF over a similar redshift range as the VIDEO study in this thesis, is presented in Table 5. These works include the Smolčić et al. (2009a,b) studies of the Cosmological Evolution Survey (COSMOS) field which uses a colour-based separation criteria developed from the Baldwin-Phillips-Terlevich (Baldwin, Phillips & Terlevich 1981) diagram to identify AGN and star-forming galaxies. Their results found pure luminosity evolution with \(L^\alpha (1+z)^\delta\) for AGN and slightly stronger evolution in star-forming galaxies with \(\alpha L \sim 2.1\), with no separate classification for radio-quiet AGN. Their results for both AGN and star-forming galaxies thus agree reasonably well with ours, with only slightly less evolution found for the AGN population.

In the Spitzer Wide-area InfraRed Extragalactic (SWIRE; Lonsdale et al. 2004) survey, Strazzullo et al. (2010) employed a method based on SED template fitting to separate their very faint radio sample \((5\sigma \sim 14\) mJy\) into strong- and intermediate-star-forming galaxies and AGN and found similar pure luminosity evolution parameters of \(\alpha L \sim 3.0\) for all three of these populations. This is higher for the AGN population than implied by the results of Sadler et al. (2007) and Smolčić et al. (2009b) and in the work presented here. However, it is consistent with previous estimates of the evolution taking place in radio-selected star-forming populations and compares well with our reported \(\alpha L \sim 2.47\). Padovani et al. (2011) identified pure luminosity evolution at levels comparable to the SWIRE survey results taking place in both their star-forming and

Figure 8. AGN radio LF in six redshift bins to \(z \sim 2.5\), plotted as red points. AGN are identified as objects fitted by red templates in the photometric redshift fitting procedure. The local LF for star-forming galaxies and AGN (Mauch & Sadler 2007) are plotted as black dotted and dashed lines, respectively. The green dotted line is the evolved RLF of star-forming galaxies and the green dashed line is the evolved RLF of AGN assuming the evolution parameters in Table 4.
Evolution of faint radio sources

Figure 9. Star-forming radio LF in six redshift bins to \( z \sim 2.5 \), plotted as blue points. Star-forming galaxies are identified as objects fitted by blue templates in the photometric redshift fitting procedure. The local LF for star-forming galaxies and AGN (Mauch & Sadler 2007) are plotted as black dotted and dashed lines, respectively. The green dotted line is the evolved RLF of star-forming galaxies and the green dashed line is the evolved RLF of AGN assuming the evolution parameters in Table 4.

Table 5. Comparison of the current determinations of the evolution of the radio LF out to a redshift of \( \sim 1.3 \). Numbers quoted are the \( \alpha_L \) parameters determined by fitting pure luminosity evolution.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Field</th>
<th>AGN</th>
<th>Star-forming galaxies</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Radio-quiet</td>
<td>Radio-loud</td>
<td>Strong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strazzullo et al. (2010)</td>
<td>SWIRE</td>
<td>2.7 ± 0.3</td>
<td>3.2^{+0.4}_{-0.2}</td>
<td>3.7^{+0.3}_{-0.4}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smolčić et al. (2009a,b)</td>
<td>COSMOS</td>
<td>0.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>2.1 ± 0.2</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Padovani et al. (2011)</td>
<td>Chandra DFS</td>
<td>3.8^{+0.7}_{-0.9}</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>3.1^{+0.8}_{-1.0}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simpson et al. (2012)</td>
<td>SXDF</td>
<td>&gt;0</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This work</td>
<td>VIDEO</td>
<td>1.18 ± 0.21</td>
<td>2.47 ± 0.12</td>
<td>1.90 ± 0.17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\( L_{1.4\, \text{GHz}} \leq 10^{24} \, \text{W Hz}^{-1} \).

radio-quiet quasar samples. However, they find evidence that the low-luminosity radio-loud AGN population undergoes no evolution in the redshift range probed by the Smolčić et al. (2009b) study and suggested that the evolution detected for low-luminosity AGN in the COSMOS study is driven by radio-quiet AGN included by their selection criteria. The evolution found for AGN sources in the VIDEO survey falls well below that found in the Padovani et al. (2011) radio-quiet population, as would be expected if the radio-quiet sources form a part of the strongly evolving ‘quasar’-mode sources.

Simpson et al. (2012) see evidence of an increase in the number of low-luminosity sources up to \( z \sim 1 \), their RLF increases by a factor of \( \sim 3 \) which is consistent with our work over this redshift range. As was the case in Padovani et al. (2011), they identify this enhancement as being predominantly driven by evolution of the radio-quiet objects. Radio-quiet objects in their sample are identified based the ratio of mid-infrared (24 \( \mu m \)) to radio flux and this definition encompasses both star-forming and radio-quiet AGN. Whereas they see no evidence of evolution for low-luminosity radio-loud AGN.

The evolution of star-forming galaxies has also been extensively studied using optical and infrared surveys. Mid- and far-infrared Spitzer observations imply a galaxy population undergoing pure luminosity evolution with \( \alpha_L \sim 3.4–3.8 \) out to \( z \sim 1.2 \) (e.g. Caputi et al. 2007; Magnelli et al. 2009; Rujopakarn et al. 2010; Magnelli et al. 2011). While far-infrared LF from Herschel data result in slightly stronger evolution estimates with \( L_{\star} \propto (1 + z)^{4.1 \pm 0.3} \) up to \( z \sim 1.5 \) (Gruppioni et al. 2010; Lapi et al. 2011). At lower redshifts (\( z < 0.5 \)) some Herschel studies have seen evidence of stronger evolution in star-forming galaxies with the total luminosity density evolving as \( (1 + z)^{7.1} \) (Dye et al. 2010). These recent infrared studies are broadly consistent with the radio-derived star-formation
histories in Table 5 implying a very similar increase in the total cosmic star formation density in the interval between $z \sim 0$–1. The radio results are also in good agreement (e.g. Smolčič et al. 2009a, fig. 6) with earlier works using ultraviolet-derived star formation estimates (Wolf et al. 2003; Arnouts et al. 2005; Baldry et al. 2005, see also Hopkins & Beacom 2006).

Beyond $z \sim 1.2$ there have been some suggestions of a cutoff $z > 1.2$. Disentangling the contributions of the various low-luminosity objects at redshifts $>1.5$, whilst Padovani et al. (2011) claim evidence of strong negative evolution in the more powerful radio-loud populations which they suggest might be the result of a high-redshift cutoff in these source populations. However, Fig. 5 indicates that the RLF continues to increase out to $z \sim 2.5$, although the rate of increase does slow beyond $z \sim 1.2$. Disentangling the contributions of the various low-luminosity radio populations is clearly a difficult proposition and has important implications for our ability to deduce their evolutionary behaviour and make inferences about links between AGN and star-forming processes. The discussion above which presents the myriad of evolutionary scenarios currently postulated serves to illustrate how much uncertainty remains in this area and the vitally important role of multiwavelength data sets in constraining these increasingly complex evolutionary scenarios.

More complicated modelling of the evolution of radio sources could be carried out by combining a range of deep fields, e.g. COSMOS (Smolčič et al. 2009a,b), SXDF (Simpson et al. 2012) and the VLA-VIDEO field, in this work, and combining surveys with Square Kilometer Array pathfinder telescopes, such as MeerKAT will allow us to explore the evolution of radio sources over larger areas and too much higher redshifts ($z \sim 4$) overcoming the sample variance limitations of current small area surveys.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The work of Kim McAlpine and Matt Jarvis was supported by the South African Square Kilometre Array Project and the South African National Research Foundation. The authors would like to thank the South African National Research Foundation for funding an intensive research retreat which made this work possible. This work is based on observations made with ESO telescopes at the La Silla Paranal Observatory under programme ID: 179.A-2006 and on data products produced by the Cambridge Astronomy Survey Unit on behalf of the VIDEO consortium. It is also based on observations obtained with MegaPrime/MegaCam, a joint project of CFHT and CEA/DAPNIA, at the Canada–France–Hawaii Telescope (CFHT) which is operated by the National Research Council (NRC) of Canada, the Institut National des Science de l’Univers of the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS) of France and the University of Hawaii. This work is based in part on data products produced at TERAPIX and the Canadian Astronomy Data Centre as part of the Canada–France–Hawaii Telescope Legacy Survey, a collaborative project of NRC and CNRS.

REFERENCES

Cardamone C. N. et al., 2010, ApJS, 189, 270
Cattaneo A. et al., 2009, Nat, 460, 213
Di Matteo T., Springel V., Hernquist L., 2005, Nat, 433, 604
Dye S. et al., 2010, A&A; 518, L10

Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/mnras/article-abstract/436/2/1084/1123142 by guest on 9 October 2018
Smolčić V. et al., 2008, ApJS, 177, 14

This paper has been typeset from a TeX/LaTeX file prepared by the author.